



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
APRIL 24, 2017

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
Courtney Jane Miller
Kevin Moore
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Frank Hotchkiss

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:07 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Tripp, Miller, Moore, and Watkins
Members absent: Gradin and Wittausch
Staff present: Cameron and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **April 10, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: Watkins/Miller, 3/0/1. (Tripp abstained. Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 17, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Miller and Board Member Tripp.

Action: Miller/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 24, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Tripp, Board Member Miller, and Board Member Moore.
- Action: Miller/Moore, 3/0/1. (Watkins abstained. Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:
 - a. Chair Gradin and Board Member Wittausch will be absent from today's meeting.
 - b. The project at 926 Indio Muerto will be heard at Planning Commission on April 18. Staff has requested that a member of the ABR attend to discuss the item.
 - c. Board members should be advised that they are able to call a 5-minute break at any time.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Board Member Miller reported on the April 20, 2017 Arts Advisory Committee meeting.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

1. 3111 STATE ST

P-R/SD-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-112-018
 Application Number: MST2017-00133
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: George Thompson

(Proposal for new scoreboards in MacKenzie Park. Project proposes to demolish the existing baseball field scoreboards and replace them with two 10 foot and 15 foot tall LED scoreboards in new locations.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: George Thompson, Parks Capital Project Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:21 p.m.,

Correspondence from Judy Balthis with concerns was read into the record.

Public comment closed at 3:24 p.m.

- Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:**
1. The back panel shall be painted green to match the front with no advertisement panels.
 2. Applicant to include notes regarding the arborist review and/or hand digging the electrical conduit underneath the existing stone pines.
- Action: Watkins/Moore, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 103 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-020
 Application Number: MST2016-00295
 Owner: American Tradition
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for a revised parking lot and a new three-story, approximately 11,000 square foot administrative support building for back-of-house activities for a proposed hotel located at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard. The hotel is being reviewed under separate development application MST2004-00791 and the hotel design will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. Currently permitted on this 2.42 acre parcel is a parking lot serving the approved Waterfront Hotel at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard; this project would replace the parking lot approved under that application. The amount of grading is unknown at this time.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only. Project requires Substantial Conformance Determination from the Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on March 13, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:34 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills and Dianne Hemingway, DMHA; Suzanne Elledge, Agent; and Allison DeBusk, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m.

Alana Charles spoke with concerns due to the modern design and feels it does not take the city's history into consideration.

Public comment closed at 3:58 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support solar panels being placed on the roof?
 2/2 Failed

Motion: Continued to the May 22, 2017 agenda with comments:

1. The Board supported the use of the materials and in general supported the massing.
2. Restudy the stair tower massing that was added to the north elevation and consider the potential of an open stair design.
3. The previous shed roof design, at the conference room, was considered a more successful design.
4. Restudy the roof pitch and verify it is not steeper than previously proposed.
5. Provide a more industrial detailing to the wood fence design.
6. The previous cement panel layout with a denser detailing pattern was preferred.

7. Study the awning, trellis, and material pallet and the overall detailing of how they all come together.
8. Study if the solar panels will be placed on the carport or on the roof.
9. Study if the carport will be part of the project and how the detailing will be in keeping with the design of the building.

Action: Tripp/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

3. 302 W MONTECITO ST

C-2 Zone

(4:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-232-011
Application Number:	MST2016-00426
Owner:	Edward St. George
Agent:	SEPPS
Applicant:	On Design LLC
Architect:	On Design LLC
Architect:	Interdisciplinary Architecture

(Proposal for a three-story mixed-use development consisting of a boutique hotel, commercial space, and public art gallery. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of two lots at 302 & 308 W. Montecito Street (APNs 037-232-011 & 037-232-002). All existing development on the two lots, consisting of four residential apartments totaling 2,540 square feet and 517 square feet of office space, will be demolished. New development on this merged 18,927 square foot parcel will be a 56,302 square foot, three-story building containing a 16,447 square foot, 32-room hotel; 1,869 square foot commercial component; an 847 square foot public art gallery and a 24,266 square foot subterranean parking garage with 52 parking spaces (42 spaces for on-site use and 10 spaces for a new development project to be constructed at 311 W. Montecito Street). 18 covered bicycle parking spaces will also be provided. There will be approximately 7,900 cubic yards of grading excavation. Planning Commission approval is required, as this project involves a Transfer of Existing Development Rights from the Sandman Hotel located at 3714-3744 State Street for 29 hotel rooms, and a Development Plan for commercial square footage allotments from the Minor and Small Additions categories on both parcels.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only. Project was last reviewed on January 30, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:31 p.m.

