



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, March 28, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*

SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER

KEVIN MOORE

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Vice-Chair Hopkins.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Cung, Hopkins, Moore, and Tripp.

Members absent: Gradin, Miller, and Wittausch.

Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 14, 2016**, as amended.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Cung abstained, Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 21, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Howard Wittausch** and **Courtney Miller**.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 28, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Scott Hopkins**.

Action: Tripp/Moore, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Ms. Gantz made the announcement that Chair Kirk Gradin, and Board Members Courtney Jane Miller and Howard Wittausch would be absent from today's meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Member Tripp reported on the previous week's Visual Arts in Public Places meeting regarding the Santa Barbara Airport. Another meeting has been scheduled in two weeks' time.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 915 E ANAPAMU ST****R-3 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00331
 Architect: Cearnal Collective, LLP
 Owner: Riviera Partners

(This is a revised project description of an Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD] project. The proposal still includes 24 residential apartments comprising 20,275 sq. ft. of living area, 9,170 sq. ft. of subterranean garage area, and 1,504 sq. ft. of private garage space, for a total of 30,949 sq. ft. The unit mix includes 19, one-bedroom and five, two-bedroom apartments ranging from 649 to 1,411 sq. ft., with an average unit size of 833 square feet. The revisions to the project include changes to the floor plan, exterior fenestration of Building 1, building footprint, and building height. The parking garage size was increased to provide additional parking, including accessible parking spaces and added storage for residents. The building footprints of Buildings 2 & 3 have not changed. Building 2 has a reduced unit count, from three to two. There will be 2,970 cubic yards of grading excavation and 19 trees will be removed, with five trees to be relocated on site, 16 trees to remain, 35 new oak trees [seventeen on-site and 28 off-site], and 50 new ornamental trees. Under AUD, the proposed residential density is 27 dwelling units per acre, with an average unit size of 833 sq. ft. A maximum density of 27 dwelling units per acre is allowed on this 40,055 sq. ft. parcel with a Medium-High Density Residential General Plan Land Use Designation.)

(Project Design Approval is requested for a revised project. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Sean Ridenour, Arris Studio Architects; and Katie Klein, Courtney Jane Miller Landscape Architects; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m.

- 1) Peggy Martin, adjacent neighbor; expressed concerns regarding access to her adjacent property, and the proposed parking and sidewalk improvements.

Public comment closed at 3:30 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval of the revised project and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the west and south elevation intersection of the guardrails and privacy walls.

- 2) Make the privacy walls thicker (minimum 2' x 8'), and potentially create a stone pilaster at the intersection of the guardrails.
- 3) **The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
 - a) **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b) **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c) **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d) **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
 - e) **Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.** The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f) **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
- 4) Board member Moore read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Moore/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 1217 PUNTA GORDA ST

R-3 Zone

(3:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-293-014
 Application Number: MST2015-00031
 Owner: Gutierrez Family Trust
 Applicant: Windy Design Consultant

(Proposal to construct a new, 798 square foot 3-story dwelling unit at the rear of an existing 916 square foot 1-story dwelling unit, and to demolish an existing 370 square foot carport. A 655 square foot 4-car carport will comprise the ground floor of the new unit and will be attached to the existing unit. Also proposed on this approximately 5,000 square foot parcel is to legalize an as-built 4'-6" tall CMU wall topped with wrought iron railings, and to construct a new 5'-0" tall fence. There will be 1,468 square feet of permeable paving for the new driveway. An Administrative Exception is requested to allow an as-built over-height wall at the front property line. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for a zoning modification to change the basic exterior characteristics of the existing one-story structure in the required interior setback.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:40 p.m.

Present: Patricio Nada, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support granting (eventual) Project Design Approval to the proposed project as presented? 4/0 (unanimous).

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Consent Review with comments.

Substitute

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Consent Review with the Board's stated comments and findings:

- 1) Provide details and a color board.
- 2) Study removing the second floor balcony roof projection on the west elevation, and provide wood trim surround detailing or other architectural element alternatives that would not protrude as much.
- 3) Vice-Chair Hopkins read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

Motion: To reopen Item #2, 1217 Punta Gorda Street and correct the motion with a substitute motion.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

FINAL REVIEW

3. 130 S ALISOS ST

R-3 Zone

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-212-015
 Application Number: MST2015-00402
 Owner: Edward St George
 Architect: On Design, LLC
 Applicant: On Design, LLC

