



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
MARCH 25, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Wm. Howard Wittausch, *Vice Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Ivan Insua
Leon A. Olson
Richard Six
David R. Watkins

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

John Campanella

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Vice Chair Wittausch.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Wittausch, Cunningham (absent 3:50 – 5:34 p.m.), Olson, Six, and Watkins (at 3:42 p.m.)
Members absent: Moore, Insua
Staff present: Ostrenger (until 6:51 p.m.), Unzueta (3:14 - 3:52 p.m.), Ternovskaya, Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician II; and Krystal Vaughn, Senior Commission Secretary

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Anna Marie Gott was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 11, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 4/0/0. (Moore, Insua, Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 18, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Cunningham and Wittausch.

Action: Cunningham/Olson, 4/0/0. (Moore, Insua, Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 25, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Six/Olson, 4/0/0. (Moore, Insua, Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Pilar Plummer announced the following:

- a. Matthew Ozyilmaz will be absent and she will be staffing today's board meeting.
- b. Chair Moore will be absent from the meeting.
- c. Item 1, 501 E. Micheltorena will be given comments only and no final appealable decision will be made.
- d. Item 6, 519 W. Pedregosa St. was postponed for re-noticing.
- e. Board member Cunningham recused himself from the review of Item 2, 219 E. Haley St.
- f. An appeal of 711 N. Milpas will be reviewed by City Council on March 26, 2019 and board member Watkins will represent the ABR at the meeting.

2. Ms. Ostrenger announced that she would be leaving the meeting after Item 4, 1616 San Pascual St.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(3:15PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

1. 501 E MICHELTORENA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-260-024
 Zone: R-M
 Application Number: PLN2017-00795
 Owner: Roscoe Villa
 Architect: DesignARC

(This project has been revised from its previously approved design in response to direction from City Council following their decision to uphold an appeal of the approval of the project on the basis of neighborhood compatibility. Proposal for a new multi-unit residential development using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. Project consists of the demolition of an existing 1,743 square foot, single-story duplex and detached two-car garage, and the construction of a new four-unit, two-story apartment building. Unit mix will include one 3-bedroom unit, one 2-bedroom unit, one 1-bedroom unit, and one studio unit ranging in size from 405 to 1,417 square feet with an average unit size of 890 square feet. Proposed density on this 7,500 square foot lot is 24 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Medium-High Density, which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are four parking spaces, site alterations and landscaping, and alterations to the on-site sandstone retaining wall bordering the sidewalk. Grading will include 188 cubic yards of cut and 35 cubic yards of fill.)

Project Design approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires conditions for the Average Unit-Size Density Program Annual Residents Survey and an environmental finding for a CEQA guidelines section 15183 exemption - projects consistent with the general plan. Project was last reviewed on February 25, 2019.

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, DesignARC; and Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Ms. Unzueta clarified that Board members can provide comments on the project but no final appealable decision will be made because the Project Design approval plan check has not yet been completed.

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m.

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Pat Saley

Public comment closed at 3:30 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The project is ready for Project Design Approval at Consent contingent upon staff review.
 2. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of the City and the neighborhood, and is not significantly different in style, colors or materials from the existing neighborhood or adjacent bungalows.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The project is sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources in the vicinity of the project.
 - e. The project does not affect public view of mountains or oceans.
 - f. The proposal includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
 3. The Board finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
 4. The outdoor lighting associated with the project is in compliance with Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.
 5. The Board requests that the project return for Final Approval to the Full Commission.
- Action: Six/Cunningham, 4/0/0. (Moore, Insua, and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:42 TO 3:50 P.M. ***

(3:50PM) CONCEPT REVIEW (CONTINUED)

2. 219 E HALEY ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-014
 Zone: M-C
 Application Number: PLN2016-00078
 Owner: Price Living Trust
 Architect: DMHA - Ed De Vicente

(Proposal for a new mixed-use development using the Average Unit Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The proposal includes the demolition of seven existing structures housing eight residential units and the construction of a four-story, 35 unit, mixed-use development. Unit mix will include 14 two-bedroom units, 16 one-bedroom units, and 5 studios ranging in size from 412 to 1,011 square feet, with an average unit size of 719 square feet. Also proposed are two commercial spaces totaling 1,816 square feet. The proposed density on this 25,541 square foot parcel will be 63 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial Industrial/Medium High Residential, 37-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 35 covered parking spaces for the residential units and 5 covered parking spaces for the commercial area, with 38 spaces required. Planning Commission review is required.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis as well as the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Haley/Milpas Design Manual, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires review by Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on February 25, 2019.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to prior contract work with the owner.

