



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
FEBRUARY 12, 2018

3:00 P.M.
 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
 630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
 Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
 Bob Cunningham
 Kevin Moore
 David R. Watkins
 Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
 Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
 Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Mr. Cameron.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Gradin (absent 4:10-5:58 p.m.), Tripp, Cunningham (until 8:15 p.m.), Moore (absent 7:52-8:15 p.m.), Watkins (at 3:07 p.m.; absent 7:05-7:54 p.m.), and Wittausch.

Members absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta (until 3:28 p.m.), Cameron, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. 2018 Election of Chair and Vice Chair:

Nominations for Chair: Gradin

A vote was taken, and Board Member Gradin was elected as Chair.

Nominations for Vice Chair: Tripp

A vote was taken, and Board Member Tripp was elected as Vice Chair.

B. 2018 Appointment of Consent Review Representatives and Subcommittees:

Appointments were made to fill the following committees:

	<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Alternate</u>
Consent Calendar (2 month Rotation)		
Architecture	Cunningham, Tripp, and Moore	Wittausch

Landscape
Sign Committee

Cunningham
Cunningham

Subcommittees

Highway 101

Gradin, Moore

Wittausch

Arts Advisory Committee

Moore

Design Awards

Gradin, Watkins

Ad hoc Subcommittees

Sign Ordinance Review

Cunningham

Moore

Architectural Detail

Gradin

Wittausch

Lower Mission Creek Design

Watkins

Tripp

Multi-Unit/Mixed-Use Design
Guidelines

Tripp

Gradin

C. Public Comment:

No public comment.

D. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 29, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Cunningham/Moore, 4/0/2. (Gradin and Tripp abstained.) Motion carried.

E. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 5, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Cunningham/Watkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 12, 2018**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Cunningham/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

No announcements.

G. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**1. 136 E HALEY ST**

M-C Zone

(3:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-271-007
Application Number: MST2018-00055
Owner: Del Mar Santa Barbara, LLC
Applicant: Gus Harper

(Proposal for a new mural in an existing commercial and industrial park. Project consists of one mural painted on a 25 foot tall by 80 foot wide wall facing a parking lot. Art produced by artist Gus Harper.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Gus Harper, Artist

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comment:

1. Review what is approved to be built prior to laying out an artistic design.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 5/1/0. (Gradin opposed.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**2. 812 JENNINGS AVE**

M-I Zone

(3:35)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-043-003
Application Number: MST2017-00511
Owner: Joe Armel
Applicant: Max Miranov

(Proposal for a short-term vacation rental conversion. The project is comprised of the conversion of a 1,081 square foot single-story, 3-bedroom house into a short-term vacation rental. Exterior changes include the demolition of the 197 square foot single car garage, addition of four new uncovered parking spaces, a new three foot fence along the front property line, new landscaping, and widening of the existing driveway apron.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on September 11, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:42 p.m.

Present: Max Miranov, Applicant; Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; and Kate Swenson, Designer

Public comment opened at 3:47 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue one week to Consent with comments:

1. Verify the distance from the front property line to the curb as there appears that there may be room for a street tree. If there is room for a street tree, consult the City arborist to verify an acceptable species and add it to the plan.
2. Show all planted areas and areas that are currently dirt and unplanted; add planting along the adjacent property line that coordinates with the existing planting.
3. Study adding a vine that will grow onto and over the 42-inch porch wall.

Action: Gradin/Cunningham, 5/1/0. (Watkins opposed.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**3. 302 & 308 W MONTECITO ST**

C-G Zone

(4:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-232-011, 037-232-002
Application Number:	MST2016-00426
Owner:	Edward St. George
Agent:	SEPPS
Applicant:	On Design, LLC
Architect:	Interdisciplinary Architecture

(Proposal for a three-story mixed-use development consisting of a hotel and commercial space. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of two lots at 302 & 308 W. Montecito Street (APNs 037-232-011 & 037-232-002). All existing development on the two lots, consisting of four residential apartments totaling 2,540 square feet and 517 square feet of office space, will be demolished. New development on this merged 18,927 square foot parcel will be a 26,818 square foot, three-story building containing a 15,210 square foot, 32-room hotel and 887 square feet of commercial floor area. Also proposed are 50 parking spaces, and 2 covered bicycle parking spaces. Planning Commission approval is required, as this project involves a Transfer of Existing Development Rights from the Sandman Hotel located at 3714-3744 State Street for 29 hotel rooms, and a Development Plan for commercial square footage allotments from the Minor and Small Additions categories on both parcels.)

(Sixth Concept Review. Comments Only. Project was last reviewed on September 25, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:10 p.m.

