



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, November 7, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER
KEVIN MOORE
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KRYSTAL M. VAUGHN, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin (left at 5:47 p.m.), Hopkins, Miller, Moore, Tripp and Wittausch.
Members absent: Cung
Staff present: Limón, Gantz and Vaughn.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes **October 24, 2016**, as amended.
Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 5/0/0. (Miller abstained; Cung absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 31, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Miller and Gradin.
Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. (Cung absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Ms. Gantz announced the following:

- a. Chair Gradin will leave the meeting at the conclusion of Item 4.
- b. Board Member Cung will be absent from today's meeting.
- c. Board Member Miller will step down from Item 3 at 3111 State Street.
- d. Board Member Moore will step down from Item 4 at 3714 State Street.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Member Gradin reported that an Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) subcommittee report would be distributed to the Board and a meeting would be scheduled to collectively discuss the report collectively.
2. Mr. Limón announced that there will be a discussion item on the November 21, 2016 agenda to provide the Board with the opportunity to collectively discuss the AUD subcommittee report prior to sending the document to the Planning Commission on December 1, 2016.

CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED ITEM

1. 321 E MICHELTORENA ST

R-3 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-251-014
 Application Number: MST2016-00383
 Owner: Hathaway Family Trust
 Architect: Acme Architecture

(Proposal for a new multi-family development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal will include the demolition of 1,408 square feet of impermeable paving and 158 lineal feet of fencing and the construction of a three-story duplex with an attached, 743 square foot, three-car garage at the rear of the site. An existing 1,428 square foot, one-story, three bedroom dwelling unit at the front of the site will remain unaltered. The unit mix will include three, 3-bedroom units (2-bedrooms plus lofts) totaling 3,269 square feet with an average unit size of 1,089 square feet. The proposed density on this 6,664 square foot parcel will be 20 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. The proposal also includes removal of one 47' tall palm tree, one 12' tall Pittosporum tree, and a 64 foot long hedge encroaching onto the public alley. Grading will be balanced on site. This parcel is located within the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment. Project requires Lower Riviera Special Design District findings of approval. Project was last reviewed on September 12, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect; Bridget Walker, Landscape Architect; and Nicole Hernandez, City Historian, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m.

1. Dee Dunkin, Chair of the Bungalow Haven Association, spoke in opposition to the project and believed it is within the Bungalow Haven District and should be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC).
2. Brad Parks spoke in opposition of the project and felt it is too large for the neighborhood and has insufficient parking.
3. Correspondence from owner Tim Hathaway was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:29 p.m.

Re-opened public comment at 3:36 p.m.

Jenna Berg spoke in opposition of the project and felt it is too large for the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:40 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Board supports the style of architecture and the detailing represented.
2. The majority of the Board viewed the third story element as too large and requested that it be reduced.
3. Study ways to improve the arrangement of the common outdoor open space.

Action: Hopkins/Gradin, 2/4/0. (Cung absent.) Motion failed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Board supports the style of architecture and the detailing represented.
2. The majority of the Board viewed the third story element as too large and requested that it be removed.
3. Study ways to improve the arrangement of the common outdoor open space.
4. Step back the second floor element so it no longer looms over the open space behind the front house.

Action: Wittausch/Moore, 4/2/0. (Gradin and Hopkins opposed; Cung absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 350 HITCHCOCK WAY

E-3/PD/SD-2 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-003
 Application Number: MST2016-00469
 Owner: DCH California Investments LLC
 Agent: Sepps
 Architect: Flex Designs
 Business Name: Alfa Romeo

(Proposal to erect a temporary, 3,600 square foot, aluminum and fabric structure to be used for a sales office and showroom, and a 388 square foot restroom trailer, during construction of a permanent building project approved by the Planning Commission under development applications MST2014-00015 and MST2015-00090. The temporary installation will remain in place for approximately 17 months. Project requires Planning Commission approval of a Development Plan.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission Review.)

Actual time: 4:09 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Applicant; John Tangeman, Fiat Chrysler Automobiles; Robert Plant, Architect; Dennis Lin, Applicant; and Andrew Bermond, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:23 p.m.

Steven Chavin supports the temporary structure being proposed; however, he spoke in opposition to the landscaping at 350 Hitchcock Way as the eucalyptus trees are a hazard to the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 4:25 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission, to return to Consent, with comments:

1. The Board would like to see elevations and details for the proposed restroom structure.
2. Clearly indicate on the plans all of the features (such as landscaping and lighting) of the front yard area that are part of the original approved project and are going to be installed as part of the temporary show room.
3. The Board would be in favor of implementing a sunset clause into the approval, turning the approved temporary structure, after a specific timeframe, into a non-conforming building in violation of City ordinance so that the normal procedure for zoning violations would then ensue.
4. The Board prefers the lighter gray fabric for the structure.
5. Due to the temporary nature of the project, the Board finds the style acceptable.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 6/0/0. (Cung absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

3. 3111 STATE ST

P-R/SD-2 Zone

(4:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-112-018

Application Number: MST2016-00480

Owner: City of Santa Barbara Parks and Recreation Department

Applicant: City of Santa Barbara Parks and Recreation Department

(Proposal for a new fenced, off-leash dog area within MacKenzie Park. The project comprises two phases: Phase I will include the demolition of a vacant 1,700 square foot building, 3,600 square feet of concrete walkways, and 500 linear feet of chain link fencing. The concrete pad for the vacant building will be repurposed as part of the off-leash dog area; Phase II will include the creation of a fenced, 6,300 square foot small dog area and a 16,000 square foot large dog area. The project includes 813 linear feet of chain link fencing, double gated entries, 1,700 square feet of ADA accessible concrete walkways, benches, water bowls, and dog waste dispensers. The project will also include the removal of four trees ranging in height from 10-15 feet including two Kumquats, one Coast Live Oak, and one Strawberry tree. There will also be upgrades to the park entry and new landscaping.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Present: George Thomson, Parks Capital Projects Supervisor, Parks & Recreation, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m.

