



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, November 25, 2013 **630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)
THIEP CUNG
SCOTT HOPKINS
GARY MOSEL
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative, Alternate)
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): ADDISON THOMPSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/gov/brdcomm/ac/abr/videos.asp.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Board member Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Mosel (present at 3:07 p.m.), Gradin, Cung, Hopkins, Poole, and Wittausch.
Members absent: Zink.
Staff present: Boughman and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **November 11, 2013**, as amended.
Action: Poole/Mosel, 3/0/3. Motion carried. (Cung/Wittausch/Gradin abstained, Zink absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 18, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin**.
Action: Hopkins/Poole, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Cung abstained, Zink absent).

The November 25, 2013, Consent Calendar was cancelled.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.**1) Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:**

- a) The previously approved project at 510 N. Salsipuedes Street (People's Self-Help Housing) will be reviewed at the 2:00 p.m. City Council appeal hearing on Tuesday, November 26, 2013; Board members Zink, Gradin, Mosel, and Wittausch volunteered to be in attendance to represent the Board.
- b) Board member Zink will be absent from the next Board meeting on December 9, 2013; Board member Gradin will Chair the meeting in his place.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**1. 3714 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-023
 Application Number: MST2012-00443
 Owner: Kellog Associates
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
 Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Revision to the previously approved mixed-use development at the previous Sandman Inn site (MST2007-00591; City Council Resolution No. 10-020). The revised project involves the demolition of the existing, 52,815 square foot, 113-room hotel and restaurant, and construction of 5,110 square feet of office space and 72 residential condominiums.)

(Second Concept Review; project requires Environmental Assessment, Project Compatibility Criteria, and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on January 22, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:13 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Gregory Parker, Investec Corporation, Applicant; Rick Kellog, Owner; and Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board commends the large project providing higher density housing with commercial use, and appreciates the higher level of design in a style valued in Santa Barbara.
- 2) There are concerns about some areas of the project. The commercial buildings #1 and #2 along State Street are important as entrance gateways to the project and should have much more character and charm; suggestions include tile elements, eaves, etc. to enhance the buildings.
- 3) The Board is very much in favor of the enhanced landscaping that divides the vehicle entrance. The landscaping in the front of the project is of particular importance.
- 4) A majority of the Board is in favor of white as the predominant color for the project.
- 5) Study additional trees along State Street and in areas of tall unrelieved architecture.
- 6) Study breaking up the massing of buildings #5 and #6, as they face the interior road and the pedestrian right-of-way.

- 7) Study varying the plate heights and eave lines to add additional character, especially along the westerly property line.
- 8) The Board made the Compatibility Analysis (SBMC 22.68.045) findings as follows:
 - a) The proposed project is consistent with applicable ABR Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code provisions; including site design, architecture, and landscaping.
 - b) The project's design is consistent with the City and the architectural character of the City and neighborhood.
 - c) The project's mass, bulk, and scale are appropriate for its location and its neighborhood, given compliance with additional comments made by the Board.
 - d) The project's design is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmarks and historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, and a significant improvement over the previous building in preserving established scenic public vistas.
 - e) The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping, given compliance with additional landscape comments made by the Board.

Action: Mosel/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 520 E YANONALI ST

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-016

Application Number: MST2013-00388

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Lisa Arroyo, Project Engineer

(Proposal for the replacement of the existing Tertiary Filtration Plant at the El Estero Wastewater Treatment Plant. The project will demolish the existing 2,200 square foot building and construct a 5,300 square foot facility including a 2,900 square foot metal canopy. The canopy will be approximately 25.5 feet tall.)

(Third review; project last reviewed on October 14, 2013. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Present: Don Cutler, CDM Smith, Consultant; Sara Iza, City Public Works Project Planner; and Lisa Arroyo, City Public Works Supervising Engineer.

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) In general the project is acceptable at this stage provided the proposed changes are incorporated, including adequate landscaping screening of the project as requested. Return with a site plan showing the proposed Willow trees.
- 2) A gray skirt board is preferred over the white skirt board.
- 3) Provide a color board and materials board including the temporary screening.
- 4) Any mechanical equipment that *can* be painted, then *should* be painted to match the roof color.

