



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, September 29, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **2:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
KIRK GRADIN, *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)
THIEP CUNG
SCOTT HOPKINS
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Landscape Representative)
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative)
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): JOHN CAMPANELLA – Present @ 2:33 p.m.

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present @ 2:40 -3:56 p.m.
SUZAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 2:00 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink (present until 5:37 p.m.), Cung, Gradin, Hopkins, Miller, Poole, and Wittausch (present @ 2:07 p.m.).
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Gantz, Limón and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Chris Manson-Hing, President, American Institute of Architects (AIA)/Santa Barbara reminded the Board about attending the annual public AIASB ArchitecTours.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **Monday, September 15, 2014**, as amended.
Action: Poole/Gradin, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Cung abstained/Poole abstained from Item#2).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 22, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole**.
Action: Poole/Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 29, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Poole/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the announcement that meeting times on today's agenda are being adjusted as follows:
 - 1) 2:15 p.m. – 210 W. Cota St.
 - 2) 2:45 p.m. – Haley-Milpas Discussion Item with Jaime Limon
 - 3) 3:00 p.m. – 604 E. Cota Street
 - 4) 3:45 p.m. – 320 W. Pueblo Street
 - 5) 4:30 p.m. – 920 Summit Road
 - 6) 5:00 p.m. – 927 E. Haley Street
 - ** 5:45 p.m. – Scheduled Break **
 - 7) 6:05 p.m. – 1120 & 1122 Indio Muerto
 - 8) 6:50 p.m. – 1118 Indio Muerto
2. The City recruitment process to fill vacancies on City Advisory Groups began on September 9, 2014. The deadline to submit completed applications to the City Clerks Office from any interested member of the public will be no later than Monday, October 13, 2014, at 5:30 p.m. Application forms and a current list of vacancies are available on the City's website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/Applications. All applicants will be required to appear before City Council for an informal interview scheduled tentatively on either Tuesday, October 21, 2014, at 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, October 28, 2014 at 4:00 p.m., or Tuesday, November 11, 2014, at 6:00 p.m. Anyone with questions can contact Deborah Applegate, Deputy City Clerk, at (805) 564-5309 or via email at DApplegate@SantaBarbaraCA.gov.
3. ABR members were emailed a letter from David Beard from the California Department of Transportation (CalTrans), summarizing how they incorporated the Board's comments at the Full Board meeting on July 7, 2014, regarding the project [US 101 from Quarantina to West City Limit](#).
4. Chair Zink will be leaving the meeting at the scheduled break, and Vice Chair Gradin will then take over as Chair for remainder of the meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no reports.

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED AT A LATER AGENDA TIME. ***

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. HALEY-MILPAS DESIGN MANUAL

(2:45) Presenter: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner.

Presentation made and discussion held.

Board Comments:

- 1) Board member Gradin commented that there is a lack of clarity and detail in the Haley-Milpas Design Manual regarding where defined design styles are mandatory, such as what defines "Hispanic Pueblo" or "Contemporary Spanish Pueblo" design style or benchmark.
- 2) Board member Wittausch concurred and commented these design style benchmarks are for areas where they are not really defined.
- 3) Mr. Limón stated that it was important for the Board to focus on compatible development guidelines. Staff will next work on the Multi-Unit Design Guidelines, including other future guidelines such as the expanding ABR Guidelines, focusing chiefly on neighborhood compatibility for new and larger multi-unit structures, and encourage desirable design features for multi-unit development and commercial development.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 604 E COTA ST****C-M Zone****(3:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-222-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00220
 Owner: Hammer Properties, LLC
 Applicant: Peter Lewis
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposal to demolish all existing buildings on the lot and construct a new, 20,041 square foot (net), 3-story mixed-use project. Buildings to be demolished include 1,682 square feet of commercial space and 6,189 square feet of residential space. New commercial floor area on the first floor will total 1,888 square feet. There will be 29 residential units on all three floors, with 2,116 square feet on the first floor, 8,971 square feet on the second floor, and 7,066 square feet on the third floor, for a total of 18,153 square feet of new residential floor area. A total of 37 parking spaces and 32 bike parking spaces will be provided on the ground floor. The maximum height of the building is 43 feet. Grading excavation of 20 cubic yards is also proposed. Under the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD), the proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 63 units allowed on this 20,670 square foot parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay. The average unit size of the apartments is 600 square feet.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 3:03 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; and Peter Lewis, Applicant; and Renee Brooke, Senior Planner (for Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner).

