



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, May 23, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

- KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
- SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*
- THIEP CUNG
- COURTNEY JANE MILLER
- KEVIN MOORE
- AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
- WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Hopkins, Moore, and Wittausch.
 Members absent: Cung, Miller, and Tripp.
 Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Sheila Lodge, Planning Commission Liaison, spoke as an individual regarding the preservation of the aesthetic appeal and natural environment and setting.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **April 25, 2016**, was tabled to the June 6, 2016.
 Action: Wittausch/Gradin, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).
 Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **May 5, 2016**, as amended.
 Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore abstained, Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 16, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Howard **Wittausch**.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 23, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Howard Wittausch** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Hopkins/Moore, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Ms. Gantz announced that Board members Tripp, Cung, and Miller would be absent from the meeting.

C. Subcommittee Reports.

Board member Hopkins volunteered to represent the Board at Tuesday's City Council meeting regarding review of future Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD) projects.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 414 & 420 E. CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00174
 Owner: 414 East Carrillo Properties, LLC
 Architect: DesignArc

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The proposal includes a voluntary lot merger of 414 and 420 E. Carrillo Street, the demolition of a 4,903 square foot building at 414 E. Carrillo Street, and the construction of a new four story mixed-use building including 21 residential rental apartments and a 1,000 square foot addition of commercial floor area. An existing 11,700 square foot commercial building will be maintained. The residential unit mix will include six studio units, six, 1-bedroom units, and nine, 2-bedroom units, with an average size of 768 square feet. The proposed density on the combined parcels totaling 34,981 square feet will be 27 dwelling units per acre, which is the maximum allowed on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Commercial/Medium High Residential 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be a total of 57 parking spaces including 37 spaces in a ground floor parking garage and 20 uncovered spaces in a surface lot. There will be 3,145 square feet of landscaping. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to provide less than the required number of parking spaces. A shared parking analysis will be provided.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 3:21 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Matt Boedekker; Melisa Cinarli Turner, DesignArc.

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m.

- 1) James Iuliano, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding preservation of the neighborhood character, regarding the busy and heavily trafficked area, street parking density, lack of Spanish style design, the exemption requested for parking, and the sight lines to the skyline and private mountain views to adjacent properties.
- 2) Paul Portney opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the busy and heavily pedestrian trafficked area, parking density in the area, and poor choice of location.
- 3) Kevin Finnegan, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding placement in the residential neighborhood,

- parking density, and neighborhood compatibility.
- 4) Katie Force, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding placement of a multi-unit during a drought when water supply is an issue, parking density, and neighborhood compatibility.
 - 5) Michael Hofmann, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding size and mass in a bungalow neighborhood for compatibility.
 - 6) Susanne Wood, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding placement of a multi-unit during a drought when water supply is an issue when there should be a building moratorium, water run-off and drainage, busy and heavily pedestrian trafficked area, lack of green space, and should consider some placement in other less dense residential neighborhoods.
 - 7) Bill Chiplis, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding parking density, private mountain view obstruction, lack of Santa Barbara Spanish style, and neighborhood compatibility.
 - 8) Scott Ross, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding proposed architectural design is poor and not compatible with the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Some Board members find the proposed brick element at E. Carrillo Street is not appropriate at the site; Applicant to explore an alternative material.
- 2) Study providing a greater setback of the roof and studio cantilevers along E. Carrillo Street.
- 3) Study the roof assembly and consider the heaviness of the beam elements.
- 4) Study the massing of the rear units facing the Canon Perdido Street south parking lot. Break up the apparent blockiness of the E. Carrillo Street elevation.
- 5) The general parking circulation layout is acceptable.
- 6) Provide more landscaping and open space with less hardscape.
- 7) Provide a view study.
- 8) Provide a conceptual landscape plan to help mitigate some of the height and massing impacts along E. Carrillo Street.
- 9) The Board appreciated the fourth story tucked into the middle of the site and the third stories on E. Carrillo Street.

Action: Hopkins/Moore, 2/2/0. Motion carried. (Wittausch/Gradin opposed, Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

It was noted by staff that all four present Board members had conducted individual site visits in preparation for review of the project.

FINAL REVIEW

2. 2800 BLK CLIFF DRIVE

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-003-393
 Application Number: MST2014-00003
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Landscape Architect: David Black & Associates

(Proposal to construct a single-lane roundabout at the intersection of Las Positas Road and Cliff Drive to improve traffic operations by reducing congestion. The roundabout will incorporate bicycle and pedestrian facilities and allow for future connectivity to a proposed multi-use pathway along Las Positas Road and potential bike lanes and/or bike path along Cliff Drive.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on April 25, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:39 p.m.

Present: Ashley Shue, Project Engineer, and David Black; Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:50 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 4:52 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 4:54 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW

3. 540 W PUEBLO ST

C-O Zone

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-090-046
Application Number: MST2007-00092
Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
Owner: Cancer Center of Santa Barbara
Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Project consists of a new comprehensive outpatient cancer treatment facility, four-tier parking structure with 180 spaces, two small commercial structures, six rental housing units, and merger of 10 lots located between W. Junipero and W. Pueblo Streets into one 3.38-acre lot. A Substantial Conformance Determination was made to allow the construction of a new Learning Center [with an 80-seat auditorium] rather than a residential duplex on the vacant lot at 529 W. Junipero St. and to allow the building at 525 W. Junipero St. to be converted to a residential duplex rather than a commercial space.)

