



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
FEBRUARY 11, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Wm. Howard Wittausch, *Vice Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Ivan Insua
Leon A. Olson
Richard Six
David R. Watkins

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

John Campanella

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician
Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Moore.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Moore (absent 4:05-4:49 p.m.), Wittausch, Cunningham (until 6:35 p.m.), Insua, Olson, Six, and Watkins
Members absent: None
Staff present: Ostrenger (until 5:00 p.m.), Ozyilmaz, and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Anna Marie Gott addressed the Board.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 14, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Insua/Olson, 5/0/2. (Six and Wittausch abstained.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 28, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/2. (Insua and Watkins abstained.) Motion carried.

Motion: To reopen approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 28, 2019**

Action: Wittausch/Six, 5/0/2. (Insua and Watkins abstained.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approve the revised minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 28, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Wittausch/Six, 5/0/2. (Insua and Watkins abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 4, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Wittausch/Cunningham, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 11, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Member Moore and Board Member Cunningham with the exception of Item C, 2700 Miradero Dr. for revision before posting as continued one week and not approved.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Ozyilmaz announced the following:

a. Item 3, 501 E. Micheltorena has been postponed to the next agenda.

b. Board Member Cunningham will be recusing himself from review of agenda Item 6, 401 S. Hope Ave. and Item 7, 402 S. Hope Ave., to avoid any actual or perceived conflicts of interest due to contractual obligations with clients.

c. Ms. Ostrenger will be leaving the meeting at 5:00 p.m.

2. Board Member Moore announced he will be recusing himself from review of agenda Item 2, 22 Anacapa St., to avoid any actual or perceived conflicts of interest due to contractual obligations with clients.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Appointments will be made for the Olive Mill Roundabout Ad HOC Subcommittee at the next Full Board meeting.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. STAFF PRESENTATION ON STATE HOUSING LEGISLATION

(3:15) Staff: Rosie Dyste, Project Planner

(Staff discussion of three bills from the State's 2017 Housing Package (Assembly Bill 678 or AB 678, Senate Bill (SB) 167 or SB 167, and SB 35) and their relationship to the City's proposed work program for Residential Multi-unit Objective Design Standards. An Ad Hoc Subcommittee will be formed comprised of members from Historic Landmarks Commission, Architectural Board of Review, and Planning Commission to advise staff on development of objective design standards for residential multi-unit development. Staff is requesting that Architectural Board of Review member(s) be appointed to the subcommittee.)

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Rosie Dyste, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

- 1. Anna Marie Gott

Public comment closed at 3:51 p.m.

Discussion held.

Nomination were made for members: Cunningham, Wittausch, Six, and Moore.

A vote was taken, and Board Member Moore and Wittausch were appointed as the Residential Multi-unit Objective Design Standards Subcommittee members.

PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

2. 22 ANACAPA ST

OC/SD-3 Zone

(3:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	033-113-008
Application Number:	MST2019-00039
Owner:	Art Center, LLC

(Proposal for a new mural on an existing commercial structure. Project consists of the installation of a mural containing the text "Funk Zone".)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Moore recused himself from hearing this item due to contractual obligations with clients.

Actual time: 4:05 p.m.

Present: Jessi Finnicum-Schwartz and Dan Weber, Architects, Anacapa Architecture

Staff comments: Mr. Ozyilmaz clarified the Urban Historian has reviewed the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

- 1. Steve Hausz in opposition
- 2. Anna Marie Gott

Public comment closed at 4:18 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members believe the proposed is a mural? 3/3 Failed

Straw vote: How many Board Members believe the proposed is a sign? 3/3 Failed

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The proposed is a piece of art, that there is no operating business with the name Funk Zone at the site, and that the term Funk Zone is not specific to the designated zone or referencing a business name.
2. Provide the size and dimensions of the mural itself to present to the Board, including a site plan for clarification, before final approval can be granted.
3. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with architectural qualities of the community and neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. Project size, bulk, and height are not applicable for the proposed type of project.
 - d. The proposed mural is intended to be added to the numerous existing artworks in the area and building.
 - e. There are no significant negative impacts to adjacent historic landmarks or structures as the closest landmark is located across the nearby parking lot.
 - f. There are no nearby established scenic mountain or ocean views from the project as the project is to the rear of the site and adjacent to a parking lot.
 - g. The project does not negatively impact any open space or landscaping.

Action: Watkins/Six, 3/3/0. (Insua, Cunningham, and Wittausch opposed. Moore absent.) Motion failed.