Present: Timothy Gorter, Principal Architect; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m.

Lynn Robinson spoke in support.

Public comment closed at 4:47 p.m.

Motion: Continued to the May 22, 2017 agenda with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the changes that have been made since the last review, especially the massing being pulled back from the property lines and the elimination of the fourth story.
2. The Board found that the height is compatible with the area.
3. Study ways to further break up the massing to express the articulation found in the floor plan.
4. Study ways to further break the horizontal lines to tie the building together vertically.
5. Further study the breaks in the massing and openness that has been created on the second and third level to further activate the space.
6. Pull the north elevation back to allow more landscaping and trees.
7. Study the ground-floor units and how they work in relation to the exit stair and how it will be accessed.
8. The Board appreciated the research and imagery provided on the west beach area; however, the Santa Barbara style should be incorporated more into the design.
9. Study the parking to potentially incorporate an additional commercial tenant.
10. Study the west parking area and how to implement more trees for shading.

Action: Tripp/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:25 TO 5:29 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 6100 HOLLISTER AVE****A-I-1/SP-6 Zone****(4:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:	073-080-065
Application Number:	MST2016-00044
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Agent:	Leif Reynolds
Applicant:	Hazel Johns
Architect:	Kupiec Architects
Engineer:	Michael Viettone
Engineer:	Van Sande Structural Engineers
Landscape Architect:	Arcadia Studio

(Proposal to construct a light industrial park totaling 47,186 square feet on an approximately 6.44 acre Santa Barbara Airport site. The project will include two 4,021 square foot retail buildings and seven light industrial buildings of modular nature for one or more tenants. The minimum unit size ranges from 2,002 square feet to 2,500 square feet. The development will include 153 parking spaces including six accessible spaces, and approximately 100,000 square feet of landscaped area with a detention basin designed to accommodate both on-site and Wallace Becknell Road storm water run-off.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:29 p.m.

Present: Bob Kupiec and Jaime Palencia, Kupiec Architects; and Derrick Eichelberger, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 5:41 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support just one color on the building? 3/1 Passed

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to the next available Consent with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the landscape design.
2. The Board can support a monochromatic building skin.
3. Return with final detailing, lighting, and final landscape plans.

Action: Moore/Tripp, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 812 JENNINGS AVE

M-1 Zone

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-043-003
 Application Number: MST2017-00109
 Owner: Joe Armel
 Applicant: Max Miramov

(Proposal for a short-term vacation rental conversion. The project is comprised of the conversion of a 1,081 square foot single house and 197 square foot single car garage into a short-term vacation rental. Exterior changes include the addition of two new uncovered parking spaces, removal of garage door on accessory structure, a new three foot fence along the front property line, new landscaping, and widening of the existing driveway apron.)

(Continued from the Consent Calendar. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan, and Development Plan Approval findings.)

Actual time: 6:07 p.m.

Present: Max Miramov, Applicant; and Renee Brooke, City Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:14 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Rita Bourbor
2. Anaixa Mussulini
3. Rafael Carrillo

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Alana Charles stated, due to the culture of the area. She said this area of the city should be taken care of, not changed, and needs to be handled delicately.
2. Natalia Govani Stated, due to parking demands, noise disturbances, and lack of rental housing.

3. Joe Rution stated, due to the current housing shortage the city is facing and stated because of the shortage, this project goes against good community planning.
4. Jose Arturo Gallegos expressed, since the area is made up of working class citizens and they are being phased out of the area due to projects like this and high rents.
5. Anna Marie Gott stated, due to the city's lack of housing, overabundance of hotels/illegal vacation rentals, and lack of parking. She also submitted a letter from Rusty Smith.
6. Sameth Shepparce ceded her time to Anna Marie Gott.
7. Correspondence from Allied Neighborhoods Association, Anna Marie Gott, Laura and Stuart Wilson, Patty West, Tony Longo, and Vasanti and Joel Fithian was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:34 p.m.

Motion: Deny the proposal with comments:

1. The Board could not make the finding for consistency with the principles of sound community planning because, despite the fact that the residential use is legal non-conforming, housing is still a priority and converting a residential unit to a commercial hotel use would be a loss for this neighborhood and the community at large.
2. The Board also had concerns regarding the parking count.

