



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
APRIL 10, 2017

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
Courtney Jane Miller
Kevin Moore
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Frank Hotchkiss

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

An archived video of this meeting is available at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Gradin, Miller (at 3:07 p.m.; absent 6:20-9:12 p.m.), Moore, Watkins (absent 3:18-4:25 p.m.), and Wittausch
Members absent: Tripp
Staff present: Limón (from 6:15-7:26 p.m.), Cameron, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 27, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: Wittausch/Watkins, 3/0/1. (Moore abstained. Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 3, 2017** as reviewed by Board Member Tripp and Board Member Miller.

Action: Watkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 10, 2017** as reviewed by Board Member Miller and Chair Gradin.

Action: Wittausch/Moore, 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:

- a. Board Member Tripp will be absent from the meeting.
- b. Board Member Miller will be leaving at 6:30 p.m.
- c. Board Members are able to call a five-minute break at any time during the meeting.
- d. The project description for Item 8, 1108 Olive Street, has changed and now includes the change of use from single family to duplex.
- e. The project description for Item 6, 302 W. Montecito Street, has changed, and the applicant will clarify the description when the item is heard.
- f. Board Member Watkins will step down from Item 2, 116 E Cota Street.

2. Board Member Moore announced he will step down from Item 5, 601 Alameda Padre Serra.

C. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:13 TO 3:18 P.M. ***

*** The following item was heard out of order. ***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. VARIOUS LOCATIONS IN THE OC ZONE****OC/SD-3 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-022-003

Application Number: MST2014-00017

Owner: SB6 Group LLC

Applicant: Marcello Ricci, Arts Fund Santa Barbara

(Proposal for a neighborhood-wide art and mural program in the Funk Zone. The approximate project area is bounded by Highway 101, Helena Street, Santa Barbara Street, and E. Cabrillo Boulevard.)

(Review After Final of additional sculpture to be located at 116 Yanonali Street.)

Actual time: 4:25.p.m

Present: Marcello Ricci, Arts Fund Santa Barbara; and Ken Bortolazzo, Artist

Public comment opened at 4:27 p.m.

Cynthia Frohling spoke in support.

Public comment closed at 4:27 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Gradin/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

*** The following item was heard out of order. ***

FINAL REVIEW

2. 116 E COTA ST

C-M Zone

(3:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-201-003
Application Number:	MST2015-00627
Owner:	Cota Street, LLC
Architect:	DesignARC

(This is a revised project description for a project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD): Proposal for a new four-story mixed-use building on a 10,865 square foot vacant parcel adjacent to Plaza Vera Cruz. The project includes 15 two-bedroom, two-bathroom residential units and approximately 738 square feet of commercial space. Sixteen covered parking spaces will be provided on the ground level. Residential units will be on the second, third, and fourth floors. The proposed building height is 45 feet, with a 457 square foot rooftop deck. The proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with an average unit size of 827 square feet. A maximum density of 63 dwelling units per acre is allowed on this parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Medium-High Density within the Priority Housing Overlay area.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect; Ken Vermillion, Architect; and Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Mr. Cameron read a memo to the Board and applicant regarding the project's Priority Housing Overlay covenant requirement.

Public comment opened at 4:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Consent with comments:

1. Restudy the caul edge design.
2. Restudy all lighting that is visible to the public. Visible ceiling lighting not acceptable as proposed.
3. Provide cut sheets and details on the plans.
4. Key in all architectural details on the elevations.
5. The color palette is still too dark and too cold; the palette should be warmed up.

6. Study the plaster finish; consider a smooth steel-troweled finish so as to be more in keeping with other buildings in the downtown area.
7. Parapets that are visible should have no visible sheet metal.
8. The removal of the planter at the front to accommodate the transformer location is unfortunate and not acceptable as designed.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 4/0/0. (Watkins stepped down. Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

3. 321 OCEANO AVE

R-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-071-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00347
 Owner: Brad and Cynthia Frohling Living Trust
 Architect: ACME Architecture

(This project has been revised from three to two new dwelling units. The current proposal is to construct a new two-story residential duplex consisting of a 1,765 square foot unit with a 444 square foot attached two-car garage, and a 2,037 square foot unit with a 443 square foot attached two-car garage. Related site grading, utilities, paving, drainage and landscaping are also proposed. The 7,564-square foot project site is currently developed with a 1,186-square foot one-story single family dwelling, including a 228 square foot attached two-car garage, which will be demolished.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution 077-16.)

