



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, January 30, 2017 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
 AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP, *Vice-Chair*
 COURTNEY JANE MILLER
 KEVIN MOORE
 DAVID R. WATKINS
 WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MATTHEW CAMERON, Planning Technician
 KRYSTAL M. VAUGHN, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Vice Chair Tripp

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin (arrived at 3:03 p.m.), Miller, Moore, Tripp (until 7:16 p.m.), Wittausch (arrived at 3:16 p.m.), and Watkins
Members absent: None
Staff present: Jaime Limón (until 7:10 p.m.), Cameron, and Vaughn

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

None.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Board comments:

The Board would like to add additional comments to Item 4, 401 & 409 E Haley Street, on the 1/17/17 Full Board minutes, under comment number 7, as clarification on how the project falls within the Haley/Milpas design manual.

Item 4, 401 & 409 E Haley Street, comment number 7e and 7f would read as follows:

- e. The use of simple forms to create bold architectural statements.
- f. The use of shade and shadow used to create visual interest and to highlight the depth of recesses.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 17, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Gradin/ Moore, 4/0/2. (Wittausch and Miller abstain.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 30, 2017**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Wittausch and Miller.

Action: Gradin/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

Mr. Cameron announced the following:

1. Vice Chair Tripp will step down after Item 5, 1600 Block of Laguna Street, for the remainder of the meeting.
2. Chair Gradin will step down for Item 6, 1005 N Milpas St.
3. Board Member Moore will step down for Item 7, 715 Bond Ave.
4. A handout has been provided to the Board announcing that the Las Positas Multi-Use Project will be going to Planning Commission.

C. Subcommittee Reports:

There were none.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1. 103 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-020

Application Number: MST2016-00295

Owner: American Tradition

Agent: Suzanne Elledge

Architect: Mike Niemann

Architect: R&A Architecture & Design

(Proposal for a revised parking lot and a new three-story, approximately 11,000 square foot administrative support building for back-of-house activities for a proposed hotel located at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard. The hotel is being reviewed under separate development application MST2004-00791 and the hotel design will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. Currently permitted on this 2.42 acre parcel is a parking lot serving the approved Waterfront Hotel at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard; this project would replace the parking lot approved under that application. The amount of grading is unknown at this time.)

(Third Concept Review. Requires Substantial Conformance Determination from the Planning Commission. Project was last reviewed on December 19, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:24 p.m.

Present: Ben Anderson, Architect; Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect; Suzanne Elledge, Agent;

and Alison DeBusk, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:45 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued to the next available Full Board Agenda with comments:

1. Study alternate colors of the proposed metal finish or alternate combinations of exterior finishes.
2. Overall massing is appropriate for the area and site.
3. The Board appreciated the site plan and the quality of the landscape/hardscape design.
4. Study the amount of the south and west facing glazing.
5. Study the proportions of the windows to provide a more poetic and charming solution to the fenestrations and look towards other examples on Cesar Chavez for proportions.
6. The Board appreciated that the surface materials were solids and not veneers.
7. The Board appreciated the quality and design of the trellis and fencing along the street.

Action: Moore/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 1935 BATH ST

R-4 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-352-006
 Application Number: MST2016-00336
 Applicant: Gregory Jenkins
 Owner: James Elizabeth Bastian

(Proposal to permit the as-built conversion of an existing 655 square foot detached garage to an additional dwelling unit on an 8,400 square foot parcel. Current development on site is a 1,228 square foot single-family dwelling and the detached garage. The project will result in a total of two dwelling units and will include the construction of a new 415 square foot two-car carport and a 262 square foot one-car carport, for a total of three covered parking spaces. Also proposed is to permit an as-built arbor at the front lot line. A total of 2,560 square feet of development is proposed. This project will address violations identified in Enforcement case ENF2016-00156 and Zoning Information Report 2016-00040. This project requires Staff Hearing Officer approval for a Zoning Modification to encroach into two required interior setbacks, and to allow three parking spaces instead of the required four.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on December 19, 2016)

Actual time: 4:12 p.m.

Present: Gregory Jenkins, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:18 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

1. The existing non-conforming one bedroom apartment appears to pose no adverse visuals impacts.
2. The proposed construction is in keeping with the design of the existing architecture and is acceptable.
3. Provide a landscape plan that shows a big box tree replacement for the existing mature tree.