(Proposal for new dwelling units, addition, and alterations for a new Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program [AUD] project which will result in a total of eight dwelling units. The project comprises the demolition of an existing 840 square foot, 4-car carport, paving, and fencing, and the construction of three new dwelling units on a multi-family parcel. Five existing dwelling units located in Buildings A, B, and C [Units 1-5] will remain unaltered, with the exception of a 194 first story addition to Unit 2 in Building B. New Building D [Unit 6] will be a two-story dwelling unit with a 561 square foot, 2-car garage, 318 square feet of living area on the ground floor, 846 square feet on the second floor, and a 30 square foot second floor deck. New Building E [Units 7 & 8] will be a two-story duplex totaling 1,888 square feet with a 97 square foot second floor deck. There will be six covered parking spaces, two uncovered parking spaces, and eight bicycle parking spaces. Site work will include new walkways, fencing, the removal of an existing 40' tall Mexican fan palm tree, and new landscaping. This project will result in a total of 9,832 square feet of development on a 16,686 square foot parcel. Under the AUD program, the proposed residential density is 21 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of eight dwelling units having an average unit size of 1,040 square feet.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires a Parking Design Waiver from Public Works Transportation. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:01 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan and Shelby Messner, On Design Architects.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members would insist on an alternative integral finish color? 2/2 (tied).

Motion: Final Approval with the requirement for a Recorded Conditions Agreement and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with the condition to return with larger samples of the proposed building plaster colors.

Action: Hopkins/Cung, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 4:29 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:32 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 300 BLK GROVE LANE

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-616
Application Number: MST2015-00381
Agent: Sequoia Deployment Services, Inc.

(Proposal for a new small cell wireless communications facility for Verizon including one 2'-0" diameter Cantenna and associated equipment to be mounted on top of an existing 25'-0" tall wooden utility pole. Also proposed is a new meter pedestal and pad with equipment cabinet and ground level handhole.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires No Visual Impact Findings and a Public Works Encroachment Permit. Project was last reviewed on August 17, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Pete Shubin, Agent for Verizon Wireless.

Public comment opened at 4:35 p.m.

- 1) Jan Kaestner (neighbor), opposition; expressed aesthetic concerns regarding the need for more wireless equipment on poles near his property.

Public comment closed at 4:37 p.m.

Motion 1: Project Design and Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Cung/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Motion 2: To reopen Item #4, 300 Block Grove Lane to correct the motion to include the findings made for no adverse visual impacts resulting from wireless antennas and equipment installation in consideration of compatibility with nearby buildings, appropriate screening, site location, and antennae color and size.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 400 BLK N CANADA ST**

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-007
 Application Number: MST2015-00382
 Agent: Sequoia Deployment Services, Inc.

(Proposal for a new small cell wireless communications facility for Verizon including one 2'-0" diameter Antenna to be mounted on a new arm at 24'-0" off grade and associated equipment on an existing 36'-0" tall wooden utility pole. Also proposed is a new meter pedestal and pad with equipment cabinet and ground level handhole to be located around the corner on Blanchard Street.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires No Visual Impact Findings and a Public Works Encroachment Permit. Project was last reviewed on August 17, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:57 p.m.

Present: Pete Shubin, Agent for Verizon Wireless.

Public comment opened at 5:08 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with the conditions:

- 1) Add one 24-inch box street tree on either side of the pole to screen the proposed equipment.
- 2) Provide drought tolerant low water use landscaping adjacent to the pedestal box.
- 3) No adverse visual impact findings were made resulting from wireless antennas and equipment installation in consideration of compatibility with nearby buildings, appropriate screening, site location, and antennae color and size.

Action: Cung/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 915 W VALERIO ST****R-2 Zone**

(5:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-203-005
 Application Number: MST2015-00564
 Owner: Richard James Howley
 Architect: Robert Pester, Architect

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 324 square foot two-car garage, an "as-built" 134 square foot building and an "as-built" outdoor fireplace at the rear of a 7,500 square foot parcel. Also, proposed is construction of a new 430 square foot two-car garage with a 591 square foot, one bedroom dwelling unit above with a 123 square foot deck on the second-level, 226 square feet of detached accessory space and an uncovered parking space. The existing 1,443 square foot single family dwelling at the front of the property is proposed to remain. This project will result in two dwelling units and 2,690 square feet of development. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow two covered and one uncovered parking spaces instead of the two covered and two uncovered parking spaces required. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report [ZIR98-00088].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 016-16. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on December 7, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:26 p.m.

Present: Robert Pester, Architect; and Jim Howley, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:34 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with comment to restudy the threshold design at the exterior doors, and the following finding was read into the record: “The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.”

