



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, April 14, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*

KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)

THIEP CUNG

SCOTT HOPKINS

COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Landscape Representative)

STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative)

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): JOHN CAMPANELLA

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - Absent

SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician

KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:08 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Hopkins (present at 4:09 p.m.), Miller, Poole, and Wittausch.

Members absent: Gradin and Cung.

Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Mr. Trevor Martinson spoke regarding his pending appeal of the Final Approval of 510 N. Salsipuedes Street. He expressed concerns about the subsequent ABR approval on April 7, 2014 of additional plan sheets. Mr. Martinson has requested that the City Attorney's Office make a determination on this issue.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **Tuesday, April 1, 2014**, as amended.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Poole abstained, Gradin/Cung/Hopkins absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **April 7, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by **Kirk Gradin**.

Action: Miller/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Hopkins absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **April 14, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by **Paul Zink/Courtney Jane Miller**.
 Action: Miller/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Hopkins absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Board Member Hopkins will arrive at the conclusion of Item 1 at 251 S. Hope Avenue, and Board Members Cung and Gradin will be absent today.
 - b) An appeal of the ABR's approval of the project at 510 N. Salsipuedes Street will be heard by the City Council on Tuesday afternoon, April 29th. Board Member Gradin will attend the hearing to represent the ABR.
 - c) The semi-annual recruitment for scheduled and unscheduled vacancies on the various City Advisory Groups is in progress. Applications must be received in the City Clerk's Office by 5:30pm Monday, May 5, 2014. Please go to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Applications to view information regarding the recruitment, including a list of current vacancies and the application form or contact Deborah Applegate, Deputy City Clerk, at dapplegate@santabarbaraca.gov.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Zink requested clarification that the ABR has an *ad hoc* Subcommittee for micro-cell sites and requested a new *ad hoc* Subcommittee be formed to review advanced meter sites. Board members to staff this *ad hoc* Subcommittee will be selected at a future time.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 251 S HOPE AVE

E-3/PD/SP-4/SD-2 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00142
 Owner: Hughes Dealership Group, Inc.
 Architect: Peikert + RRM Design Group
 Applicant: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for the construction of a new 17,004 square foot building with 90 studio apartments for very low- and low-income seniors on a vacant 1.76 acre site. The project includes a two-bedroom manager's unit, commercial kitchen, and common dining room.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert and Lisa Plowman, Architects; Rob Pearson, Executive Dir. of the Santa Barbara Housing Authority (HACSB).

Public comment opened at 3:51 p.m.

- 1) Bob Cunningham, opposition; with concerns requesting emphasis of the elevations of the circulation element and street frontage façades; additional roof details; and requested screening of the parking; subdued lighting; site story poles, improved curb and sidewalk pedestrian appeal; and landscaping to be similar to that across the street on La Rada.

- 2) Jim Smith, (speaking for seven other people, submitted documentation) opposition; with concerns regarding the proposed size, bulk, and scale, and requested a more residential look and feel to the proposed project, parking density in the neighborhood, and requested a reduction in height on the project.
- 3) Vicki St. Martin, support; but with concerns regarding size, parking density, and rapid traffic in the area, and neighborhood compatibility of the proposed project.
- 4) Dorinda Carr, (submitted letter) opposition; with concerns regarding size and scale of the proposed project, and rapid traffic and parking density in the area.
- 5) Tamara Diamond, opposition; with concerns regarding size and scale of the proposed project, rapid traffic and parking density, and adjacent crosswalk safety.
- 6) Karen Shaw, (adjacent neighbor) opposition; with concerns regarding size and scale, rapid traffic, parking density, and adjacent cross walk safety due to the loading of cars by the nearby dealership in the middle of the road.
- 7) Edward Steinfeldt, (adjacent neighbor) opposition; with concerns regarding parking density in the area due to the nearby car dealership, and the proposed square footage (footprint) for each unit.

