



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

TUESDAY, May 27, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*

KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)

THIEP CUNG

SCOTT HOPKINS

COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Landscape Representative)

STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative)

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): JOHN CAMPANELLA

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician

KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Cung, Gradin, Hopkins, and Miller.

Members absent: Poole, and Wittausch.

Staff present: Gantz, Limón, and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **May 12, 2014**, as submitted.

Action: Hopkins/Cung, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Gradin abstained, Poole/Wittausch absent.)

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **May 19, 2014**. The Consent Minutes was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **May 27, 2014**. The Consent Minutes was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Miller/Cung, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1) Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Board members Poole and Wittausch will be absent from today's meeting.
- b) Due to a conflict in meetings scheduled for this room, today's meeting will need to be concluded by 6:00 p.m. Staff is asking the board members to be succinct in their comments and to not repeat comments that have already been voiced by another board member.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Board Member Zink reported on review of photo-simulations of the Southern California Gas Company wireless meter installment project at proposed City locations, and that a newly appointed Subcommittee report will be made soon on those proposed locations for notification to the public for a future continued Board review.

Board Member Miller reported on the monthly Arts Advisory Subcommittee meeting. Local artist business licenses were discussed, and the Santa Barbara Airport Douglas Lockner sculpture signage may return for ABR review.

Board Member Gradin reported on the denied appeal to City Council of the People's Self-Help Housing project at 510 N. Salsipuedes Street which received Board Project Design Approval on September 16, 2013 and Final Approval on April 7, 2014.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 3328 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-324-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00209
 Owner: Bryan William McCann
 Applicant: Darkmoon Building Design and Construction
 Business Name: Instrumental Music

(Proposal for a streetscape facade remodel on an existing 3,161 square foot one-story commercial building. No other changes are proposed on this 6,750 square foot parcel. Requires Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Architect; and Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion:

Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the revisions made to the project.
- 2) The proposed revisions to the façade do not yet meet the standards of Santa Barbara and the ABR Guidelines. Applicant is to consider alternative ways to resolve the arches.
- 3) The Board finds the proposed canopies unacceptable and recommends removal, redesign or enhancement of the proposed canopies.

- 4) The Board finds the proposed color scheme unacceptable; return with a revised color scheme and provide color samples.
- 5) The pop-up element on the elevation appears not in keeping with the rest of the building; consider an alternative to resolve.
- 6) Restudy the south elevation to align better with the existing building.
- 7) Return with corrected elevations, and study more opportunities to add more landscaping, where possible.
- 8) Include setbacks on the plans.
- 9) Provide size of curb details in relation to the distance between the sidewalk; and if there is an ample amount of depth along the sidewalk, then provide additional landscaping along the front of the structure.
- 10) Show the overhang of the existing canopy on the plans.

Action: Hopkins/Gradin, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 122 S VOLUNTARIO ST

R-2 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-213-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00047
 Owner: Jane Barrett
 Architect: Eric Swenumson

(Proposal for a new two-story 3,006 square foot duplex at the rear of a lot, a new three-car carport, and three uncovered parking spaces. The existing 985 square foot one-story single-family residence will remain at the front of the lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Eric Swenumson, Architect; Erin Carroll, Landscape Architect; and Jane Barrett, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion 1: Project Design Approval and continued one week to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Return with rear light fixture cut-sheet details.
- 2) Provide additional eave details.
- 3) Add a bamboo root barrier along the property line.
- 4) Provide Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) compliance Best Management Practices.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Motion: To reopen Item #2, 122 S. Voluntario Street.

Action: Zink/Gradin, 5/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion 2: The Board made and read the following CEQA finding into the record: "The Board found that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 1605 COOK PL****A-F/SD-3 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00163
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: U.S. Department of Commerce
 Applicant: Andrew Bermond

(The National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) is proposing to establish an Atmospheric River Observatory (ARO) on airport property in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. Site preparation will include the removal of two non-native trees, one non-native bush, 90 linear feet of chain link fencing, and a 250 square foot planter area. The ARO would consist of a 449-MHz wind profiler mounted on a 24'-0" square antenna frame surrounded by four, 5' diameter acoustic sources, a GPS receiver, tripod-mounted instrumentation, a 96 square foot, 10'-0" tall equipment shed, and concrete mounting pads ranging in depth from 4" - 6". Approximately four cubic yards of aggregate base may be imported to level the grade. Project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 3:54 p.m.

