



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, October 28, 2013 **630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room** **3:03 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
 KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)
 THIEP CUNG
 SCOTT HOPKINS
 GARY MOSEL
 STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative, Alternate)
 WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): ADDISON THOMPSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/gov/brdcomm/ac/abr/videos.asp.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by the Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Mosel (present at 3:06 p.m.), Gradin (present at 3:40 p.m.), Cung (present at 3:06 p.m. until 5:58 p.m.), Hopkins, Poole (present until 5:58 p.m.), and Wittausch.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Limón (present until 4:48 p.m.), Boughman, and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:**
No public comment.
- B. Approval of Minutes:**
Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **October 14, 2013**, as amended.
Action: Poole/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent).
- C. Consent Calendars:**
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 21, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Kirk Gradin.
Action: Hopkins/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 28, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Kirk Gradin.

Action: Poole/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:

- a) The appeal of 510 N. Salsipuedes Street will be heard by City Council on November 26, 2013, with a site visit on November 25, 2013.
- b) Board members Poole and Cung will be leaving the meeting at 6:00.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. (3:10) AVERAGE UNIT-SIZE DENSITY (AUD) INCENTIVE PROGRAM

Staff: Bettie Weiss, City Planner & Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
(Training on the relationship between Design Review and the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive program. This training will focus on the role of the ABR, key design issues, examples of past projects and standards, and the role of the Planning Commission.)

Presentation made and discussion held.

Board members had the following general questions and comments:

1. The Board supports the approach to have planning staff provide a recommendation to the ABR on when a project should be forwarded to the Planning Commission for comments.
2. Recommends that the 'livability' of units be considered when high density projects are proposed and not just architectural design.
3. Asked about and received confirmation that the lack of open space could be a basis for denial of a project.
4. Asked if other space not used for rental units could be reduced, and at what point is a mixed use project considered too large?
5. Inquired about the maximum height measurement methods when projects exceed 45 feet and are required to get PC approval? What is actually considered 'top of roof'?
6. Asked if outdoor private living space is the same amount regardless of number of units? How is outdoor living space factored in with commercial?

Planning staff provided answers to the questions and thanked Board members for their input.

Planning Commissioner Swartz attended and asked that the Board follow City policy regarding AUD projects regardless of your personal feelings on the subject. The Planning Commission has expressed interest and support of a new review process that would involve PC review of some projects. Asked that they work together to effectively implement the program.

Planning Commissioner Campanella attended and indicated he was looking forward success of the AUD program and wanted to clarify that there are some AUD projects such as for sale (condo) projects would still be in front of the Planning Commission. He pointed out how some of the aspects of the AUD design such as the one space per unit design actually can make the buildings smaller and more compatible for the site. He asked that the Board look at projects carefully to consider trade-offs when considering all design criteria and when it may affect the density for a project.

Planning Commissioner Swartz attended and indicated asked that the Boards follow City policy regardless of your personal feelings on the subject. The Planning Commission has expressed interest and support of a new review process; and asked that they work together to effectively to implement the program.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. RIGHT OF WAY ADJACENT TO 3139 CLIFF

E-1/SD-3

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-941
Application Number: MST2013-00117
Applicant: Cable Engineering Services
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Peter Hilger

(Proposal to modify an existing microcell antenna site for AT&T. The existing 12-inch panel antennas located on the utility pole in the public right-of-way will be replaced with six larger 4-foot by 12-inch panel antennas on new ten-foot cross arms. The project includes replacement of the existing meter pedestal, new equipment in an existing vault, and new vent stacks.)

(Second review, project last reviewed on August 5, 2013. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires finding of No Visual Impacts and Coastal Review.)

Actual time: 4:17 p.m.

Present: Peter Hilger and Rob Searcy, Agents for Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury regarding was received.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

- 1) The Board is unable to make the finding for no adverse visual impact.
- 2) The Board would like to see a stronger effort to conceal the project, including the roadside cabinets.
- 3) The Board expressed concerns about the elimination of roadside landscaping.

Action: Wittausch/Gradin, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Cung supports the project).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 412 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-271-019
Application Number: MST2008-00322
Owner: Anabilt, LLC
Applicant: Anabilt Properties LLC
Architect: Shubin & Donaldson

(The proposal includes subdividing an existing 13,500 square foot vacant parcel into three new lots and to construct a new three-story sustainable mixed-use building on each new parcel. The proposal includes a total of 4,074 commercial square feet and 7,113 residential square feet. Lot one includes 1,374 square feet of commercial area and a 1,658 square foot residential unit on a 4,760 square foot lot. Lot two includes 1,344 square feet of commercial area and a 1,616 square foot residential unit on a 5,070 square foot lot. Lot 3 includes 538 square feet of commercial area and a 2,552 square foot residential unit on a 3,670 square foot lot. A total of 10 parking spaces (four covered and six uncovered) are proposed for the project. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review of a Tentative Subdivision Map and Development Plan Approval.)