- 5) The Board made the Compatibility Analysis (SBMC 22.68.045) findings as follows:
- a) Given the project's location, the proposed project is consistent with applicable ABR Design Guidelines and with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code provisions.
 - b) The project's design is consistent with the City and the architectural character of the City and neighborhood given the project's location.
 - c) The project's mass, bulk, and scale are appropriate for its location and its neighborhood, given compliance with additional comments made by the Board.
 - d) The project's design is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmarks and historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, or established scenic public vistas.
 - e) The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping, given compliance with additional landscape comments made by the Board.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

PROJECT DESIGN HEARING

3. 525 E MICHELTORENA ST

R-3 Zone

(4:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-260-031
 Application Number: MST2013-00461
 Owner: PB Micheltorena LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for façade improvements to an existing commercial building and accessibility upgrades to the parking lot, new entry stairs, accessible ramp, and exterior patio. Also included is a reconfiguration of the front stairs to accommodate an accessible lift at the front of the building.)

Actual time: 5:03 p.m.

Present: Edward DeVicente, and Ryan Mills, DMHA, Applicants; and Courtney Miller, SJMLA, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury regarding was received.

Straw vote: How many Board members found the flat steel for the front canopy acceptable? 3/3 (tie vote).

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide larger scaled, detailed, and dimensioned floor plan to show the street frontage at the lift and new stairs. Study making the stairway access wider and more inviting, and screen the lift from direct view from the sidewalk and street.
- 2) Provide accurate and to-scale street front south elevations.
- 3) The material chosen for the imitation wood siding will be critical.
- 4) Provide a replacement canopy tree for the liquid amber trees proposed for removal to help buffer the building elevation at the west side.
- 5) Restudy the cornice details on Sheet A2.02 on the plans.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 5:46 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:49 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 522 GARDEN ST****C-M Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-211-023
Application Number: MST2013-00464
Owner: Carla Lejade
Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal to construct a new three-story mixed-use building on a 3,320 square foot vacant lot. The project consists of two commercial tenant spaces of 247 and 221 square feet on the ground floor, an 884 square foot residential unit with a 481 square foot deck on the second floor, a 682 square foot unit with a 175 square foot deck on the third floor and a 692 square foot roof deck. Parking consists of two residential parking spaces and two bicycle parking spaces in a two-car garage, and two uncovered parking spaces for the commercial units. The project is proposed under the Average Unit-size Density Incentive Program.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and an Environmental Finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

Actual time: 5:49 p.m.

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect; Anna Lehr, City Public Works Project Engineer II; and Solomon Metcalf, Craft Model Assistant & Intern.

Public comment opened at 6:02 p.m.

1) Neil Ablitt, neighbor, spoke in support of the proposed project.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was received.

Public comment closed at 6:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board unanimously had very favorable comments on the proposal with no requested changes.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 810 E CANON PERDIDO ST #A****R-3 Zone**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-042-003
Application Number: MST2013-00456
Owner: Scott Chasse Trust
Designer: Robinson Drafting & Design

(Proposal to legalize the conversion of an existing 1,545 square foot, one-story duplex to a triplex under the Average Unit Density (AUD) program. The project includes as-built interior remodel of the duplex and the legalization of an as-built illegal unit which includes a new as-built 220 square foot upper loft floor area on this 11,250 square foot parcel. Also proposed is to permit the after-the-fact demolition of a two-car garage, approval of five new uncovered parking spaces, associated landscape changes, and removal of unpermitted structures located within the setbacks. An existing one-story, 445 square foot single-family dwelling on site will remain unaltered. This application addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00402. The project requires an environmental finding for CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

Actual time: 6:11 p.m.

Present: Louis Robinson, Designer; and Scott Chase, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:17 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a more fully developed landscape plan with a licensed landscape architect.
- 2) Provide landscape screening between the parking area and the street, and at the rear.
- 3) If only four parking spaces are required for the project, the Board would prefer landscaping or useable yard area rather than parking in the front of the building. An additional tree would be in order.
- 4) Show on the plans where the trash and recycling enclosure will be located.
- 5) Reduce the amount of gravel or hard surface, and replace with more landscaping.
- 6) Provide a color board and a materials board, and an irrigation plan prior to final approval.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent).

THE NOVEMBER 25, 2013 CONSENT CALENDAR WAS CANCELLED

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:42 P.M. ****