



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
NOVEMBER 5, 2018

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Chair*
Kevin Moore, *Vice Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Richard Six
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Kathleen Goo, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Tripp.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Tripp, Moore, Cunningham (absent from 7:03 to 8:16 p.m.), Six, Watkins (at 3:09 p.m., until 7:02 p.m.), and Wittausch

Members absent: None

Staff present: Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney (until 7:03 p.m.), Unzueta (until 7:03 p.m.), Cameron, and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Anna Marie Gott addressed the Board regarding specific Brown Act issues for proper noticing, agendas, and minutes for projects scheduled for design reviewed by the Board.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **October 22, 2018**, as submitted.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Watkins Absent) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 29, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Members Cunningham and Moore.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 5, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Member Cunningham and Board Member Watkins.

Action: Watkins/Cunningham, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:

- a. Board Member Watkins will be leaving the meeting after Item 1, 711 N. Milpas St.
- b. Board Member Moore has recused himself from review of Agenda Item 4, 22 Anacapa St. and Item 6, 401 Orilla Del Mar Dr.
- c. Board Member Cunningham has recused himself from review of Agenda Item 2, 501 Niños Dr.
- d. Story poles for 101 S. Canada Street have been posted and are available for viewing until Wednesday, November 7, 2018; the Board is encourage to visit the site/story poles as it will assist in future ABR reviews.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 711 N MILPAS ST

C-G Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-121-014
 Application Number: MST2015-00561
 Owner: 711 N Milpas, LLC
 Agent: Alan Bleeker, Agent for Owner
 Applicant/Architect: RRM Design Group
 Contractor: Scott Schell
 Landscape Architect: Rachel Arriaga

(Proposal for a new mixed-used development to be developed under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). Project includes a lot merger between eight lots (APNs 031-184-011, -014, -016, -017, -019, -021, -022, and -024) for a total project site of 66,199 square feet. Two existing residential units and commercial buildings totaling 33,000 square feet will be demolished, and a new 57,721 square foot mixed-use building will be constructed containing a total of 2,874 square feet of non-residential floor area and 76 residential units. Unit mix will consist of 44 2-bedroom, and 32 1-bedroom units ranging in size from 575 to 805 square feet with an average unit size of 684 square feet. The proposed density for this project is 50 dwelling units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay which allows for 37-63 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are 89 parking spaces and 80 bicycle parking spaces. Project received Staff Hearing officer approval for a front setback modification on May 27, 2016. A Level 2 Substantial Conformance Determination for a reduction in commercial floor area has been granted, which brought the project in compliance with City parking requirements.)

(A. Overview of the history and status of the 711 North Milpas Street mixed-use project. Discussion will include a presentation from staff on the history of approvals and review for the 76-unit Average Unit-Size Density Program project, as well as clarification on process and purview for the ABR.)

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Allison De Busk, Project Planner and Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney

Staff comments: Ms. Ostrenger provided a brief synopsis on the history of the proposed project, the current review before the Board, and the Board's purview regarding the proposed project. She also clarified that following the required procedures, the present decision before the current Board is whether the Substantial Conformance Determination criteria have been met regarding the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Anna Marie Gott spoke of concerns regarding discretionary approvals by the Board versus administrative staff approval on projects, Board trainings and updates for discretionary reviews, inconsistencies within the ABR Guidelines, and project history and noticing issues. She requested that the Board receive additional written information on the proposed project before making discretionary findings on the project. Catherine Vincente, Mo Mason, Jim Fared, and Patricia Ann Huckaby ceded their time to Ms. Gott.
2. Natasha Todorovic spoke of confusion regarding the discretionary approvals by the Board versus administrative staff approval on projects, and substantial conformance determinations made by the Community Development Director. She stated that such important decision that impact the quality of life for neighbors in project neighborhoods should be more transparent in the design review process. Natalia Govoni ceded her time to Ms. Todorovic.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Presentation made and discussion held.

(B. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Conditions of Approval outlined in the memo from City staff dated September 24, 2018. Project was last reviewed on September 24, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:53 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, RRM Design Group; Rachel Arriaga, Landscape Architect; Alan Bleeker, Co-Owner; Allison De Busk, Project Planner; and Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney

Staff comments: Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney provided information and direction to the Board.

