



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
MARCH 13, 2017

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kirk Gradin, *Chair*
Amy Fitzgerald Tripp, *Vice Chair*
Courtney Jane Miller
Kevin Moore
David R. Watkins
Wm. Howard Wittausch

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Frank Hotchkiss

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: John Campanella

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Cameron, Planning Technician
Krystal M. Vaughn, Commission Secretary

An archived video of this meeting is available at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Gradin (absent 5:35-6:23 p.m.), Miller (absent 6:42-7:38 p.m.), Moore, Tripp, Watkins (arrived at 3:06 p.m.; absent 4:30-5:35 p.m.), and Wittausch

Members absent: None

Staff present: Cameron and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **February 27, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: Tripp/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Moore abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 6, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Miller/Watkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 13, 2017**, as reviewed by Board Member Miller and Board Member Tripp.

Action: Miller/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Cameron announced the following:

- a. Board Member Watkins will be stepping down from Item 4, 3891 State Street.
- b. Board Member Miller will be stepping down from Item 7, 325 W Anapamu Street.
- c. Item 8, 1412 Castillo Street, includes a memo from Nicole Hernandez, City of Santa Barbara Urban Historian.
- d. Any Board Members needing to file their Form 700, be advised that the deadline is this Thursday.

2. Chair Gradin announced he will be stepping down from Item 5, 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez.

C. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

1. 3500 MCCAWE AVE

P-R/SD-2 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	051-230-005
Application Number:	MST2017-00066
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Applicant:	Mulligan's Cafe
Architect:	Jan Hochhauser

(Proposal for tenant improvements to the outdoor dining patio of a restaurant. The project comprises the removal of 52 feet of cast iron and the addition of 52 inch tall glass windscreens, three flat screen TVs, and the replacement of three overhead heaters at Mulligan's Cafe and Bar.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: Nigel Gomersall, Architect, Hochhauser Blatter Architecture; and Mario Medina, Owner, Mulligan's Cafe

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued one week to Consent with comments:

1. Restudy the clamp design.
2. Provide a curb under the glass.
3. Maintain columns; two-panel option is preferred.
4. The metal finish shall be unpainted.

Action: Wittausch/Watkins, 4/2/0. (Gradin and Moore opposed.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 3111 STATE ST

P-R/SD-2 Zone

(3:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	051-112-018
Application Number:	MST2016-00480
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara Parks & Recreation Department
Applicant:	Parks & Recreation Department

(Proposal for a new fenced, off-leash dog area within MacKenzie Park. The project comprises two phases: Phase I will include the demolition of a vacant 1,700 square foot building, 3,600 square feet of concrete walkways, and 500 linear feet of chain link fencing. The concrete pad for the vacant building will be repurposed as part of the off-leash dog area; Phase II will include the creation of a fenced, 6,300 square foot small dog area and a 16,000 square foot large dog area. The project includes 813 linear feet of chain link fencing, double gated entries, 1,700 square feet of ADA accessible concrete walkways, benches, water bowls, and dog waste dispensers. The project will also include the removal of four trees ranging in height from 10-15 feet including two Kumquats, one Coast Live Oak, and one Strawberry tree. There will also be upgrades to the park entry and new landscaping.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 7, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:49 p.m.

Present: Kathy Fry, Associate Planner and Keven Strasburg, Park Project Technician, Parks and Recreation, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments:

1. Study storm water use and whether permeable paving will be required.
2. Provide plant sizes and water uses.
3. Study implementing built-in, more artistic seating if available.

Action: Tripp/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 402 S HOPE AVE****E-3/P-D/SD-2 Zone**

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-017
Application Number: MST2015-00603
Owner: Santa Barbara Auto Group
Contractor: Lusardi Construction Company
Business Name: BMW/Audi

(Proposal for a 4,257 square foot one story addition to an existing 42,551 square foot commercial building for the BMW/Audi dealership. An exterior remodel of the existing one and two story building is also proposed. There will be no grading or parking lot changes on this 4.37 acre parcel. A Community Benefit allocation of nonresidential floor area was approved by City Council on January 12, 2016. Planning Commission approval of two Development Plans is required.)

(Project Design Approval is requested.)

Actual time: 4:17 p.m.

Present: Mike Ramsey, Contractor, Lusardi Construction Company; Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Jessica Grant, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Grant stated that Planning Commission approval was received for the development plan on November 10, 2016 with the condition to change existing landscape turf.