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Ms. Brooke reported that a memo will be prepared to guide the Board regarding compliance with the Zoning Ordinance and AUD concerns for the proposed project.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the overall building heights and interior room heights.
- 2) Study the treatment of exterior surfaces, colors, and materials; simplify the chosen color palette; and concentrate on the form of the building, rather than the surfaces of the building.
- 3) Study the proximity of the building massing along Salsipuedes Street. Treatment of the space under the balconies on the lower level shall make it unavailable to loitering.
- 4) Study the balcony locations and their relationship to the park on the Cota Street side. Study the proximity to the sidewalk, including the middle overhang.
- 5) Study the parapet height. Consider the design style requirements of the Haley-Milpas Guidelines.
- 6) Study improving the way-finding for the entry.
- 7) Study more opportunities for increasing the landscaping.
- 8) Provide a roof plan.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**3. 320 W PUEBLO ST****RETIRED Zone**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-102-001
 Application Number: MST2003-00152
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Svcs. (SEPPS)
 Architect: Erich Burkhart
 Architect: Brian Cearnal
 Landscape Architect: Bob Cunningham

(The original project under this application was the proposed Cottage Hospital Master Plan which involved the replacement of the main hospital building and other structures on site, new parking structures, and the closure of one block of Castillo Street. A revision to the project is proposed to construct a new egress stair, required by the Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development, which necessitates the removal of the existing 60 foot tall, 28" diameter Pinus canariensis "Canary Island Pine" tree. The revision to the project also includes a tree replacement plan as mitigations for the loss of a protected tree and to comply with the conditions of approval.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 020-05. Specifically, Condition II.B.15.p requires replacement of protected tree at a 10:1 ratio.)

Actual time: 4:13 p.m.

Present: Tom Thompson and Nick Henderson, SB Cottage Hospital; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect; and Suzanne Riegle, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Ms. Riegle clarified that the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the Cottage Hospital Master Plan reported on biological impacts that identified specific trees to be protected, such as Canary Island Pine trees, Morton Bay Fig trees, etc., and the conditions (B-15A through Q) regarding tree protection, including the 10:1 ratio for protected trees (B-15P). Staff consulted Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst, and concurred and supports Mr. Cunningham's proposed bio-mass replacement tree species. She also reported that due to current drought conditions, the street trees required to be maintained by the City and replaced by the City Arborist haven't been approved yet by the Parks and Recreation Department, unlike the other five trees on the project site to be maintained by Cottage Hospital.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted (including the street trees).

Action: Miller/Gradin, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Board Comments: One Board member suggested the Applicant include a reference to the replacement tree planting delay due to current drought conditions

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 920 SUMMIT RD****A-2 Zone**

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-211-009
 Application Number: MST2005-00831
 Owner: MCC BB Property, LLC
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Ty Warner Hotels and Resorts
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Svcs. (SEPPS)
 Business Name: Montecito Country Club

(Proposals for renovations to the Montecito Country Club. This proposal has been reduced in scope to the following: facade improvements to the existing clubhouse; a new 5,746 square foot golf cart storage building; a new 702 square foot storage and maintenance building; modify parking lot; relocate pool; modify pool support building; add a pool pavilion, 365 square foot snack shop, 555 square foot pool equipment room, splash pool, lap pool, whirlpool; sand volleyball court, bocce ball court; new patios, and landscaping. The clubhouse structure is eligible for Structure of Merit status and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. The project includes major grading with 192,000 cubic yards of cut and fill for recontouring, and renovation of an existing 18-hole golf course. Significant tree removals (252), tree relocations (43), and new trees (725) are proposed, with a net gain of 479 additional trees. The project received Planning Commission approval on 9/10/09 (Resolution No. 035-09) for a Conditional Use Permit Amendment, Coastal Development Permit, and Development Plan Approval. Proposed development has been reduced by approximately 7,200 square feet from the approved project. The project involves the following Assessor Parcel Numbers: 015-300-001, 015-300-002, 015-300-003, 009-091-014, 009-091-019, 009-091-020, 009-151-006, 009-151-007, 015-211-009, 015-211-010, and 015-280-014.)

(Project Design Approval is requested of revised project. Requires a Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 035-09. Project was last reviewed on March 17, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:29 p.m.

Present: Steven Welton, Agent, SEPPS; Rob Yeager, Architect; and Bill Medel, Project Manager, Ty Warner Hotels and Resorts.

