



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, February 13, 2017 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
 AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP, *Vice-Chair*
 COURTNEY JANE MILLER
 KEVIN MOORE
 DAVID R. WATKINS
 WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MATTHEW CAMERON, Planning Technician
 KRYSTAL M. VAUGHN, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Chair Gradin

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Miller, Moore, Tripp, Wittausch (Arrived at 3:10 p.m.), and Watkins
Members absent: None
Staff present: Cameron and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

None.

The Board Acknowledged a letter received from Richard Ross and discussed how to address concerns raised about how public comment is conducted.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 30, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: Tripp/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 6, 2017**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Miller and Tripp.

Action: Miller/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 13, 2017**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Miller and Tripp.

Action: Miller/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Cameron announced that the following items were postponed indefinitely:

1. 1412 Castillo Street
2. 1124 Castillo Street

Jaime Limón announced the following:

1. Planning Commission (PC) will be reviewing the Infill design guidelines on February 16, 2017.
2. The City Council meeting on February 14, 2017 will review the proposal for story pole requirements on an Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD) projects and Design Review Chairs have been invited to attend.
3. The City Council meeting on February 28, 2017 will review possible AUD restrictions and pause in applications.
4. City Council did accept the proposal of extending project notices to property tenants and the implementation may affect the community presence at future Design Review meetings.

Tony Boughman addressed the Board and confirmed an Infill Design Guideline subcommittee meeting will be held on February 21, 2017 at 2 p.m. to review PC comments.

C. Subcommittee Reports.

There were none.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

1. CITYWIDE

C-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00560
 Owner: I&G Direct Real Estate 3, LP
 Owner: Paseo Nuevo LLC
 Applicant: Museum of Contemporary Art
 Owner: Various Locations

(Concept review for a proposal from the Museum of Contemporary Art: Santa Barbara for a temporary, travelling art installation at various locations throughout Santa Barbara.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Audrey Lopez, Curator of Community Engagement, Museum of Contemporary Art; and Jaime Limon, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:45 p.m.

The following people spoke in support:

1. Makayla Rawling
2. Elizabeth Arras
3. Amanda Allen
4. Michael Montenegro

Public comment closed at 3:51 p.m.

Motion: Concept, Project Design, and Final Approval as submitted with the comment that City Staff examine the projects safety liability.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 5/1/0. (Gradin opposed) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 3344 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-324-014
 Application Number: MST2016-00280
 Owner: Everquest Lodge, INC
 Architect: Ab Design Studio, INC

(Proposal for an addition and alterations to an existing two-story, 8,304 square foot motel on a 27,443 square foot parcel. The proposed improvements include a 985 square foot lobby addition and exterior renovations. The work will comprise new doors, windows, building siding, and roof throughout, and replacement of the following: hardscape elements, walls, fencing, pool equipment enclosure, pool coping, trash enclosure, trellises, planters, and parking lot paving. Also proposed are new walkways, curb cuts, parking lot restriping, bicycle parking, ADA ramp, outdoor fireplace, pool enclosure, spa, and permeable paving. Two 30' tall Queen palm trees will be removed, as well as a four-trunk 15' tall King palm tree. This project addresses zoning violations identified in Enforcement Case ENF2013-01400.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution #080-16.)

Actual time: 4:10 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, AB Design Studio, Inc; Eric Behr, Architect, AB Design Studio, Inc; and Susan Raymond, Landscape Architect, RLA, Rob Maday Landscape Architecture

Public comment opened at 4:20 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the muntin bars, as shown on the elevations, should be true divided lights? 5/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel this project could return on Consent? 0/6 Failed

Straw vote: How many Board Members would agree to add the condition that the boards and batts be true boards and batts at 12 inches on center as opposed to simulated? 4/2 Passed

- Motion: Project Design Approval and indefinite continuance with the following comments**
1. The Board likes and appreciates the projects direction
 2. In general, the Board supports the architectural style, detailing and massing of the changes proposed.
 3. Study reducing the height of the walls adjacent to sidewalk at the driveway entrance and pull them back away from the sidewalk to provide a planter adjacent to the sidewalk.
 4. It is expected that the windows are true divided lights.
 5. Study the possibility of a vegetated swale along the Amapola Drive side as a replacement for the filtration filter.
 6. The Board prefers a standing seam option for the roof.
- Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

- 3. 601 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA R-2 Zone**
- (4:10)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-261-004
 Application Number: MST2014-00422
 Owner: Teri Tuason
 Engineer: Lobana Engineering
 Designer: Frank Rogue

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a new 1,326 square foot, 3-story affordable dwelling unit and a 523 square foot, 2-car attached garage on a 7,405 square foot lot. There is currently an existing 2-story, 2,159 square foot dwelling unit and garage on site which will be altered to remove a fireplace and add a 529 square foot rooftop deck. Total development on site will be 4,008 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a lot area modification and a zoning modification to encroach into the required front setback.)

(Comments Only. Project requests comments on elements requiring a Modification. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer Approval.)

Actual time: 4:52 p.m.

