



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, December 05, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER
KEVIN MOORE
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 GABRIELE M. COOK, Acting Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Cung (left at 5:57 p.m.), Hopkins, Miller, Moore, Tripp and Wittausch (arrived at 3:17 p.m.).
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Gantz, Jaime (arrived 3:21 p.m.), and Cook.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **November 21, 2016**, as amended.

Action: Hopkins/Moore, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Wittausch absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 28, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Wittausch (all items).

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Wittausch absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **December 5, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Miller and Wittausch.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Wittausch absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Board Member Cung announced that this will be his last meeting as a member of the ABR.
2. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) The regularly scheduled ABR meeting of 2017 on January 3rd has been reinstated and, since electronic equipment upgrades in this room will occur in the morning and early afternoon, the 1pm ABR Consent meeting has been cancelled.
 - b) Board Member Miller will step down from Item #1 at 219 E. Haley Street.
3. Steve Greer, Environmental Analyst, City of Santa Barbara, announced that relative excerpts from the Mitigated Negative Declaration for the Las Positas Multi-Use Path project, scheduled for the December 19 ABR meeting, will be handed out at the end of today's meeting due to the extensive nature of the document.
4. Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara, discussed scheduling a special lunch meeting Friday, December 9, 2016 from 12 p.m. – 1 p.m. to review the Draft Infill Design Guidelines.

ABR-PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

1. 219 E HALEY ST

C-M Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-014
 Application Number: MST2016-00078
 Owner: Price Living Trust
 Architect: Shaun Lynch

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program. The proposal includes the demolition of seven existing structures housing eight residential units totaling 3,416 square feet and the construction of a three story, mixed-use development. The residential unit mix will include 28, 2-bedroom, units and eight, 1-bedroom units totaling 29,198 square feet, with an average unit size of 811 square feet. Also proposed are two commercial spaces totaling 2,018 square feet. Total development on site will be 32,908 square feet. The proposed density on this 25,113 square foot parcel will be 63 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial Industrial/Medium High Residential, 37-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 37 covered parking spaces for the residential units and nine covered parking spaces for the commercial area, with 44 spaces required. Grading is yet to be determined. Planning Commission approval is required.)

(Comments only; one-time pre-application consultation review with limited plans presented.)

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills and Greg Christman, DMHA; Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Board Member comments:

1. Board Member Wittausch appreciated the planning, however, expressed that, architecturally, the project does not fit in the neighborhood. He had concerns regarding the style, scale, and limited amount of open space. He suggested removing one unit for every five on the upper floors and reducing the floor-to-floor heights. He recommended that the project be stepped back from the property line and the unit layout be studied, as it is repetitive.
2. Board Member Tripp expressed that a mixed-use project makes sense for the area. As far as the approach and layout, the front façade is moving in the right direction. She suggested that the mass be separated into two elements to make it feel like two buildings. She echoed Board Member Wittausch's sentiment that losing a unit would be helpful to break up the massing. She advised breaking up the massing on the east and west elevations and breaking up the podium to make it relate to the site and adjacent buildings.
3. Board Member Moore echoed Board Member Tripp's comments regarding the mixed-use project being good for the area. He expressed concerns regarding too much mass being pushed too aggressively toward the street and property line. He appreciated the idea of the paseo, however, is concerned about the third floor bridge blocking the paseo from being open to the sky. He suggested studying privacy impacts and livability of the second level units. He also suggested studying repositioning the units to take advantage of mountain views, as it may enhance livability. Board Member Moore advised opening the middle mass over the garage entrance to allow the paseo to be more exposed to the street and to study pulling back some contemporary shapes and forms of the project. He felt conflicted about Haley/Milpas Design Manual and how it relates to AUD projects.
4. Board Member Hopkins expressed that the project feels tight and squeezed, that it is too close to the property line. He appreciated the angles and third floor paseo, however, the second floor paseo does not feel livable. He expressed concerns regarding the entrance as it feels tight and is not gracious. He echoed Board Member Moore's thought that the paseo should open up to the street. He advised studying the cohesiveness of style and materials as well as the roofline and podium level as they are too monotonous as presented.
5. Board Member Cung agreed with Board Member Hopkins' comments. He expressed concern regarding the direction of AUD projects in Santa Barbara and how it will affect Haley Street. He appreciated the open spaces provided but encouraged the open spaces be workable, not just breaking up the massing. He expressed concern regarding the third floor of the project and the number of units. He echoed Board comments regarding removing several units in order to break up the massing. He advised studying the massing, particularly in middle, and providing more light on all floors. Board Member Cung could support a two story building with a third story stepped back. He advised consideration of adjacent neighbors.
6. Board Member Gradin agreed with comments made by the Board. He expressed that the project needed to accommodate itself to the neighborhood, and to respect its neighbors by providing more relief at the property lines. He advised that, as presented, the mass, bulk and scale are not acceptable for the neighborhood. The light, air, and landscaping are insufficient and the livability needs to be addressed. He expressed concern regarding the architectural style and how it relates to the guidelines and neighborhood. He appreciated the design efforts.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 321 OCEANO AVE****R-2/SD-3 Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-071-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00347
 Owner: Brad & Cynthia Frohling Living Trust
 Architect: Acme Architecture

(This project has been revised from three to two new dwelling units. The current proposal is to construct a new two-story residential duplex consisting of a 1,765 square foot unit with a 444 square foot attached 2-car garage, and a 2,037 square foot unit with a 443 square foot attached 2-car garage. Related site grading, utilities, paving, drainage and landscaping are also proposed. The 7,564-square foot project site is currently developed with a 1,186-square foot one-story single family dwelling, including a 228 square foot attached 2-car garage, which will be demolished. This project requires Staff Hearing Officer approval of a lot area modification and a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 077-16. Project was last reviewed on October 10, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:19 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect; and Karen Brody, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:26 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support this item coming back to Full Board for final approval? 5/2 (passed).

