



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, July 8, 2013 **630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair* – Present
KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative) – Present
THIEP CUNG – Absent
SCOTT HOPKINS – Present
GARY MOSEL – Present
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative, Alternate) – Present
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH – Present

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): ADDISON THOMPSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician – Absent
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present for Consent Review
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Gradin, Hopkins, Mosel, Poole, and Wittausch.
Members absent: Cung.
Staff present: Limón and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:
 No public comment.
- B. Approval of Minutes:
 Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of June 24, 2013 as submitted.
 Action: Poole/Hopkins, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Wittausch abstained, Cung absent).
- C. Consent Calendars:
 Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 1, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Stephanie Poole.
 Action: Poole/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 8, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Stephanie Poole.

Action: Poole/Gradin, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

a. Mr. Limon made the following announcements:

- a) Board member Cung, and Planning Technician Tony Boughman will be absent from today's meeting; and
- b) Agenda Item #7, for 1810 San Pascual has been postponed two weeks to the July 22, 2013 meeting; therefore, Agenda Item #8, 402 N. Milpas St., will move up on the agenda to that time slot.

b. Board member Hopkins announced he will be stepping down on Item #2, 510 N. Salsipuedes St.

c. Board member Gradin announced he will be stepping down on Item #8, 402 N. Milpas St.

d. Board member Poole announced that she will be absent from the ABR meeting on August 5, 2013; therefore, Kirk Gradin will review the Consent Calendar for that date.

e. Board member Mosel announced that he will be absent from the next scheduled meetings on July 22, 2013, and July 29, 2013.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no reports

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. (3:10) AVERAGE UNIT-SIZE DENSITY (AUD) INCENTIVE PROGRAM

Staff: Irma Unzueta, Project Planner, Community Development Department
John Ledbetter, Principal Planner
Bettie Weiss, City Planner

(Discussion of the review process for Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program projects.)

Discussion held.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

*****The Board will conduct individual site visits to 510 N. Salsipuedes St.*****

2. 510 N SALSIPUEDES ST

C-M Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-222-018
Application Number: MST2013-00212
Owner: People's Self Help Housing
Architect: Peikert Group Architects, LLP

(Concept review of a proposal for a new, multi-family, residential building providing 100% affordable housing. The project is revised to be three stories with 40 units and 46 parking spaces. The project consists of a 42,446 square foot, three-story, 40 unit apartment building with an attached garage with 46 parking spaces on the first floor level and an attached 3,300 square foot community center. Three existing lots will be merged to create one 41,099 square foot property. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications.)

(Second Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on June 10, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:36 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect and Lisa Plowman, Planning Manager for Peikert Group Architects, LLP; Jeanette Duncan, President & CEO of People's Self Help Housing; and Allison De Busk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m.

- 1) Trevor Martinson, opposed; expressed concerns regarding rear driveway entrance, parking in fire lanes, and requested a reduction in the height of the building.
- 2) Robert Burke, (submitted both emails and letters) opposed; expressed various public impact concerns to the Board.

Letters of concerns from Robert Burke, Tony Herrera (Hayward Lumber), and Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan and a roof plan.
- 2) The Board appreciates the applicant's reductions in mass and scale; particularly the elimination of the fourth floor which helps to bring the proposed project further into context with the neighborhood.
- 3) The Board appreciates the architectural design and finds it is compatible with City design guidelines, and with the surrounding neighborhood.
- 4) The proposed open space areas and their location on the site seem to be appropriately designed and scaled.
- 5) Some Board members found that the some additional playful design elements, such as those on the front corner building could be added elsewhere on the architecture.
- 6) Some Board members found that the garage ceiling height and floor levels above could be lowered to reduce the overall height of that portion of the project.
- 7) Some Board members found that the third-story massing at the Haley Street side should be reduced and relocated to other areas of the project.
- 8) Some Board members found that additional landscape areas should be created on the Haley Street side by shifting the building back away from the street.
- 9) Provide either story poles or a 3D modeling study and building comparison to other three story projects to evaluate the compatibility of the three story height and massing.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Cung absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 200 BLK W COTA ST 1989 SEG ID**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-989
Application Number: MST2011-00054
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Jessica Grant

(Proposal to demolish an existing bridge deck and abutments and replace them with cast-in-steel shell piles supporting a reinforced concrete pile cap at each end of the bridge. New bridge deck to be installed atop the new abutments.)

(Project was last reviewed on April 30, 2012.)

Actual time: 4:51 p.m.

