



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
NOVEMBER 19, 2018

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Chair*
Kevin Moore, *Vice Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Richard Six
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Tripp.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Tripp, Moore ((until 5:10 p.m.), Cunningham (absent 4:20-5:15 p.m.), Six, Watkins (until 6:30 p.m.), and Wittausch (at 4:30 p.m.)
Members absent: None
Staff present: Cameron and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Anna Marie Gott addressed the Board regarding issues of Substantial Conformance, staff and board purviews for discretionary findings, and consistency issues with the City Charter of Santa Barbara.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **November 5, 2018**, as amended.
Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 12, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members Moore and Cunningham with a change to Item E, 22 Anacapa St.
Action: Cunningham/Moore, 4/0/1. (Six abstained from Item A, 920 Summit Road due to conflict of interest. Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 19, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Member Moore and Board Member Cunningham.
 Action: Six/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:
 - a. Board Member Wittausch will be late to the meeting.
 - b. Vice Chair Moore will be stepping down from Item 2, 401 Orilla Del Mar, and then leaving the meeting at 5:00 p.m.
 - c. Board Member Watkins will be leaving the meeting at 6:30 p.m.
2. Board Member Cunningham announced that he would be stepping down from Item 4, 813 E. Carrillo St.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1. 520 ANACAPA ST

M-C Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-201-023
Application Number:	MST2017-00120
Owner:	Louis and Leonila Sanchez
Agent:	Trish Allen, SEPPS
Architect:	Tom Ochsner
Landscape Architect:	Julio Veyna

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a mixed-use project. Project proposes a lot merger of five parcels (APNs 031-201-022, -023, -024, -026, -017); the adaptive re-use of an existing 6,392 square foot mixed-use building, containing a residential unit, and an existing 4,548 square foot commercial building; demolition of three commercial buildings totaling 4,758 square feet; and the construction of a new 12,001 square foot, 7-unit apartment structure. Total units on site will be 8 two-bedroom units ranging in size from 800 to 1,512 square feet. Also proposed are 16 uncovered parking spaces and 12 covered parking spaces, and roof mounted photovoltaic paneling.)

(Third Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Prior to action project requires compliance with Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on September 10, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Agent; Liz Hughes, Architect; and Julio Veyna; Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the proposed metal awning/canopy? 1/4 Failed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support having the applicant restudy the open space between the buildings? 2/3 Failed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely Full Board with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the changes made to the project so far, especially to the site plan and to the architecture.
2. The Board supports the size of the playground and the relative size of the dining areas.
3. Restudy reducing the mass of the metal canopy to be more in keeping with a Hispanic style of architecture.
4. Restudy the eave of the southeast corner of the building at 520 Anacapa Street to help break-up the boxy appearance, reduce the overall mass at the third level, and provide less symmetry to the east side of the building.
5. Provide articulation on the parapet of the balcony walls of the west elevation, and provide a cap or molding to provide more interest to the building at 520 Anacapa Street.
6. The Board repeats its request that the applicant provide more pedestrian circulation back to the park.
7. Restudy the stretched French arches throughout the project.
8. Provide more interest to the blank wall on the west elevation of the building at 518 Anacapa Street.
9. Provide a harmonious color blend of the proposed crepe myrtle and jacaranda trees throughout the project.
10. Provide landscaping at the east elevation of the building at 520 Anacapa Street.
11. Provide more contrast in the vehicular and pedestrian paver colors.
12. Study reducing the overall massing of the building at 520 Anacapa Street by changing the size and glazing at the east elevation.
13. Study and provide more detailing of the elevator tower on the west elevation of the building at 520 Anacapa Street; removal of the venting will be at the Applicant's discretion.
14. Restudy the proportions of the mirador element, through either a reduction in width and/or vertical elongation, to highlight and give it more focus.