Four letters and emails of concern from Dr. Kiumarss Nassari, Jim Souza, the Board of Directors for the Hope Village Maintenance Corp., Dorinda Carr, and William Gebhart were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4: 09p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board generally appreciates the well-sited project, but finds the project is too massive, and suggests a reduction in the size, bulk, and scale of the buildings as seen from the street, with suggestions to break up the massing by:
 - a) Removing end units on the third floor;
 - b) Add tile roofs at the porches and balconies or add a tile roof at the third story at the mansard to preserve the flat roof for photovoltaic equipment.
- 2) The Board was in favor of Option 2 with a red tile Spanish roof treatment of the building.
- 3) The Board expressed concern about the creek setback for long-term security and felt the proposed 35-foot setback may not be enough, and to perhaps step the building back.
- 4) Study compacting vertical circulation elements to maximize open space.
- 5) Return with building sections on the plans, and/or computer modeling. Story poles may be required in the future.
- 6) Provide a Transportation Traffic Study of traffic circulation and impacts, and parking numbers, including any queuing issues prior to returning for further ABR review.
- 7) Provide landscape screening for parking areas and show on the plans any proposed landscape fingers in the parking drawings.
- 8) Provide roof plan.
- 9) Obtain comments from Creeks Division staff prior to returning for further ABR review.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Gradin/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 121 E MASON ST****OC/SD-3 Zone**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-084-005
Application Number: MST2014-00115
Architect: Dan Weber
Owner: Somo SB, LLC

(Proposal for a new residential and commercial mixed-use development comprising 66 residential apartment units (including ten affordable density bonus units), approximately 28,359 square feet of ocean-oriented commercial building area, 12,154 square feet of industrial/manufacturing building area, and 10,071 square feet of building area for recreation facilities and overnight accommodations on a 1.75 acre site. The project incorporates five existing structures and includes an outdoor gym and rooftop pool.)

(Requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 4:47 p.m.

Present: Dan Weber, Architect; and Neal Dipaola, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:13 p.m.

- 1) Karl Kras, (member of Funk Zone Neighborhood Association) spoke in support of the proposed project, and of importance of maintaining neighborhood participation; requested breaking up the massing in favor of mixed-use and individual industrial style buildings for a more artistic community; more public open space; bike and pedestrian-friendly amenities; and maintain the variety of sustainable housing.
- 2) Ron Gallo, (President and CEO of Santa Barbara Foundation); spoke in support of the proposed project which is continuing to evolve as an important arts section of Santa Barbara.
- 3) Darcel Elliot, (agent for Das Williams, Rep.); spoke in support of the project.
- 4) Jay Harkrider, support; spoke in support of the project that will include input from local artists and local hotels.
- 5) Nils Hammerbeck spoke in support of the project.

A letter of concerns from Suzanne Martin-Reay was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:26 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the relationship between building heights and open spaces.
- 2) Provide perspectives from the corner of E. Yanonali Street and Gray Avenue, and provide transitions from the old to the new on the plans, the heights of neighboring buildings, and shadowing for additional contextual perspective. The Board suggested 3-D modeling might be helpful.
- 3) Prior to the next ABR review, provide Transportation and Fire Department staff review of pedestrian and vehicular safety issues, alley access for parking, turn-around radius, and emergency access and egress (on a one-way street).
- 4) Study reducing the height of some portions of the buildings surrounding the tower.
- 5) Identify existing and proposed buildings on the plans. Add adjacent parcel buildings on the elevations and callout those buildings heights.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 5:52 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:56 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 2720 DE LA VINA ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-220-021
 Application Number: MST2014-00079
 Owner: William Meller Family, LLC
 Applicant: DesignARC, Inc.

(Conceptual review of a new 20,925 square foot four-story mixed-use building. The proposal would demolish the existing 4,167 square foot commercial building and surface parking lot on the 11,607 square foot parcel, and construct a new 38 foot tall mixed-use building consisting of 2,936 square feet of commercial space on the ground floor, attached two-level 19 space parking garage, and seven residential units on the two floors above. The project is proposed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. There will be 1,562 cubic yards of grading excavation and 168 cubic yards of fill, mainly for the lower level of parking below grade. As proposed, the project would require Staff Hearing Officer review of a front setback modification.)

(Concept Review; comments only. Requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings.)

Actual time: 5:56 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Applicant, and Melisa Cinarli Turner, Project Manager for DesignARC, Inc.; William Meller, Owner; and Tony Boughman, Associate Planner.