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with the comment to return with finalized details and lighting.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 3891 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-035
Application Number: MST2016-00147
Owner: Watabun USA, Inc.
Architect: Designarc
Landscape Architect: Hyphae Design Laboratory

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes the demolition of an existing two-story, 30,000 square foot commercial retail building and the construction of a new four-story mixed-use development including 85 residential units and 11,065 square feet of commercial floor area. The residential unit mix will include 12, 1-bedroom units, 68, 2-bedroom units, and 5, 3-bedroom units, with an average size of 811 square feet. The proposed density on this 1.36 acre parcel will be 63 dwelling units per acre, which is the maximum allowed on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Commercial/High Residential 49-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be a total of 192 parking spaces, including 126 covered residential spaces and 66 covered commercial spaces. Grading excavation will comprise 22,250 cubic yards. There will be 7,625 square feet of landscaping on all levels, and a 12,995 square foot roof deck with swimming pool. Planning Commission review is required.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed in an ABR pre-application consultation on April 25, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:30 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, DesignARC; Jaeson Greer, Architect and Melisa Turner, Project Manager, DesignARC; and Jessica Grant, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:57 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The project is moving in the right direction, and the Board appreciated the changes that have been made.
2. The color palette that was presented is much better than the previously proposed palette.
3. The change in materials and stone work is appreciated.
4. Study the cowls to read more as openings in massing blocks rather than projecting fins.
5. Study opportunities to further break up the horizontal line of the upper floor, and vary the massing in other ways.
6. Study opportunities to open up the long hallways.
7. Study whether there is a need for roof-mounted mechanical equipment.
8. The trees shown on the rendering appear to be appropriate choices for the development and will need to be very large box sizes when installed.
9. Provide a preliminary study of storm water treatment and how it will be addressed.
10. Show the footprint of the existing building on the floor plans of the new building.

11. Where appropriate, indicate where the garage understory parking occurs in relation to inside planting.
12. Carve out additional landscaped areas on the east and south property line to accommodate trees.
13. The four foot wide planter along the east property line should run the entire length.

Action: Wittausch/Moore, 5/0/0. (Watkins stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 103 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	017-113-020
Application Number:	MST2016-00295
Owner:	American Tradition
Agent:	Suzanne Elledge
Architect:	Mike Niemann
Architect:	R&A Architecture & Design

(Proposal for a revised parking lot and a new three-story, approximately 11,000 square foot administrative support building for back-of-house activities for a proposed hotel located at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard. The hotel is being reviewed under separate development application MST2004-00791 and the hotel design will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. Currently permitted on this 2.42 acre parcel is a parking lot serving the approved Waterfront Hotel at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard; this project would replace the parking lot approved under that application. The amount of grading is unknown at this time.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Requires Substantial Conformance Determination from the Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on January 30, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:35 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Agent; Ben Parker, Architect, R&A Architecture & Design; and Allison DeBusk, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:51 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members would support Project Design Approval as the project is presented today? 2/3 Failed

Motion: Continued to the April 24, 2017 Full Board Agenda with comments:

1. The Board appreciated all the changes that have been made, as well as the new material choices.
2. In general, the Board found the project compatible with the area.
3. The pedestrian path to the public right away needs to be studied.
4. Consider the potential use of square light windows.
5. Study the south elevation in reference to the number of windows and how they balance out throughout the project.
6. Study the French doors on the second level and how the materials transition.
7. Study the trash building massing and how it can be tied into the overall structure.

8. Study the eve and how it will get resolved.
9. Overall the project is successful in the break-up of the mass with the use of different materials.
10. Provide more detail on the guardrails.
11. Confirm if the project is in the flood zone and its relationship to its grading.
12. The Board reviewed the proposed project and found that Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Guidelines.
 - b. The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular Neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the proposed development are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites, or natural features, and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
 - e. The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to establish Public Vistas.
 - f. The design of the proposed development includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Wittausch/Watkins, 5/0/0. (Gradin stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

6. 00 BLK S VOLUNTARIO STREET 1517 SEG ID

(5:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	ROW-001-517
Application Number:	MST2017-00065
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Agent:	City of Santa Barbara

(Proposed pedestrian improvements at the intersection of Carpinteria Street and Voluntario Street. Project is comprised of a decrease in street width at pedestrian crossings, replacement of existing concrete, movement of an existing bus stop, ADA upgrades, and an expansion to curbside planters. Also proposed are 49 new streetlights on N. Voluntario Street, N. Soledad Street, and Cacique Street.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:23 p.m.

Present: Alex Ubaldo, Project Engineer and Laura Yanez, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Mr. Cameron stated that there are 15 new streetlights, not 49 as mentioned in the project description.