Public comment opened at 4:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board found the configuration, site plan, and architecture of the proposed project was not in Substantial Conformance; however, the scale and area of the building are acceptable.
- 2) Provide landscaping along the west elevation.
- 3) Study more traditional materials for the building.
- 4) Study the west elevation façade.
- 5) One Board member suggested the Applicant study rotating the entire building.
- 6) Provide additional photographic documentation.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 927 E HALEY ST****R-2 Zone**

(6:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-241-015
Application Number: MST2014-00410
Owner: Warder Bayly
Designer: Diana Costea

(Proposal to demolish an existing 144 square foot detached 1-car garage and construct a new 2-story, 1,046 square foot dwelling unit and 618 square foot 3-car attached garage at the rear of the parcel. An existing 1-story, 579 square foot dwelling unit at the front of the parcel will remain unchanged. Also proposed is to demolish a 128 square foot storage shed. Total new square footage on site will be 1,664 square feet. There is no grading proposed. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00333.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and a Public Works Transportation waiver of parking design standards.)

Actual time: 4:57 p.m.

Present: Diana Costea, Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:08 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An email from Adriana Rosas in opposition to the project was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Return with neighboring adjacent building footprints on the plans.
- 2) Significantly reduce the second floor deck area.
- 3) The Board finds the third floor roof deck is not acceptable as proposed.
- 4) The proposed architectural style shall be more compatible with the existing front house.
- 5) Provide a clear pedestrian path from the street to the secondary unit.
- 6) Provide a trash enclosure.
- 7) Provide a preliminary landscape plan.
- 8) Restudy of the proposed parking arrangement and site layout.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:37 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:10 P.M.***

*** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF AGENDA ORDER. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

6. 210 W COTA ST

R-3 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-121-014
Application Number: MST2014-00338
Owner: Brian Fahnestock
Architect: Thompson Naylor Architects

(Proposal for a 941 square foot two-story addition at the rear of an existing 1,137 square foot one-story duplex. The existing one-story duplex would be remodeled to a single unit and a new 539 square foot two-car garage with 402 square foot second-floor studio unit is proposed to be attached at the rear of the building. Two existing uncovered parking spaces will be covered. Also proposed is to remove an existing hot tub, car cover, and shed. Under the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD), the proposed residential density is 19 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of two units allowed on this 4,600 square foot parcel.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on August 18, 2014.)

Actual time: 2:14 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect; and Julie Fahnestock, Owner.

Public comment opened at 2:22 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An emailed letter of support of the proposed project was forwarded by the Applicant from Katherine Emery.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support vinyl windows for this proposed project as long as the windows are recessed with appropriate detailing shown on the plans? 6/1 (passed).

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Applicant to complete the east elevation (rear building) with the board and batten siding to turn the corner and return around the main building. Provide additional wood trim detailing for the windows at the board and batten locations and at the garage door.
- 2) The second story element shall be detailed with a water board (sill detail) under the windows and the entire length of the second story portion of the building.
- 3) All vinyl windows shall be recessed with appropriate detailing shown on the plans.
- 4) Provide details of the stair tread and riser dimensions.
- 5) The Board is waiving the requirement for a landscape plan for this proposed project.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 5/1/1. Motion carried. (Zink opposed, Gradin abstained).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1120 & 1122 INDIO MUERTO ST****R-3 Zone****(6:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-291-027
 Application Number: MST2014-00051
 Owner: Edward St George Revocable Trust
 Architect: On Design Architects

(Proposal to construct five new 2-story and 3-story buildings for a total of 11 new residential units on two separate parcels: Lot 2: This 7,290 square foot parcel at 1120 Indio Muerto (APN 017-291-004) will be developed with two, 2-story buildings: Building B, a duplex, and Building C, a 3-car garage with a second-story dwelling unit. Three covered and three uncovered parking spaces are proposed. Lot 3: This 34,189 square foot parcel at 1122 Indio Muerto (017-291-027) will be developed with three, 3-story duplexes and one 2nd-story duplex above an existing 12-car garage. These buildings D, E, F, and G, will range in size from 2,500 - 3,000 square feet. An existing duplex, concrete driveway, and storage shed will be demolished. Over both parcels, sixteen trees are proposed to be removed: 10 Brazilian pepper trees ranging from 12' to 30' tall and 8" to 18" in diameter; three Palm trees at 12' tall and 14" in diameter, one Redwood tree at 12' tall and 12" in diameter; and two Avocado trees ranging from 12' to 24' tall and 8" to 24" in diameter. Grading will be balanced on site with 2,210 cubic yards of excavation and 2,210 cubic yards of fill. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00343)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:10 p.m.

