



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
MAY 8, 2017

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
Courtney Jane Miller
Kevin Moore
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Frank Hotchkiss

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Gradin, Tripp, Miller (absent 4:28-5:16 p.m.), Watkins, and Wittausch
Members absent: Moore
Staff present: Limón (until 3:24 p.m.), Cameron, Sanchez, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **April 24, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: Tripp/Miller, 3/0/2. (Gradin and Wittausch abstained. Moore absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 1, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Members Tripp (Item G), Miller (Items B-D), and Wittausch (Items A, E, & F).

Action: Miller/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 8, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Miller (Items A-F) and Board Member Wittausch (Items A-G).

Action: Miller/Tripp, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:
 - a. Board Member Miller will step down from Item 3, 325 W. Anapamu Street.
 - b. Board Member Moore will be absent from today's meeting.
2. Mr. Limón discussed how the Board should approach reconsiderations of previous meeting items according to ABR guidelines.
3. Chair Gradin announced Board Member absences in June. He also reminded the public of the current recruitment for ABR members.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 321 E MICHELTORENA ST

R-3 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	027-251-014
Application Number:	MST2016-00383
Owner:	Hathaway Family Trust
Architect:	ACME Architecture

(Proposal for a new multi-family development using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal will include the demolition of 1,408 square feet of impermeable paving and 158 lineal feet of fencing and the construction of a two-story duplex with an attached, 743 square foot, three-car garage at the rear of the site. An existing 1,428 square foot, one-story, three bedroom dwelling unit at the front of the site will remain unaltered. The unit mix will include 1, three-bedroom unit and 2, two-bedroom units totaling 3,097 square feet, with an average unit size of 1,032 square feet. The proposed density on this 6,664 square foot parcel will be 20 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. The proposal also includes removal of one 47 foot tall palm tree, one 12 foot tall Pittosporum tree, and a 64 foot long hedge encroaching onto the public alley. Grading will comprise 10 cubic yards of excavation and 60 cubic yards of fill dirt. This parcel is located within the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Item was last reviewed on December 5, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:23 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect; and Laurie Romano, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:38 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval with comments:

1. The door and windows indicated on the north elevation at the first floor should be brought closer together to make the adjoining trim piece a single piece.
2. It was suggested to connect the outdoor space for the front unit closer to the back door.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

*** Item re-opened at 4:26 p.m. ***

The motion was amended to the following:

Motion: Final Approval with comments:

1. The door and windows indicated on the north elevation at the first floor should be brought closer together to make the adjoining trim piece a single piece.
2. It was suggested to connect the outdoor space for the front unit closer to the back door.
3. The applicant shall fulfill the AUD Annual Resident Survey requirement.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 414 W LOS OLIVOS ST

R-3 Zone

(3:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	025-171-043
Application Number:	MST2017-00163
Owner:	JammyAuto, LLC and Seth Hatfield
Applicant:	Dennis Thompson

(Proposal for a new residential unit using the City's Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project consists of the demolition of an existing two-car garage, as well as 58 square feet at the rear of the existing duplex and construction of a 1,290 square foot addition to the rear of the existing duplex containing a 630 square foot three-car garage and a 660 square foot second story residential unit. Unit mix will include 3, one-bedroom units ranging in size from 648 to 836 square feet with an average unit size of 715 square feet. The proposed density for this 5,234 square foot lot is 27 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium High Density Residential, which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed is a new trash enclosure, new private outdoor living spaces to be enclosed with fences and gates, and replacement and reconfiguration of the existing driveway.)

(Comments only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect; and Seth Hatfield, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Joddi Leipner, neighbor, commented on the impacts of the density of this project on the neighborhood, including to parking, privacy, and access to sunlight. She read correspondence from David Huerta.

2. Michele Carbone, neighbor, asked that setbacks be maintained and emphasized the issue of parking.

Public comment closed at 3:56 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Provide additional photographs of the neighborhood.
2. Resolve the outdoor living and trash enclosure issues; ensure that the outdoor living space is functional in relation to each unit.
3. Study making the proposal appear as two units as opposed to one larger house, by the roofline or other feature.
4. Study applying materials or details of the front house to the addition to create continuity.