Action: Gradin/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

PRE-APPLICATION CONSULTATION**3. 302 W MONTECITO ST****C-2 Zone****(4:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-232-011
 Application Number: MST2016-00426
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Applicant: On Design LLC
 Architect: On Design LLC
 Agent: SEPPS
 Architect: Interdisciplinary Architecture

(Pre-application consultation of a proposal for a three-story mixed-use development consisting of a boutique hotel, café, art gallery, and mini-storage. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of two lots at 302 & 308 W. Montecito Street (APNs 037-232-011 & 037-232-002). All existing development on the two lots, consisting of four residential apartments totaling 2,540 square feet and 450 square feet of office space, will be demolished. New development on this merged 18,927 square foot parcel will be a 29,475 square foot, three-story building containing a 23,750 square foot, 32-room hotel; 850 square foot café; 4,575 square foot mini-storage for the exclusive use of hotel guests; a 300 square foot art gallery that is not accessible to the public but rather experienced from the public right-of-way; and a subterranean parking garage with 52 parking spaces (42 spaces for on-site use and 10 spaces for a new development project to be constructed at 311 W. Montecito Street). Six covered bicycle parking spaces will also be provided. There will be approximately 7,900 cubic yards of grading excavation. Planning Commission approval is required for a project involving a Transfer of Existing Development Rights from the Sandman Hotel located at 3714-3744 State Street for 29 hotel rooms, and a Development Plan for commercial square footage allotments from the Minor and Small Additions categories on both parcels.)

(Comments only. One time review with limited plans presented. Project will require Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 4:30 p.m.

Present: Timothy Gorter, Principle Architect; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; and Sam Maphis, Landscape architect

Public comment opened at 4:52 p.m.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Susan Mellor had concerns regarding traffic being brought into the area.
2. Bonnie Donavon inquired on if there would be an Environmental Impact Report done on the project and if conditions would be made to not allow the property to be converted from a hotel to a dormitory.
3. Leslie Colasse had concerns regarding the roof deck and feels it is unnecessary for the area.

Public comment closed at 4:55 p.m.

Board comments:

1. The Board appreciated how the building is pushed away from the street.
2. The Board appreciated the intent to integrate the mature trees that are existing around the site.
3. The Board appreciated the amount of research that has been considered as well as the overall presentation of the project.
4. There was large support for the art component of the project as well as the concept for the parklet.
5. Re-study the massing of the project.
6. Re-study the courtyard at the podium level and consider pulling the massing in or starting the roof deck at the podium level.

7. Further develop the street scape and consider implementing furniture.
8. Study enlarging the art gallery space so that it can be occupiable.
9. Consider reducing the storage space element so as to better integrate the sidewalk element with the art gallery.
10. Study the projects relationship to its adjacent neighbors as well as those with access off Bath St.
11. Study implementing more of the West Beach area style.
12. Articulate the mass further to make the project less monolithic.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 835 E CANON PERDIDO ST

C-2 Zone

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-312-008
 Application Number: MST2016-00531
 Owner: Philinda Properties
 Architect: RRM Design Group
 Applicant: Old Dairy Partners LLC

(Proposal for a three-story, 50-unit multi-family residential development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal will include a voluntary lot merger of three lots totaling 34,780 square feet and the demolition of approximately 19,000 square feet of one- and two-story commercial and industrial buildings. The unit mix will include 26, 2-bedroom units and 24 studio units with an average unit size of 642 square feet. The proposed density will be 63 dwelling units per acre, the maximum allowed on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Density Residential, 37 - 63 dwelling units per acre within the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 50 covered parking spaces and 50 covered bicycle spaces. Also proposed is a 1,842 square foot rooftop deck, photovoltaic panels, and a trash enclosure. Grading is yet to be determined. This project requires Planning Commission review for an AUD project on a parcel exceeding 15,000 square feet.)

(Second Concept Review. Project was last reviewed on January 3, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:45 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect, RRM Design Group; and Lisa Plowmen, Planning Manager, RRM Design Group

Public comment opened at 6:04 p.m.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Christine Newhauser had concerns regarding the density of the project and how it will negatively impact the community.
2. Leslie Colasse had concerns regarding the flatness and repetitiveness of the architecture and feels it's too modern.
3. Natalia Govoni had concerns regarding AUD projects in general and feels the size and density of this project will negatively impact the community.

Public comment closed at 6:12 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members could support the request for story poles? 2/4 Fail

Straw vote: How many Board Members could support the implementation of more flat tile caps? 2/4 Fail

Straw vote: How many Board Members could support the drawings as presented today in terms of stylistic vernacular? 4/2 Pass

Motion: Continued to Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:

1. The Board was very appreciative of the significant change and shift of design that was accomplished by the architect.
2. The Board advised that the project is moving in the right direction.
3. The Board agreed that the projects new design is more in keeping with the neighborhood in terms of massing and style.
4. The Board would like to see more poetry and charm in reference to the massing and fenestration.
5. Study further articulation of the flatter 3 story masses.
6. Study adding additional variety to the third story parapet line.
7. Study the use or impact of using stacked parking to free up ground floor/upper level open space.
8. Provide additional graphics to help the Board understand how this project will fit within its area, specifically a 2 dimensional street scape, 3 dimensional massing study and site sections are requested.