(Project requires conformance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 009-09.)

Actual time: 4:48 p.m.

Present: Robin Donaldson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury regarding was received.

Motion: Project Design Approval as submitted and continued indefinitely back to Full Board.

Action: Hopkins/Cung, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 3885 & 3887 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-012
Application Number: MST2013-00411
Owner: Cleo M. Purdy Trust
Architect: DesignArc
Applicant: Greg Reitz

(Proposal for a new mixed-use residential and commercial building. The proposal consists of the demolition of 12,155 square feet of the rear portion and remodel of 22,250 square feet of the front of the existing two-story commercial building; demolition of the existing 4,990 square foot motel; the addition of 89 apartment units (average unit size of 806 square feet); and a new two-level subterranean parking garage with 119 parking spaces. The project site is located in the Priority Housing Overlay of the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program and would result in 63 dwelling units per acre. The four-story building would be approximately 81,807 square feet and 45 feet tall. The project also includes 19 surface parking spaces, new swimming pool, new landscaping, 13,146 cubic yards of cut grading, and the merger of the two existing parcels. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for a zoning modification to allow alterations to the existing commercial building within the front setback.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 5:14 p.m.

Present: Greg Reitz, Applicant; Mark Kirkhart, Architect; and Dan Gullett, Associate Planner.

The applicant presented a REVISED PROJECT, which does not require a front setback modification. A description of the revised project follows:

(Proposal for a new mixed-use residential and commercial building. The proposal consists of demolition of the 22,500 square foot existing two-story commercial building; demolition of the existing 4,990 square foot motel; replacement of 4,500 net square feet of commercial space; the addition of 89 apartment units with an average unit size of 811 square feet; and a new subterranean parking garage with 134 assigned residential parking spaces. The project proposes 63 dwelling units per acre under the Average Unit Density Program Priority Housing Overlay. The four story building would be approximately 76,679 square feet and 45 feet tall. The project also includes 18 surface commercial parking spaces, new swimming pool, new roof deck, new landscaping, 26,246 cubic yards of cut grading, and the merger of the two existing parcels.)

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m.

- 1) Amy Beth Katz (local realtor); expressed support for the project as an admirable example of affordable and workforce housing with excellent use of shared community space.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury regarding was received.

Public comment closed at 5:35 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the revised design concept, including enlargement of the courtyards and fronting State Street with commercial rather than a combination of commercial and residential.
- 2) The Board recognizes the elevations are conceptual and not fully developed, so Board comments regarding the elevations are very general.
- 3) Some Board members believe the west elevation massing is too repetitive and could be more playful.
- 4) Some Board members see a tremendous opportunity on the State Street façade to create greater play between the commercial and residential portions of the building.
- 5) Some Board members request further study to open up building corridors more.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**5. 235 E COTA ST.****C-M Zone****(5:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-031

Application Number: MST2013-00385

Owner: Alano Club of Santa Barbara, Inc.

Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(Proposal to install a six-foot tall plaster wall to create an enclosed courtyard at the north side of the building, and add an additional exterior stair to the second-story on the west elevation, and provide parking as approved by the Planning Commission.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires conformance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 048-03.)

Actual time: 5:58 p.m.

Present: Rex Ruskauff, Architect; and Bill McCarty, Board member of the Alano Club.

Public comment opened at 6:04 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury regarding was received.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the elevations to modify the proposed improvements to be more sympathetic with the existing building; including the stairway and the new wall proposed around the courtyard.
- 2) Return with plans and drawings showing the existing buildings, site features, and property lines.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung and Poole absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 474 SCENIC DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(6:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-272-003
Application Number: MST2013-00425
Owner: Edward Yates
Architect: Jonathan Villegas

(Proposal for alterations to a one-story five-unit apartment complex. The proposal would relocate an existing front site retaining wall to the front property line, re-grade the driveway entries, replace a wood deck and stairs at the rear of the existing single-family residential unit, replace an existing two-car carport with a two-car garage, and replace an existing three-car carport with a new three-car garage. The existing carports and proposed garages are non-conforming to the interior and rear setbacks. This project will address the violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00676 including the as-built installation of vinyl windows. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 6:17 p.m.

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Letters of concern from Paula Westbury and Stephen Pointer were received and acknowledged.

