



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
JULY 17, 2017

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
Lisa LaPlaca
Courtney Jane Miller
Kevin Moore
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Frank Hotchkiss

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Gradin (absent from 4:17 p.m.–5:02 p.m.), Tripp, Moore, Watkins (at 3:04 p.m.), and Wittausch
Members absent: LaPlaca and Miller
Staff present: Limón (until 3:39 p.m.), Cameron, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Brian Miller, commented on high density projects and used a project at the corner of Laguna and Haley Street as an example. He expressed that the high density projects are creating a canyon like street scape in the city which is not in keeping with the style of Santa Barbara.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **July 3, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 4/0/1. (Gradin abstained. Miller, LaPlaca absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Request from applicant for revision of final minutes for 1298 Coast Village Road from the meeting of June 19, 2017:

Current accepted motion reads as follows:

Motion: The Board moves to deny the increase in height with comments:

1. The increase in height is inconsistent with the direction from City Council and driven by market concerns rather than aesthetics.
2. Changes in awning colors, balcony configuration, and detailing are acceptable as proposed.

Action: Gradin/Moore, 4/0/0. (Tripp and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

Proposed correction to the motion reads as follows:

Motion: The Board moves to deny the increase in height with comments:

1. The increase in height is inconsistent with the direction from City Council.
2. Changes in awning colors, balcony configuration, and detailing are acceptable as proposed.

Action: Gradin/Moore, 4/0/0. (Tripp and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

The majority of the Board agreed to correct the minutes for this item as written above.

- D. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 10, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Wittausch/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Miller and LaPlaca absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 17, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Wittausch/Moore, 5/0/0. (Miller and LaPlaca absent.) Motion carried.

- E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:

- a. Representatives are requested to appear before City Council for the appeal hearings of two projects:
 - i. 812 Jennings Avenue will be heard on August 1, 2017 (Tripp will attend.)
 - ii. 2017 Bath Street will be heard on August 8, 2017 (Watkins will attend.)
- b. Item 3, 2840 De La Vina Street, has been postponed at the applicant's request.
- c. Item 4, 610 East Cota Street, is no longer comments only and action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.
- d. Chair Gradin will be stepping down from Item 2, 1236 San Andres Street.

2. Renee Brooke, City Planner, announced that Irma Unzueta will be the new Design Review and Historic Preservation Supervisor upon Jaime Limón's retirement.

3. The Board presented Jaime Limón with a retirement gift to the Sycamore Mineral Springs Resort.

4. Mr. Boughman presented and discussed the new ABR infill Design Guidelines handout.
5. Board Member Moore reported on the Planning Commission meeting he attended regarding 401-409 East Haley Street.
After some discussion, the Board decided that a 30-minute discussion item to further discuss what the Planning Commission can provide to aid the ABR in reviewing large projects such as 401-409 East Haley Street, which are the first in the area, will be scheduled on August 14, 2017.

F. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1.	103 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ	OM-1/SD-3 Zone
<u>(3:15)</u>	Assessor's Parcel Number:	017-113-020
	Application Number:	MST2016-00295
	Owner:	American Tradition
	Agent:	Suzanne Elledge
	Architect:	DMHA

(Proposal for a revised parking lot and a new three-story, approximately 11,000 square foot administrative support building for back-of-house activities for a proposed hotel located at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard. The hotel is being reviewed under separate development application MST2004-00791 and the hotel design will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. Currently permitted on this 2.42 acre parcel is a parking lot serving the approved Waterfront Hotel at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard; this project would replace the parking lot approved under that application. The amount of grading is unknown at this time.)