Action: Wittausch/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 325 W ANAPAMU ST

R-4 Zone

(4:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-212-004
 Application Number: MST2016-00101
 Owner: Cynthia Howard
 Architect: Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description: This is a proposal under the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). Proposal to demolish an existing single family dwelling, detached garage, and shed totaling 4,390 square feet and to construct a 4,812 square foot, two-story residential apartment building housing eight rental units. Unit mix will include 8, one-bedroom units ranging in size from 557 to 693 square feet with an average unit size of 600 square feet. The proposed residential density is 37 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 63 dwelling units per acre allowed on this 9,585 square foot parcel with a General Plan Designation of High Density Residential in the Priority Housing Overlay. Also proposed are a 2,687 square foot carport with eight parking spaces, eight covered bicycle parking spaces, and a 144 square foot trash enclosure. No grading is proposed. Also proposed is the removal of five trees.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project. Item was last heard March 13, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Derrik Eichelberger, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:43 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Geoffrey Ravenhill, neighbor, discussed size, bulk, and scale concerns, and privacy issues related to porches and windows.
2. Brett Gowirtzman, neighbor, expressed privacy concerns related to balconies and windows,

and suggested varying colors to make the project look smaller.

3. Ed Baum, neighbor, discussed a large honey locust tree on the property and asked that this tree be preserved for beauty and shade.
4. Richard Ross, neighbor, expressed concerns regarding size, bulk, and scale, particularly on the north elevation.
5. Sissy Ross, neighbor, requested as high a fence as possible to buffer sound.

Public comment closed at 4:54 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the changes made since the last review and the continued work with the neighbors to modify design to be more compatible with their concerns.
2. Provide a larger functional porch at the front main entrance on the first floor.
3. Provide additional screening that drops from the ceiling of the carport area to provide additional visual relief to neighbors.
4. Study keeping the tree at the south end.
5. The Board supported the use of different colors for the two main masses of the building, and a third color for the solid plaster or concrete surfaces.
6. The Board made the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 3/1/0. (Watkins opposed. Miller stepped down. Moore absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Board Member Watkins opposed due to the openness of the parking area creating problems of smoke and odor, and concern that the presence of the rear garage door would contribute to additional traffic at the alleyway.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 2017 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-292-014
Application Number: MST2017-00146
Owner: Drew Rudman
Owner: Deanne Rudman

(Proposal for the conversion of a single family residence into a short-term rental. Project is comprised of the conversion of a 1,260 square foot one-story, three-bedroom single family residence into commercial hotel floor space. Exterior changes include the replacement of a 951 square foot gravel driveway with permeable pavers, and the removal of a driveway gate at the northeast property line. No changes are proposed for the existing structures. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings.)

(Continued from April 24, 2017 Consent agenda. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings, as well as findings that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.)

Actual time: 5:16 p.m.

Present: Drew Rudman, Owner; and Renee Brooke, City Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:23 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Joe Rution stated that even a single unit is important to retain for the city's housing stock, and emphasized that this is a residential neighborhood.
2. Bonnie Freeman, neighbor, expressed concern about parking impact, and emphasized that short-term rentals are damaging to neighborhood character.
3. Natalia Giovoni stated that housing is an important priority and that this conversion does not represent sound community planning.
4. Anna Marie Gott emphasized the importance of preserving this primarily residential neighborhood and highlighted the low vacancy rate for housing in the city. Neal Hooker and Doug Taylor ceded their time to Anna Marie Gott. Correspondence from Ms. Gott was also acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:34 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 5:35 p.m.

Correspondence in opposition from Allied Neighborhoods Association, Jeff Geis, Janice Aramaki, Nora Gallagher, and Robert Pearson was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:44 p.m.

Motion: Deny the proposal with comment:

1. The Board could not make the finding for the proposal’s consistency with the principles of sound community planning because it creates a decrease in long-term housing opportunities in the community.

Action: Watkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 1312 E GUTIERREZ ST A

R-2 Zone

(6:00)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-392-003
 Application Number: MST2017-00156
 Owner: Jasen Bodie Nielsen
 Applicant: Burke Design

(Proposal for an addition to an existing duplex. Project comprises 549 square feet of second floor additions to an existing 2,084 square foot, two-story duplex. Proposal includes enclosing the second floor entry walk, stairs, and landing into 127 square feet of habitable space, and construction of 422 square feet of additional living space, a 280 square foot upper level deck, and a new two-car carport. Alterations are also proposed for an existing driveway gate, landscaping, and the existing parking areas.)

**** Item postponed at the applicant's request. ****

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:01 P.M. ***