Individual comments: Board Member Wittausch stated that even though he agreed the project should be reviewed by the Arts Advisory Board, he opposed the motion because the details are precedent-setting for other future murals and signs in the City, and not in the best interests of the Sign Program, Mural Program, or the Funk Zone.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The proposed text Funk Zone is not representative of a designated zone or business name.
2. The proposed project shall return to the Arts Advisory Board and return to the ABR with a representative from the Arts Advisory Board to provide comments in order to address the ABR's concerns on the proposed project.
3. Provide dimensions for the proposed project on the plans.

Action: Cunningham/Wittausch, 4/2/0. (Six and Watkins opposed. Moore absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Board Member Six stated that he opposed the motion as it does not give the applicant enough direction.

PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**3. 501 E MICHELTORENA ST****R-M Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-260-024
 Application Number: MST2017-00795
 Owner: Roscoe Villa
 Architect: Ken Vermillion

(Proposal for a new multi-unit residential development using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. Project consists of the demolition of an existing 1,743 square foot, single-story duplex and detached two-car garage, and the construction of a new four-unit, two-story apartment building. Unit mix will include one 3-bedroom unit, one 2-bedroom unit, one 1-bedroom unit, and one studio unit ranging in size from 405 to 1,417 square feet with an average unit size of 890 square feet. Proposed density on this 7,500 square foot lot is 24 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Medium-High Density, which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are four parking spaces, site alterations and landscaping, and alterations to the on-site sandstone retaining wall bordering the sidewalk. Grading will include 10 cubic yards of cut and 35 cubic yards of fill.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires conditions for the Average Unit-Size Density Program Annual Residents Survey. Project was last reviewed on May 21, 2018.)

Item was postponed two weeks.

PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**4. 1250 COAST VILLAGE RD****C-1/SD-3 Zone**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-230-037
 Application Number: MST2018-00581
 Owner: FM Properties
 Architect: The Warner Group Architects

(Proposal for cosmetic changes to an existing commercial building in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The exterior alterations comprise replacement of Saltillo tile walkways with brick pavers, replacement of roof tiles on tower elements with standing seam metal roofs, replaced lighting, minor accessibility improvements, and new landscaping.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and was last reviewed on January 28, 2019.)

*** The following item was heard out of order. ***

Actual time: 5:30 p.m.

Present: Thiep Cung, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent.
Action: Six/Moore, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 1723 GARDEN ST

RS-15 Zone

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-007
 Application Number: MST2018-00668
 Applicant: Amy Taylor
 Owner: Valerie Cherot

(Proposal to permit various unpermitted conditions on a multi-unit residence. Project consists of reducing the number of units from 11 to 9, per a 1975 Planning Commission Condition of Approval, permitting an unpermitted garden area that displaced three required parking spaces, permitting unpermitted doors, decks, stairs and railings at several units, and minor additions to two of the units. The project also includes storage lofts and other alterations to the interior configuration of various units. Planning Commission review is requested for a parking modification for a reduction in parking from the 13 required to 3 provided, and an interior setback modification. The project also require a waiver from the Architectural Board of Review for an Alternative Open Yard Design. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2017-00334 and Enforcement Case ENF2017-01216.)

(First Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines. Project requires review by the Planning Commission.)

*** The item was heard out of agenda order. ***

Actual time: 4:49 p.m.

Present: Amy Taylor, Applicant; and Valerie Cherot, Owner

Staff comments: Mr. Ozyilmaz clarified the Board's scope of review to be the as-built conditions, garden aesthetics, and alternative open yard appropriateness and compatibility with the neighborhood. The project also requires a waiver from the Board for an Alternative Open Yard Design.

Public comment opened at 5:02 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. John Jameson in opposition
2. Anna Marie Gott
3. Gary Carroll in support
4. Nancy Darrow in support

Correspondence from Anna Marie Gott was acknowledged.
 Public comment closed at 5:12 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:

1. Provide more consistent and compatible guard railings.
2. The proposed as-built garden changes are acceptable as presented.
3. The Board supports a waiver for an Alternative Open Yard Design.
4. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Cunningham/Wittausch, 5/1/0. (Watkins opposed.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:35 TO 6:17 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

6. 401 S HOPE AVE

RS-7.5/ACS/SP4-RA/USS Zone

(5:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	051-240-018
Application Number:	MST2017-00697
Owner:	Santa Barbara Auto Group
Applicant:	Lusardi Construction Co.