Public comment opened at 4:37 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Alan Bleeker, Co-Owner spoke about the need for similar AUD projects in the City of Santa Barbara.
2. Correspondence in support from Ginger Markovitz was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Leslie Colace spoke of concerns regarding heights and dimensions of the project, proposed illumination details, and the lack of neighborhood compatibility. Jose Arturo Gallegas ceded his time to Ms. Colace.
2. Sheila Lodge, Planning Commissioner, spoke of concerns regarding the size of the proposed project and lack of neighborhood compatibility.
3. Rick Clauson spoke of concerns regarding the size of the proposed project and lack of neighborhood compatibility. Kathy Clauson ceded her time to her husband.
4. John Cooley spoke of the nice design of the proposed project, but expressed concerns that the size of the proposed project did not fit into the neighborhood.
5. Anna Marie Gott spoke of concerns against taking any action of approval on the project at this time, the history of the project, substantial conformance, timelines, AUDs, Brown Act compliance, and the lack of neighborhood compatibility. Anita A. Leski, Mo Mason, Catherine Vincenti, Patricia Anne Huckaby, Jim Farned ceded their time to Ms. Gott. Written correspondence was also received from Ms. Gott.
6. Christine Neuhauser spoke of concerns regarding the modern design and lack of neighborhood compatibility, intent of AUD projects; and out of proportion of mass, bulk, and scale.
7. Natasha Todorovic spoke of concerns regarding the lack of neighborhood compatibility. Natalia Govoni ceded her time to Ms. Todorovic
8. Matt Kelly spoke of concerns regarding mass, size, scope, and scale; lack of setback; and lack of neighborhood compatibility; and general preservation of the look of Santa Barbara.
9. Jana Garcia spoke of concerns regarding the large oversized project located directly across from her home and the lack of neighborhood compatibility.
10. Correspondence from Ann Hefferman, Paulina Conn, Jim Farned, Sasha Kapernekas, Kathy Khoury, Kellam de Forest, Herman Pfauter, Sebastian Aldana Jr., Pamela Boehr, Steve Nagelmann, Francesca Galt were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:16 p.m.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:16 TO 5:22 P.M. ***

Straw vote: How many Board Members find the northwest corner sufficiently different? 1/5 Passed

Straw vote: How many Board Members would like to see more color differentiation? 5/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support removing the channels from below the balcony railings, as shown as Detail 1-705, and replace them with flat sheet metal and a hemmed drip edge to support the railing from the walls? 3/3 Failed.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the changes that have been made so far on the proposed project.
2. Provide additional details, including the detailing at the balcony guardrail and the transition between the banding and the plaster.
3. Restudy the trellis on the roof.
4. Study pulling the trellis and the balconies below back so that there is more distance from the street.

5. Update the landscape plan to be more coordinated with the site plan to show the area for the seating outside the commercial area.
6. Show on the plans the fence along the Junior High School area, and call-out the plantings to either remain or be replanted to match existing and to create a buffer zone.
7. Provide a lighting plan showing all lighting on the exterior of the building, including the integration of any trellis lighting.
8. Provide the plaster parapet details with same edge corner detail.
9. Provide details at the tile sill and the tile details within the recesses on the north corner of the building.
10. Continue the brick veneer the full depth of the entry to prevent a visible transition to plaster.
11. Restudy the foam banding above the brick, and utilize the brick to be the transition piece between the plaster and the brick.
12. Provide all the awning callouts on the plans as the "fabric awnings".
13. Revise the architectural louver awning to be more cohesive with the steel canopy and trellis details.
14. Provide more shade trees in the parking; and provide more evergreens at the north, south, and west property lines.
15. Restudy providing taller evergreen landscaping on the northern edge of the property.
16. Provide a different color to the proposed white plaster; and provide color sample alternative options.

Action: Tripp/Cunningham, 4/2/0. (Six and Watkins opposed.) Motion carried.

Individual comment: Board Member Six did not support the motion as the motion did not include or address his concerns regarding the northwest corner of the building.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 7:03 TO 7:33 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

2. 501 NINOS DR

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(5:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	017-362-005
Application Number:	MST2018-00494
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Applicant:	George Thomson

(Proposal for renovation and alterations to Dwight Murphy Field, including conversion of an existing grass soccer field to artificial turf with new fencing and lighting, replacement of existing buildings with restrooms at a new location, and accessible pathways. Additional new amenities include a fitness area, youth baseball field, picnic areas, and a universally accessible playground. The project will also involve the conversion of Park Road to primarily one-way circulation with angled parking, and redesigned park entries. Planning Commission review is required for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(First Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires further environmental assessment and Planning Commission review.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Moore recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 7:34 p.m.

Present: George Thomson, Applicant, Parks Capitol Projects Supervisor, Parks & Recreation Division, City of Santa Barbara; and Jeff Ferber, Architect, RRM Design Group

Public comment opened at 7:45 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Steve Hausz spoke of concerns regarding the use of synthetic and artificial turf due to non-decomposed organisms and warmer climate surface effects caused by synthetic and artificial turf; whereas real grass is aesthetically attractive, decomposes organisms and provides natural cooling climate effects.
2. Jerg Jergenson queried the location of the public restrooms and windows.