Action: Cung/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 2118 OAK PARK LN

R-3 Zone

(5:35)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-221-021
 Application Number: MST2016-00089
 Owner: Eldan, Inc.
 Architect: Thomas Oschner, AIA Architect
 Applicant: Joseph Flynn

(Proposal for four new dwelling units in two, 2-story duplexes to be constructed under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The new buildings will be constructed behind an existing 838 square foot single-family dwelling, which will be remodeled. Two existing sheds will be demolished and eight fruit trees will be removed. Five uncovered parking spaces are proposed. The total new development on this 9,375 square foot parcel will be 3,847 square feet. Grading excavation of 40 cubic yards will be balanced on site. The average unit size will be 937 square feet with an average unit size maximum allowed of 965 square feet on a parcel with a Medium High Density [15-27 dwelling units per acre] land use designation.)

(Comments only; requires compliance with Tier 2 SWMP and landscape plan.)

Actual time: 5:41 p.m.

Present: Joseph Flynn, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 5:52 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design and effort that has gone into the proposed project.
- 2) Provide a fully developed landscape plan addressing the locations of the common open space, the bicycle parking, and the trash bins.
- 3) Study the new duplexes and the possibility of incorporating more character-giving elements and details into the design.
- 4) Provide exterior elevations of the existing unit.
- 5) Provide the elevations of the driveway gate and any fencing if proposed.

Action: Tripp/Cung, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**8. ROW FROM E CABRILLO TO INDIO MUERTO****C-2/SD-3 Zone****(6:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-010-065
Application Number: MST2015-00550
Owner: James and Joan Dixon, Trustees
Owner: City of Santa Barbara, Public Works

(Proposal for right-of-way improvements under the Lower Milpas Pedestrian Improvement Project. The proposal includes the installation of 700 linear feet of sidewalk along the east side of S. Milpas Street beginning at E. Cabrillo Blvd. and continuing to the US 101 on/off-ramp north of the Union Pacific Railroad. The project also includes ten new light poles, a center median island, and curb and gutter improvements. An additional sidewalk infill of 565 linear feet is also proposed along Calle Puerto Vallarta, connecting S. Milpas Street to Dwight Murphy Park and the Santa Barbara Zoo. The project will require the relocation of a private driveway into Tri-County Produce as well as a reconfiguration of their parking lot. Improvements will be made on the following streets: S. Milpas Street, Calle Puerto Vallarta, Por La Mar, and Corona Del Mar. Project requires Coastal Review.)

(Requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program, a Waiver for perimeter planters, and Coastal Review. Project was last reviewed on November 23, 2015.)

Actual time: 6:13 p.m.

Present: Aaron Liggett, Landscape Architect/Arcadia Studio; and Derrick Bailey, Supervising Transportation Engineer; and Eric Goodall, Project Engineer I of the City of Santa Barbara, Public Works.

Public comment opened at 6:27 p.m.

- 1) Jarrett Gorin, opposition (for Tri-County Produce); spoke of concerns regarding the proposed design which would create a barrier across the entire frontage of the adjacent Tri-County Produce store; requested wide-paved and easily passible free-flowing boundaries with a lot of opportunities for open pedestrian movement; suggested acceptable planter placement instead of a barrier.
- 2) Jonathan Robert Gonzalez, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the existing tree, and an increase in pedestrian traffic and homeless impacts and a decrease in quality of life in the neighborhood.
- 3) Alex Jones, neighbor, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding increase in pedestrian traffic and homeless impacts, and requested to instead improve the sidewalk conditions.
- 4) Paul Gifford, opposition; spoke of concerns of the character and impacts of the proposed development, and requested the City contact local residents of the potential impacts of increased pedestrian traffic and noise.

Public comment closed at 6:35 p.m.

City staff clarified that the design adheres to requirements stated in the City's Pedestrian Master Plan, the preferred configuration maximize the width of the parkway, and the Urban Forestry Guidelines tries to maximize the width of the parkway for tree health.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support a meandering pathway and sidewalk as a possible solution? 1/3 (failed-not enough movement would not make it worthwhile).

- Motion:** **Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**
- 1) Study the option of reconfiguring the pathway by narrowing the planting strip by one foot to provide additional buffer space for the five adjacent neighbors.
 - 2) Study providing appropriate fences and hedges to preserve and maintain neighboring visual privacy issues and concerns.
 - 3) Applicant to work with the adjacent Tri County Produce on increasing the permeability of the proposed parkway.

Action: Cung/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Miller/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:08 P.M. ****