



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, June 6, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER
KEVIN MOORE
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
KRYSTAL M VAUGHN, Acting Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Cung (left at 4:45), Hopkins, Miller, Moore, Tripp and Wittausch (arrived at 3:04)
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Gantz and Vaughn.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **April 25, 2016**, regarding only the last Agenda Item #7, 3891 State Street, as amended.

Action: Hopkins / Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **May 23, 2016** as submitted.

Action: Hopkins / Wittausch, 4/0/3. (Cung, Miller, Tripp abstained) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 31, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Wittausch and Miller.

Action: Miller /Tripp, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **June 6, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Miller and Wittausch.

Action: Miller / Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

a. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Board member Moore will step down from Agenda Item 2, 15 S. Hope Ave.; and Item 3, 251 S. Hope Ave.
- b) Board member Tripp will step down from Agenda Item 6, 116 E. Cota St.
- c) Board member Cung will be leaving at 4:30 p.m.

b. Board member Hopkins announced that he will step down from Agenda Item 3, 251 S. Hope Ave.

D. Subcommittee Reports. No reports were made.**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****1. 414 & 420 E. CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-023

Application Number: MST2016-00174

Owner: 414 East Carrillo Properties, LLC

Architect: DesignArc

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The proposal includes a voluntary lot merger of 414 and 420 E. Carrillo Street, the demolition of a 4,903 square foot building at 414 E. Carrillo Street, and the construction of a new four story mixed-use building including 21 residential rental apartments and a 1,000 square foot addition of commercial floor area. An existing 11,700 square foot commercial building will be maintained. The residential unit mix will include six studio units, six, 1-bedroom units, and nine, 2-bedroom units, with an average size of 768 square feet. The proposed density on the combined parcels totaling 34,981 square feet will be 27 dwelling units per acre, which is the maximum allowed on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Commercial/Medium High Residential 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be a total of 57 parking spaces including 37 spaces in a ground floor parking garage and 20 uncovered spaces in a surface lot. There will be 3,145 square feet of landscaping. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to provide less than the required number of parking spaces. A shared parking analysis will be provided.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires precase determination, Environmental Assessment, and Staff Hearing Officer approval. Project was last reviewed on May 23, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, Melisa Cinarli, Project Manager; and Matt Boedekker, Owner's Agent.

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m.

- 1) Lucia Davis, opposition; expressed concerns regarding parking, size, bulk, and scale.
- 2) K. Force, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding the height of the building which will be overpowering for the neighborhood.
- 3) Scott Ross, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding obstructed views and parking density.
- 4) Michael Hofmann, opposition; with expressed concerns regarding high density living is at its maximum for this neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:47 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the older color scheme as a more favorable design?
4/3 (passed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board finds the design changes that were made from the previous review on May 23, 2016 acceptable and appreciates the design of the East Carrillo building being more in keeping with the Santa Barbara style.
- 2) Study further setting back the second and third story elements on the east Carrillo St. side.
- 3) Provide further articulation of the wall located at the first story on Carrillo St.
- 4) Consider moving the stone elements on the back wall, facing the parking lot, to the street side.
- 5) Study an alternative entrance to the parking lot area with the intent of lowering the building.
- 6) Consider adding planting in front of the wall that goes into the parking lot.
- 7) The Board finds the design changes regarding the south elevation of the 420 annex that were made from the last review on May 23, 2016 more acceptable.
- 8) Study a way to lower the overall roof line, vary parapet heights, and provide additional landscaping for screening.
- 9) Provide a south elevation for the 414 building.
- 10) Provide a plan section perspective through the driveway and parking area of both buildings.
- 11) Provide an East elevation of the 414 building.
- 12) Provide 1/8" scale plans.
- 13) Provide a section elevation of the west elevation of the 414 building.

Action: Cung/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**2. 15 S HOPE AVE****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-058
 Application Number: MST2015-00010
 Owner: Johnman Holding LLC
 Architect: R & A Architecture & Design, Inc.
 Agent: Dudek

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish the existing 8,368 square foot non-residential building and construct 41,187 square feet of development, including a 45-foot tall four-story mixed-use building with an underground parking garage and one detached two-story residential unit, on a 33,910 square foot lot. The project consists of 631 net square feet of commercial floor area and 46 residential units (comprised of 13 studio units, 30 one-bedroom units, and 3 two-bedroom units) totaling 36,502 square feet plus ancillary space (lobby, office, storage, community room). Parking would consist of 11 spaces at-grade and 40 spaces underground for a total of 51 parking spaces; 48 bicycle parking spaces are proposed. Vehicular access would be provided from Hope Avenue, and a four-foot sidewalk dedication would be granted. Approximately 6,900 cubic yards of excavation is anticipated for the underground garage. The project proposes a 45-foot setback from the top-of-bank of Arroyo Burro Creek to the first floor of the development, with the second, third and fourth floors cantilevering out up to 13 feet beyond that (closer to the creek). The project also includes creek restoration and more than 13,000 square feet of open space. The project is proposed under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay at a density of 60 du/ac, and the average unit size is 794 square feet.)

