



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, February 27, 2017 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
 AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP, *Vice-Chair*
 COURTNEY JANE MILLER
 KEVIN MOORE
 DAVID R. WATKINS
 WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MATTHEW CAMERON, Planning Technician
 KRYSTAL M. VAUGHN, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:07 p.m. by Chair Gradin

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Miller (Arrived 3:09 and Left at 6:18 p.m.), Tripp, Wittausch, and Watkins
Members absent: Moore
Staff present: Limón, Cameron, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

None

B. Approval of Minutes:

Staff comments: Mr. Limón provided direction on the types of appropriate comments that should be made as part of motions involving projects seeking zoning modifications. The Board should not vote on the supportability of zoning modifications when conducting straw votes. The Board should not focus on the number of zoning modifications being proposed but rather on any aesthetic impacts as part of a discussion on zoning modifications, specifically in reference to item 3, 601 Alameda Padre Serra, on the February 13, 2017 Full Board minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **February 13, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Tripp/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 21, 2017**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Tripp and Miller.

Action: Watkins/Miller, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 27, 2017**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Tripp and Miller.

Action: Miller/Tripp, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Cameron announced the following:

1. Board Member Moore will be absent from today's meeting.
2. Board Member Miller will be step down for Item 3, 6100 Becknell Road, and will leave at 7 p.m.
3. Board Member Gradin will step down and present Item 4, 1236 San Andres St.
4. Board member Watkins will step down from Item 5, 414 & 420 E. Carrillo St.

Jaime Limón announced that City Council will be hearing the Consideration of a Temporary Restriction on Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program Applications on Tuesday, February 28, 2017.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Vice Chair Tripp reported on the Infill Design Guideline subcommittee meeting that took place on February 21, 2017. She advised that both she and Board Member Watkins were present and that any changes made will be reviewed at today's meeting.
2. Chair Gradin reported on the City Council meeting that he attended on February 14, 2017 and discussed the Story Pole Ordinance that was adopted. Jaime Limón further discussed that meeting and advised that Council added to the ordinance, requesting all projects requiring story polls to also have a 4 foot by 8 foot board displayed with a rendering of the proposed project.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. CITYWIDE

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 099-MSC-0PD
 Application Number: MST2017-00059
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Planning Division

(Infill Design Guidelines to be inserted into existing ABR General Design Guidelines & Meeting Procedures.)

Recommendation to the City Council for adoption of proposed guidelines.

Actual time: 3:38 p.m.

Present: Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Straw vote: How many Board Members are ready to release the document as presented? 5/0 Passed

Discussion was held, the Board made two minor edits and approved the Infill Design Guideline to move forward.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 600 BLK W ANAPAMU ST 1906 SEG ID

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-906
Application Number: MST2014-00386
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to remove and replace the Anapamu Street Bridge over Old Mission Creek. The existing single span bridge is approximately 36 feet wide and 38 feet long and was constructed in 1926. A new single span bridge will be designed to meet the required standards of the City, Caltrans, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation officials (AASHTO).)

(Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project was last heard on August 17, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:48 p.m.

Present: Matthew Berger, Design Engineer; David Black, Landscape Architect; James Colton, Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara;

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the all concrete solution is preferred, no color? 5/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Board members prefer the rectangular block pattern for the stone work veneer, 24 inch high? 4/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Board members can support the traditional chorused veneer as proposed? 4/1 Passed

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval with comments:

1. Gray concrete guard walls are preferred.
2. The random cut stone, 24 inch high, traditional coursing for the veneer in Mesa Buff is preferred.

Action: Gradin/Miller, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**3. 6100 BECKNELL ROAD****A-I-1/SP-6 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065
 Application Number: MST2014-00619
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara - Airport Admin.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting
 Applicant: Direct Relief
 Architect: DMHA.