Present: Andrew Bermond, Airport Planner; and Clark King, NOAA Research Specialist.

Public comment opened at 4:13 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to Consent Review with the comment that the Board finds the proposed project acceptable as presented.

Action: Cung/Gradin, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 4:05 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:15 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW**4. 128 ANACAPA ST****OC/SD-3 Zone****(4:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-083-022
 Application Number: MST2012-00332
 Owner: James McDonald
 Designer: J. Ewing Design

(Proposal to construct two detached single-family residential condominium units on a 5,000 square foot vacant lot. Both buildings would be three-stories with roof terraces and attached two-car garages. Unit A would be 2,756 square feet, with an attached 446 square foot garage. Unit B would be 2,246 square feet with an attached 422 square foot garage. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested of a Tentative Subdivision Map and a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 005-14. Project was last reviewed on April 28, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:16 p.m.

Present: J. Ewing; Designer; David Black, Landscape Architect; and James B. McDonald, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:33 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued one week to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Provide complete window details. Show glazing in the sections. Show windows on the elevations and show unique details, such as the plaster molding above the second floor window, for example.
- 2) Include a typical door and window profile where those appear in the details.
- 3) Provide deeper recesses, as possible, at the exterior walls.
- 4) There shall be no visible flashings at the parapets.
- 5) Visible flashing at the fascia shall be minimized as much as possible at eave terminations.
- 6) Call-out the elevation details on the plans for identification; key details to the elevations with elevations to match the floor plans.
- 7) Show the copper gutters and downspouts in the details and elevations of the plans.
- 8) Provide a weep screed detail that minimizes the amount of exposed concrete footing.

Action: Gradin/Cung, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

5. 101 N MILPAS ST

C-2 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-083-015
Application Number: MST2014-00195
Owner: Amiri Family Trust
Applicant: Permit Consultants, Inc.
Architect: Marchi & Associates

(Proposal for renovation and exterior alterations to an existing 2,660 square foot commercial building comprising the following: demolish an existing planter, front steps, and dumpster enclosure pad and construct a new ADA accessible entrance and ramp, add new exterior ATM, and replace the trash enclosure, hardscape, and landscape. Also proposed is to restripe the parking lot, replace parking lot lighting, replace doors and windows, install a fire department connection and backflow device, and repaint the exterior of the building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:45 p.m.

Present: Rob Jacknewitz, Applicant, Permit Consultants, Inc.; Paul S. Kielsmeier, Senior Project Manager, Wells Fargo.

Public comment opened at 5:04 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the proposed yellow color for the surround at the ATM machines? 2/3 (Gradin/Cung in favor; vote failed).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support a more toned-down yellow color for the surround at the ATM machines in plaster instead of the proposed metal? 3/2 (passed).

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy for a more toned-down yellow color for the ATM machines with plaster instead of the proposed metal.
- 2) Integrate the proposed lighting fixtures into the proposed architectural style; coordinate the proposed lighting with the site plan and proposed photometrics.
- 3) Study to remove the proposed redundant ATM overhangs, and any remaining security to be relocated to the roof overhang.
- 4) Add more planting details and call-outs on the plans. Revisit planter facing Milpas Street.
- 5) Study opportunities for additional landscaping to the tall wall along Mason Street.
- 6) Restudy to add more character and interest to the proposed handrail and trash enclosure steel frame gates with an applied wood finish.
- 7) Consider adding a shade tree on the south-side of the parking lot.

Action: Cung/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Wittausch absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**6. 721 CLIFF DR****R-3/SD-3 Zone****(5:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-025
 Application Number: MST2014-00243
 Owner: Santa Barbara Junior College District
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects
 Applicant: Julie Hendricks Fahnestock
 Business Name: Santa Barbara City College

(Proposal for a new three-story 30,000 square foot classroom and office building to be constructed on the West Campus at Santa Barbara City College. This building will replace existing classroom structures. The building is proposed to have a roof garden.)

(Advisory comments only; project requires a Coastal Development Permit from the California Coastal Commission.)

