



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
FEBRUARY 26, 2018

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Kevin Moore
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Vice Chair Tripp.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Tripp, Cunningham (absent 4:26-6:58 p.m.), Moore, Watkins (from 3:10-7:55 p.m.), and Wittausch
Members absent: Gradin
Staff present: Unzueta (from 6:58-7:55 p.m.), Cameron, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

1. Rick Closson read a couple of mixed metaphors to the Board and expressed that though he may not agree with every decision the ABR makes, he applauds the collective energy and the individual investments that each Board Member makes. He encouraged other members of the public to come before the Board to speak.
2. Anna Marie Gott discussed a project at 402 Anacapa Street, MST2016-00514, that was approved on December 5, 2016 and explained why the Board should bring the project back for reconsideration and consider denying the project. Ms. Gott also submitted written correspondence for the Board to review. Victor Reyes, Jose Arturo Gallegos, and Christine Gallery ceded their time to Ms. Gott.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **February 12, 2018**, as submitted.

Action: Wittausch/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 20, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Member Cunningham.

Action: Cunningham/Moore, 5/0/0. (Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 26, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Member Moore.

Action: Moore/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:

a. Chair Gradin is absent from today's meeting.

b. Item 5, 402 Anacapa Street, was noticed correctly, stating there is a waiver requested for an alternative landscape design for the parking area; however, that language was not included in the agenda description. Though the agenda description did not include the waiver language, the applicant is still asking for an alternative landscape design waiver.

c. Board Member Watkins will step down from Item 6, 8 S. Milpas Street.

d. Board Member Cunningham will step down from Item 3, 926 Indio Muerto Street and Item 4, 1062 Coast Village Road.

e. Today will be Ms. Vaughn's last meeting as the ABR secretary, as she will be cross training as the Planning Commission secretary.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW**1. 1220 & 1222 SAN ANDRES ST****R-M Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-151-010
 Application Number: MST2016-00211
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Applicant: Interdisciplinary Architects
 Architect: Interdisciplinary Architects

(Proposal for a multifamily residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD) and a voluntary lot merger of the parcels at 1220 and 1222 San Andres Street (APNS 039-151-010 and -011). The proposal includes the demolition of an existing duplex and three single-family dwellings totaling 4,831 square feet, and construction of seven new buildings comprising five duplexes and two single-family dwellings, for a total of 12 new dwelling units. Six buildings will have two stories and one building will have three stories. The unit mix will include five 3-bedroom units, six 2-bedroom units, and one 1-bedroom unit, ranging in size from 673 to 1,184 square feet with an average unit size of 996 square feet. The proposed density on this 29,291 square foot merged parcel will be 18 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be fourteen uncovered and three covered parking spaces, for a total of 17 spaces, and 12 covered and secured bicycle parking spaces. Grading excavation and fill of 1,196 cubic yards will be balanced on site. Also proposed is the removal of nine trees. Total development on site will be 13,313 square feet. This project will address zoning violations identified in Zoning Information Reports ZIR2016-00211 and ZIR2015-00389 and Enforcement cases ENF2014-000621, ENF2015-00771, and ENF2016-00718.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires conditions for the Average Unit-Size Density Program annual resident survey. Project was last reviewed on January 29, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:20 p.m.

Present: Tim Gorter, Architect; and Shelby Messner, Planner

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue one week to Consent with comments:

1. On sheet A9.01, details 2 and 3, add the scalloped edge to the rake and eave detail.
2. Extend the tile past the plaster two inches.
3. On sheet A9.01, detail 1, extend the wood blocking down past the tile.
4. Add the typical wood corbels detail at the porch at building F and above the garage.
5. On sheet A9.01, detail 12, add plywood sheeting to the window head and sill.
6. Lower the awning at building E.
7. Update the elevations to show the rake details under each roof tile.

Action: Tripp/Cunningham, 4/1/0. (Watkins opposed. Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 707 KIMBALL AVE****M-1/SD-3 Zone**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-161-006
 Application Number: MST2017-00052
 Owner: Nopal Investment Company, LLC
 Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects

(Proposal for a new commercial addition. Project is comprised a voluntary lot merger of two parcels (APNs 017-161-006 017-161-005), the demolition of two single-family residences, and the construction of a 3,000 square foot two-story addition to an existing 3,325 square foot industrial building. Also proposed are four new parking spaces. The two existing single family dwellings will be demolished under separate permit. Approval for a Coastal Development Permit was granted by the Staff Hearing Officer on January 17, 2018.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project must comply with Staff Hearing officer Resolution 003-18. Project was last reviewed on November 20, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:53 p.m.

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect, Edwards Pitman Architects; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Brodison stated that on January 17, 2018, the Staff Hearing Officer approved the Coastal Development Permit for the new building and the Development Plan to allow the new construction, and if the Board finds the project ready, it may take action today.

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue one week to Consent with comments:

1. Consider placing a small tree near the building in the center planter to create a visual vertical element to the building while not impeding on the circulation of trucks in the parking lot.
2. Provide an irrigation plan.
3. Make sure all the existing planting appears on the proposed landscape plan.
4. The site walls should be painted to match the existing building.
5. Restudy the lighting and consider providing an option that is more industrial and matches the aesthetic of the building.