(Project was last reviewed on April 11, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:46 p.m.

Present: Benjamin Anderson, R & A Architecture & Design, Inc., John Cuykendall, Dudek; Lane Goodkind, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 5:13 p.m.

Bob Cunningham, Opposition; expressed concerns regarding compatibility with the area.

Public comment closed at 5:15 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide better definition of the entry on the west side of the building at grade.
- 2) The Board would like to see details for the shingled tiles, edges, jams, parapet copings, and building corners.
- 3) Add tile thickness to the north side west elevation so the windows are located further from the edge.
- 4) Study an alternate material for the exposed balcony edges; no tile or plaster.
- 5) Explore different parapet heights between the tile and the plaster parapet elements.
- 6) On the third floor west elevation, study changing the relationship of the tile that turns the corner into the building entry to the plaster elements.
- 7) On the east elevation, study an alternate material for the panhandle's tile element.
- 8) Provide more railing details.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Moor stepped down, Cung absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 251 S HOPE AVE****E-3/PD/SP-4/SD-2 Zone****(4:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00142
 Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Peikert & RRM Design Group
 Applicant: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal by the Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara for a new, four-story affordable housing development for very-low and low income senior residents on a vacant 1.76 acre lot adjacent to Arroyo Burro Creek. The proposal would be developed under the City's Average Unit-Size Density [AUD] Incentive Program and the City's Density Bonus Program with a proposed density of 51 dwelling units per acre. The project includes 89 studio apartments, one-bedroom manager's unit, kitchen, dining facilities, storage, and common areas [lobby/reception area, conference room, offices, gift shop, salon, and gym]. The total building area is 52,516 square feet [gross]. The average unit size is 347 square feet. The proposal includes 30 uncovered vehicular parking spaces and 5 bicycle lockers. The Planning Commission approved a Front Setback Modification to allow the building to encroach into the required front setback [based on AUD requirements for R-3]; an Interior Setback Modification to allow uncovered parking to encroach into the required interior setback [based on AUD requirements for R-3]; a Lot Area Modification to allow 90 residential units instead of 47 residential units on the subject property; and a Parking Modification to allow 34 vehicle and 5 bicycle parking spaces instead of the required 90 vehicle and 90 bicycle parking spaces required for AUD projects. Council approved the Amendment to the Rancho Arroyo Specific Plan to allow Community Benefit Housing and Recreation/Open Space as the uses in Area A-2, a Zone Change to Rancho Arroyo Specific Plan Area A-2 from E-3/PD/SP-4/SD-2 [One-Family Residence, Planned Development, Rancho Arroyo Specific Plan and Upper State Street Area Overlay] Zones to R-3/SP-4/SD-2 [Limited Multiple-Family Residence Zone, Rancho Arroyo Specific Plan and Upper State Street Area Overlay] Zones, and a further reduction in the number of parking spaces.)

(Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 005-16 and City Council action taken on May 3, 2016. Project was last reviewed November 9, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:37 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert & Elisha Pierce, Architects; Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect; Skip Szymanski & Rob Fredericks, Santa Barbara Housing Authority; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:52 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval for architecture and continued one week to Consent Review for landscape design, with comments:

- 1) The consensus of the Board is that the project is ready for Project Design Approval as submitted.
- 2) The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood.
- 3) Provide a parapet detail.
- 4) Study adding tile roofs to the stair towers.
- 5) Consider adding a tile roof to the north end of the building.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Moore/Hopkins stepped down, Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 20 MINUTES AT 6:08 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:28 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

4. 100 ADAMS RD

A-F/SD-3 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003
 Application Number: MST2013-00379
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Patsy Price, Land Use Planner

(Proposal to demolish and reconstruct a portion of the existing Pump Station No. 2 structure and expand an existing equipment garage currently located on the Goleta West Sanitary District Headquarters on property leased from the Santa Barbara Airport. The existing Pump Station is 4,297 square feet and includes a platform level of 1,102 square feet, two below platform levels of 2,784 square feet and a 411 square foot emergency generator room. The 1,102 square feet above platform level will be demolished and reconstructed with a small addition of 396 square feet to provide 1,498 square feet of work areas, break room, and shower/locker facilities for operations staff. The two below platform levels will be permanently sealed off, and the generator room is to remain. Including the generator room, the total square footage for the new Operations Building is 1,909. An existing 188 square foot locker room area in the existing Administration Building will be reconfigured to house the pump station switch gear. To improve circulation on the site and better accommodate larger District vehicles including the Vector Truck, the project also includes expansion of an existing 2,400 square foot equipment garage by 900 square feet. The total project results in a net decrease of 1,488 square feet of non-residential floor area and requires Planning Commission Review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; requires Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 6:28 p.m.

