



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, July 22, 2013 **630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair* – Present
KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative) – Present
THIEP CUNG – Present
SCOTT HOPKINS – Present
GARY MOSEL – Absent
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative, Alternate) – Present
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH – Present

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): ADDISON THOMPSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 3:40 p.m.
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician – Present
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:10 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Cung, Gradin, Hopkins, Poole, and Wittausch.
Members absent: Mosel.
Staff present: Boughman, Limón (present until 3:40 p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:
 No public comment.
- B. Approval of Minutes:
 Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **July 8, 2013**, with corrections.
 Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Cung abstained from all items/Gradin abstained from Item 8, Mosel absent).
- C. Consent Calendars:
 Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 15, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** (and **Kirk Gradin** for Item A, 1130 N. Milpas St.).
 Action: Poole/Gradin, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 22, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole**.

Action: Poole/Hopkins, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Gradin abstained item F, Mosel absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

a. Mr. Boughman announced that Board member Mosel will be absent from today's meeting.

b. Board member Hopkins announced that he will be stepping down from agenda Item# 3, 3869 State Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

1. 300 BLK W DE LA GUERRA ST

Right-of way

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-942

Application Number: MST2013-00292

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Request for an early concept review for the proposed removal and replacement of the De La Guerra Street bridge.)

(Concept Review; Comments only.)

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: John Ewasiuk, Principal Civil Engineer for the City of Santa Barbara/Public Works Dept.

Mr. Ewasiuk announced that Public Works would be holding a public forum at the Louise Davis Center at 1232 De La Vina St., for anyone from the public to review the plans for the proposed project and to ask any questions.

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Discussion held regarding development of a conceptual design. The Board gave general comments to follow the same design ideas as other recently built bridges and provide photos of them.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 1130 N MILPAS ST****E-1/R-3 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
Application Number: MST2009-00551
Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
Architect: DesignArc
Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new 2,210 net square foot one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza, and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,700 cubic yards of excavation and 1,200 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires City Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy Review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

(Request for comments for Public Works consideration in granting an exception to water conservation requirements in order to plant Begonias as part of the approved memorial Begonia garden.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect; DesignARC; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS Inc.; and Eric Lassen, Board of Directors, Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation.

Public comment opened at 3:48 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion:**Board comments:**

- 1) As the proposed project has already been reviewed and approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission, the Board finds that in terms of design review and water-use quality, the proposed project poses no negative adverse aesthetic issues and in fact will provide an enhancement to a very visible part of the Santa Barbara Bowl experience.
- 2) As the project commemorates an important Santa Barbara horticulturist, the Board recommends that the memorial Begonia garden is an appropriate exception to the usual water-wise standards.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 10 MINUTES AT 3:50 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:02 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 3869 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-037

Application Number: MST2013-00282

Owner: Grace Lutheran Church of Santa Barbara

Architect: Peikert + RRM Design Group

(Concept review for a proposed new residential building, providing affordable, senior-rental housing. The project consists of a 39,071 square foot, three-story, 60-unit building, including one manager's unit, an administrative office, laundry facilities, a total of 16 proposed on-site, uncovered, parking spaces, and 1,500 square feet of community space, located on a proposed 31,648 square foot lot. A total of 55 uncovered parking spaces will be provided on the proposed adjacent lot. The existing church and two-story stucco building are proposed to be demolished. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications and a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Concept Review; Comments only.)

Actual time: 4:02 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect; Lisa Plowman, Planning Manager at Peikert, and Bill Jennings for Front Porch (non-profit organization and Agent for Grace Lutheran Church of Santa Barbara).

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment re-opened at 4:30 p.m. for the late speaker, Debbie Kovada, who commented that due the large size of the project, the proposed project was not compatible with the neighborhood.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) To address issues of neighborhood impact, the applicant is to return with building footprints of the immediately adjacent neighboring buildings, and of the existing building to be removed.
- 2) Some Board members found that reductions in mass, bulk, and scale need to be implemented; particularly where the building approaches the street, and as the project impacts neighbors to the west.
- 3) A majority of the Board found that refinements of the design and stylistic elements of design are needed, and more continuity and integrity in the choice of design style should be implemented.
- 4) The Board acknowledges that this is an excellent location for a higher density senior housing project within the community.
- 5) Provide information for the trash enclosure size, location, and design.
- 6) Some Board members had concerns regarding some of the outdoor living space locations, although other Board members found that the community space is appropriately located in relation to a nearby existing community garden.
- 7) Some Board members found that the smaller roof elements at the third floor should be shed components instead of hip or gable roofs.
- 8) Study the parking layout and circulation.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Mosel absent).

Board comments: One Board member suggested that a traffic circulation study may be useful to the applicant in determining parking density in the area for appropriate and adequate parking for the site and within the neighborhood.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1810 SAN PASCUAL ST****R-3 Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-163-010
Application Number: MST2013-00261
Owner: Brian Escalera
Applicant: R.E. Johnson

(Proposed demolition of an existing, 1,196 square foot, single-family residence and garage. Proposed construction of a new two-story, 5,494 square foot, four-unit apartment building. This includes four covered parking spaces. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications.)

(Comments Only; Project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 5:19 p.m.

Present: R.E. Johnson, Architect; Kris Kimpel, Landscape Architect; and Brian Escalera, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:34 p.m.