(Final Approval of the Learning Center addressed at 529 W. Junipero Street. Project requires compliance with Substantial Conformance Determination made on December 11, 2015. Project was last reviewed on March 14, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:54 p.m.

Present: Lisa Lyle and Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective, LLC; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:02 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted with compliments to the Applicant.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:03 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 5:16 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 350 HITCHCOCK WAY****E-3/PD/SD-2 Zone**

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00090
 Owner: DCH California Investments, LLC
 Applicant: SEPPS
 Architect: Robert Plant

(Proposal to demolish an existing approximately 15,936 square foot service bay structure [including 2,363 square feet of commercial floor area] and construct a new 36,752 square foot, two-story automobile dealership building. The building will include three automobile showrooms, business and automobile parts area, enclosed service bays, and interior car storage. The project includes 99 parking spaces. The subject property is identified as Parcel 2 of an approve subdivision [MST2014-00166]. Planning Commission approved a Development Plan and P-D Development Plan on April 7, 2016.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-16. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on August 31, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:16 p.m.

Present: Robert Plant, Flex Designs; Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect; Maruja Clensay, SEPPS; and Andrew Bermond, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:36 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to the June 20, 2016 Full Board meeting with comments:

- 1) Provide alternatives to the proposed aluminum siding panels. The Board prefers a smooth troweled plaster finish with elegantly placed score lines.
- 2) Provide material samples of the proposed exterior finishes in the proposed color to fit within the Santa Barbara style.
- 3) Eliminate the exposed metal cap where there is a plaster wall or parapet.
- 4) Provide a modest change in the parapet height between the corrugated metal and the stucco parapet.
- 5) Assure the light fixtures at the canopy nearest the street aren't a visual nuisance for pedestrians at the street.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:00 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:29 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 2118 OAK PARK LN****R-3 Zone**

(6:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-221-021
 Application Number: MST2016-00089
 Owner: Eldan, Inc.
 Architect: Thomas Oschner, AIA Architects
 Applicant: Joseph Flynn

(Proposal for four new dwelling units in two, 2-story duplexes to be constructed under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The new buildings will be constructed behind an existing 838 square foot single-family dwelling, which will be remodeled. Two existing sheds will be demolished and eight fruit trees will be removed. Five uncovered parking spaces are proposed. The total new development on this 9,375 square foot parcel will be 3,847 square feet. Grading excavation of 40 cubic yards will be balanced on site. The average unit size will be 937 square feet with an average unit size maximum allowed of 965 square feet on a parcel with a Medium High Density [15-27 dwelling units per acre] land use designation.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Requires a landscape plan and Recorded Conditions. Project was last reviewed on March 28, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:29 p.m.

Present: Joseph Flynn, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:40 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the project's site planning and detailing, and likes the new common space between duplex A and B.
- 2) Study ways to enhance the sense of entry for the pedestrian walkway onto the site, either by adding a trellis or some lighting or by potentially moving the sidewalk more adjacent to the driveway.
- 3) Study the necessity of the roof overhangs in the center walkway between the duplexes as they create a sense of impingement in the current design.
- 4) Study the adjacencies of the windows between the two duplexes, perhaps alternating window locations would increase unit privacy.
- 5) Restudy privacy issue of bay windows and proximity of units.
- 6) The following finding was read into the record: *"The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."*
- 7) A Recorded Conditions Agreement for an Annual Residence Survey is required.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 3/1/0. Motion carried. (Moore opposed, Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**6. 927 E ORTEGA ST****R-2 Zone**

(7:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-123-012
Application Number: MST2016-00146
Owner: Andreas Blomst
Designer: Shannon Blomst

(Proposal to construct a new 467 square foot, one-story detached accessory dwelling unit and uncovered parking space to the rear of an existing 943 square foot, one-story single-family dwelling on a 5,000 square foot parcel. Also proposed is to demolish 65 square feet from the existing residence and construct a one-story, 143 square foot addition on the front elevation. Other proposed work will include the following: legalize an as-built carport, replace a 692 square foot concrete driveway with a 1,238 square foot permeable driveway, demolish an existing rear patio cover, replace windows in the same openings, add a new garage door, and a change in building finish from wood to stucco. Landscape changes will include the removal of one orange tree and a planter from the front yard and the removal of three trees (peach, fig, and poinsettia) from the rear yard.)

(Second Concept Review. Requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on May 9, 2016.)

Actual time: 7:06 p.m.

Present: Andreas and Shannon Blomst, Owners.

Public comment opened at 7:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Consider lowering the plate height of the rear unit.
- 2) Center the window under the gable on the east elevation.
- 3) It was noted that there were no changes proposed for the existing carport. (Applicant to place the post back in the original location.)
- 4) Explore increasing the depth of landscaping along the drive aisle.
- 5) Study the fenestration mutton break-up of the windows.
- 6) Consider adding a cover at the entry for a more welcoming entrance.
- 7) The following finding was read into the record: *"The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."*

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung/Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:35 P.M. ****