The letter in opposition from Stephen Pointer, adjacent neighbor, was summarized by staff with concerns regarding neighborhood incompatibility in size and density of the multi-family development, lack of roof material and color details in the plans, and concerns about blocking of his private views of the adjacent golf course. He requested relocating trash area and bins, and evaluation of the extent of proposed grading at the driveway entrances and retaining walls.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Remove all or a majority of existing vinyl windows that are adversely affecting the overall aesthetics of the building, and replace with wood windows appropriate to the design style and era of the building.
- 2) The front wall and wooden gate should be simplified to match the handsome existing wall as a more appropriate design.
- 3) Simplify the use of the proposed wrought iron balustrade as opposed to wood.
- 4) The proposed garage encroachment in the setback poses no aesthetic concerns.
- 5) The open yard modification is more supportable if the three-car carport is shifted further to the setback property line for more efficient use of the open space between the two.
- 6) Refine the garage design for a flat level parapet detail. The parapet should be either without a cap or using a tile cap for a more acceptable and appropriate design element.
- 7) Study opportunities to increase the landscaping on the streetscape.
- 8) Provide a color board and materials board with colors and materials more appropriate to the design era of the buildings.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung and Poole absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 2334 DE LA VINA ST****R-4 Zone**

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-113-001
Application Number: MST2013-00419
Owner: BLH Properties, LLC
Architect: Jason Grant

(Proposal for a new three-story, three-unit residential condominium building. The project consists of a 1,635 square foot two-story unit, a 1,888 square foot three-story unit, a 1,578 square foot two-story unit and three attached 400 square foot two-car garages. Total proposed square footage, including garages, is 6,301 square feet on the 7,405 square foot vacant lot. Staff Hearing Officer review of a tentative subdivision map is requested.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

Actual time: 6:54 p.m.

Present: Jason Grant, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Letters of concern from Paula Westbury regarding was received.

The letter in opposition from Vadim Hsu for Ms. Roya Bahari, adjacent neighbor, was summarized by staff as expressed concerns regarding potential large size, height, bulk, scale, density of the development, privacy concerns, neighborhood compatibility, and potential negative impact to protected historic resources of her home.

Staff also announced to the Board that Nicole Hernandez reported that the structure is potentially eligible as a Structures of Merit by the Historic Landmarks Commission.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Many Board members find that a traditional Spanish style design would be more appropriate for the neighborhood.
- 2) Study the tall, narrow entry elements to possibly lower the height of those elements.
- 3) The Board finds that the third-floor setback encroachment is not necessary; study to pull third-floor elements inward.
- 4) Study the floor plans at the interior stairway of the center unit to be more compact and improve utilization of the spaces.
- 5) Restudy the extremely tall chimney facing De La Vina Street.
- 6) The large and tall glazed windows on the west elevation are not appropriately scaled for the style of the structure.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung and Poole absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:20 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 p.m.)

Representatives present: Kirk Gradin.

Staff present: Tony Boughman.

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**A. 104 LOS AGUAJES AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-002

Application Number: MST2013-00428

Owner: Dario Pini

Architect: Murphy & Associates Architects

(Proposal to permit "as-built" improvements for a 17-unit apartment building. New 6-foot and 17-inch plaster site walls replaced the existing wood fences, and lighting fixtures on the wall pilasters replaced existing pole lights. This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00998 including interior work and other repairs.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Postponed indefinitely due to Applicant's absence.

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 225 E HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-012

Application Number: MST2011-00310

Owner: Iglesia Del Dios Vivo

Architect: JYL Ratkevich

(Proposed abatement of ENF2011-00287. This includes the "as-built" conversion of a restaurant and boarding home to a church and residence. The exterior alterations include minor alterations to the windows and doors, extending the second-story deck, and repaving portions of the driveway and parking areas. Four parking spaces are proposed.)

(Review After Final to re-plaster building and relocate mechanical equipment to a new enclosure at the rear of the building.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR – FINAL REVIEW**C. 7 N NOPAL ST****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-122-010

Application Number: MST2013-00386

Owner: Architectural Millwork of Santa Barbara

Architect: Craig Burdick

(Proposal for tenant improvement to the existing 7,010 square foot two-story building for new tile showroom. Proposal includes the removal of two overhead roll-up doors, replace with new storefront windows and entrance doors, new awnings, new planter boxes, new exterior wall tile. Redesign parking lot to relocate 9 spaces and add one parking space. Relocate 4 existing bike parking spaces and new trash enclosure.)

(Final Review of details.)

Postponed indefinitely due to Applicant's absence.