Present: Ed Galindo, Architect; Patsy Price, Land Use Planner; Mark Nation, General Manager, Goleta West Sanitary District

Public comment opened at 6:40 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the use of the faux wood metal siding on this particular building? 1/5 (failed).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the use of the faux wood and the orange polycarbonate material together? 1/5 (failed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide details of how the materials will work together, such as parapets connections, and corners.
- 2) Simplify the details and use of varying material, where possible.
- 3) Substitute the faux wood material with something more compatible with Santa Barbara style.
- 4) **The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
 - a. **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.

- b. **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
- c. **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
- d. **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
- e. **Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.** The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
- f. **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Tripp/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

5. **400 BLK N LA CUMBRE RD**

(5:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-000-269
 Application Number: MST2016-00224
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Eric Goodall, Project Eng I

(Proposal for the La Cumbre Sidewalk Infill Project to fill in several missing links of sidewalk and access ramps on N. La Cumbre Road spanning 1/3 of a mile from Via Lucero to Stacy Lane. The project will include 140 linear feet of new retaining walls, removal of four existing trees within the parkway, new parkway landscaping, new pedestrian signage, and rapid flashing beacon crossings at La Cumbre Road and La Colina Road. This project will provide safe routes to Hope Elementary School, La Colina Junior High School, and Bishop Diego High School.)

(Comments only; requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.)

Actual time: 7:11 p.m.

Present: Eric Goodall, Project Engineer I.

Public comment opened at 7:21 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Provide elevations of the retaining walls and show full length heights and extents.
- 2) Bevel the top of the retaining wall at both corners.
- 3) Study the preservation of the existing large yucca tree that is shown on the plans to be removed.

Action: Tripp/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**6. 116 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

(6:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00627
 Owner: Cota Street, LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a new four-story mixed-use building on a 10,865 square foot vacant parcel adjacent to Plaza Vera Cruz. The project includes 15 two-bedroom, two-bathroom residential units and approximately 738 square feet of commercial space. Sixteen covered parking spaces will be provided on the ground level. Residential units will be on the second, third, and fourth floors. The proposed building height is 45 feet, with a 457 square foot rooftop deck. Under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD], the proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with an average unit size of 827 square feet. A maximum density of 63 dwelling units per acre is allowed on this 10,865 square foot parcel designated Medium-High Density and within the Priority Housing Overlay area.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on May 9, 2016.)

Actual time: 7:30 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell and Eric Behr, AB Design Studio; and Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to In-Progress Review including the Conditions of Approval dated June 6, 2016 as well as CEQA finding as follows, and with comments:

- 1) Study the fifth element on the north east corner to aid in the design without being a repetition of the other four.
- 2) Study the removal of the metal panels on the lower register.
- 3) Consider restoring the stair tower material to extend all the way down to the entrance to replace the metal panel.
- 4) Board Member Wittausch read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 3/2/1. Motion carried. (Gradin/Moore opposed, Tripp stepped down, Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**7. 226 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-3 Zone**

(7:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-252-013
 Application Number: MST2015-00566
 Owner: Edward St George
 Applicant: On Design LLC
 Architect: On Design LLC

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,095 square foot, one story dwelling unit and construct a new 1,441 square foot, two story duplex [Building A] and new 935 square foot, two story dwelling unit [Building B] under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. Three existing buildings, Building C, an 866 square foot, one-story dwelling unit, Building D, a 2,180 square foot, three story dwelling unit with attached one car garage, and a detached two car garage will remain unchanged. Two new uncovered parking spaces are proposed, resulting in a total of three covered and two uncovered parking spaces. One mature avocado tree will be removed. The average unit size will be 1,084 square feet, with a maximum average unit size allowed of 1,090 square feet. The 11,250 square foot parcel has a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. This project addresses zoning violations identified in enforcement cases ENF2015-00024 and ENF2015-00517.)

(Final Approval is requested. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on April 11, 2016.)

Actual time: 8:08 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, Architect; Shelby Messner, Applicant

Public comment opened at 8:22 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members find acceptable keeping the angled bracket as detailed and making it consistent throughout? 2/3/1 (passed).

Motion: Final Approval and Continued one week to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Study an alternative for the flesh color on Building A.
- 2) Make all roof brackets consistent where applicable, and all angles on roofs are to be at a 45 degree angle where applicable.
- 3) Revise the south elevation of Building B so that the ridge end on the right matches the left.
- 4) Applicant to provide, hardscape, materials, colors, and details with a final landscape plan.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Gradin opposed, Cung absent)

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:30 P.M. ****