(Proposal for a remodel to an existing auto dealership comprising enclosure of a 1,037 square foot existing roofed display area, and demolition and reconstruction of floor area, resulting in a total of 1,760 square feet of new enclosed floor area. The remodel also includes upgrading the existing showroom and restrooms, demolition of non-load bearing partition walls, new paint, new flooring, and new storefront systems with a similar look and color. The total area of work including the new enclosed area is approximately 8,954 square feet. Other exterior alterations include the demolition of an existing vehicle display and demonstration course, new and reconfigured parking spaces, and landscaping around the building entrance per vehicle brand specifications. Planning staff has granted a Substantial Conformance Determination (Level II) for new floor area that the Planning Commission previously approved under Resolution No. 020-95.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis. Project was last reviewed on January 28, 2019.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to contractual obligations with clients.

Actual time: 6:18 p.m.

Present: Mike Ramsey, Applicant, Lusardi Construction Co./Santa Barbara Auto Group; and Duane Sanders, Executive Manager, Santa Barbara Auto Group

Public comment opened at 6:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements, and the project's design is consistent with design guidelines.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of the City and the neighborhood, and is not significantly different in style, colors or materials from the existing neighborhood or adjacent homes.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood as the project has been reduced in height and does not block mountain or ocean views.
 - d. The project does not have any sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources in the vicinity of the project.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic mountain and ocean vistas as the height of the project has been reduced.
 - f. The project includes acceptable change in open space and appropriate landscaping has been reviewed at a prior meeting.

Action: Six/Wittausch, 6/0/0. (Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

7. 402 S HOPE AVE

RS-7.5/ACS/USS Zone

(6:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	051-240-017
Application Number:	MST2019-00012
Owner:	Santa Barbara Automotive, LLP
Applicant:	Mike Ramsey

(This is a one-time pre-application consultation. Proposal for a 1,197 square foot fabric canopy work area to house special alignment equipment and safety features of new cars.)

(No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to contractual obligations with clients.

Actual time: 7:18 p.m.

Present: Mike Ramsey, Applicant, Lusardi Construction Co./Santa Barbara Auto Group; and Duane Sanders, Executive Manager, Santa Barbara Auto Group

Staff comments: Mr. Ozyilmaz stated that this was a one-time pre-application Board review, and that no final appealable decision will be made at this meeting.

Public comment opened at 7:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Board comments:

1. The Board could not support the proposed temporary structure as it adds no architectural value to the site, is not integrated into the existing architecture, and does not match the existing style, scale or architecture.
2. The Board finds the applicant's reasons of expense and lack of available square footage is not sufficient for not exploring other alternatives for a more permanent design or structure.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:48 TO 7:05 P.M. ***

PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

8. 526 N QUARANTINA ST

C-G Zone

(7:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-231-018
 Application Number: MST2019-00005
 Owner: Ned Pasori
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(This is a one-time pre-application consultation. Proposal for a three unit residence using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. Project proposes the demolition of a 1,350 square foot residence and 300 square foot garage, and the construction of a 4,372 square foot, three-story, three unit residential building with three covered parking spaces. Unit mix includes one, 2-bedroom unit and two, 1-bedroom units ranging in size from 630 to 1,271 square feet with an average unit size of 872. The proposed density on this 2,675 square foot parcel is 56 dwelling units per acre on a lot within the Priority Housing Overlay which allows for 37-63 dwelling units per acre. This project has not been reviewed for compliance with applicable City development standards.)

(No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.)

Actual time: 7:05 p.m.

Present: Jeff Shelton, Applicant

Staff comments: Mr. Ozyilmaz stated that this was a one-time pre-application Board review, and no final appealable decision will be made.

Public comment opened at 7:15 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Martha Fragosa in opposition
2. Benjamin Stafford in opposition
3. John Fragosa

Correspondence from Abbey Fragosa was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:21 p.m.

Board comments:

1. Even though the project is located in a transitional neighborhood, the applicant should minimize the proposed mass, bulk, scale, and how it presents to the street.
2. The applicant needs to seek neighborhood input in order to improve integrating the proposed structure into the quiet neighborhood.
3. Study lowering the plate heights, moving away from the property line, etc., and study ways to integrate more air and natural light access into project to achieve more harmony with the neighborhood.
4. Study reducing the massing by either removing a square foot from each level, breaking up the massing, and/or dropping the grade to help reduce the massing above grade, as the proposed structure is too enclosed, maximizes too much of the site, and the proposed small amount of open space is too centralized to the building.
5. Study possible privacy impacts and provide photographs from the street view, and from the point of view from neighboring homes.
6. Provide architecture, materials, and garage details.
7. Study and provide entry/exit access details and possible traffic impacts to the site.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:05 P.M. ***