Actual time: 3:50 p.m.

Present: Ed De Vicente, Principal Architect, DMHA; Ryan Mills, Principal Designer, DMHA; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Brodison clarified that the next step for the project would be for it to continue on to the Planning Commission for comments and then it would return to the ABR Full Board.

Public comment opened at 4:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with return to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board provided comments on the following Compatibility Analysis Criteria (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements; however, it is not fully consistent with the Design Guidelines.
 - b. The overall character of the design is compatible with the community and with many of the Haley/Milpas Design Guidelines.
 - i. The project is architecturally well designed, with many strong attributes; elements such as the finished plaster, the use of wood, the cornice detailing,

- and the breaking up of the overall massing into smaller elements are all beneficial and fitting with the surrounding buildings in the area and helps to reduce the overall apparent bulk of the building; however, some Board Members are concerned about the apparent height of the project as it may not relate to the surrounding neighborhood.
- ii. Further refine the orientation of the wood at the guard rails and balconies and make them consistent with one another.
 - iii. The Board finds that the proposed detail of six inches off the finish face of material to glazing at all window units is acceptable; request further study as it relates to the out-swing door details.
 - iv. Some Board members believe that the podium walls at the east and west, as currently designed, are successful in that they provide relief off the property lines and further reduce the apparent bulk and scale from adjacent properties.
 - v. The using of plantings along the ground level and upper level is greatly appreciated.
 - vi. The board appreciates the use of canopy trees throughout the project.
 - vii. The use of aluminum framed windows as proposed is acceptable and the Board requests that the applicant retain the windows and material.
 - viii. The proposed use of color to break up the massing is acceptable and appreciated.
- c. As designed, the project is not entirely appropriate in its apparent size, mass, bulk, height, and scale and is therefore not compatible with the neighborhood.
 - i. Due to the apparent height, the project is not appropriate for the current location without further restudy.
 - ii. Further study the roofline in order to provide better articulation to reduce overall apparent mass of the individual clusters of the buildings.
 - d. The project does not impact adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources in the vicinity of the project.
 - e. Further study design strategies to reduce impact on surrounding public views of the ocean and mountains.
 - i. In order to better protect public views of the mountains and the surrounding fabric of the community, study sloping the access drive aisle and depressing the parking garage to the greatest extent feasible; applicant to work with their utilities consulting team to see how that could better be achieved to blend in with the mechanical and plumbing systems.
 - f. The use of open space and landscaping is greatly appreciated in that the project provides views to the surrounding neighborhood, creates a courtyard for gathering and has ample use of landscaping throughout the project.
 - i. Some Board member would like to see more architectural detail in the emergency egress passageway so that it doesn't read as an inactivated corridor.

Action: Watkins/Olson, 4/0/0. (Moore, Insua, and Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

(4:35PM) CONCEPT REVIEW (CONTINUED)**3. 420 E CARRILLO ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-028
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2019-00057
 Owner: QCI 420 Carrillo LLC
 Architect: Anacapa Architecture

(Proposal for a façade remodel and non-residential addition to an existing commercial structure. Project consists of repainting the existing exterior brick and installation of wood cladding to existing architectural features. The project also includes a new elevator shaft to improve access to the second floor, new railings and stairs, and new rooftop equipment. Also proposed is a reconfiguration of the parking lot, and installation of new landscaping at the upper and lower parking lots. Project proposes to reallocate square footages to exclude existing mechanical equipment rooms and add 85 square feet of net new non-residential floor area. Project requires a Development Plan Approval finding from the Architectural Board of Review as well as a waiver for an alternative parking lot landscape design.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the project compatibility analysis as well as the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on March 11, 2019.

Actual time: 5:34 p.m.