Action: Six/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 401 ORILLA DEL MAR DR****R-4/SD-3 Zone****(3:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-321-016
 Application Number: MST2018-00147
 Owner: Ray Fazendin
 Applicant: Michelle McToldridge

(Proposal for the redevelopment of an existing residential duplex in the Coastal Zone. Project consists of the demolition of the majority of the existing 1,094 square foot, single story duplex, and the construction of 2,667 square foot, three story duplex. Also proposed are site work, landscaping, and four on-site parking spaces. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires review by Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on July 30, 2018.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Moore recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 4:20 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect; Michelle McToldridge, Applicant; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. David Thomas, adjacent neighbor, spoke of concerns regarding the proposed third story height of the proposed project which already sits at a higher elevation, and the odd design style which lacks neighborhood compatibility.
2. Tim Warner, neighbor, spoke of concerns regarding the lack of solar access, the garage, the proposed third story height as the finished floor adds to the proposed height of the project, and the current FAR calculations do not fit in the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 4:55 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. The Board carried forward the previous July 30, 2018 comments, as follows:
 - a. The Board appreciates the quality of the proposed design.
 - b. The Board cannot support the third story as currently proposed (as an enclosed habitable space).
2. Study substituting the proposed third story element with an alternative non-habitable outdoor space or similar design element.
3. Refine the details and character elements.
4. Provide a more Spanish style railing in lieu of the wire mesh.
5. Study incorporating garage doors to the east elevation.

Action: Tripp/Six, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:10 TO 5:15 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW**3. 711 N MILPAS ST****C-G Zone**

<u>(4:30)</u>	Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-121-014
	Application Number:	MST2015-00561
	Owner:	711 N Milpas, LLC
	Agent:	Alan Bleeker, Agent for Owner
	Applicant/Architect:	RRM Design Group
	Contractor:	Scott Schell
	Landscape Architect:	Rachel Arriaga

(Proposal for a new mixed-used development to be developed under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). Project includes a lot merger between eight lots (APNs 031-184-011, -014, -016, -017, -019, -021, -022, and -024) for a total project site of 66,199 square feet. Two existing residential units and commercial buildings totaling 33,000 square feet will be demolished, and a new 57,721 square foot mixed-use building will be constructed containing a total of 2,874 square feet of non-residential floor area and 76 residential units. Unit mix will consist of 44 2-bedroom, and 32 1-bedroom units ranging in size from 575 to 805 square feet with an average unit size of 684 square feet. The proposed density for this project is 50 dwelling units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay which allows for 37-63 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are 89 parking spaces and 80 bicycle parking spaces. Project received Staff Hearing Officer approval for a front setback modification on May 27, 2016. A Level 2 Substantial Conformance Determination for a reduction in commercial floor area has been granted, which brought the project in compliance with City parking requirements.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with the following Guidelines: Infill Design Guidelines, Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on November 5, 2018.)

Actual time: 5:15 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Tony Tomasello, and Hal Hart, RRM Design Group; Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:45 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Steve Dowty (President, Pearl Chase Society) spoke of concerns regarding the lack of neighborhood compatibility for the proposed mass, bulk, and scale, and proposed architecture.
2. Natalia Govoni spoke of concerns regarding the proposed height of the project, design style, and lack of compatibility with the east side neighborhood, Municipal Code, and City Charter of Santa Barbara.
3. Fred Sweeney spoke of concerns regarding how the project "touches the ground" (i.e., design style from a pedestrian perspective), and fits with the streetscape and cultural neighborhood of the Milpas Street corridor, the lack of neighborhood compatibility, and details of the project. Jana Garcia ceded their time to Mr. Sweeney.
4. Christine Neuhauser read a statement by Leslie Colasse of concerns regarding lighting for the upper trellis, details, and the lack of neighborhood compatibility of the proposed project. Betsy Kramer ceded her time to Ms. Neuhauser.
5. Anna Marie Gott requested denial of the project, and spoke of concerns regarding issues of

project irregularities with the City Charter, parking, vehicular access, Substantial Conformance Determination issues, and the lack of neighborhood compatibility with the Milpas Street neighborhood. Don Sharpe, Chris Barrows, Matthew Kelly, Victor Arias, James Farned, and Mr. Vicenti ceded their time to Ms. Gott.