Action: Tripp/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 926 INDIO MUERTO ST****C-2/SD-3 Zone**

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-284-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00415
 Owner: IWF SB Gateway, LP
 Applicant: John Cuykendall
 Architect: David Thiel

(Proposal to demolish an existing 12,000 square foot commercial building and construct an approximately 55,000 square foot, 45'-0" tall hotel on a 38,122 square foot parcel. The project will comprise a three-story hotel with 111 rooms and a 115 space, semi-subterranean parking lot with supportive amenities. Planning Commission approval was granted on May 18, 2017 for Development Plan Approval, a Coastal Development Permit, and a Transfer of Existing Development Rights.)

(Comments Only. Project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination and must comply with Planning Commission Resolution 010-17. Project was last reviewed on December 4, 2017.)

RECUSAL: Board Member Cunningham stepped down from the hearing of this item.

Actual time: 4:26 p.m.

Present: David Thiel, Architect, AGI; Ken Marshall, Dudek; Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Brodison stated that the project went before the Planning Commission on May 18, 2017 and a Development Plan Approval, Coastal Development Permit, and Transfer of Existing Development Rights was approved. Subsequently, Citizens for Livable Neighborhoods appealed the project to the City Council; however, they withdrew their appeal with the stipulation that the applicant remove six hotel rooms from the fourth floor to reduce the size of the building and revise the style of the architecture to be Spanish-themed, which is more in keeping with the overall style of Santa Barbara. The applicant agreed and is before the ABR today to review the updated plans.

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m.

Natalia Govoni, Citizens for Livable Neighborhoods, spoke in support of the project and explained that over the course of its development, the project has evolved to become a more refined structure in keeping with the Santa Barbara style, and that the applicant has worked with the neighbors, reduced massing, and shifted the design to maintain mountain views.

Public comment closed at 4:50 p.m.

Motion: **Continue to the March 26, 2018 Full Board agenda with comments:**

1. The Board is appreciative of the changes that have been made, the direction the project is going, and all the research that has been done.
2. The Historic Landmarks Commission Landscape Architect shall review the landscape plan and provide the ABR with comments before the next review.

3. Look for more moments where the design can be varied.
4. On the Indio Muerto elevation, study the roofline to the left of the pedestrian entrance tower and look for ways to implement some variation.
5. Study the distance from the top of the balcony arches to the cornice and consider ways to implement more spacing between them.
6. Study the corner and enclosed balconies and look for areas to add more detailing and release between the covered balconies and the arch below.
7. Restudy the proposed black color for the awnings.
8. Study adding additional detailing below the wrought iron railings.
9. Study the size of the mechanical equipment that will be placed on the roof top in comparison to the parapet and make sure it will not be visible from the street or the vehicular view from the 101 Freeway; implement some screening if necessary.

Action: Tripp/Wittausch, 4/0/0. (Cunningham and Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 1062 COAST VILLAGE RD

C-1/SD-3 Zone

(5:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	009-211-014
Application Number:	MST2016-00451
Owner:	David Back Revocable Trust
Architect:	The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(The project proposes to demolish a 10,872 square-foot 14-unit apartment building, carport, hardscape and ten mature pine trees, and construct a new 22,312 square foot, three story mixed use development. The new development would include nine two-bedroom condominium units, 989 net new square feet of commercial, and a subterranean garage with 24 vehicular parking spaces. The project will require design review by the Architectural Board of Review and review by the Planning Commission for the Tentative Subdivision Map for condominiums, Coastal Development Permit, and Modification to provide a portion of the common yard not at grade. Per a 2010 Memorandum of Understanding with Santa Barbara County, all projects on Coast Village Road also require a courtesy review by the Montecito Planning Commission. This review is required prior to Planning Commission review.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Planning Commission Review. Item was last heard on July 3, 2017.)

RECUSAL: Board Member Cunningham stepped down from the hearing of this item.

Actual time: 5:26 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective; Martha Degasis, Arcadia Studio, Landscape Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kennedy stated that the project is currently going through a 30-day Development Application Review Team review and there are three modifications being requested, which will need to be reviewed by the Board. She also advised that the project has received comments from the Montecito Planning Commission, Montecito Board of Architectural Review, Montecito Association, and the Coast Village Road Merchants Association. Ms.

Kennedy summarized the comments received by the Montecito review boards and stated that copies of the comments will be provided to the ABR for the next review.

Public comment opened at 5:50 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Timothy Hording had questions regarding privacy trees and visibility from the project's roof decks down to his property.
2. Correspondence from Sascha Liebowitz and Mike Taigman, and Paul and Julie Craig in opposition was acknowledge.