The following individuals spoke in support of the project:

1. Carol Behar.
2. Hillary Hauser.

Public comment closed at 4:52 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members are in favor of requesting the applicant to redesign the entry pathway so as to preserve the large Live Oak and Strawberry trees that are proposed for removal? 3/2 Passed

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Overall, the Board is in favor of the proposal and use of the park.
2. Redesign the entrance pathway so as to preserve the large Strawberry and Coast Live Oak trees.
3. Provide a more creative design at the paved concrete dog owner area; potentially more organic in shape.
4. Change the chain link fence from black to Malaga green vinyl.
5. Provide pictures of the proposed outdoor furniture and location on the plans.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 5/0/0. (Miller stepped down; Cung absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

4. 3714 STATE ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-023
 Application Number: MST2012-00443
 Owner: KW Fund V-Sandman, LLC
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
 Architect: Brian Cearnal
 Agent: John Schuck
 Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis, AIA

(Revision to the previously approved mixed-use development at the former Sandman Inn site under MST2007-00591; City Council Resolution No. 10-020. The revised project involves the demolition of the existing, 52,815 square foot, 113-room hotel and restaurant, and construction of 5,110 square feet of office space and 72 residential condominiums.)

(Review After Final of a change to the approved project to construct a 10-unit building with eight single level units and two, 2-story townhomes in lieu of the approved 10-unit building with eight, 3-story townhomes and two, 2-story townhomes. This change will result in a net reduction of 3,825 square feet in six bedrooms and eight bathrooms. Requires a Substantial Conformance Determination by the Community Development Director. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 008-14.)

Actual time: 5:11 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect; and John Schuck, Agent.

Public comment opened at 5:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two week to Consent with comments:

1. Study ways to open up the wall elements of the south facing units' stairwell.
2. Expand the planting area and/or add additional canopy trees at the gap between the two commercial buildings against the south face of the proposed building.
3. Study the walkways on both sides of the proposed building. The west side walkway of the building should be more meandering, and the east side walkway should be reduced where possible.

Action: Gradin/Miller, 3/2/0. (Hopkins, Tripp opposed; Moore stepped down; Cung absent.)
Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:47 P.M. TO 6:09 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 1116 SAN PASCUAL ST

R-3 Zone

(6:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-202-016
Application Number: MST2016-00359
Owner: Edward St George
Architect: On Design LLC

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes demolition of an existing, detached, 720 square foot garage and 176 square foot shed and construction of a new 1,629 square foot two-story duplex. An existing 675 square foot single-family dwelling on site will remain unchanged. The residential unit mix will include one, 2-bedroom unit (existing dwelling) and a new 1,629 square foot duplex with two, 2-bedroom, 2-bath units. New Unit B will be 705 square feet and new Unit C will be 925 square feet, with an average unit size of 768 square feet. The proposed density on this 6,880 square foot parcel is 21 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Private outdoor living space for the new units will be provided in two second floor decks totaling 173 square-feet. There will be a total of three parking spaces provided, two in a 420 square foot, attached two-car garage, and one uncovered space. No grading is proposed. Total development on site will be 2,304 square-feet of floor area. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2016-00345.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only: requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on October 24, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:11 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:19 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the improvements made thus far on the project.
2. Study the possible use of horizontal siding to match the building in front.
3. Consider relocating the walkway at the back of the property to the opposite side, to free up the uncovered parking space.
4. Indicate the private outdoor living space for Unit B.
5. Develop the landscape plan so that it is in conformance with the current site plan.
6. Study reducing the tower element in Unit C. Look into adding a small roof over Unit C's entry.

Action: Wittausch/Moore, 5/0/0. (Gradin stepped down; Cung absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**6. 2840 DE LA VINA ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone****(6:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-220-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00417
 Business Name: Grocery Outlet Bargain Market
 Owner: Storch Family Living Trust
 Architect: David Hardister AIA

(Proposal for a new facade on the existing Ralph's shopping center. Also proposed are new railings and 28 square feet of concrete sidewalk fill in at the rear truck dock to expand the sidewalk for forklift use. Some of the existing ADA parking spaces will be relocated but the overall number of parking spaces will remain the same. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Project was last reviewed on September 26, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:43 p.m.

Present: David Hardister, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:47 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued four weeks with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the direction over the previous proposal; however, the current proposal is generic in nature and needs additional refinement, detailing, and study of proportions, to be in keeping with Santa Barbara style.
2. The red striping should be removed.
3. The Board would like to see a master architectural plan of the site to determine how the project fits into the neighborhood.
4. The arch at the end of the east elevation needs further study
5. The central parapet element should be made deeper to extend over the existing roof.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Cung and Gradin absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:11 P.M. ****