6. Steve Amerikaner spoke on the applicant's behalf requesting the Board to focus on the current project details for approval and not to review past issues.
7. Correspondence from Sue Burk, Larry Anderson, Anna Marie Gott, Santos Guzman, Brent Richard, Ann Hefferman, Victoria Valente, Sebastian Aldana Jr., Paulina Conn, Pamela Boehr, Steve Hoegerman, and Fred Sweeney were acknowledged and/or read into the record.

Public comment closed at 6:15 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval and continued to Consent with minor conditional details.

Action: Six/_____, Motion failed due to lack of second.

Motion: Denial of Final Approval on the project with comments:

1. The Board finds the details at the base, windows, awnings, balconies and parapets, corners, and transition materials do not reflect the character or human scale of the immediate community, nor capture the uniqueness of the Milpas Street area.
2. The project as a whole does not reflect the rhythm or quality of adjacent structures.
3. The Board finds the detailed concerns from the prior meeting regarding the north building have not been adequately met or resolved.
4. The Board finds the mechanical units as proposed on the balconies at all levels and conditions are not appropriate as proposed within the public view.
5. The Board finds this project does not substantially conform to the plans granting Project Design Approval.

Action: Watkins/Cunningham, 3/2/0. (Tripp and Six opposed. Moore absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**4. 813 E CARRILLO ST****R-M Zone****(6:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-251-016
Application Number: MST2015-00602
Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a project under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project includes the demolition of an existing 1,428 square foot 2-story house and construction of 16 affordable studio units in three 2- and 3-story buildings totaling 5,112 square feet. The units will be restricted to war veterans. Also proposed is a 2- and 3-story, 589 square foot community center, 387 square foot, 2-story manager's unit with attached 1-car carport, a 234 square foot manager's office, 89 square foot laundry facility, and trash enclosure. Seventeen parking spaces are required, with eight proposed. The average unit size is 357 square feet and the proposed residential density is 49 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 27 dwelling units per acre allowed on this 15,005 square foot parcel. The General Plan Land Use Designation is Medium High Density Residential, allowing 15-27 dwelling units per acre.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with the following guidelines: Infill Design Guidelines, Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on April 10, 2017.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item.

Item postponed to the December 3rd, 2018 agenda due to loss of quorum.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 1108 OLIVE ST****R-M Zone****(6:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-180-012
Application Number: MST2018-00476
Owner: Andre Schneider
Applicant: Bryan Pollard

(Proposal for a four-unit residential project to be developed using the Average Unit Size Density (AUD) Program. Project consists of the demolition of all structures on site, and the construction of two, two-story duplexes. Unit mix will include three, 2-bedroom and one studio apartments ranging in size from 315 to 1,128 square feet with an average unit size of 877 square feet. The proposed density on this 7,250 square foot lot is 25 dwelling units per acre, on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are four covered parking spaces and changes to the on-site landscaping.)

(Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Prior to action project requires compliance with Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on October 8, 2018.)

Item postponed to the December 3rd, 2018 agenda due to loss of quorum.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**6. 614 E HALEY ST****M-C Zone**

(7:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-293-004
Application Number: MST2018-00589
Business Name: The Factory SB, Inc.
Owner: Justine Roddick
Applicant: Karen Blakeman
Architect: Karl Kras

(Proposal to renovate an existing non-residential structure. Project consists of a new outdoor patio to the rear of the site, a new trash enclosure, improvements to the existing open shed, new site entrance, new fencing, new windows and awnings, and a change in paint colors. Project also proposes a parking lot restripe which requires a waiver for Alternative Parking Lot Design.)

(No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following Guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Haley/Milpas Design Manual, Outdoor Lighting Design Manual.)

Item postponed to the December 3rd, 2018 agenda due to loss of quorum.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**7. 1250 COAST VILLAGE RD****C-1/SD-3 Zone**

(7:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-230-037
Application Number: MST2018-00581
Owner: FM Properties
Architect: The Warner Group Architects

(Proposal for cosmetic changes to an existing commercial building in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The exterior alterations comprise replacement of Saltillo tile walkways with brick pavers, replacement of roof tiles on tower elements with standing seam metal roofs, replaced lighting, minor accessibility improvements, and new landscaping.)

Item postponed to December 3, 2018.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:13 P.M. ***