Present: John Ewasiuk, Principal Civil Engineer; Tom Conti; City of Santa Barbara Public Works; Natera Jones, Bengal Engineering.

Public comment opened at 5:04 p.m.

- 1) Jim Davis; expressed concern regarding the electrical service to his residence from the adjacent electrical service pole near the project site.

A letter of concerns from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:05 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with conditions:

- 1) Applicant to provide a creative solution where the existing site walls abut to the new concrete railing.
- 2) The existing site walls are to be either plastered or removed.
- 3) The wrought iron railing shall match in color and design the existing Bath Street Bridge; and the proposed fencing along the street on both sides of the bridge should match.
- 4) The Board prefers the concrete railing design alternative #3 (with the rectangular openings).
- 5) Applicant to make the pedestrian lighting part of this project; remove the "future" wording references on the plans.
- 6) Note Sycamore trees to be 24-inch box size.

Action: Mosel/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 35 N CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ****OM-1/SD-3 Zone**

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-004
 Application Number: MST2012-00486
 Owner: Verde Ventures LLC
 Architect: Studio R

(Proposal to demolish and replace two existing one-story storage buildings in the same locations; one is 3,798 square feet, and the other is 3,278 square feet. They will be constructed with concrete bases, metal siding, and roofs. The square footage of the buildings will not change, and seven parking spaces are proposed to remain. Staff Hearing Officer review of a Coastal Development Permit and a Conditional Use Permit to allow non-ocean-oriented business to be conducted on site is requested. The project also includes permitting an as-built, 1,341 square foot, one-story storage building requiring Development Plan approval, and permitting as-built benches and fountain.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on June 24, 2013.)

Actual time: 5:33 p.m.

Present: Rex Ruskauff, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan by a licensed landscape architect or licensed architect.
- 2) Remove the paving in the front along Calle Cesar Chavez, except at the curb cuts.
- 3) Provide enhanced landscaping at the patio area.
- 4) When returning with a color board and further building details, some Board members have concerns about the detailing for the false windows at the rear of the Building D.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 101 S LA CUMBRE RD****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(5:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-027
 Application Number: MST2013-00018
 Owner: Avenue 26 Holdings, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Revised proposal to construct a new, one-story, 4,737 square foot commercial building, and 27 space parking lot with new street trees and landscaping, located on a 25,764 net square foot lot. The existing 1,737 square foot gas station, surface parking lot, and related structures will be demolished. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for 3,000 square feet of new commercial square footage, and for a Front Setback Modification to allow the building to encroach into the Upper State Street area front setback.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental review and Staff Hearing Officer review for new non-residential floor area and a zoning modification. Project was last reviewed on May 28, 2013.)

Actual time: 5:51 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:00 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the proposed project is in conformance with the Upper State Street Guidelines.
- 2) Some members find that additional landscaping in front would enhance the project.
- 3) The outdoor dining area at the front of the building is an enhancement and will energize the street corner. The Board carried forward all previous comments made at the May 28, 2013 meeting, as follows:
 - a) The proposed mass, bulk and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood.
 - b) The contemporary nature of the design ties into the other neighboring contemporary buildings nearby. Some Board members found that additional traditional details and materials should be added to the structures would make it more compatible to the neighborhood.
 - c) The way the building addresses the corner, and the site elements used at the corner, are general enhancements to the project.
 - d) The proposed modification does not pose any adverse visual impacts or conflicts because it is a one-story structure.
 - e) Study possible visual conflicts between the metal and the wood canopies.
 - f) Study adding additional playful elements and details to the architectural design.
 - g) Provide more fenestration or other elements to the parking lot side of the building to make it more user-friendly.
 - h) Provide additional landscaping buffers at the rear corners, adjacent to the north and east side elevations.
 - i) The project complies with the Architectural Board of Review Guidelines, is consistent with the City Charter, and applicable Municipal Code requirements; the project's site design and architecture is compatible with the ABR Guidelines. The Board looks forward to a review of the landscaping plan. There are no negative adverse impacts to adjacent City Landmarks or historic resources. The design responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - j) The project's design appears to provide an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping; however, a proposed landscape design needs to be submitted and reviewed before a final determination can be made.

