



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
DECEMBER 3, 2018

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Chair*
Kevin Moore, *Vice Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Richard Six
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:
Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:
John Campanella

STAFF:
Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Tripp.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Tripp (until 5:15 p.m.), Moore, Cunningham (at 6:07 p.m.), Six, Watkins (until 9:08 p.m.), and Wittausch

Members absent: None

Staff present: Ostrenger (until 5:15 p.m.), Unzueta (until 6:07 p.m.) Cameron, and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Anna Marie Gott addressed the Board regarding her filed appeal to City Council of the Board's Denied Final Approval of 711 N. Milpas Street for parking and access issues.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **November 19, 2018**, as submitted.

Action: Six/Watkins, 3/0/2. (Moore abstained from Items 2-7; Wittausch abstained from Item 1. Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 26, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members Cunningham and Moore.

Action: Watkins/Six, 5/0/0. (Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **December 3, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Member Cunningham and Board Member Moore.

Action: Watkins/Wittausch, 4/0/1. (Six abstained from Item F, 1298 Coast Village Rd. Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:

- a. Board Member Cunningham will be absent from review of Item 1, 813 E. Carrillo St., and Item 2, 1298 Las Positas Rd.
- b. Chair Tripp will be leaving the meeting early at approximately 5:00 p.m. Vice Chair Moore will chair remainder of the meeting
- c. Board Member Watkins later announced he would be leaving the meeting early.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW**1. 813 E CARRILLO ST****R-M Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:	029-251-016
Application Number:	MST2015-00602
Owner:	Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
Architect:	RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a project under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project includes the demolition of an existing 1,428 square foot 2-story house and construction of 16 affordable studio units in three 2- and 3-story buildings totaling 5,112 square feet. The units will be restricted to war veterans. Also proposed is a 2- and 3-story, 589 square foot community center, 387 square foot, 2-story manager's unit with attached one-car carport, a 234 square foot manager's office, 89 square foot laundry facility, and trash enclosure. Seventeen parking spaces are required, with eight proposed. The average unit size is 357 square feet and the proposed residential density is 49 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 27 dwelling units per acre allowed on this 15,005 square foot parcel. The General Plan Land Use Designation is Medium High Density Residential, allowing 15-27 dwelling units per acre.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with the following guidelines: Infill Design Guidelines, Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on April 10, 2017.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham previously recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Skip Szymanski, Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara; Elijah Pierce, Architect, RRM Design Group; Chris Dufour, Landscape Architect, RRM Design Group; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Brodison clarified for the Board the landscaping waiver for the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 3:52 p.m.

Mark Sheridan spoke in general support of the AUD program, but had no comments for this particular proposed project.

Anna Marie Gott spoke of concerns regarding granting approval for the proposed project without compliance with guidelines confirmed by the Board, and recommended continuance of the proposed project in order to either confirm guidelines or to properly amend the project.

Public comment closed at 3:57 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Consult the City Arborist on the location for an additional street tree and add it to the landscape plan
2. The Historic Landmark Commission landscape architect shall review the final landscape plan.
3. Add additional larger trees north of the parking area.
4. Provide a planting vine at the waiting bench.
5. Provide more decorative residential light to replace the industrial fixtures.
6. Provide a water line on the front building.
7. Foam sills are not supportable; adjust shutters.
8. Provide details of the roof solar installation.
9. Stone is preferred for the walls at the manager's unit and along the driveway.
10. Provide either real wood or wrought iron railings consistently throughout the project.
11. Remove the S8 fixture at the gas meter location.
12. The Hagan roof vents are to be covered with comp shingles.
13. Provide an additional series of steps at the manager's unit.
14. Restudy rake and eave condition at the south elevation of the courtyard building.
15. Clarify and study the utility closet.
16. Clarify whether the A/C units are either wall-mounted or pad-mounted.

