



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

TUESDAY, January 22, 2013 **630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)
THIEP CUNG
SCOTT HOPKINS
GARY MOSEL
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative, Alternate)
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): ADDISON THOMPSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:15 p.m. by the Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Mosel, Gradin, Cung, Hopkins, Poole, and Wittausch.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Boughman and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Amanda Burgess, Administrative Analyst, City Parks & Recreation Department, handed out a flyer to Board members, and announced two upcoming Urban Forest Community meetings on Thursday, January 24th, at the Central Library, Faulkner Gallery from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m.; and on Saturday, January 26th, at the Louise Lowry Davis Center, from 10:00 a.m. to 12:00 Noon.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 7, 2013**, as amended.
Action: Mosel/Gradin, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole abstained).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 14, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gradin.

Action: Gradin/Mosel, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **Tuesday, January 22, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gradin.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Boughman announced the Agenda Item #2, 222 N. Milpas Street was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request; all following agenda items would therefore move-up on the agenda.

E. Subcommittee Appointments.

Chair Zink proposed a two week postponement of Subcommittee appointments to the February 4, 2013, meeting.

Motion: To postpone the Subcommittee Board appointments two weeks to the February 4, 2013, meeting.

Action: Zink/Gradin, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. 601 E MICHELTORENA ST****C-O Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-270-030

Application Number: MST2003-00827

Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation

Agent: Ken Marshall

Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers

(The Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation Workforce Housing Project will remove the former St. Francis Hospital complex, including the main hospital, convent, central plant, and other ancillary structures and construct 115 residential condominiums that will cover approximately 5.94 acres of the 7.39 acre site. Eighty-one of the units will be sold to Cottage Hospital employees at prices within the City's structure for affordable units and 34 units will be sold at market rates. The project will provide approximately 265 parking spaces, including 254 parking spaces for the 115 condominium units and 11 spaces for the Villa Riviera facility. **The project was approved by the Planning Commission on September 21, 2006 (Resolution No. 039-06), and by the City Council on December 19, 2006 (Resolution No. 06-103), and April 29, 2008 (Resolution No. 08-038).**

(Review After Final referred from Consent Calendar to permit an as-built white picket fence along the top of the stone walls at Micheltorena Street.)

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Joe Andrulaitis, Architects; and Allison De Busk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m.

Stephen Fountain (neighbor); opposed, spoke of concerns regarding the compatibility of the fence with the style and design of the house.

An email was received from Clay and Lynda Cole with concerns regarding the proposed white picket fence.

Motion #1 Approval of Review After Final of the as-built white picket fence with the condition to refurbish the corner posts and other posts with 6"X6" detail and new cap on the proposed fence. The white color is acceptable. Fence detail drawings to be reviewed by staff.

Action: Mosel/Poole, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Gradin opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Motion #2: Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

- 1) The as-built color for Building #45 is acceptable.
- 2) Near Building #38, the Board directs staff to work with the applicant for a solution to screen the as-built S.C.E. transformer and the as-built back-flow device; referencing other examples on the complex for how screening was achieved.
- 3) The as-built solution, and the proposed terracotta-color wainscoting on Building #38 are acceptable, if wrapped around the building in an acceptable manner.

Action: Wittausch/Gradin, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

2. 222 N MILPAS ST

C-2/C-P Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-051-002
 Application Number: MST2012-00412
 Owner: Scolari Properties, LLC
 Applicant: Jose Cervantes
 Business Name: The Fresh Market

(Proposal for a remodel and tenant improvements to the existing 29,953 square foot one-story grocery store building. The project consists of a new front façade, interior remodel to divide the building into three tenant lease spaces, new outdoor patio seating, new mechanical equipment, and minor alterations to landscaping. The existing 137 parking space parking lot is to remain.)

(Project was revised for three tenant spaces rather than two.)

Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

3. 3714 STATE ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-023
 Application Number: MST2012-00443
 Owner: Kellog Associates
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall

(Conceptual review of a proposed revision to the previously approved mixed-use development at the Sandman Inn site (MST2007-00591; City Council Resolution No. 10-020). The revised project involves the demolition of the existing, 52,815 square foot, 113-room hotel (Sandman Inn) and construction of 5,274 square feet of office space and 72 residential condominiums.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 3:58 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Gregory Parker, Investec Corporation; Kenneth Marshall, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

- 1) Paul Hernandi (Citizens Planning Association, submitted letter), *in support* of the elimination of the proposed underground parking, and reduction of the proposed commercial components; but *expressed concerns* regarding aesthetics of the reduction of setbacks, removal of trees, and massing of fewer larger buildings, effects of three story elements on mountain views, pedestrian safety, and compliance with the Upper State Street Guidelines.
- 2) Joe Rution, (Allied Neighborhood Assoc.) *in support* of the number of trees and neighborhood compatibility; but with *expressed concerns* regarding making the project more pedestrian-friendly, and creating a human-scale neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 4:26 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of Board finds that the present proposal is an improvement over the previous project in that there is a great deal more on the ground landscaping and open space.
- 2) Provide a conceptual landscape plan and preliminary building elevations to review the massing, fenestration, and scale of proposed buildings.
- 3) The Board is not in favor of removal of the existing trees along State Street. Study options of varying the setbacks of the front buildings to allow the trees to remain.
- 4) The Board is concerned about the lack of pedestrian friendliness of the front commercial units, and supports the Planning Commission's comment about the plaza at the corner of State and Hitchcock in that the pedestrian experience and views are important.
- 5) The Board is concerned about the relationship between the commercial parking lots and the residential portion. Study the relationship between those elements.
- 6) Study integrating and interspersing the visitor/guest parking into the proposed plan.
- 7) Study use of roof decks for residents or for solar energy. Increase the variety in roof heights while preserving views where possible. Locate decks in the central part of the site.
- 8) The Board appreciates the relaxed juxtaposition of buildings in the proposed plan, instead of a simple linear arrangement and configuration.
- 9) Maximize the private outdoor living space for each unit.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

4. 1130 N MILPAS ST

E-1/R-3 Zone

(4:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00551
 Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
 Architect: DesignArc
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new 2,210 net square foot one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza, and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,700 cubic yards of excavation and 1,200 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires City Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

Actual time: 5:01 p.m.

Present: Steve Carter, Architect, DesignARC; and Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc, Agent.

Public comment opened at 5:05 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 4/3/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins/Cung/Wittausch abstained).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 213 W COTA ST

R-3 Zone

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-161-004
Application Number: MST2012-00447
Owner: Soon Sik Tansen
Designer: Tom Kress

(Proposal for a new three-unit two-story apartment building totaling 4,181 square feet. The project consists of two three-bedroom units, one two-bedroom unit, five attached garage spaces, and one uncovered parking space. The existing single-family residence will be demolished.)

(Second Review, project last reviewed on December 10, 2012. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Tom Kress, Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

(Carrying-over some previous motions from December 10, 2012, with modifications as follows):

- 1) Provide a landscape plan. The plan should address the front of the wall at the sidewalk.
- 2) Provide details for the following areas: a) for Unit C – a more significant overhang for the front door; b) for Unit B – study the proportions of the corbel with a more significant over-hang.
- 3) The Board strongly urges a more street-friendly presence to the front elevation; provide access from the sidewalk, incorporate more detailed elements to the front of the building, move the front door of the front unit to face the street, and provide a one-story front porch element.
- 4) Provide more trash enclosure details; address the number of cans per unit.
- 5) Address the planting in the parkway.
- 6) Study alternate front yard and common area ground plant material details with the proposed landscape plan.
- 7) Some Board members suggest moving the wall back.
- 8) Vinyl windows are not acceptable; propose alternatives.