(Seventh Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Substantial Conformance Determination by Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on May 22, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:31 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect, DMHA; Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Suzanne Elledge, Agent, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 3:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the centering of the mass on the northwest elevation should be moved? 2/3 Failed

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the project is ready for Project Design Approval with comments? 3/2 Passed

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The vinyl windows are not acceptable as proposed.
2. Restudy the resolution of the parapet on the third-floor roof elements on the north elevation.
3. Study adding an additional layer to the trellis.
4. Study implementing a heavier wood material at the awnings.
5. The Board recommends eliminating any hanging or wall-mounted down lights at the second and third floor to limit the impact to the first-floor pedestrians and adjacent building sites and study alternative illumination for those levels.
6. Relocate the transformer or screen it from street view.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Miller, LaPlaca absent.) Motion carried

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 1236 SAN ANDRES ST****R-3 Zone****(3:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:	039-151-001
Application Number:	MST2006-00364
Owner:	Edward St. George
Architect:	Kirk Gradin
Architect:	On Design

(The approved four-unit condominium project has been revised in order to be developed under the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project includes the demolition of two existing residential units and an accessory structure totaling 1,636 square feet. The revised project consists of the construction of a 5,521 square foot (net) building, with four, three-bedroom units ranging from 1,034 to 1,214 square feet. The average unit size is 1,108 square feet. The proposed density on the 10,000 square foot parcel is 18 dwelling units per acre. The General Plan land use designation is Medium-High Density, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Five covered parking spaces are proposed. There will be a total of 225 cubic yards of cut and 25 cubic yards of fill, of which 95 cubic yards will be outside of the building footprint and 50 cubic yards will be exported off site. The approved project included a Modification to allow an encroachment into the side yard setback. A Substantial Conformance Determination was granted on June 22, 2017 to allow the conversion of the previously approved project granted under Planning Commission Resolution No. 01-08 to an AUD Program project.)

(Project Design Approval was previously granted for the original project on April 4, 2008. Project Design Approval is required for the revised project. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 01-08 and the Substantial Conformance Determination. Project was last reviewed on February 27, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:17 p.m.

Vice Chair Tripp read the following statement:

The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4 (b) (5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he or she is a member to present, explain, architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Kirk Gradin is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of their client.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; and Noah Greer, Architect Assistant

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m.,

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Michael Galindo spoke on behalf of Kim Behrendtsen and himself and expressed concerns regarding parking, overcrowding, and safety. Kim Behrendtsen requires special care and there are times, because of overcrowding, that her accessible service vehicle is unable to reach her location.
2. Correspondence from Colleen Kelly was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:39 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members can support the colors as presented? 1/3 Failed

Straw vote: How many Board members believe the wood lintels should be restudied and replaced with plaster in certain areas? 3/1 Passed

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The Board would like the colors to be restudied and shown on the driveway elevation.
2. Provide a material board with all the standard materials and lighting.
3. Provide photos of the landscape material being proposed.
4. Study the wood lintels and consider replacing them with plaster in certain areas.
5. Provide addition landscaping to the front ground-level patio on the north side.

Action: Tripp/Wittausch, 4/0/0. (Gradin stepped down. Miller and LaPlaca absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 2840 DE LA VINA ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	051-220-023
Application Number:	MST2016-00417
Owner:	Storch Family Living Trust
Architect:	David Hardister AIA, Principal
Business Name:	Grocery Outlet Bargain Market

(Proposal for a new facade on the existing Ralph's shopping center. Also proposed are new railings and 28 square feet of concrete sidewalk fill-in at the rear truck dock to expand the sidewalk for forklift use. Some of the existing ADA parking spaces will be relocated but the overall number of parking spaces will remain the same. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on June 19, 2017.)

Item postponed at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 610 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-470-001
Application Number: MST2017-00093
Owner: RR & F Enterprises
Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a mixed-use development using the Average Unit-Sized Density Incentive Program (AUD). Project is comprised of the renovation of an existing 8,794 square foot, two-story mixed-use building containing two residential units and four commercial spaces to include eight residential units and one mixed-use space. Unit mix will include 3 two-bedroom units, 5 one-bedroom units, and 1 studio-live/work-unit ranging from 667 to 1366 square feet with an average unit size of 905 square feet. The proposed density on this 15,105 square foot lot will be 26 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are a reconfigured parking lot with 12 uncovered parking spaces, 2,253 square feet of private outdoor living space, and seven covered bike parking spaces. This project will result in a net reduction of 6,539 square feet of commercial floor space.)

