



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
MAY 22, 2017

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
Courtney Jane Miller
Kevin Moore
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Frank Hotchkiss

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Acting Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Gradin (absent 4:14-5:17 p.m., left at 6:16 p.m.), Tripp, Moore, Watkins (at 3:05 p.m.), and Wittausch
Members absent: Miller
Staff present: Limón (from 3:05 p.m.-3:30 p.m.), Cameron, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Board Member Wittausch read an email from Richard Ross, a member of the public who spoke at the last meeting on the project at 325 W. Anapamu Street. Mr. Ross praised the ABR and neighbors who attended the hearings for achieving an acceptable proposal. Board Member Wittausch wished to recognize public participation in neighborhood preservation.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **May 8, 2017**, as amended.
Action: Tripp/Watkins, 4/0/1. (Moore abstained. Miller absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 15, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch (Items A-G) and Board Member Miller (Items A-C).

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 5/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 22, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch (Items A-H) and Board Member Miller (Items A-C).

Action: Tripp/Watkins, 4/0/1. (Gradin abstained from Item H. Miller absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

Mr. Cameron announced the following:

1. Board Member Miller will be absent from today's meeting.
2. Chair Gradin will step down from Item 4, 302 & 308 W. Montecito Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM – REQUEST FOR RECONSIDERATION**1. 2017 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-292-014

Application Number: MST2017-00146

(Discussion of request by Chair Kirk Gradin for possible reconsideration of the May 8, 2017 denial decision. Debate is limited to the question of whether or not there is a majority of the Board interested in reconsidering the matter.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Discussion held. A consensus was reached that there was insufficient Board support for reconsideration of the item, so no motion was proposed.

CONTINUED CONCEPT REVIEW**2. 2017 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-292-014
Application Number: MST2017-00146
Owner: Drew Rudman
Owner: Deanne Rudman

(Proposal for the conversion of a single family residence into a short-term rental. Project is comprised of the conversion of a 1,260 square foot one-story, three-bedroom single family residence into commercial hotel floor space. Exterior changes include the replacement of a 951 square foot gravel driveway with permeable pavers, and the removal of a driveway gate at the northeast property line. No changes are proposed for the existing structures. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings.)

(Project will be reviewed only if reconsideration vote is affirmed. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings, as well as findings that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.)

*** The item was not heard due to lack of Board support for reconsideration, as discussed during Item 1. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 505 W LOS OLIVOS ST****R-3 Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-210-012
Application Number: MST2007-00470
Owner: Westmont College
Architect: RRM Design Group

(THIS IS A REVISED PROJECT: The Planning Commission approved a 13-unit condominium project, which included a lot merger; demolition of a duplex and detached garage; demolition of a single-family residence and attached garage; construction of 9 new three-bedroom units and 1 new two-bedroom unit in three new buildings; addition to the existing apartment building; and remodel and conversion of the apartment building into 2 three-bedroom and 1 two-bedroom condominiums. Westmont College is proposing a revision to the approved project. The project has been changed to demolish the existing four-unit apartment building that was to be converted and build 3 new condominiums in two separate buildings, with the same bedroom count as the approved project. Parking for the converted apartment building will be provided with one uncovered and five covered spaces in the existing carport, and parking for the 13 newly constructed units would be provided with two-car garages attached to each unit. Three guest parking spaces will also be provided. The proposed development will total 26,418 square feet on the 32,550 square foot lot. Two of the two-bedroom units would be provided to middle-income households using a target income of 130% of Area Median Income (AMI), consistent with the Inclusionary Housing Ordinance. Requires Planning Commission approval of a revised Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on January 1, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Scott Hopkins, Katie Moses, Tony Tomasello, and Chris Dufour, RRM Design Group; and Doug Jones, Westmont College

Staff comments: Jessica W. Grant, Project Planner, stated that the project received Planning Commission approval on May 18.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued one week to Consent with comments:

1. The Board expressed appreciation for the changes made since the last review to address its comments.
2. Provide a 3-D or 2-D rendering that shows the color selections; if more than one color scheme is proposed, more than one rendering should be provided.
3. The Board expressed concern about the monochromatic nature of the current color board.
4. The landscape is to be reviewed at Consent, but it appears generally acceptable as proposed.
5. The Board would like to see better definition of the street-facing porch areas to allow for larger usable front entry porch areas.
6. Study additional shutters in select locations.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 302 & 308 W MONTECITO ST****C-2 Zone**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-232-011, 037-232-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00426
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Agent: SEPPS
 Applicant: On Design, LLC
 Architect: On Design, LLC
 Architect: Interdisciplinary Architecture, Inc.

(Proposal for a three-story mixed-use development consisting of a boutique hotel, commercial space, and public art gallery. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of two lots at 302 & 308 W. Montecito Street (APNs 037-232-011 & 037-232-002). All existing development on the two lots, consisting of four residential apartments totaling 2,540 square feet and 517 square feet of office space, will be demolished. New development on this merged 18,927 square foot parcel will be a 56,302 square foot, three-story building containing a 16,447 square foot, 32-room hotel; 1,869 square foot commercial component; an 847 square foot public art and a 24,266 square foot subterranean parking garage with 52 parking spaces (42 spaces for on-site use and 10 spaces for a new development project to be constructed at 311 W. Montecito Street). Eighteen covered bicycle parking spaces will also be provided. There will be approximately 7,900 cubic yards of grading excavation. Planning Commission approval is required, as this project involves a Transfer of Existing Development Rights from the Sandman Hotel located at 3714-3744 State Street for 29 hotel rooms, and a Development Plan for commercial square footage allotments from the Minor and Small Additions categories on both parcels.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only. Project requires review by Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on April 24, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:14 p.m.