Actual time: 5:25 p.m.

Present: Thierry Cassan, AIA, Architect; and Julie Hendricks Fahnestock, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 5:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

The Board made only comments, as follows:

- 1) A majority of the Board felt that there would be minimal impacts to public views based on the photographs.
- 2) One Board member suggested that a concrete base may work better than the proposed traditional Spanish sandstone to match the base of the other building.
- 3) Two Board members found that the interplay between the two buildings could be better resolved.
- 4) Two Board members found the stone base plinth acceptable as proposed because it humanizes the building to pedestrian scale, symbolizes a tie to the earth, and is a strong concept typical of Santa Barbara and the area.
- 5) One Board member would prefer a wider entry with more drama.
- 6) One Board member found the overall site plan to be acceptable, and interesting vertical angles that match the general pier design are a charming detail; however the connecting area should be resolved better.

- 7) The very strong canopy support does not relate to the building to the right of it. It appears unfinished. Carrying the texture of the right building over onto the front wall is unnecessary. Make it plainer.
- 8) A majority of the Board found the landscape plan, green roof and the proposed swale generally acceptable; possibly add additional trees and landscaping of significant scale to match the building massing around the building; especially in parking lot elevation in the landscape islands.
- 9) One Board member found the strong horizontal band on the building to be overwhelming and unnecessary; perhaps replace with plain plaster and restudy an alternate way to better incorporate the windows.
- 10) The Board felt the project would not impact public views from Shoreline Drive and other view impacts would be minimal.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:58 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Kirk Gradin**, and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

ABR - NEW ITEM**A. 1934 ELISE WAY R-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-015-017
Application Number: MST2014-00231
Owner: Housing Authority/City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Thomas Moore

(Proposal to replace all of the existing aluminum windows in a 16 unit residential development with new Milgard vinyl retrofit windows. No new window openings are proposed.)

Present: Thomas Moore, Applicant.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 706 E HALEY ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-301-002
Application Number: MST2014-00010
Owner: Slason Family 1992 Survivors Trust
Owner: Santa Barbara Land Company
Applicant: JM Holliday Associates
Agent: Jerry Rocci

(Proposal for a complete interior and exterior remodel of an existing mixed-use building consisting of 1,300 square feet of commercial space and five residential units on a 10,000 square foot site. The remodel consists of a new floor plan configuration, a 60 square foot commercial addition, new exterior patio and trellis along Haley Street, new entries for the residential units, and one new accessible uncovered parking space. Also proposed is to remove an existing 10" diameter tree and to construct a new 51 linear foot, 6'-0" tall CMU and plaster wall.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan and Findings for Removal of a tree within the front setback per SBMC 15.24.090 Findings for Removal.)

Present: Michael Holliday, Applicant.

Final Approval as noted on plan Sheets A5.0, A6.0, and the color/material board. CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 exemption findings were made, and SBMC Section 15.24.090 Findings were also made for the tree removal.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 118 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-091-016
Application Number: MST2014-00240
Owner: Kenneth and Barbara Coates Family Trust
Owner: Lesley Alexander Trust
Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal for fire damage repairs and improvements to an existing 2,216 one-story commercial building. The project includes minor door and window changes, 500 square feet of new paving including walkways and a new ADA accessible ramp, relocation of skylights, replacement of 620 square feet of roofing, and new landscaping on a 3,969 square foot parcel.)

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on plan Sheet A1.0.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**D. 3761 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-053
Application Number: MST2014-00155
Owner: Teachers Insurance & Annuity Association of America
Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for landscape plan revisions and tree replacement in the Whole Foods retail store parking lot including the following: remove 34 Eucalyptus citriodora "Lemon Gum," nine Agonis jervis bay after dark "Bronze Peppermint Tree," and 11 Chionanthus retusus "Chinese Fringe Tree" and replace with 13 Lophostemon confertus "Brisbane Box," 12 Melaleuca styphelioides "Prickly Paperbark," and eight Stenocarpus sinuatis "Firewheel Trees." In summary, 54 trees will be removed, 33 new trees will be planted, and 70 existing trees will be protected in place and will remain unchanged.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 12, 2014.)

Present: Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on plan Sheet LP-1.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 1:55 P.M. ****