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments.

1. Restudy the location and arrangement of the trash enclosure.
2. Study providing a larger step between the roof elements as it descends to the rear.
3. Study providing landscaping opportunities (one or two shade trees) along the south property line.

Action: Gradin/Cung, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**3. 2840 DE LA VINA ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-220-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00417
 Owner: Storch Family Living Trust
 Architect: David Hardister, AIA
 Business Name: Grocery Outlet Bargain Market

(Proposal for a new facade on the existing Ralph's shopping center. Also proposed are new railings and 28 square feet of concrete sidewalk fill in at the rear truck dock to expand the sidewalk for forklift use. Some of the existing ADA parking spaces will be relocated but the overall number of parking spaces will remain the same. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Project was last

reviewed on October 7, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:49 p.m.

Present: David Hardister, Architect; and Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:55 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the Mission style approach as presented? 2/5
 How many Board members could support the Midcentury style approach as presented? 5/2
 How many Board members could support either approach with additional work? 5/2

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with comments:**

1. The Board felt both options could work if more details/studies are provided.
2. Santa Barbara style: study how the windows relate to the arcade.
3. Midcentury style: study providing more openings and glass on the ground floor instead of a wood screen and tie the two elevations (facing De La Vina/parking lot) together.

Action: Cung/Hopkins, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Gradin opposed).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 321 E MICHELTORENA ST

R-3 Zone

(5:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-251-014

Application Number: MST2016-00383

Owner: Hathaway Family Trust

Architect: Acme Architecture

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a new multi-family development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal will include the demolition of 1,408 square feet of impermeable paving and 158 lineal feet of fencing and the construction of a two-story duplex with an attached, 743 square foot, three-car garage at the rear of the site. An existing 1,428 square foot, one-story, three bedroom dwelling unit at the front of the site will remain unaltered. The unit mix will include one, 3-bedroom unit and two, 2-bedroom units totaling 3,097 square feet, with an average unit size of 1,032 square feet. The proposed density on this 6,664 square foot parcel will be 20 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. The proposal also includes removal of one 47' tall palm tree, one 12' tall Pittosporum tree, and a 64 foot long hedge encroaching onto the public alley. Grading will comprise 10 cubic yards of excavation and 60 cubic yards of fill dirt. This parcel is located within the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Lower Riviera Special Design District findings of approval and an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on November 7, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:25 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect; Laurie Romano, Landscape Architect; Trish Allen, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting.

Public comment opened at 5:37 p.m.

Letters of support from Dario Pini, John Winsor, the proprietor of Riviera Market, and Santos Leow, were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:38 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and indefinite continuance to In-Progress review, with comments:

1. Study enhancing the small third floor stair element to appear more as a cupola.
2. Study the southwest corner and south elevations to provide a better alignment between the 2nd story projection and garage openings below and allow corner hip roof to complete itself.
3. Study creating flat, usable open spaces with more privacy using taller plantings.
4. The Board found that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City Staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
5. The Lower Riviera Special Design District (Bungalow District) findings were made:
 - a) Expressed conditions of approval have been imposed on the proposed development which appropriately incorporate the existing structures or architectural features or other aspects of the these structures (or of the site involved) into the new development, or these structures, features or aspects will be appropriately replicated in the new development; and
 - b) The proposed development will not substantially diminish the unique architectural style and character of the Bungalow District as a residential neighborhood of the City.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:57 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 6:25 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 401 & 409 E HALEY STREET

C-M Zone

(6:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-212-018
 Application Number: MST2016-00508
 Owner: Laguna Haley Studios II, LLC
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.

(Proposal for a new mixed-use development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project will include a voluntary lot merger of Assessor parcels 031-212-017 and 031-212-018 which will result in one parcel of 22,500 square feet. All existing residential and commercial structures totaling 5,828 square feet will be demolished. The proposal will include construction of a three-story, mixed-use building with 29 residential units totaling 22,497 square feet and three commercial spaces totaling 3,306 square feet. A ground level parking garage will provide 58 parking spaces. Roof decks are also proposed. The residential unit mix will include six studios, nine, 1-bedroom units and 14, 2-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 775 square feet. The proposed density on this parcel will be 56 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Commercial, Industrial, Priority Housing, 37-63 dwelling units per acre. No grading is proposed. This project requires Planning Commission approval.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 6:25 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Jason Green, Architects

Public comment opened at 6:38 p.m.

1) Dominic Rios, expressed concerns regarding possible noise complaints by residents against his garage.

Public comment closed at 6:40 p.m.

Motion: Continued six weeks to Full Board with comments:

1. The Board found that, in general, the mass, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
2. There was concern, by at least half the Board members, about the pedestrian impacts of the third story elements along Haley Street.

Action: Gradin/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 2900 BLK CLIFF DR 2945 SEG ID

(7:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-945

Application Number: MST2016-00505

Contractor: Cable Engineering Services

Owner: City of Santa Barbara - Public Works

(Proposal for AT&T Mobility to remove an existing 40'-0" tall wood power pole without wireless equipment and install a new wood pole of the same height with a new Cantenna mounted on top. This installation site is a temporary interim location due to the roundabout project construction. No other work is proposed.)

(Requires No Visual Impact findings and Coastal Review.)

Actual time: 7:24 p.m.

Present: Peter Hilger, Applicant

Public comment opened at 7:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval with the condition that the pole be located a minimum of three feet from the edge of the bike path. No Visual Impact findings were made.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:35 P.M. ****