Mr. Boughman requested the Board focus their comments on the project's mass, bulk, and scale; architectural style; quality of architecture and materials; landscaping; and whether there is any adverse impact from the proposed modification.

The Applicant clarified that the description of the proposed project should be corrected for a *three-story* mixed-use building and not a four-story mixed-use building.

Public comment opened at 6:15 p.m.

1) Cyndie Howard, opposition; expressed concerns regarding proposed height, proposed parking element, and mass, bulk, and scale.

Public comment closed at 6:18 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board generally finds the project acceptable in terms of architectural style, and in size, bulk, and scale, and site planning.
- 2) Applicant to restudy the proposed colors, materials, textures, and patinas.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 522 GARDEN ST****C-M Zone**

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-211-023
Application Number: MST2013-00464
Owner: Carla Lejade
Architect: Jeff Shelton, Architect

(Proposal to construct a new three-story mixed-use building on a 3,320 square foot vacant lot. The project consists of two commercial tenant spaces of 247 and 221 square feet on the ground floor, an 884 square foot residential unit with a 481 square foot deck on the second floor, a 682 square foot unit with a 175 square foot deck on the third floor and a 692 square foot roof deck. Parking consists of two residential parking spaces and two bicycle parking spaces in a two-car garage, and two uncovered parking spaces for the commercial units. The project is proposed under the Average Unit-size Density Incentive Program.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on November 25, 2013.)

Actual time: 6:40 p.m.

Present: Anna Lehr, Project Engineer; and Dan Upton, Contractor and Agent for Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:44 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Board member Hopkins read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.
- 3) Provide improved screening of the back-flow preventer equipment to ABR staff for Administrative approval.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 121 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-2 Zone**

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-221-019
Application Number: MST2014-00140
Owner: Geoffrey Rockwell
Architect: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal to demolish an existing 400 square foot two-car garage and construct a new 1,219 square foot, second floor, single-family residence above 1,181 square feet of new attached garages on the ground level. The proposed attached one-car garage and two attached two-car garages, and existing uncovered parking space will serve the new residence and two existing residences on the parcel. The proposal of 2,400 square feet will result in a total of 4,404 square feet of development on a 13,088 square foot lot.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:56 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:01 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the additional housing unit.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan showing existing planting to remain and proposed plant species.
- 3) Provide compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Plan (SWMP) requirements in coordination with the landscape plan and the amount of open space.
- 4) Provide a pedestrian path of travel from the sidewalk to the proposed new entry to the project.
- 5) Provide a trash enclosure for all three units with appropriate number of containers.
- 6) Applicant to modify the west elevation; specifically, the second floor cantilever width. Suggestions included incorporating a broken pitch and changing the building material for the cantilevered section, and increasing the width of the cantilevered beams over the garage doors.
- 7) Provide a consistent vocabulary for the fenestration. The Board suggested a Craftsmen style to match the front unit's window, mullion, and proportion details.
- 8) Add architectural interest to the north elevation, perhaps using dormers over the windows to break up the long fascia board.
- 9) On the west elevation, lessen the cantilever at the corner.
- 10) Provide additional interest with a covered entry.
- 11) Provide staff with the required Phase I Archaeological Resources Report.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

**** THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:29 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Paul Zink** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**A. 2320 DE LA VINA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-113-021
Application Number: MST2014-00027
Owner: Barbara Harootunian Trust
Applicant: Vanguard Planning

(Proposal for renovations to an existing two-story apartment building. The project would eliminate a swimming pool and fencing and equipment shed and install landscaping, hardscaping, and barbeque. The project includes restoring the parking lot to a 13-space configuration, a new trash enclosure, permitting an as-built second-story deck and as-built storage lockers on the ground. The project will address all violations in ENF2013-00906.)

(Final Approval of updated Landscape Plan is requested.)

Final Approval of the landscape plan.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 1924 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-363-018
Application Number: MST2014-00162
Owner: 1922 De La Vina
Architect: Paul Poirier & Associates
Business Name: Cajun Kitchen

(Proposal for alterations to an existing commercial storefront including the removal of a wood site wall, installation of new wrought iron fence, installation of a new accessible ramp at an existing deck, and an awning replacement.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on plan Sheet A1.1, with revised plans to return to staff.

**** CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 1:25 P.M. ****