Vice Chair Tripp read the following State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory:

The City Attorney's office has determined that sole proprietors are allowed to prepare professional documents and make project presentations before a board they served on based on an exception to the Political Reform Act and Fair Political Practices Commission rulings. The limitation is that they are not to unduly influence their fellow board members on a decision by advocating for their clients. The exception allows board members to continue practicing their profession in the City while volunteering on a board.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect; and Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Bonnie Donovan, neighbor, clarified that the adjacent elderly care facility and condos, as indicated by the presenter, are actually a drug and alcohol rehabilitation center and office with parking on top. Ms. Donovan acknowledged that the design has changes; however, it is still too large for the neighborhood, will impede her ability to implement solar energy at her property, is underparked and will contribute to the area's congestion, takes away from potential public open space, and will become a neighborhood nuisance as the hotel will be unmanned with no one to monitor the party deck. Pam Meredith ceded her time to Ms. Donovan.
2. Correspondence from Paulina Conn and Kellam de Forest was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:39 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the 5-foot setback, as shown, for the majority of the north side of the property? 4/2 Passed.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. Overall, the Board agrees that regarding style, the project is moving in the right direction; however, some detailing can be simplified.
2. Restudy the canted walls, as they are working in some areas but not in others; look at the overall project and see how the canted walls can all read as one project.
3. Study the fence at the north property line and have it be more permanent and integrated into the design.
4. Consider using other materials to add warmth to the palette.
5. Simplify some forms to break up the massing.
6. With regard to the commercial space programming, verify there will be enough on-site parking to accommodate the program.
7. Implement more public interaction at the sidewalk.
8. Look at the utility area that opens to the exterior of the building and consider ways to possibly have the space open to the interior of the project instead.
9. If the balconies do not appear to be usable, consider an alternate use for the space such as a potential for planting.

Action: Tripp/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Gradin stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 15 S ALISOS ST**

R-2 Zone

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-172-018
Application Number: MST2017-00493
Owner: Jeff Persson and William McCarty
Architect: CSA Architects

(Proposal for an additional duplex on a parcel currently developed with two residential units. Project is comprised of the demolition of a detached 770 square foot two-car garage and accessory structure, and the construction of a two story, 3,478 square foot duplex. Unit mix on this 14,625 square foot lot will be four 2-bedroom units ranging in size from 669 to 1,439 square feet. Also proposed are alterations to the existing landscaping, reconfiguration of the parking arrangement to include eight parking spaces, and 692 cubic yards of grading.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on December 4, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:25 p.m.

Present: Trevor Wellman and Elsa Reader, CSA Architects

Public comment opened at 5:35 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. Provide a path of travel for pedestrians from the street all the way through to the last unit on the site.
2. Provide both a site plan and landscape plan and show what is existing and what is proposed.
3. Provide more height within the landscaping, especially at the property line.
4. Study the entries and tie them into the walkway path so pedestrians are not entering directly off of the driveway.
5. Study pushing the proposed gate back away from the street.
6. Work with a landscape architect or someone who is knowledgeable on how far to maintain the clearance from the avocado tree and the parking space.
7. Provide a front elevation of the existing first unit for context and also show any walls or fencing.

Action: Tripp/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**5. 3891 STATE ST 24****C-G/USS Zone**

(5:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-035
 Application Number: MST2018-00046
 Owner: GC Galleria LLC
 Applicant: Ben Carron
 Architect: Corey Russo
 Business Name: Target

(Proposal for a tenant improvement for a new Target location. Project consists of internal floor infill, and enclosing of existing entryways to total 995 square feet in new commercial floor area to an existing 31,440 square foot commercial structure. Project includes exterior facade alterations including new site walls and vertical metal trellises. Also proposed are site alterations including reconfiguration of the existing parking lot and adjacent landscaping. A total of 91 parking spaces is proposed for the site.)

(Comments Only. Project requires further Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:58 p.m.

Present: John Dews, Site Development Manager and William Huntress, Architect, Target; and Corey Russo, Project Manager, MBH Architects

Public comment opened at 6:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue four weeks to the Full Board with comments:

1. Add at least three additional sight line views to verify that rooftop equipment will not be visible along La Cumbre and State Streets, as identified on the plan by Chair Gradin.
2. Study if adding additional window area is possible to break up the second-story mass further.
3. Find a less monotonous way of applying the first-floor vertical trellis.
4. Provide the dimensions for the pedestrian access and accessibility.
5. Planting, wherever possible, for the trellis would be encouraged, especially along the street sides, with the intent of making the trellis become a green wall.
6. Provide a landscape plan that identifies all existing species.
7. The trellis metal color should match the door and window color proposed.