Action: Six/Watkins, 4/1/0. (Wittausch opposed. Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 1298 LAS POSITAS RD****RS-1A/P-R Zone****(3:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-034
Application Number: MST2013-00141
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Michael Nelson, Executive Director
Architect: Ray Hicks

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for demolition of an existing 872 square foot office/restroom building at a City tennis facility and construction of a 1,927 square foot tennis recreation building with restrooms, court director office, pro shop, and multipurpose room. The proposal also includes replacement of the existing stadium court seating with stepped planting areas and new stairs down to the courts. New hardscape will provide ADA access and the existing parking lot will be repaired and restriped. The existing concrete practice facility and backboard will be retained, with the addition of a new roof and solar panels. Grading includes 220 cubic yards of cut and 22 cubic yards of fill. The Parks and Recreation Commission made project findings on May 25, 2016.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Prior to action project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on August 27, 2018.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham previously recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Ray Hicks and Joe Andrulaitis, Architects

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Patty Bryant (Elings Park Assoc.).
2. Bruce Griffin.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Anna Marie Gott spoke of concerns regarding granting approval for the proposed project without proper agenda language.

Public comment closed at 5:30 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support granting a Project Design Approval today?
3/1 Passed

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The proposed form line is acceptable.
2. The proposed integral color concrete is acceptable.
3. Provide all framing details for the proposed trellis and awnings.

4. Refine the detailing for the decorative column capitals with concrete spheres.
5. Provide a design for the chain link fence on the practice enclosure walls, more sympathetic to the architecture.
6. Provide a site plan showing all proposed exterior lighting and details.
7. Provide a site plan clearly defining all areas of new and replaced hardscape.
8. Remove solar panels from site plan if not part of project.
9. The proposed awning fabric is acceptable.
10. The proposed bollards are acceptable.
11. Provide up-lighting details showing compatibility with dark sky compliance requirements.
12. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. There are no sensitive adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources at the project site.
 - e. There are no established scenic public vistas at the project site.
 - f. The project provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping as it provides a public outdoor amenity.
13. The Board makes the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Moore/Six, 4/0/0. (Tripp and Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:02 TO 6:07 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**3. 3855 STATE ST****C-G/USS Zone**

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-010
 Application Number: MST2018-00436
 Owner: Macerich La Cumbre, LLC
 Agent: Sam Masterson, Exec VP/Chief of Dev.
 Applicant: Darin Eng, Retail Senior Associate

(Proposal for a tenant improvement to an existing commercial use. Project consists of a multiple elevation remodel of an existing grocery store in preparation for occupation by Bristol Farms. Alterations include new stucco, stone, paint, and tile roofing, relocation of entry doors, and the installation of new storefront windows. An increase in height from 25 feet to 37 feet is proposed as part of the façade remodel.)

(Third Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Prior to action project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Upper State Street Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on October 22, 2018.)

Actual time: 6:07 p.m.

Present: Darin Eng, Retail Senior Associate; and Sam Masterson, Exec. V.P./Chief of Development for Bristol Farms

Public comment opened at 6:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Study the vine planting location on the northern elevation of the building and consult with a landscape architect for shade tolerance.
2. In general, the trellis members are too skinny and need to be more substantial.
3. Study the possibility of a mural location, or similar, on the northern elevation or on the blank wall facing the parking lot.
4. The sandstone (or cast concrete) base should be wider than the plaster column above it. Provide physical samples of materials.
5. Further integrate the wood columns at the dining wall.
6. Add vine plantings to grow on the southern trellis at the outdoor eating area.
7. In the parking lot island, consider replacing the existing shrubs with blue rye.
8. Study eliminating the plaster lintel on the northeast corner.
9. Study extending the pilasters vertically or potentially providing further detailing similar to the northern neighbor.
10. Study the proportions of the clerestory windows or study potentially adding an additional structure for the trellis to allow the windows at the dining area to be continuous.
11. Provide a wood or wood-like door with vertical planks at the egress door at the northeast corner.
12. Provide sandstone at the window sill bulk heads to the right of the eastern entry and at the south window.
13. Study adding windows at the south walls of the tower.
14. Extend trellis overhangs.
15. Study heavier rafter tails at less frequent intervals i.e. further apart.