Action: Gradin/Mosel, 4/0/3. Motion carried. (Hopkins/Cung/Wittausch abstained).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**6. 120 S HOPE AVE****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014
Application Number: MST2012-00361
Owner: Patricia S. Nettleship, Trustee
Owner: Macerich Company
Architect: Ryan Mills

(Proposal to complete the La Cumbre Plaza facade upgrades to all buildings per the current Tenant Design Criteria. Square footage changes are not proposed. Conceptual or project approval of proposed facade upgrades on buildings A through K, and development of a plan for phased final approvals on a building-by-building basis is requested. The goal is to secure all permits and complete construction of all proposed work at La Cumbre Plaza by 2015.)

(First review of first phase of façade renovations for the mall under this application. This review is for Buildings D and G, work to include removal of existing canopy, new parapet heights and detailing, new display boxes, new window and storefront openings, and re-massing façade elevations.)

Actual time: 6:07 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect; Trey Lindle, Representing Macerich Company

Public comment opened at 6:13 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the faux chimney on the (Starbuck's) corner.
- 2) Restudy the parapet details, canopy overhang, and column corner configuration (formerly "Ann Taylor"). Some Board members find that additional details need to be added; others feel it can be simplified.
- 3) Study the kiosk window for a better transition between contemporary and Spanish traditional design styles.
- 4) Provide additional details of the corridor entrance door.
- 5) Provide more details of the east elevation at the parking lot corner. Study reducing the height of the columns at the corner. Provide a ridge cap at the tile roof elements.
- 6) Some Board members had concerns about the connecting roof from the electrical closet to the building; others were in favor of it.
- 7) Study the composition, window configuration, and proposed massing for the two adjacent units at the parking lot east elevation corner.
- 8) Clarify the discrepancies between the CAD drawings and hand drawn elevations.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 35 N CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ****OM-1/SD-3 Zone**

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-004
 Application Number: MST2012-00486
 Owner: Verde Ventures, LLC
 Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(Proposal to demolish and replace two existing one-story storage buildings in the same footprints. One is 3,798 square feet and the other is 3,278 square feet and they will be constructed with concrete bases and metal siding and roofs. The square footage of the buildings will not change and seven parking spaces are proposed to remain. Staff Hearing Officer review of a Coastal Development Permit and a Conditional Use Permit to allow non-ocean-oriented business to be conducted on site is requested.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 6:51 p.m.

Present: Rex Ruskauff, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:55 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Some Board members like the simplicity of design for the industrial building; others find that, particularly on the street-facing façades, additional character giving elements need to be incorporated. Variation of roof heights, extending eaves or canopies, or variations of window sizes would all be considered.
- 2) Pulling the building back from Mason Street to provide better sight lines is appropriate. As much new landscaping at the front of the buildings on the street sides or elsewhere is strongly encouraged.
- 3) Provide better photo documentation of the rear of the site where Building D is proposed, and it is suggested to pull the building back from the property line so that windows could be added to the south facing elevation.
- 4) Provide a conceptual landscape plan.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**8. 1911 CHINO ST****R-2 Zone**

(6:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-121-013
 Application Number: MST2012-00475
 Architect: Gil Barry
 Owner: Alamar II, LLC

(Proposal to demolish an existing detached 600 square foot two-car garage and construct a new 1,320 square foot two-story single-family residence and attached 407 square foot two-car garage. The project is located at the rear of the 7,500 square foot lot behind the existing 990 square foot one-story single-family residence. A new driveway and two uncovered parking spaces are also proposed.)

(Second Review. Project was last reviewed on January 7, 2013. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 7:19 p.m.

Present: Gil Barry, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:29 p.m.