Action: Miller/Tripp, 3/1/0. (Moore opposed. Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 7:03 TO 7:25 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 500 ANACAPA ST

C-M Zone

(6:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-201-031
Application Number:	MST2017-00120
Owner:	Louis and Leonila Sanchez
Agent:	Trish Allen, SEPPS

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). Project is comprised of the adaptive re-use of an existing 6,392 square foot mixed-use building and an existing 4,548 square foot commercial building; demolition of three commercial buildings, three residential buildings, a storage yard, and a shop canopy totaling 7,389 square feet, and the construction of two new 8-unit apartment buildings measuring 16,221 and 24,425 square feet. Unit mix will include 8 one-bedroom units, and 8 two-bedroom units ranging in size from 722 to 955 square feet with an average unit-size of 839 square feet. The proposed density on those lots being developed with residential units (APN: 031-201-021 and 031-201-017) is 34 dwelling units per acre on parcels within the Priority Housing Overlay, which allows for 37-63 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are 16 uncovered parking spaces and 45 covered parking spaces, a lot line adjustment for APN 031-201-031 and 031-201-021, and roof mounted photovoltaic paneling. Project requires Planning Commission review and Development Plan Approval findings.)

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 7:26 p.m.

Present: Scott Ellinwood, Architect; and Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 7:55 p.m.

Alana Charles spoke with concerns regarding the arcade; she was informed the arcade was an architectural term referring to an arched corridor, not a recreational business.

Public comment closed at 7:56 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the overall massing of the project?
2/2 Failed

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the effort that has gone into the project.
2. The architectural style is not appropriate as proposed. If a traditional style is desired, make it more authentic with more detailing; if a modern approach is desired, take it further in that direction. The postmodern forms are not acceptable.
3. Study the demising wall and consider utilizing more landscaping to create a buffer between the commercial and residential areas.
4. The site plan needs to be refined; address more balance between the individual buildings' mass and open spaces and the scale of the building forms and their surroundings.
5. Study the master plan, especially the pedestrian access to downtown, parks, and the circulation within the site itself.
6. The Board appreciated and encouraged the stated energy goals.
7. Minimize paving to incorporate more landscape.

Action: Tripp/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

7. 2840 DE LA VINA ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

(7:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-220-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00417
 Owner: Storch Family Living Trust
 Architect: David Hardister AIA
 Business Name: Grocery Outlet Bargain Market

(Proposal for a new facade on the existing Ralph's shopping center. Also proposed are new railings and 28 square feet of concrete sidewalk fill in at the rear truck dock to expand the sidewalk for forklift use. Some of the existing ADA parking spaces will be relocated but the overall number of parking spaces will remain the same. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Item was last reviewed on December 5, 2017.)

Actual time: 8:39 p.m.

Present: David Hardister, Architect

Public comment opened at 8:45 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the canopy element? 1/3 Failed

Motion: Continued to the May 22 agenda with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the effort that has gone into the project as well as the new direction of implementing a midcentury style.
2. The Board requested the material palette be simplified.
3. The use of the green screens is appropriate where planters are being implemented.
4. Study the application of the green color and consider using it as an accent color.
5. Study ways to highlight the entrances of other tenants and simplify the façade.

Action: Tripp/Miller, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

8. 1116 SAN PASCUAL ST

R-3 Zone

(7:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	039-202-016
Application Number:	MST2016-00359
Owner:	Edward St George
Architect:	On Design LLC

(Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes demolition of an existing, detached, 720 square foot garage and 176 square foot shed and construction of a new 1,629 square foot two-story duplex. An existing single-family dwelling on site will remain unchanged and a new 2,108 square foot duplex will be constructed. The residential unit mix will include three, 2-bedroom units ranging in size from 675 to 909 square feet with an average unit size of 763 square feet. The proposed density on this 6,880 square foot parcel is 19 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be a total of three parking spaces provided, two in a 494 square foot, attached two-car garage, and one uncovered space. No grading is proposed. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2016-00345.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on November 7, 2016.)

Actual time: 9:09 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, Architect; Shelby Messner, Project Planner; and Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 9:20 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Overall, the Board appreciated the changes that were made including the addition of the outdoor open space for each unit and the changes to the siding of the building.

2. Provide photographs of the windows with the designated trim.
3. Provide a color sample of the windows.
4. Provide an additional tree for screening of the second-floor windows at the southern property line.
5. Provide paver specifications and samples.
6. Provide the material for the wood fence.
7. The Board made the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 4/0/0. (Gradin and Wittausch absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:31 P.M. ***