Actual time: 4:31 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect, ACME Architecture

Public comment opened at 4:44 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued one week with comments:

1. Study reducing or eliminating the exposed drip edge on the caul edge.
2. Provide revised details for the doors and windows with a recess for all vinyl products.
3. Study reducing some of the white on the building to gray.
4. Study adding *Hominis Sporum* shade trees along the property line.

Action: Gradin/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 125 E GUTIERREZ ST****C-M Zone****(4:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-271-012
Application Number: MST2016-00056
Owner: Michael and Lisa Schlagel
Architect: Ferguson Ettinger Architects

(Proposal for a new residential building using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). Project consists of the demolition of a 1,100 square foot single family dwelling and detached 220 square foot garage, and the construction of 7,142 square foot, three-story building containing seven residential units. Unit mix will consist of 6 two-bedroom units and 1 one-bedroom unit ranging from 625 to 974 square feet with an average unit size of 815 square feet. The proposed density for this 7,050 square foot lot is 44 dwelling units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay, which allows 37-63 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are nine covered parking spaces, and seven covered bike spaces.)

(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Brett Ettinger, Architect, Ferguson Ettinger Architects

Public comment opened at 5:37 p.m.

Staff comments: Mr. Cameron advised that because of the height of the project, story poles will be required before Project Design Approval is given.

The following people spoke in support:

1. Robin Donaldson stated that he valued how the fourth story was being approached and appreciated that it was stepped back from the street, and that he believes the massing is appropriate for the neighborhood. Correspondence from Mr. Donaldson was also acknowledged.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Dolores Iniguez expressed that the project does not fit within the characteristics of the neighborhood.
2. Jose Gallegos expressed that the project is overbuilt for the neighborhood and would like to see the project reduced to the quaint aesthetic for which Santa Barbara is known.

Public comment closed at 5:42 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Provide further study on how the storm water filtration is to be accommodated and explain how it will work if it is located at the second-floor podium level.
2. Reduce the impact on the neighbors to the west by pulling back the massing and deck elements on the second and third floor.
3. Study reducing the floor to floor height wherever possible.
4. Study breaking up the repetitive linear and horizontal forms to be more in keeping with the forms at the front.
5. Reduce the amount of dark metal sidings on the larger massing areas.

6. Study reducing or eliminating the projecting cantilevers at the street.
7. Provide a complete block and a half radius neighborhood study with clear graphics showing where three- and four-story elements occur.
8. Demonstrate how the project adheres to the Haley-Milpas Design Guidelines.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 601 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA

R-2 Zone

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-261-004
 Application Number: MST2014-00422
 Owner: Teri Tuason
 Engineer: Lobana Engineering
 Designer: Frank Rogue

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a new 1,326 square foot, three-story affordable dwelling unit and a 523 square foot, two-car attached garage on a 7,405 square foot lot. There is currently an existing two-story, 2,159 square foot dwelling unit and garage on site which will be altered to remove a fireplace and add a 529 square foot rooftop deck. Total development on site will be 4,008 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a lot area modification, an open yard modification, and a zoning modification to encroach into the required front setback.)

(Eighth Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by Staff Hearing Officer.)

Actual time: 6:19 p.m.

Present: Frank Rogue, Designer; Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Megan Arcinega, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Mr. Limón confirmed that the project description is now correctly listing all modification requests, and the Staff Hearing Officer is looking for comments from the ABR on portions of the project that the ABR may have not been aware of at previous reviews. Mr. Limón asked the Board to focus its review on if the zoning modifications proposed are supportable architecturally and aid the project in being more in keeping with the neighborhood and acceptable rather than focus on how many zoning modifications are being requested.

Public comment opened at 6:30 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. b.j. Danetra asked questions regarding the accuracy of the drawings and also wanted clarification of where the square footage has decreased as the plans dimensions and project description dimensions do not match.
2. Correspondence from Trudi and Bruce Ramsey was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:35 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Verify the existing as-built elements on the south elevation.
2. Provide preliminary hand sketches of the following details:
 - a. Balcony edges and surfaces and how they will be built.

- b. How the transition from the existing flat roof with a parapet will be made to the existing porch roofs.
- c. Typical eave and rake details.
- d. Typical window detail.
3. Study lowering the roof at the stair tower element on the west side.
4. Study simplifying or eliminating the stone/concrete window surrounds.
5. Study the rooflines, stair wells, overall massing, and façade to make them less bulky and more refined.
6. Provide a section through the proposed deck.
7. Study implementing hip-roofs at the rear to match the hip-roofs at the front.