Action: Gradin/Cunningham, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:43 TO 7:05 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**6. 501 E MICHELTORENA ST****R-M Zone**

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-260-024
 Application Number: MST2017-00795
 Owner: Roscoe Villa
 Architect: Ken Vermillion

(Proposal for a new multi-unit residential development using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. Project consists of the demolition of an existing 1,743 square foot, single-story duplex and detached two-car garage, and the construction of a new four-unit, two-story apartment building. Unit mix will include one 3-bedroom unit, two 1-bedroom units, and one studio unit ranging in size from 880 to 1,300 square feet with an average unit size of 962 square feet. Proposed density on this 7,500 square foot lot is 24 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Medium-High Density, which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are five parking spaces, a new curb cut, and to alter the on-site sandstone retaining wall bordering the sidewalk. Grading will include 25 cubic yards of cut and 35 cubic yards of fill. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for the proposed two-car garage located in the front yard setback.)

(Comments Only. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for a front setback modification.)

Actual time: 7:05 p.m.

Present: Ken Vermillion and Mark Kirkhart, Architects, DesignARC

Public comment opened at 7:19 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Pat Saley, neighbor, expressed that the proposed development's architectural style is incompatible with the neighborhood and requested that the Board consider taking a drive around the neighborhood. Susan Spector and Petra Rees ceded their time to Ms. Saley.
2. Paula Cathey, neighbor, representing the Olive Street Association, explained that neighbors are concerned about losing ocean views and asked the Board to consider requesting story poles. Ms. Cathey also expressed that the proposed development is stylistically incompatible with the neighborhood, will contribute negatively to neighborhood density, and poses parking concerns. Ms. Cathey also submitted written correspondence.
3. Correspondence from David and Kathleen Rauber was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:27 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. Study reducing the overall height, specifically at the street level, to reduce the impact at the street.
2. Study modifying the style proposed to include more traditional elements that are in keeping with the neighborhood.
3. Provide an arborist report for the oak tree, including the depth required for permeable paving.

Action: Gradin/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Watkins stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**7. 732 BOND AVE****C-G Zone**

(7:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-232-007
Application Number: MST2014-00453
Owner: Allen Arnold
Applicant: Kevin Moore

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. Project consists of demolishing an existing 700 square foot single-family dwelling and the construction of 750 square feet of commercial floor space and three residential units to be built in one 3-story mixed-use and one 2-story residential building. The unit mix will include three 2-bedroom units ranging in size from 907 to 1,539 square feet with an average unit size of 1,129 square feet. The proposed density on this 5,342 square foot lot will be 28 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Commercial High Residential, which allows for 28-36 dwelling units per acre. Six covered parking spaces are proposed. No new grading is proposed.)

(First Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires further Environmental Assessment. A Pre-Application Consultation was held for this project on November 21, 2016.)

Actual time: 7:52 p.m.

Chair Gradin read the following State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory:

The City Attorney's office has determined that sole proprietors are allowed to prepare professional documents and make project presentations before a board they served on based on an exception to the Political Reform Act and Fair Political Practices Commission rulings. The limitation is that they are not to unduly influence their fellow board members on a decision by advocating for their clients. The exception allows board members to continue practicing their profession in the City while volunteering on a board.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect; and Allen Arnold, Owner

Public comment opened at 8:09 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board provided positive comments and stated that the project is ready for Project Design Approval.
2. Study adding an additional street tree on Bond Avenue and Nopal Street.

Action: Gradin/Tripp, 5/0/0. (Moore stepped down.) Motion carried.

PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**8. 500 BLK GARDEN****M-C Zone**

(8:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-211-021
Application Number: MST2017-00859
Owner: Price Living Trust
Applicant: Jay Higgins
Architect: Larry Clark

(One-time pre-application concept review for a new mixed-use building. Project consists of the construction of a 7,407 square foot, three-story building on a parcel currently developed as a parking lot in the M-C zone. The proposed structure will include three 1-bedroom apartments and 5,912 square feet of commercial space. Twenty-five parking spaces are proposed to be retained on site.)

(Comments Only.)

Actual time: 8:15 p.m.

Present: Larry Clark, Architect

Public comment opened at 8:20 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Board comments:

1. The mass, bulk, and scale are acceptable, with some improvements requested.
2. Study projecting the second- and third-floor balcony and window areas as a way to break up the north elevation; consider breaking up the roofline as well and project it out over the balcony extension to help relieve the monotony of the elevation.
3. Provide a planting recess at the southwest corner as a buffer to the adjacent property.
4. The handicap ramp appears to not meet code requirements.
5. The stair component needs to be restudied to incorporate better into the façade in a handsome way.
6. The relationship between the third-floor window on the east elevation and the roofline should be restudied.
7. Since the project is street facing, have the roof hips come to a corner.
8. Provide high-quality detailing and materials that are appropriate to the area.
9. Consider adding more plantings wherever possible between the sidewalk and the building.
10. Accurately show any existing buildings on adjacent properties.
11. Provide a new street tree at the front of the lot, if appropriate.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:42 P.M. ***