Present: Dan Weber, Architect, Anacapa Architecture; Kristin Stoyanova, Designer, Anacapa Architecture; Jessi Finnicum-Schwartz, Architect; Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 6:02 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The project is ready for Project Design Approval and Final Approval at Consent.
2. The Alternative Parking Lot Landscape Design can be supported.
3. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The project is not adjacent to Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 4/1/0. (Watkins opposed. Moore, Insua absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Board Member Watkins stated that the colors of the proposed building is not sensitive or compatible with the neighborhood.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:15 TO 6:20 P.M. ***

(5:10PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

4. 1616 SAN PASCUAL ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-223-014
 Zone: R-M
 Application Number: PLN2018-00598
 Owner: Madden, Michael Francis Living Trust
 Applicant: Blair Weymouth, Y.S. Kim
 Designer: Blair Weymouth

(Proposal for a new multi-unit residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program. Project consists of the demolition of a 222 square foot garage and the construction of a two-story duplex addition to an existing 786 square foot single unit residence. Unit mix will consist of two, two-bedroom units and one studio unit ranging in size from 537 to 786 square feet, with an average unit size of 685 square feet. Proposed density for this 5,900 square foot parcel is 22 dwelling units per acre, on a site with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are three parking spaces: a two car garage, and an uncovered parking space.)

Project Design approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis as well as the following Guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires conditions for the Average Unit-Size Density Program Annual Residents Survey and an environmental finding for a CEQA guidelines section 15183 exemption - projects consistent with the general plan. Project was last reviewed on December 3, 2018.

Actual time: 6:20 p.m.

Present: Blair Weymouth, Weymouth Design; Y.S. Kim, Applicant

Public comment opened at 6:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent for Final Approval with comments:

1. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. There are no applicable adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.

- e. No applicable established scenic public vistas.
- f. The project includes a good amount of open space and landscaping.
- 2. Include an eave at the south portion of the garage. The eave should extend as far as possible in order to match the shorter eaves present throughout the existing architecture.
- 3. The Board finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
- 4. The project complies with Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, and Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 3/1/1. (Watkins opposed. Olson abstained. Moore and Insua absent.)
Motion carried.

Individual comments: Board Member Watkins stated that that the private space and common open space should be differentiated from one another.

(5:45PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

5. 1717 THOMAS AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-193-008
 Zone: R-M
 Application Number: PLN2019-00092
 Owner: Antonio Aguilera Garcia
 Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(Proposal for two new residential units using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. Project consist of maintaining two existing residences on-site, and the construction of a three car garage with two second story units. Unit mix will include one, two-bedroom unit and three, one-bedroom units ranging in size from 437 to 734 square feet with an average unit size of 539 square feet. The proposed density on this parcel is 27 dwelling units per acre on a lot with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Four parking spaces, and four bike parking spaces are proposed. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for an Open Yard Modification.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review.

Actual time: 6:51 p.m.

Present: Rex Ruskauff, Architect

Public comment opened at 6:59 p.m.

The following individual(s) spoke:

- 1. Gina Carbajal
- 2. Bob Conway, opposed.

Public comment closed at 7:04 p.m.

Motion: Continue four weeks to the Full Board with comments:

1. Determine whether Thomas Avenue is an alley, and discuss reconfiguring some parking to be located in the front yard consistent with the neighborhood, and if backing out into Thomas Avenue is acceptable.
2. The Board would be supportive of an additional parking space beyond the minimum required.
3. Both stories of the new construction should be a continuous material rather than different material at the second floor line.
4. Study introducing at least one column at the width of the parking garage.
5. The Board supports the overall massing of the architecture, including the new two-story addition in the back, and it is similar to the existing pattern of the neighborhood.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 4/0/0. (Moore and Insua absent.) Motion carried.

(6:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

6. 519 W PEDREGOSA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-163-017
 Zone: R-M
 Application Number: PLN2018-00516
 Owner: Tom Kenny
 Applicant: Brooke Van Duyne

(Proposal for two new multi-unit structures on a lot developed with a single residential unit. Project proposes to maintain the existing 1,358 square foot, 3-bedroom unit and construct two new two-story structures containing three residences. Unit mix includes one three-bedroom, one one-bedroom, and two studio units ranging in size from 455 to 1,358 square feet with an average unit size of 702 square feet. The proposed density on this parcel will be 26 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. A total of four vehicle and four bicycle parking spaces are proposed; vehicle parking includes a proposed new two two-car garage and two new uncovered spaces. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for an Open Yard Modification.)

Item 6 postponed to the April 8th agenda for re-noticing.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:30 P.M. ***