Action: Gradin/Watkins, 3/0/1. (Moore abstained. Tripp and Miller absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

6. 302 W MONTECITO ST

C-2 Zone

(5:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-232-011
Application Number:	MST2016-00426
Owner:	Edward St. George
Agent:	SEPPS
Applicant:	On Design LLC
Architect:	On Design LLC
Architect:	Interdisciplinary Architecture

(Proposal for a three-story mixed-use development consisting of a boutique hotel, café, art gallery, and mini-storage. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of two lots at 302 & 308 W. Montecito Street (APNs 037-232-011 & 037-232-002). All existing development on the two lots, consisting of four residential apartments totaling 2,540 square feet and 450 square feet of office space, will be demolished. New development on this merged 18,927 square foot parcel will be a 29,475 square foot, three-story building containing a 23,750 square foot, 32-room hotel; 850 square foot café; 4,575 square foot mini-storage for the exclusive use of hotel guests; a 300 square foot art gallery that is not accessible to the public but rather experienced from the public right-of-way; and a subterranean parking garage with 52 parking spaces (42 spaces for on-site use and 10 spaces for a new development project to be constructed at 311 W. Montecito Street). Six covered bicycle parking spaces will also be provided. There will be approximately 7,900 cubic yards of grading excavation. Planning Commission approval is required for a project involving a Transfer of Existing Development Rights from the Sandman Hotel located at 3714-3744 State Street for 29 hotel rooms, and a Development Plan for commercial square footage allotments from the Minor and Small Additions categories on both parcels.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Planning Commission review.)

Item postponed to the next available agenda due to lack of quorum.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 7:26 TO 7:49 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 813 E CARRILLO ST****R-3 Zone****(6:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-251-016
Application Number: MST2015-00602
Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a project under the Average Unit Size-Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project includes the demolition of an existing 1,428 square foot two-story house and construction of 16 affordable studio units in three two- and three-story buildings totaling 5,112 square feet. The units will be restricted to war veterans. Also proposed is a two- and three-story, 589 square foot community center, 387 square foot, two-story manager's unit with attached one-car carport, a 234 square foot manager's office, 89 square foot laundry facility, and trash enclosure. Seventeen parking spaces are required, with eight proposed. The average unit size is 357 square feet and the proposed residential density is 49 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 27 dwelling units per acre allowed on this 15,005 square foot parcel. The General Plan Land Use Designation is Medium High Density Residential, allowing 15-27 dwelling units per acre.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution 018-17.)

Actual time: 7:49 p.m.

Present: Anthony Tomasello, Senior Planner, and April Palencia, Artist, RRM Design Group

Public comment opened at 8:01 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the quality and finesse of the site and building design.
2. Study adding additional landscaping along the driveway.
3. Study relocating the bike parking to inside the interior courtyard to open up the view of to the tree.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 4/0/0. (Tripp and Miller absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 1108 OLIVE ST****R-3 Zone****(7:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-180-012
Application Number: MST2017-00108
Owner: Andre R Schneider
Architect: Bryan Pollard

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for various additions to a one-story single family residence to convert into a two-story duplex. Project is comprised of the construction of a two-story 1,529 square foot dwelling unit at the rear of the parcel as well as an 874 square foot second story addition to an existing 1,292 square foot single-family residence. Unit mix will include 1 four-bedroom unit and 1 three-bedroom unit. Also proposed are 2 two-car attached garages ranging from 401 to 520 square feet.)

(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 8:17 p.m.

Present: Bryan Pollard, Architect; and Andre R Schneider, Owner

Public comment opened at 8:34 p.m.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Greg Denginger expressed that the project is too large for the neighborhood and will obstruct views of the mountains and create privacy issues.
2. Bill Chiplis expressed concerns regarding the size of the project and feels the building is well designed but too large for the neighborhood and better suited for Montecito.
3. Sue Ellen Jackson expressed concerns for privacy, mass, bulk, and scale as well as runoff entering her property.
4. Susanne Wood expressed concerns with the mass, bulk, and scale of the project and believes because of the project's size, it will not function well on the small lot.

Public comment closed at 8:50 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members support the mass, bulk, and scale as acceptable? 2/2
Failed

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board as a whole expressed that the style of the house and detailing are appropriate.
2. Two Board members expressed that the applicant should study shifts in the floor plan to reduce the scale in the middle, at the second floor.
3. Continue to work with the neighbors.
4. Study how to best maintain visual privacy from the neighbor at the rear.
5. Provide a complete photo documentation of all houses on both sides of the block.
6. Provided a neighborhood study showing one and two story properties in the neighborhood.

Action: Gradin/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:12 P.M. ***