(Proposal to construct a new facility for Direct Relief, a nonprofit organization, including a new 127,706 square foot warehouse with an attached two-story 27,294 square foot administrative office building, a secure truck yard loading area, and 162 parking spaces on a 7.99 acre parcel to be purchased from the City of Santa Barbara Airport. The existing eight buildings totaling 12,937 square feet would be demolished. A new public road is proposed to be constructed immediately south of the project site, which is located in Sub-area 3 of the Airport Specific Plan (SP-6). The project received a designation as a Community Benefit project and an allocation of 80,000 square feet (and reservation of 30,000 square feet) of non-residential floor area from the Community Benefit category by the City Council. Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission is required.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must be consistent with Planning Commission Resolution No. 011-16. Project was last heard on August 15, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:13 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect, DMHA; Michelle Swanitz, DMHA; Mark Lenahan, Chairman of the Building Committee; Nicole Hornum, Landscape Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:44 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted of the architecture with comments:

1. The landscaping is to be reviewed by Historic Landmark's Landscape Architect.
2. Applicant to consider increasing the massing of the wooden benches so that they are more in alignment with the massiveness of other landscape features.

Action: Gradin/Tripp, 4/0/0. (Miller stepped down; Moore absent.) Motion carried.

ABR-PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**4. 1236 SAN ANDRES ST****R-3 Zone**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-151-001
 Application Number: MST2006-00364
 Owner: Byers Family Trust
 Architect: Kirk Gradin
 Architect: On Design
 Owner: Edward St. George

(This is a one-time, pre-application consultation for a revised residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will include the demolition of two existing residential units and an accessory structure totaling 1,636 square feet, and the construction of a 3,249 square foot building containing four residential units. The unit mix will be four, three-bedroom units ranging from 1,034 to 1,214 square feet with an average unit size of 1,108 square feet. The proposed density on this 10,000 square foot parcel will be 18 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are five covered parking spaces and a total of 225 cubic yards of cut and 25 cubic yards of fill, of which 95 cubic yards will be outside of the building footprint and 50 cubic yards will be exported off site. A Substantial Conformance Determination is requested for an interior setback modification previously granted under Planning Commission Resolution No. 01-08.)

(Comments only, this is a one-time pre-application consultation.)

Actual time: 4:51 p.m.

Vice Chair Tripp read the following statement: The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4 (b) (5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he or she is a member to present, explain, architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Kirk Gradin is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of their client.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect; Shelby Messner, Project Manager

Public comment opened at 5:05 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Board member comments:

1. Overall the Board appreciates the project and finds most of the changes acceptable.
2. The open space has a good view and appears to be accessible.
3. The different volumes in height seem to be acceptable.
4. Study modulating the north elevation to tie in the character of the building.
5. Study the standing seam roof and consider implementing pitched or parapet roofs to blend in with the pueblo design.
6. Study different window types and finishes to enhance the design; such as anodized bronze instead of clear anodized.
7. Study implementing landscaping on the ground level and upper level patios.
8. Provide details and materials for permeable driveway paving.
9. Study the possibility of using alternative colors for the yellow detectable warning pavers.
10. Restudy the overall color scheme of the project.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 414 & 420 E. CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone****(5:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00174
 Owner: 414 East Carrillo Properties, LLC
 Architect: DesignARC
 Owner: Mark Singer

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes a voluntary lot merger of 414 and 420 E. Carrillo Street, the demolition of a 4,903 square foot building at 414 E. Carrillo Street, and the construction of a new four story mixed-use building including 21 residential rental apartments and a 850 square foot addition of commercial floor area. An existing 11,700 square foot commercial building will be maintained. The residential unit mix will include six studio units, six, 1-bedroom units, and nine, 2-bedroom units, with an average size of 768 square feet. The proposed density on the combined parcels totaling 34,981 square feet will be 27 dwelling units per acre, which is the maximum allowed on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Commercial/Medium High Residential 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be a total of 57 parking spaces including 37 spaces in a ground floor parking garage and 20 uncovered spaces in a surface lot. There will be 3,145 square feet of landscaping. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to provide less than the required number of parking spaces. A shared parking analysis will be provided.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last heard on June 6, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:27 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, DesignARC; Jason Greer, Architect, DesignARC; Kimberly True, MLA, ASLA Landscape Architect, True Nature; and Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:47 p.m.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Scott Ross, neighbor, spoke in opposition with concerns regarding lack of parking, line of site, and influx of traffic/congestion in an already saturated area.
2. David Gray spoke with concerns regarding the height of the project, lack of privacy, and the incompatibility of the projects style/color.