- 1) Natasha Garduno, opposed; expressed concerns regarding size of project in a single family residential neighborhood, traffic, noise and parking.
- 2) Jeff Hartwell, (submitted letter, for Islay West Home Owner's Assoc.) opposed; with expressed concerns regarding privacy, traffic, noise, and parking.
- 3) Gina Carbajal, opposed; with expressed concerns regarding density, privacy, noise, traffic, and parking.
- 4) Bob Conway, (submitted letter) opposed, with expressed concerns regarding privacy, traffic, noise, parking, and density.
- 5) Tim LaDouce, opposed; expressed concerns regarding architecture not addressing the street, privacy, traffic, parking, and density.

Letters of concern from Martin Feeney, Bob Conway, Salud Carbajal, Jessica Zavala, Jeff Hartwell, and Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:52 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The proposed project is ready for Project Design Approval as designed pending implementation of the Average Unit-size Density (AUD) Incentive Program Ordinance. The Board finds the project's well designed mass, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the neighborhood; and provides appropriate privacy to adjacent neighbors, particularly to the rear of the project.
- 2) Provide additional screening of the second-floor deck or to provide some re-arrangement of the deck itself, so as not to adversely impact the neighbors to the rear of Unit D.
- 3) The project can be more neighborhood-friendly by shifting the entrance to Unit A to face the street, and with the inclusion of a covered porch on that side of the unit.
- 4) Some Board members found that the project could be moved further toward the street; however, it is unclear at this time what impacts this may have on other required aspects of the project such as common outdoor living space requirements.
- 5) The perimeter shape of the second-floor deck at Unit C should correspond to the roof planes.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel absent).

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Representatives present: Stephanie Poole.

Staff present: Tony Boughman.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**A. 1130 PUNTA GORDA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-332-003
Application Number: MST2012-00233
Owner: Green Valley Corporation
Architect: Jan Hochhauser
Landscape Architect: David Black

(Proposal for the re-development of the prior mobile home park with 40 residential units, 40 parking spaces, and a private community building for the residents. Site improvements include a new driveway and landscaping. The State Department of Housing and Community Development is the official permitting agency for mobile home parks. The review by the ABR is based on recorded conditions as an agreement between the City and property owner. The review purview of the ABR is limited to the following: the placement of up to four one-story mobile homes; standard mobile home materials siding, colors, roofing materials; all elements of the landscaping and permanent paving materials; the community building; and perimeter wall materials and covering surfaces.)

Final Approval as submitted.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**B. 1320 E GUTIERREZ ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-392-006
Application Number: MST2011-00463
Owner: Flores Family Trust
Designer: Oscar Ricardo Munoz

(Proposal for additions at the rear of an existing 2,319 square foot, two-story duplex. The project consists of a 392 square foot addition, an attached 496 square foot two-car garage at the first floor, a new 465 square foot second story addition, and 729 square feet of decks at the second floor. An existing 324 square foot carport will be moved to achieve the required separation from the main building. All windows and doors will be replaced. The lot size is 11,250 square feet. The project will address violations identified within ENF2011-00119.)

(Final Review of details.)

Continued one week with comments:

- 1) Provide a color board with paint chips.
- 2) Provide window specifications and colors.
- 3) Provide a sample of the bronze paint and the stain color for the fence.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 1532 ANACAPA ST****R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-241-001
 Application Number: MST2013-00290
 Owner: Steven E. Stevens, Revocable Trust
 Applicant: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal to renovate the existing landscaping, including removal and replacement of trees.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Courtesy review of landscaping provided by Phil Suding, Landscape Architect.

Continued one week for the applicant to study providing more landscaping at the rear corner of the property, and provide details of the trash enclosure.

ABR - NEW ITEM**D. 3200 BLK CLIFF DR****Right-of-way**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-941
 Application Number: MST2013-00288
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Alan Casebier

(Proposal for a new fiber optic pedestal utility connectivity unit, adjacent to the existing electric meter pedestal. Install ground buss with rod and new underground PVC conduit from existing equipment vault to the new cabinet and install 2-inch underground PVC conduit from the cabinet to the existing power pole and up the power pole.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Paint all cabinets the same green color.
- 2) Repair the vent at the vault.
- 3) Place a boulder to act as a barrier to protect the vault vent.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - NEW ITEM**E. 803 CASTILLO ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-031-014
 Application Number: MST2013-00291
 Owner: Clara Acquistapace Trust
 Owner: Timothy Delaney
 Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal to relocate electrical meters, paint exterior of triplex, and add permeable pavers in driveway and new landscaping. Project includes rebuild of garage with same size, location, openings and roof pitch.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Replace the concrete driveway with pavers.
- 2) Paving is not to be expanded, except for a small area for the trash cans. There are concerns that expanding the paving would negatively impact the Oak tree and facilitate parking in the setback.
- 3) Provide appropriate plant screening to replace the overheight hedge at De La Guerra Street.
- 4) *Agave* and *Bird of Paradise* foundation plantings are to be installed at both the De La Guerra and Castillo Street sides of the building.
- 5) Provide plants to screen the side yard from Castillo Street.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**F. 402 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-311-027
Application Number: MST2013-00228
Owner: J. Paul Bagley III
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to remodel the existing auto service building for general commercial use. The project includes removal of roll-up doors and installation of storefront windows and doors, other minor building alterations, accessibility upgrades, replacement of driveway with landscaping at Gutierrez Street.)

(Final Review of details.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:43 P.M. ****