Action: Miller/Wittausch, 5/1/0. (Watkins opposed) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**5. 1600 BLK LAGUNA STREET****(6:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-000-844
 Application Number: MST2016-00553
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for the installation of a new Verizon Wireless facility consisting of a Cantenna to be installed on top of an existing 30' utility pole within Public Right of Way. Also proposed is the installation of a 4'-8" x 2'-3" equipment pad and new meter and equipment cabinet.)

(Action may be taken is sufficient information has been provided. Requires No Visual Impact Findings.)

Actual time: 7:16 p.m.

Present: Ben Hacksted, Agent, Sequoia Deployment Services

Public comment opened at 7:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 7:34 P.M. TO 7:56 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 1005 N MILPAS ST****R-3 Zone**

(7:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-251-012
 Application Number: MST2016-00506
 Owner: Steven Dahl
 Architect: Banyan Architects

(Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise the demolition of an existing 1,055 single-family dwelling and 270 square foot detached garage and construction of a 3,579 square foot, two- and three-story building housing four residential units. The unit mix will be two, 2-bedroom units and two, 3-bedroom units ranging in size from 881 to 902 square feet, with an average unit size of 894 square feet. The proposed density on this 7,579 square foot parcel will be 23 units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are four, 1-car garages, covered bicycle parking, a trash enclosure, and 1,017 square feet of second and third story patio areas. There will be 60 cubic yards of grading excavation and 630 cubic yards of fill dirt.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project requires Conditions of Approval for the AUD Annual Residents Survey.)

Actual time: 7:56 p.m.

Board Member Wittausch read the following statement: The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4 (b) (5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he or she is a member to present, explain, architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Kirk Gradin is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of their client.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect, Banyan Architects; and Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 8:12 p.m.

Mike Lewis spoke in opposition due concerns regarding the removal of the eugenia hedge that runs between his the projects property line and would like the hedge to be preserved if possible.

Public comment closed at 8:16 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval.

Action: Watkins/Miller, 4/0/0. (Tripp absent) Motion carried.

*** Discussion for item 6 was re-opened at 8:40 p.m. ***

Revised Motion: Project Design and Final Approval with the Condition of an Annual Resident Survey and the CEQA 15183 finding:

1. The Annual Resident Survey report for each unit shall include:
 - a. Net floor area.
 - b. Number of bedrooms.
 - c. Monthly rent.
 - d. Periods of vacancy.
 - e. Household size.
 - f. Employment location of each resident by zip code.
 - g. Number of automobiles owned by each household.
2. The Board found that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Miller/Watkins, 4/0/0. (Tripp absent) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**7. 715 BOND AVE****C-2 Zone****(7:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-231-015
 Application Number: MST2015-00198
 Owner: Monica Elias Calles-Gonzalez
 Architect: Kevin Moore

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a new multifamily development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project includes a 1,577 square foot, one-story addition to an existing 1,136 square foot, one-story single-family dwelling, resulting in a 3-unit apartment building. An existing carport and shed foundation will be removed, the existing driveway will be replaced with permeable pavers, and three uncovered parking spaces will be provided at the rear. Also proposed are new decks and six covered bicycle parking spaces. The unit mix will comprise two, one bedroom units and one, three bedroom unit, with an average of 518 square feet. The proposed density on this 5,000 square foot parcel will be 26 dwelling units per acre with a General Plan land use designation of 37-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be no grading. One tree is proposed to be removed from the rear yard.)

(Second Concept Review. If project is ready for Project Design Approval requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. This project was last reviewed on December 19, 2016.)

Actual time: 8:27 p.m.

Chair Gradin read the following statement: The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4 (b) (5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he or she is a member to present, explain, architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Kevin Moore is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of their client.

Present: Kevin Moore,

Public comment opened at 8:36 p.m.

Sheila Lodge spoke with concerns and wanted to clarify where the parking would be located, express her general dislike of AUD projects, and mention that this AUD project was not as bad as others in the city.

Public comment closed at 8:37 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the project could return on Consent instead of Full Board?
4/1 Pass

Motion: Project Design Approval with the CEQA 15183 finding and return to Consent with comments:

1. Applicant to return with details and landscaping.
2. The Board found that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 4/0/0. (Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:50 P.M. ***