Present: Frank Rogue, Architect; and Teri Tuason, Owner; and Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Megan Arciniega advised that the project description should read as follows: Proposal for a new 1,348 square foot, 3-story affordable dwelling unit and a 523 square foot, 2-car attached garage on a 7,405 square foot lot. There is currently an existing 2-story, 2,159 square foot dwelling unit and garage on site which will be altered to remove a fireplace and add a 259 square foot rooftop deck. Total development on site will be 4,030 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for 1) a lot area modification, 2) a front setback modification, and an 3) open yard modification.

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. b.j. Danetra spoke in opposition and wanted clarification on where the tower is being measured from and why lot modification were automatically considered, disregarding zoning laws, as opposed to keeping the design within the lots limitations.
2. Terri Gray has concerns regarding the height of the project and feels it is excessive and would like the Board to consider requesting story poles.
3. Mark Gamson requested story poles be put up to better understand the project.
4. A Letter of expressed concern from Bruce and Trudi Ramsey was received by the Board.

Public comment closed at 5:14 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the project as proposed with the three modifications? 0/4 Failed

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board does not support the project as designed and finds that a redesign of the project is needed to make the project more compatible with the neighborhood.
2. A redesign is suggested to further reduce the size of the project in order to support the inclusion of an affordable unit.
3. The Board does not support encroachments into the front yard or the open yard modification as they contribute to the overall size, bulk, and scale of the project. One method to achieve compatibility for the project is to study eliminating modifications that are requested to bring the project more in conformance with zoning.
4. Applicant to return with plans that are correct in scale.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 4/0/2. (Moore and Watkins Stepped down.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 36 HITCHCOCK WAY****R-2/SD-2 Zone****(4:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-059
 Application Number: MST2016-00322
 Owner: Channel Islands YMCA
 Applicant: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Channel Islands YMCA

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to remove 26 mature Eucalyptus trees and two Canary island pine trees ranging in height from 25' to 100'. There will be 29 new trees planted including 20 Coast live oaks, eight Western sycamores, and one Canary island pine. Two existing Blue gum eucalyptus trees along the riparian corridor will be pruned. This project has received an exemption from landscape design standards for water conservation from the Public Works Director.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval requested.)

Actual time: 5:43 p.m.

Present: Bob Cunningham, Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 5:50 p.m.

Edward Steinfeld spoke in support of the project.

Public comment closed at 5:52 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval with the comment that the applicant is to replace the new *pinus canariensis* with alternative skyline trees such as sycamore.

Action: Miller/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

5. 122 W FIGUEROA ST

C-2 Zone

(5:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-222-012
 Application Number: MST2016-00579
 Owner: James G. Pattillo
 Architect: Bob Kupiec

(Proposal for tenant improvements to an existing one-story, 7,500 square foot, 3-unit commercial office building. Improvements include voluntary seismic upgrades, new fire sprinkler systems, interior renovations and HVAC improvements.)

(Project Design and Final Approval requested.)

Actual time: 5:57 p.m.

Present: Bob Kupiec, Architect, Kupiec Architects; James G. Pattillo Applicant; and Bruda Smith, Kupiec Architects

Public comment opened at 6:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the parapet should be carried down the remainder of the building? 6/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Board Members are fine with no reveal? 3/3 Failed

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval and continued one week to Consent with comments:

1. The Board is very appreciative of the upgrade to the building and the new façade treatments.
2. Doors and windows are to be true divided lights.
3. Implement an enhanced parapet design to some portion of the east façade to coincide with the new parapet at the front.
4. Provide a parapet cap that does not have exposed metal.
5. Provide coffers at the ceiling entrances.
6. Provide enhanced paving at the entrances.
7. Provide a site section or photographic study that verifies the non-visibility of the new HVAC units on the roof.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 1810 SAN PASCUAL ST****R-3 Zone****(6:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-163-010
 Application Number: MST2016-00443
 Owner: Antonio & Norma Gijon
 Applicant: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). An existing 1,212 square foot single family dwelling and 512 square foot detached garage will be demolished and a two-story building with four, two-bedroom apartments totaling 4, 160 square feet and four, 517 square foot 2-car garages will be constructed. Bicycle parking will be provided. The proposed density on this 8,503 square foot parcel will be 21 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of 15-27 dwelling units per acre, and the average unit size will be 1,040 square feet. There will be 2,027 square feet of new paving. No grading is proposed, and no trees will be removed.)

(Comments only, project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:30 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Applicant

Public comment opened at 6:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. In general the Board believes the scale of the building and style that's chosen is appropriate for the site and neighborhood.
2. The Board would like to see enhanced detailing and shifts in roof massing to enhance the charm of the architecture.
3. The front porch should be a usable porch, five to seven feet deep minimum.
4. Study ways to vary the fenestration and gable ends that face the street.
5. Study ways to modify and articulate the roof line across the south elevation.
6. Consider a trim at the windrow and other changes, such as the wall finish material, to enhance the architecture.
7. Relocate the underground retention shown at the front yard to be under the driveway.
8. Study enhancing the entrance to the two middle units.
9. Reduce the width of the balcony for the two middle units that are facing the driveway.
10. The planters along the driveway should be at a minimum of five foot square.
11. Study and show bike parking on the plan.
12. Verify accessibility issues that may occur with the project.
13. Show how refuse will be accommodated.
14. If vinyl clad windows are proposed return with preliminary detail on how they would be handled.
15. Provide a better definition for outdoor open space and how it will be used.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:15 P.M. ***