16. Study providing more volume at the entry ceiling.
17. Study modulating the parapet height where possible.
18. The height of the proposed tower is acceptable.
19. Restudy the cornice detailing for more variation.
20. Provide physical samples of materials.
21. Study using more Santa Barbara style lighting.

Action: Wittausch/Moore., 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 1250 COAST VILLAGE RD

C-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-230-037
 Application Number: MST2018-00581
 Owner: FM Properties
 Architect: The Warner Group Architects

(Proposal for cosmetic changes to an existing commercial building in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The exterior alterations comprise replacement of Saltillo tile walkways with brick pavers, replacement of roof tiles on tower elements with standing seam metal roofs, replaced lighting, minor accessibility improvements, and new landscaping.)

(Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was referred to the Full Board on November 12, 2018.)

Actual time: 6:53 p.m.

Present: Mike Brown; Warner Group Architects

Public comment opened at 7:00 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The proposed colors are not compatible with the neighborhood and surrounding buildings.
2. The roofing change to a standing seam metal roof is not compatible with the neighborhood.
3. Study alternate colors and paving; provide samples of materials and colors.
4. Reconsider the choice of the dragon tree.

Action: Cunningham/Moore, 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 1108 OLIVE ST****R-M Zone****(5:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-180-012
Application Number: MST2018-00476
Owner: Andre Schneider
Applicant: Bryan Pollard

(Proposal for a four unit residential project to be developed using the Average Unit Size Density (AUD) Program. Project consists of the demolition of all structures on site, and the construction of two, two-story duplexes. Unit mix will include three, 2-bedroom and one studio apartments ranging in size from 315 to 1,128 square feet with an average unit size of 877 square feet. The proposed density on this 7,250 square foot lot is 25 dwelling units per acre, on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are four covered parking spaces and changes to the on-site landscaping.)

(Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Prior to action project requires compliance with Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on October 8, 2018.)

Actual time: 7:38 p.m.

Present: Brian Pollard, Applicant/Architect; and Andre Schneider, Owner

Public comment opened at 8:04 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Lucia Davis expressed concerns regarding the lack of prior communication from the applicant, changes to the neighborhood character and window and yard privacy issues of the proposed two-story structure, and requested accurate story poles for the proposed height of the project for neighborhood compatibility.
2. Sue Jackson, adjacent neighbor, expressed concerns regarding the lack of prior communication from the applicant, window and yard privacy issues, project grading and fill, proposed height of the project, water drainage concerns off the project site onto her adjacent property, plantings along the 8-foot fence between the properties, and requested more sturdy masonry retaining walls between the two properties to mitigate drainage and potential garage flooding issues, and reduction of the proposed height for neighborhood compatibility.
3. Greg Denlinger appreciated the added trees and south masonry wall changes, but expressed concern regarding access to his zero lot line garage, drainage and yard privacy issues from the proposed two-story structure with the filled-in raised grading; and the loss of private mountain views.
4. Correspondence from Greg Denlinger was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 8:18 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The proposed architectural style, general appearance, and massing are acceptable.
2. The Board recommends the applicant minimize the length of the front building by a minimum of 2 feet toward the street; i.e., relocate the rear building away

from the back property line for a reduction of the length of front unit and interior yard to create more rear yard space.