Public comment closed at 5:52 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and indefinite continuance back to the full board with the applicant to return for an in progress review.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 4/0/0. (Watkins stepped down; Moore absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**6. 305 E HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

(6:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-211-019
Application Number: MST2017-00011
Owner: Price Living Trust
Architect: Larry Clark

(Proposal for improvements to a 22,500 square foot commercial lot currently developed with two commercial buildings (1 two-story and 1 one-story) totaling 11,000 square feet. Project will include permitting an "as-built" enclosure of an 870 square foot loading dock area that was converted to a storage area. The project also includes new stairs, an ADA ramp, three new parking spaces, one ADA compliant space, a new planter, and the removal of concrete to add landscaping along Haley Street. This proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2010-000916.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan.)

Actual time: 6:09 p.m.

Present: Larry Clark, Architect

Public comment opened at 6:13 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and return to Consent with the comment to show plants to be added and the trash enclosure.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Moore absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:18 P.M. TO 6:59 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**7. 126 E HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

(7:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-271-026
Application Number: MST2017-00016
Owner: 417 Santa Barbara Street Investment
Architect: Ab Design Studio INC

(Proposed tenant improvement for two commercial buildings sharing a single parcel. Project proposes for the renovation of a 18,683 square foot two-story building and a 11,026 square foot one-story building including a new addition to the outdoor patio, new shade canopy, and to rebuild the existing exterior stairs to comply with ADA. There will be a 513 square foot reduction in overall building area, with an extensive remodel of the facades of both buildings.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:59 p.m.

Present: Eric Behr, AB Design Studio; Matthew Beausoleil, Project Manager, AB Design Studio

Public comment opened at 7:12 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued to the next available Agenda with comments:

1. The mass, bulk, and scale, seem to be acceptable.
2. The façade remodel does not appear to fit within the Hispanic Pueblo District as described in the Haley-Milpas Design Guidelines.
3. Applicant to return with an explanation on how the projects redesign addresses the Haley-Milpas Design guidelines.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 4/0/0. (Miller and Moore absent.) Motion carried.

ABR-PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**8. 11 ANACAPA ST****OC/SD-3 Zone**

(7:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-112-010
Application Number: MST2017-00009
Owner: Richlor Living Trust
Architect: Henry Lenny

(One time pre-application consultation for proposed new restaurant in the Coastal Zone. Project includes the conversion of existing fabrication shop for a new 2,521 square-foot restaurant and bar use. A remodel will be done to the front facade of this 11,847 square-foot multi-tenant building, a new 1,834 square-foot dining patio will be built, and the existing parking lot will be reconfigured.)

(Comments only, this is a one-time pre-application consultation.)

Actual time: 7:38 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Henry Lenny Design Studio

Public comment opened at 7:47 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Board member comments:

1. The Board appreciates the design and it's potential.
2. The Board likes the steal windows and use of inset glass.
3. The Board appreciates the proposed landscape and would like the applicant to study ways to provide a buffer between the parking lot and the outdoor dining space.
4. Study implementing a more Art Deco design to the entrance door.
5. Study the possibility of adding some kind of water element to the outdoor dining space.
6. Keep the current finish of the building as it has great character and gives an antiquated feel to the structure.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**9. 422 W PADRE ST****R-3 Zone****(8:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-221-018
Application Number: MST2017-00023
Owner: Steve Mountain Family Trust
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza Architect

(Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise the demolition of an existing one-story single-family dwelling, detached garage, and a shed totaling 1,453 square feet and the construction of a 2,858 square foot multi-family apartment building housing three residential units. The unit mix will be three, two-bedroom units ranging from 883 to 1,020 square feet with an average unit size of 953 square feet. The proposed unit density on this 5,750 square foot parcel will be 23 units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium High Density 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are three one-car garages totaling 648 square feet. There will be approximately 15 cubic yards of grading excavation.)

(New Project. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan.)

Actual time: 8:03 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect

Public comment opened at 8:12 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued one month with comments:

1. The mass, bulk, and scale is generally acceptable.
2. The style chosen appears to be appropriate for the neighborhood.
3. Board Members would like to see further study given to the manner in which the walls and roof of the second floor are articulated; particularly in the area of the stairwell.
4. Provide a usable porch for the unit at the street with a minimum depth of five feet.
5. Show a trash enclosure.
6. Give some additional thought as to how the open yard area can be best utilized by the tenants.
7. Show the pedestrian way from the sidewalk to the units at the rear.

Action: Tripp/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Miller and Moore absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:33 P.M. ***