Present: Laura Weinstein and Keith Nolan, Architects.

Public comment opened at 6:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An emailed letter was acknowledged from Refugia Acosta who had parking density concerns.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the proposed architecture.
- 2) Provide more landscaping around the 12-car garage building.
- 3) Provide pedestrian circulation through the site, possibly with paving delineated.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan and include a tree protection plan noting number of existing trees, sizes, species, locations, and the proposed trees to be protected or removed. Restudy the replacement of trees to be removed.
- 5) Study opportunities for increased landscaping and adding vine pockets.
- 6) Consider shading the asphalt with shade trees.
- 7) Study attaching a one-car covered garage to Unit #1 on parcel 2.
- 8) Provide a trash enclosure area.

Action: Hopkins/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**8. 1118 INDIO MUERTO ST****R-3 Zone**

(6:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-291-003
Application Number: MST2014-00283
Owner: Edward St George Revocable Trust
Applicant: Laura Weinstein
Architect: On Design Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 889 square foot single-family residence and construct a new two-story 1,539 square foot dwelling with a 413 square foot detached two-car garage on a 3,960 square foot lot. The proposal will result in an 89% guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00343.)

(Comments only. Comments are requested regarding the compatibility of this project with the ABR project at 1120 and 1122 Indio Muerto previously on this agenda. This project is under the purview of the Single Family Design Board.)

Actual time: 6:55 p.m.

Present: Laura Weinstein and Keith Nolan, Architects.

Public comment opened at 6:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

The Architectural Board of Review made the positive comment that the proposed project is compatible with the rear sites and with the neighborhood.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:31 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

ABR - NEW ITEM**A. 2973 STATE ST C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-122-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00452
 Owner: Dushais Family Credit Shelter Trust
 Applicant: Roger Barbosa
 Architect: PSM Architects
 Business Name: CVS Pharmacy

(Proposal for ADA accessibility upgrades to parking stalls and an existing sidewalk at the front of the building including new landscaping and hardscaping. There will be no change in the number of parking spaces provided.)

Present: Roger Barbosa, Applicant.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on plan Sheets AL-1 and AL-2.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**B. 3328 STATE ST C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-324-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00209
 Owner: Bryan William McCann
 Applicant: Darkmoon Building Design And Construction
 Business Name: Instrumental Music

(Proposal for a streetscape façade remodel on an existing 3,161 square foot one-story commercial building. No other changes are proposed on this 6,750 square foot parcel.)

(Project was last reviewed September 15, 2014. Proposed signage and light fixtures to be reviewed under separate sign permit application.)

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Applicant.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on plan Sheet A1.1

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 3427 STATE ST C-P/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-063-012
 Application Number: MST2014-00468
 Owner: Richard James, Inc
 Applicant: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for rear parking lot restriping to add an ADA accessible parking space and a new trash enclosure. Also proposed is a new window awning and to replant two existing planters with Creeping Fig on the Broadmoor Plaza elevation.)

Present: Yvan LeBrock and Misael Contreras, Applicants.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 200 BLK W COTA ST 1989 SEG ID**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-989
 Application Number: MST2011-00054
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jessica Grant

(Proposal to demolish an existing bridge deck and abutments and replace them with cast-in-steel shell piles supporting a reinforced concrete pile cap at each end of the bridge. New bridge deck to be installed atop the new abutments.)

(Review After Final of drought-driven changes to approved landscape plan including substitution of 4" of mulch in lieu of parkway planting, a deep root water method for the new trees, and reconfigured irrigation of parkways for future property owner maintenance.)

Present: Tom Conti, Applicant.

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on plan Sheet L-1, L-2, and L-6.

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 3943 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-021
 Application Number: MST2013-00359
 Owner: GRI Regency, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
 Business Name: Five Points Shopping Center

(Proposal to reconfigure parking lot and add 21 parking spaces in the Five Points Shopping Center parking lot. The proposal includes grading work, accessibility improvements (parking and paths of travel), replacement of existing light fixtures, landscaping, and an additional trash enclosure.)

(Review After Final to replace two previously-approved pole light fixtures with wall fixtures behind Petco, replace 13 existing wall fixtures behind Ross, Starbucks, Albertson's, CVS, and Big 5 with new, and replace one existing wall fixture at Saigon.)

Present: Rogelio Solis, Applicant.

Final Approval of Review After Final.

**** CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 1:40 P.M. ****