Public comment closed at 5:56 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the interior modification with the condition that the corridor be a minimum of 12 feet wide? 3/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the modification request along the east property line as proposed? 4/0 Passed

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission for return to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board supports the interior modification if the smallest width in the paseo is 12 feet wide.
2. Overall the Board finds the architectural style appropriate.
3. The Board is appreciative of the applicant moving the buildings further away for the north property line and retaining the large trees along that area.
4. Looking at unit 1, the Board suggest studying the proximity of the building to the property line and study the openings to make sure they are feasible.
5. On the second floor of units 7 and 5, study the large windows and their relationship to their neighbors in regards to privacy.
6. Continue the dialogue with the neighbors and share any updates of the design.
7. The Historic Landmarks Commission Landscape Architect should review the design and provide feedback.
8. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been satisfied (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The proposal complies with the City Charter and Municipal Code and is consistent with design guidelines.
 - b. The proposal is compatible with the architectural character of the City and neighborhood, including the style, character, color, materials, and detailing.
 - c. The proposal is appropriate in size, mass, bulk, height, and scale, including the 11 foot floor to floor height, in this instance, because the height is pulled back from the street and not perceived as a high building from the street view.
 - d. The proposal is not near any historic resources.
 - e. The preservation of established scenic public views is not applicable as there are none in proximity to the project.
 - f. The proposal includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping, particularly because the buildings have been moved away from the north and east property line to preserve trees and allow for additional planting.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 3/1/0. (Watkins opposed. Cunningham and Gradin absent.)
Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:35 TO 6:58 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 402 ANACAPA ST

M-C Zone

(6:35)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-271-016
Application Number: MST2018-00005
Owner: Inga Frick

(Proposal to convert an existing residential unit to a three guestroom short-term rental. Two of the guest rooms will have kitchens. Existing development on the site consists of a two-story, 1,508 square foot, and two-bedroom single residential unit with two uncovered parking spaces. Minor exterior alterations include relocating an existing driveway gate. A previous project for the site was approved on December 5, 2016 under the Master Application number MST2016-00514 which proposed to convert the residential unit to one, two-guestroom short term rental. The project requires Development Plan Approval findings for conversion of residential floor area into commercial use.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings for new commercial floor space. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan.)

Actual time: 6:58 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Susan Elledge Planning and Permitting; Dwight Gregory, Architect; Inga Frick, Owner; and Irma Unzueta, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Unzueta stated that per the City Attorney's office, in an effort to not violate the Brown Act, the Board should not discuss previous projects proposed at this location and should focus the discussion on the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 7:12 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Mary Ellen Tiffany expressed that she sent in a letter to the ABR secretary and is in support of the project.
2. Correspondence from Carlo Sarmiento, Robin Donaldson, Bill Brace, Ivan Marquez, Fess Aldanas, Egis Maskoliunas, Adam Phillips, Dean and Michael Vanece, and Michael Casey was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Anna Marie Gott explained how the Full Board, not Consent, is required to make a projects Development Plan Approval Findings and stated that the Board is to use its own independent judgment to make these findings. She also discussed concerns regarding parking and explained that paid parking nearby costs \$22-26/day and most people staying at the vacation rental will most likely opt to park in front of the house or on the street for free, causing added congestion. She brought up concerns regarding the property being listed as a three-bedroom,

one-bathroom unit and provided documentations showing that the property is being used as a triplex, not a single-family residence, and is able to accommodate up to 11 people. Christine Gallerie, Rick Closson, Victor Reyes, Jose Arturo, ceded their time to Ms. Gott. Ms. Gott also submitted written correspondence.

2. Pete Dovela expressed that the approval of this project will increase the demand for parking in an already saturated area and will decrease the value of the surrounding properties, including his own. Natalia Govonie ceded her time to Mr. Dovela.
3. Correspondence from Anna Marie Gott, Chris Gallery, Denice Spangler Adams, and Ernest Salomon was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:27 p.m.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. Provide an aerial neighborhood site plan, showing the different uses of the surrounding properties.
2. Add an additional street tree along the Gutierrez parkway.
3. Study adding a third parking space for the third unit.
4. Provide a trash enclosure at the proposed refuse location.
5. Provide screening for the condensing unit.
6. Provide both existing and proposed plants on the plan.

Action: Tripp/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

6. 8 S MILPAS ST

C-G Zone

(7:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	017-165-012
Application Number:	MST2017-00851
Owner:	Canoga Terrace, LLC
Applicant:	Finn Moller
Architect:	Kevin Dumain

(Proposal for a new commercial addition to an existing fuel service station. Project consists of a 594 square foot addition to an existing 1,672 square foot service station. The addition will include expanded areas for retail sales, an additional restroom, cooler, and storage. Also proposed are attic space for mechanical equipment and a new mechanical well to screen equipment. Exterior alterations also include alterations to the existing parking lot, a 164 square foot trash enclosure, alterations landscaping, and improvements to on-site storm water management.)

(Comments Only. Project requires further Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 7:54 p.m.

Present: Kevin Dumain, Architect, DesignARC; and Finn Moller, Applicant

Public comment opened at 8:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. Provide an existing site plan with an existing floor plan so that the Board can differentiate what is proposed and what is existing.

2. Provide a landscape plan showing all that is existing and will remain as well as what is proposed, including the hardscape.
3. Provide a materials board; including colors, lighting options, hardscape.
4. Consider moving the bike parking to the street side of the trash enclosure.
5. Provide a curb with a planter adjacent to the building to keep cars off the walls of the building.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:16 P.M. ***