Present: Tim Gorder, Architect; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; and Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued four weeks to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the changes made since the last review, and overall, the project is moving in a positive direction.
2. The Board appreciated the building being pulled back from the property line and the added landscaping at the north and west elevations on the first and second levels with the raised planters.
3. Further study the language of the railings to create a more cohesive design that ties the building together.
4. Study integrating either material or color change where the building is recessed.
5. Study the width of the fins at the ends of the sawtooth to be wider and more in keeping with the overall thickness in other areas.
6. Study the window layout on the south and east elevations.
7. The added commercial space on the south elevation should have direct access from the sidewalk.

8. Study the possibility of green screen for the elevator to the roof deck; study landscape features for the roof deck.
9. Address the large expanse of wall on the east elevation.
10. Anywhere there is a wall end, study making it thicker.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 4/0/0. (Gradin stepped down. Miller absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 103 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-020
 Application Number: MST2016-00295
 Owner: American Tradition
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for a revised parking lot and a new three-story, approximately 11,000 square foot administrative support building for back-of-house activities for a proposed hotel located at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard. The hotel is being reviewed under separate development application, MST2004-00791, and the hotel design will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. Currently permitted on this 2.42 acre parcel is a parking lot serving the approved Waterfront Hotel at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard; this project would replace the parking lot approved under that application. The amount of grading is unknown at this time.)

(Sixth Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Substantial Conformance Determination by Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on April 24, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect, DMHA; Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Suzanne Elledge, Agent, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The project is ready for Project Design Approval.
2. The Board appreciated the changes made since the last review, particularly removing the tower and adding the exterior stair.
3. Study a less refined trellis structure, going more toward wide flange beams and exposed welded brackets. Concern was expressed about proximity of the brackets supporting the shading devices at the third floor in relation to the eave.
4. Further study the open railing.
5. The windows on the west elevation should be centered with the ridge.
6. Colors and materials are generally acceptable.
7. The roof of the two-story element on the west elevation should be reduced in height.

Action: Gradin/Tripp, 5/0/0. (Miller absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 2840 DE LA VINA ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-220-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00417
 Owner: Storch Family Living Trust
 Architect: David Hardister
 Business Name: Grocery Outlet Bargain Market

(Proposal for a new façade on the existing Ralph's shopping center. Also proposed are new railings and 28 square feet of concrete sidewalk fill in at the rear truck dock to expand the sidewalk for forklift use. Some of the existing ADA parking spaces will be relocated, but the overall number of parking spaces will remain the same. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on April 24, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:52 p.m.

Present: David Hardister, Architect, Woodblock Architecture

Public comment opened at 5:55 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board recognized the time and effort devoted to the project, and it is moving in the right direction.
2. Study the exterior materials, particularly the wood siding and the stucco finish on the south and east elevations at Plaza Liquors, perhaps making them flush.
3. Study the possibility of a canopy over the entrance to the grocery store.
4. Provide color and material samples.
5. Consider the finish of the metal screen; one Board Member recommended anodized bronze.
6. Provide landscape details.
7. Provide a section through the west façade.
8. Provide photo pages of the site and roof.
9. Provide schematic details.
10. Survey the existing roof condition and provide information about how it will be treated.

Action: Wittausch/Watkins, 4/0/1. (Gradin abstained. Miller absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 208 OCEANO AVE****R-2/SD-3 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-074-007
Application Number: MST2016-00023
Owner: Tantri, LLC
Architect: Craig Goodman

(Proposal for major remodel, partial demolition, and reconfiguration of an existing two-story duplex, which will result in a 1,400 square foot duplex at the rear of an 8,756 square foot parcel. The duplex will include a 330 square foot covered porch on the ground floor, remodeled 302 square foot uncovered deck on the second floor, and a new stairway. A portion of the structure will be demolished, including as-built work, as part of the major remodel to alter the structure to a Spanish architectural style. The garage size will be increased and building footprint widened to provide a reduced 3 foot side yard setback at the ground floor. Four tandem covered parking spaces are proposed in the new parking configuration. Other site work will include the replacement of existing fencing with new site walls, new raised planters, new driveway, hardscape, landscaping, and a relocated trash enclosure. The existing four-unit apartment building at the front of the site also requires approval of as-built window replacements, proposed storage, and a new entry. Requires Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification to provide less than the required open yard area. Three parking design waivers are being requested from the Transportation Division. This proposal will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00524.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project is required to be consistent with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 026-17. Project was last reviewed on October 10, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:16 p.m.

Present: Craig Goodman, Architect

Public comment opened at 6:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members consider the project ready for Project Design Approval? 0/4 Failed

Motion: Continued four weeks to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board was pleased with the efforts made, and the project is moving in the right direction.
2. The Board was pleased with the handling of the Monterey style front building.
3. The Board appreciated the permeable paving and the addition of landscaping.
4. Study additional vine pockets along the fence where possible.
5. Study the detail of the second-floor deck at the east elevation and how it is integrated into the roof.
6. Study simplifying the detailing of the back building, particularly the excessive use of ironwork.
7. Study the mirador location.
8. Study alternatives to the roof deck on the east elevation.
9. Study the stairs; confirm that the exterior stairs at the back building meet exiting requirements.

10. Study the use of the columns on the second floor of the back building and on the east elevation, possibly eliminating some to simplify.
11. Study window details and the relationships between the windows.
12. Provide samples for the proposed vinyl windows.

Action: Wittausch/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Miller absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:10 P.M. ***