(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:02 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Jolie Wah, and Anthony Tomasello, RRM Design Group; and Robert Fowler, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 5:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The Board is looking for a more traditional resolution to the railings.
2. Provide floorplans and site sections that accurately represent the elevations, particularly the south elevation.
3. Provide screening for the electrical transformer.
4. Study opportunities to create variation in the elevation, specifically at the street parking lot corner.

Action: Gradin/Moore, 5/0/0. (Miller and LaPlaca absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 835 E CANON PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-312-008
Application Number: MST2016-00531
Owner: Philinda Properties
Applicant: Old Dairy Partners, LLC
Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a three-story, 50-unit, multi-family residential development using the Average Unit-Sized Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal will include a voluntary lot merger of three lots totaling 34,780 square feet and the demolition of approximately 17,200 square feet of one- and two-story commercial and industrial buildings. The unit mix will include (26) 2-bedroom units, (4) 1-bedroom units, and (20) studio-units with an average unit size of 633 square feet. The proposed density will be 63 dwelling units per acre, the maximum allowed on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Density Residential, 37 - 63 dwelling units per acre within the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 51 covered parking spaces and 50 covered bicycle spaces. Also proposed is a 1,181 square foot rooftop deck, photovoltaic panels, and a trash enclosure. Grading is yet to be determined. Planning Commission review for an AUD project on a parcel exceeding 15,000 square feet, per SBMC 28.20.080, was held on March 16, 2017.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on June 19, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:39 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Chris Dufour, and Lisa Plowman, Planning Manager, RRM Design Group

Public comment opened at 5:58 p.m.,

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Christine Neuhauser expressed that the size, height, and density of the project are not in keeping with Santa Barbara style architecture.
2. Jose Arturo Gallegos expressed the project is being developed on commercial property and suggests the property be turned into a commercial park, not a massive structure that will obstruct views.
3. Correspondence from Kelem De Forest, Anna Marie Gott, and Christine Neuhauser was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:04 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members can support Project Design Approval? 2/3 Failed

Motion: Project Design Approval with the applicant to return for an in-progress review on the next available agenda, with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the work that has been done so far.
2. The third-floor parapet needs to have more variation in height on the Philinda and Canon Perdido side.
3. Restudy the treatment of the roof area adjacent to the corner tower and the height of the tower to provide more prominence.
4. Provide further development of the Art Deco style in the building, such as brackets at the canopies and balconies, a more explicit Art Deco design for the railings, and additional plaster detailing that is similar or compatible with what is being done at the tower.
5. Study the connecting roof elements between the open masses and consider lowering them, having them appear different in material, and minimize height and depth as much as possible.
6. The Historic Landmarks Commission landscape architect should conduct a courtesy review and provide ABR with comments.
7. The applicant is to provide reference images for the Art Deco detailing.
8. The Board made the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Gradin/Moore, 2/3/0. (Wittausch, Tripp, and Watkins opposed. Miller, LaPlaca absent.) Motion failed.

Motion: Continued to the next available agenda with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the work that has been done so far.
2. The third-floor parapet needs to have more variation in height on the Philinda and Canon Perdido side.
3. Restudy the treatment of the roof area adjacent to the corner tower and the height of the tower to provide more prominence.
4. Provide further development of the Art Deco style in the building such as brackets at the canopies and balconies, a more explicit Art Deco design for the railings, and additional plaster detailing that is similar or compatible with what is being done at the tower.
5. Study the connecting roof elements between the open masses and consider lowering them, having them appear different in material, and minimize height and depth, as much as possible.
6. The Historic Landmarks Commission landscape architect should conduct a courtesy review and provide ABR with comments.
7. The applicant is to provide reference images for the Art Deco detailing.
8. Applicant to study reducing the height of the building.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Miller, LaPlaca absent.) Motion passed.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:50 P.M. ***