3. The proposed stepping of rear retaining walls should accommodate enough width in the hedge planting area to maintain the hedge.
4. The design of the proposed roof pitch and minor stair is acceptable.
5. The proposed heavy posts and architecture are acceptable.
6. Restudy the fenestration cut-ups of the single paned windows on the west elevation to continue the architectural theme.
7. Restudy to simplify and reduce the floor plan and rear units for neighborhood compatibility.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 2/3/0. (Cunningham, Wittausch, and Watkins opposed. Tripp absent.) Motion failed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Significantly reduce the overall size and massing of the proposed project to ensure neighborhood compatibility.
2. The proposed architectural style and general appearance are acceptable.
3. The Board recommends the applicant minimize the length of the front building by a minimum of two (2) feet toward the street; i.e., relocate the rear building away from the back property line for a reduction of the length of front unit and interior yard to create more rear yard space.
4. The proposed stepping of rear retaining walls should accommodate enough width in the hedge planting area to maintain the retaining hedge.
5. The design of the proposed roof pitch and minor stair is acceptable.
6. The proposed heavy posts and architecture are acceptable.
7. Restudy the fenestration cut-ups of the single paned windows on the west elevation to continue the architectural theme.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 4/1/0. (Moore opposed. Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 9:07 TO 9:11 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

6. 614 E HALEY ST

M-C Zone

(6:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-293-004
Application Number:	MST2018-00589
Owner:	Justine Roddick
Applicant:	Karen Blakeman
Architect:	Karl Kras
Business Name:	The Factory SB, Inc.

(Proposal to renovate an existing non-residential structure. Project consists of a new outdoor patio to the rear of the site, a new trash enclosure, improvements to the existing open shed, new site entrance, new fencing, new windows and awnings, and a change in paint colors. Project also proposes a parking lot restripe which requires a waiver for Alternative Parking Lot Design.)

(First Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Prior to action project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following Guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Haley/Milpas Design Manual, Outdoor Lighting Design Manual. Item was postponed on November 19, 2018.)

Actual time: 9:11 p.m.

Present: Karl Kras, Architect; Karen Blakeman, Applicant; and Justine Roddick, Owner

Public comment opened at 9:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Restudy the proposed windows on the east elevation.
2. Provide awning and other added elements that match the style of the existing building.
3. Simplify the proposed fencing in the rear yard and relate it to the existing building.
4. Restudy the tall fence between the parking area and the building.
5. Refine the landscape plan to show existing planting and any proposed changes.
6. Provide a design solution for pedestrian wayfinding to the side door entrance.
7. At least three board members thought the proposed colors required restudy.

Action: Moore/Six, 4/0/0. (Tripp and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 1616 SAN PASCUAL ST

R-M Zone

(6:35)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-223-014
 Application Number: MST2018-00598
 Owner: Michael Francis Madden Living Trust
 Applicant: Blair Weymouth

(Proposal for a new multi-unit residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program. Project consists of the demolition of a 222 square foot garage and the construction of a two-story duplex addition to an existing 786 square foot single unit residence. Unit mix will consist of two, two-bedroom units and one studio unit ranging in size from 537 to 786 square feet, with an average unit size of 685 square feet. Proposed density for this 5,900 square foot parcel is 22 dwelling units per acre, on a site with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are three parking spaces: a two car garage, and an uncovered parking space.)

(First Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Prior to action project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis as well as the following Guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines.)

Actual time: 9:43 p.m.

Present: Blair Weymouth, Lead Designer/Applicant; and Y.S. Kim, Agent

Public comment opened at 9:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Study the second floor window facing San Andres Street to match existing windows.

2. Show all elevations, especially the south elevation, on the plans.
3. Show a completely developed site plan with landscaping and hardscape.
4. Consult with Building and Safety staff for correct pedestrian access.
5. Provide exterior lighting and materials on the plans and elevations.
6. On plan Sheet A-3, Section A, show the roof over the portion of the building that projects over the garage portion of the setback.
7. Study privacy impacts to adjacent neighbors; provide building footprints, functions, window locations, etc.
8. Provide additional large canopy trees, and a designated street tree verified with the City Arborist.

Action: Wittausch/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Tripp and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 10:20 P.M. ***