Public comment opened at 6:33 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members prefer the red brick over the tan? 4/2 Passed

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments:

1. Change the direction of the permeable paving to be a consistent 45-degree angle.
2. The Board prefers the use of red brick for the hardscape material.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

7. 325 W ANAPAMU ST

R-4 Zone

(5:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	039-212-004
Application Number:	MST2016-00101
Owner:	Cynthia Howard
Architect:	Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description: This is a proposal under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). Proposal to demolish an existing single family dwelling, detached garage, and shed totaling 4,390 square feet and to construct a 5,633 square foot, two-story residential apartment building housing 9 rental units. Also proposed is a 3,464 square foot carport with 10 parking spaces, 10 covered bicycle parking spaces, and a 129 square foot trash enclosure. No grading is proposed. Also proposed is the removal of five trees. Under AUD, the average unit size is 626 square feet, with a maximum allowed of 970 square feet. The proposed residential density is 40.9 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 63 dwelling units per acre allowed on this 9,585 square foot parcel with a General Plan Designation of High Density Residential in the Priority Housing Overlay.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on January, 17 2017.)

Actual time: 6:42 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective LLP; and Derrik Eichelberger, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Staff comments: Mr. Cameron stated that Project Design Approval cannot be granted as staff received the new plans today and did not have adequate time to review them.

Public comment opened at 6:52 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Claudia Bratton expressed concerns regarding parking.
2. Richard Ross expressed concerns regarding the project's size, bulk, and scale and feels the project is inappropriate for the neighborhood.
3. Cissy Ross expressed concerns regarding the size of the project and how close it is to her cottage that is near the property line.
4. Bruce Bivans expressed concerns regarding the project's size.
5. Geoffrey Ravenhill expressed appreciation for the improvements; however, he believed the back gate will be used by tenants and not for emergency use only.

6. Brett Gewirtzman also expressed appreciation for the improvements; however, he voiced the same concerns with the use of the gate off the alley, privacy, noise, and the project's contemporary design.
7. Katherine Lee expressed appreciation for the improvements as well; however, she voiced that the mass, bulk, and scale are still too large for the neighborhood, and the north elevation is still too contemporary.

Public comment closed at 7:05 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the reduction of two units and two parking spaces since the last review.
2. The Board appreciated the redesign efforts that were made to provide access off Anapamu Street rather than the alleyway.
3. Study enhancements to the outdoor living space
4. Continue to work with the neighbors to provide additional landscaping or other means of privacy, specifically along the east and west property lines.
5. Continue to develop the use of trees to screen windows.
6. Reduce or eliminate the encroachment of the second-floor deck on the south elevation to protect the privacy of the neighbor to the west.
7. Provide a study of what the railing looks like to assure that it fits within the building style.
8. Provided a usable porch for the street facing unit on Anapamu Street.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 4/1/0. (Watkins opposed. Miller stepped down). Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 1412 CASTILLO ST

R-4 Zone

(7:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-052-024
 Application Number: MST2016-00529
 Owner: Charles & Sylvia Butler Revocable Trust
 Architect: Craig Goodman

(Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise the addition of a 45 square foot bathroom to an existing 944 square foot residential unit and a 1,543 square foot second story to "Building B", as well as the permitting one 498 square foot "as-built" residential unit. Unit mix will be four, three-bedroom units and one, one-bedroom unit ranging from 498 to 1,396 square feet with an average unit size of 805 square feet. The proposed density on this 8,173 square foot parcel will be 27 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are four tandem spaces in an 894 square foot addition to the existing garage, and two uncovered spaces. Project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2016-01132.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 7:38 p.m.

Present: Craig Goodman, Architect; and Charles Butler, Owner

Public comment opened at 7:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Board members have questions regarding the viability of the project as designed, specifically regarding access to the adjacent parcel, and requests direction from staff.
2. The mass, bulk, and scale are not appropriate for the site and neighborhood as proposed.
3. Provide photographs of the neighborhood.
4. Provide verification from Transportation that all the parking and access is approvable.
5. Study reducing the paving and increasing open landscape area.
6. In general, the roof forms and massing are very complicated and need to be simplified, or in some cases restudied and redesigned.
7. Provided one site section through each new building so as to better illustrate how they are all going together.
8. It appears there may be some discrepancies in scale and measurement; upon return, verify that all drawings are to scale.
9. Restudy the anomalies of the design, such as the exceedingly high chimney.
10. Provided greater clarifications in the drawings themselves.
11. Verify that the trash enclosure size for the entire project is adequate.
12. Provide a usable front porch for the front unit facing the street.
13. Vinyl windows are not acceptable on the front unit.

Action: Gradin/Watkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:45 P.M. ***