Action: Hopkins/Gradin, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**6. 128 ANACAPA ST****OC/SD-3 Zone****(5:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-083-022
Application Number: MST2012-00332
Owner: James B. McDonald
Designer: J. Ewing Design

(Proposal to construct two, detached, single-family, residential condominium units on a 5,000 square foot vacant lot. Both buildings would be three-stories with roof terraces and attached two-car garages. Unit A would be 2,756 square feet, with an attached 446 square foot garage. Unit B would be 2,246 square feet with an attached 422 square foot garage. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested of a Tentative Subdivision Map and a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on May 28, 2013.)

Actual time: 6:06 p.m.

Present: J. Ewing; Designer; and James B. McDonald, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:20 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the changes made to the south elevation.
- 2) The Applicant and Owner are aware of the issues of the proposed windows at the interior lot line and that the windows may be required to be removed at a later date.
- 3) The mass, bulk, and scale are generally acceptable.
- 4) The project meets generally the compatibility findings.
- 5) The Board finds an acceptable amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Hopkins/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1810 SAN PASCUAL ST****R-3 Zone****(6:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-163-010
Application Number: MST2013-00261
Owner: Brian Escalera
Applicant: Re Johnson

(Proposed demolition of an existing, 1,196 square foot, single-family residence and garage. Proposed construction of a new, two-story, 7,090 square foot, four-unit apartment building. This includes four covered parking spaces.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Postponed two weeks to the July 22, 2013, meeting at the Applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**8. 402 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone****(6:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-311-027
Application Number: MST2013-00228
Owner: J. Paul Bagley III
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to remodel the existing auto service building for general commercial use. The project includes removal of roll-up doors and installation of storefront windows and doors, other minor building alterations, accessibility upgrades, replacement of driveway with landscaping at Gutierrez Street.)

(Second Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on June 10, 2013.)

Actual time: 6:38 p.m.

Board member Poole read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions, and Board member presentations.

Present: Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect (presenting architecture for Kirk Gradin).

Public comment opened at 6:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with conditions:

- 1) Some Board members found that the horizontal redwood siding does not match the quality and character of the building; applicant to provide a better matching alternative.
- 2) Provide additional landscaping such as a vine or creeping fig plantings to help mitigate the wall's appearance at the property line.
- 3) Remove the side stairs where the door will be removed on the south elevation.
- 4) Remove the brick cap at the air conditioner enclosure wall; cap to match the existing site walls on the property.

Action: Poole/ Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin stepped down, Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Representatives present: Stephanie Poole.
Staff present: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**A. 1320 E GUTIERREZ ST R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-392-006
Application Number: MST2011-00463
Owner: Flores Family Trust
Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal for additions at the rear of an existing, 2,319 square foot two-story duplex. The project consists of a 392 square foot addition, and an attached 496 square foot two-car garage at the first floor, a new 465 square foot second story addition, and 729 square feet of decks at the second floor. An existing 324 square foot carport will be moved to achieve the required separation from the main building. All windows and doors will be replaced. The lot size is 11,250 square feet. The project will address violations identified within ENF2011-00119.)

(Final Review for Final Approval of details.)

Continued one week to Consent Review for the applicant to provide a revised beam detail drawn to scale, and to show a paver details and specifications meeting Storm Water Management Program requirements.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 410 N QUARANTINA ST M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-302-018
Application Number: MST2013-00230
Owner: James Burge
Architect: Windward Engineering
Contractor: Skye Line Construction

(Proposal for site alterations and tenant improvements to an existing commercial building. Site alterations include a new parking lot configuration and landscape plan, a new six-foot tall rolling gate and wrought iron fence, and new plaster walls and planters. Alterations to the building include the addition of new rooftop equipment and new corrugated steel rooftop screening material, the addition of a new subpanel closet and electrical work, and a new trash and electrical service enclosure. The project includes a lot merger of two lots (408 and 410 N. Quarantina) under a separate Public Works permit.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the condition that an archeological monitoring contract is submitted and reviewed by Planning staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 632 E CANON PERDIDO ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-032-017
Application Number: MST2013-00269
Owner: Boys & Girls Club of SB
Architect: LMA Architects

(Proposal to construct a new, chain-link fence and slat enclosure around the existing trash and recycle bins located at the existing Boys & Girls Club of Santa Barbara. The proposal will comply with previous Planning Commission conditions of approval (Resolution No. 044-01; MST2001-00150).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - NEW ITEM**D. 42 HELENA****OC/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-112-007
Application Number: MST2013-00277
Owner: Above Mission Creek, LLC
Architect: Greg Christman

(Proposal for a new ADA accessible ramp, and a new raised deck for an existing commercial building. The proposal includes an interior remodel and demolition of an existing raised deck and step structure.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:59 P.M. ****