Public comment closed at 7:50 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the use of synthetic turf for this project?
1/3 Failed

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board generally supports the renovation of the park and accessible playground for children and families to use.
2. Restudy the proposed lighting and field locations of proposed lighting.
3. Study to provide canopy shade trees along the soccer field, and study creating more space along the side of the playing fields to provide team and spectator seating.
4. Study to provide wheel stops and/or planters within the parking lot in order to deter the public from driving the wrong direction at the end of the intersection of Niños and Por La Mar.
5. Study providing real turf instead of artificial synthetic turf for the soccer field.
6. Study providing curb stops at the diagonal parking at Niños Drive and to provide additional landscape planting.
7. Study providing an alternative transportation (bus transit) pick-up/drop-off location.

Action: Tripp/Six, 4/0/0. (Moore and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**3. 510 E ORTEGA ST****M-C Zone****(5:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-171-002
Application Number:	MST2015-00530
Owner:	Tom and Monica Curry
Applicant:	Bildsten Architecture and Planning
Architect:	Erica Obertelli

(Proposal to demolish an existing 816 square foot single-family residence and detached garage and construct a three story five-unit apartment building under the Average Unit Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The project will consist of two studio units, two two-bedroom units, and one three-bedroom unit, all totaling 4,807 square feet, with an average unit size of 961 square feet. A total of five covered parking spaces will be provided in a ground level garage. All existing trees will be removed including a 30' tall Jacaranda in the front yard and six 8' to 12' fruit trees in the rear yard. No grading is proposed. The 5,000 square foot parcel is designated medium-high density, and is within the priority housing overlay area with a maximum average unit size of 970 square feet. This project addresses violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00421 and Enforcement Case ENF2014-00954.)

(Review After Final of a new pedestrian walkway where the building originally had no setback, and changes to the windows and garage. Project was last reviewed on December 19, 2016.)

Actual time: 8:16 p.m.

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; and Ken Vermillion, Project Manager, Bildsten Architecture and Planning

Public comment opened at 8:21 p.m.

Jerg B. Jergenson commented on the privacy impacts and loss of his private mountain views, that the area is zoned for commercial and manufacturing, and requested the window locations be restudied to lessen privacy impacts to his property.

Public comment closed at 8:23 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: Wittausch/Moore, 4/0/0. (Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 22 ANACAPA ST****OC/SD-3 Zone**

(6:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-113-008
 Application Number: MST2018-00412
 Owner: Art Center, LLC
 Applicant: Saba Zahedi

(Proposal for tenant improvements to a commercial building located in the Funk Zone. The project includes a new canopy, decorative metal and tempered glass fencing, wood counters, firepit, painting exterior walls and doors, replacing exterior fencing and patio as required to install ADA parking, and the addition of a new shade trellis. Project includes alterations to existing murals as well as proposals for new murals.)

(First Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires further Environmental Assessment. Project was postponed on October 8, 2018.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Moore recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 8:40 p.m.

Present: Saba Zahedi, Applicant; and Adam Griffin, Anacapa Architecture

Public comment opened at 8:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue one week to Consent with comments:

1. The Board generally supports project.
2. Provide details on the window proposed to act as a screen wall.
3. Provide undercarriage details of the ramp stairs on the open side.
4. Provide a sample and/or cut-sheet of the proposed lighting and details.
5. Provide a tree in the parkway.

Action: Wittausch/Cunningham, 4/0/0. (Moore and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 520 ANACAPA ST****M-C Zone**

(7:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-023
 Application Number: MST2017-00120
 Owner: Louis and Leonila Sanchez
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Architect: Tom Ochsner
 Landscape Architect: Julio Veyna

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a mixed-use project. Project proposes a lot merger of five parcels (APNs 031-201-022, -023, -024, -026, -017); the adaptive re-use of an existing 6,392 square foot mixed-use building, containing a residential unit, and an existing 4,548 square foot commercial building; demolition of three commercial buildings totaling 4,758 square feet; and the construction of a new 12,001 square foot, 7-unit apartment structure. Total units on site will be 8, two-bedroom units ranging in size from 800 to 1,512 square feet. Also proposed are 16 uncovered parking spaces and 12 covered parking spaces, and roof mounted photovoltaic paneling.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires further Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on September 10, 2018.)

Item postponed two weeks at the Board's discretion.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**6. 401 ORILLA DEL MAR DR****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

(7:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-321-016
 Application Number: MST2018-00147
 Owner: Ray Fazendin
 Applicant: Michelle McToldridge

(Proposal for the redevelopment of an existing residential duplex in the Coastal Zone. Project consists of the demolition of the majority of the existing 1,094 square foot, single story duplex, and the construction of 2,667 square foot, three story duplex. Also proposed are site work, landscaping, and four on-site parking spaces. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing officer for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on July 30, 2018.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Moore recused himself from hearing this item.

Item postponed two weeks at the Board's discretion.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:04 P.M. ***