- 1) Ralph Romero, opposed; requested further review of drainage, expressed concerns about privacy.
- 2) Ryan Romero, opposed; seconded concerns regarding drainage and privacy.
- 3) Patrick Burns, opposed; second units in neighborhood should match front units, concerned that this project will harm the existing character of the neighborhood.
- 4) Johan Delsol, opposed; existing site has many residents and cars, outstanding violations, unkempt condition of property, traffic and street parking concerns, and blocking private views.
- 5) Rich Barrett, opposed; concerns about reduction of rear yard space, architectural style, prefers a single-story project, a neighborhood compatibility and window study was requested; expressed concerns regarding privacy and living standards issues; request drawings, elevations, and photos to show proximity to adjacent properties.
- 6) Evelyn Lee, opposed; seconds Mr. Barrett's and Mr. Burns' comments, would like to see proposed lighting for pedestrian walkway and a landscape plan; suggests a wall at end of driveway to block cars.
- 7) Louis Truckenmiller; opposed; supports all comments from neighbors, concerned about proposed windows in closets.

A letter of expressed concerns from Brian Wingate and Evelyn Lee regarding was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:41 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with conditions:

- 1) The mass, bulk, and scale is appropriate to the neighborhood and to the site.
- 2) The architect has done a commendable job in considering the impacts to the neighbors, both in privacy and views.
- 3) Some Board members feel that additional simplification of the architecture could be made and that additional consideration on the south elevation, some changes to the balcony configuration or window configuration on the south elevation could be made to provide greater privacy to the neighbor on that side.
- 4) Some Board members find that window areas and sizes could be reduced, and that perhaps some windows should be eliminated, for example those in the closet areas on the west elevation. Other Board members feel that the windows as shown are fine.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 4/3/0. Motion carried. (Zink, Mosel, Wittausch opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:15 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 p.m.)

Representatives present: Kirk Gradin.

Staff present: Tony Boughman.

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**A. 3891 STATE ST 24****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-035
 Application Number: MST2013-00006
 Owner: Watabun U S A, Inc.
 Architect: Tai Yeh

(Proposal to construct a new trellis over an existing outdoor patio at the front of the Galleria building. The project includes a 540 square foot trellis surrounded by a 7-foot garden wall with glass wind screen.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with conditions to provide trellis, post pier, connections, walls, glass, and gate details.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 3820 STATE ST****R-O/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-240-052
 Application Number: MST2013-00023
 Owner: Peaceful View Properties, LLC
 Agent: Michael Cicileo

(Proposal to remove 18 existing large Eucalyptus trees in the raised planter in front of the building and in the rear parking lot, and replacing them with 18 Arbutus Marina trees (24-inch box size) on a 78,454 square foot commercial lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Removal of the large Eucalyptus trees is approved with replacement trees as approved.
- 2) Hymenosporum flaxum shall be planted along the front of the building façade planter to provide a tall columnar tree replacement; to be planted in non-uniform group plantings, as shown on the plans.
- 3) Arbutus Marina planted in rear parking lot as proposed.
- 4) Maintain and propagate current ground cover plantings.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 1022 E COTA ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-242-007
Application Number: MST2013-00021
Owner: Maria Gomez

(Proposal to permit the as-built re-roof of front portion of the duplex structure. The existing terracotta s-tile was replaced with green glazed s-tile and the green tile was added as a cap along the existing parapet walls. This proposal will abate violations in ENF2012-0000854.)

(Action may be taken is sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted. It was suggested that the applicant to paint flashing above the shed roof to match the wall.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ABR - NEW ITEM**D. 115 E VALERIO ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-012
Application Number: MST2007-00639
Owner: Anne Maxwell
Agent: Souter Land Use Consulting

(Proposal to convert three existing residential units to condominiums. The site is currently developed with a one-story, two-bedroom 1,113 square foot unit, and a two-story duplex with two-bedroom units at 1,493 and 1,468 square feet on a 12,500 square foot lot in the R-2 zone. No exterior alterations are proposed for the existing residential units. A Modification is being requested to permit an as-built garage window in Unit 1. There are currently two two-car garages on site. The proposal includes some site alterations to include landscaping alterations and the addition of three new uncovered parking spaces, for a total of six on-site parking spaces. A Design Review waiver is requested to not fence the private outdoor living space in the front yard for unit 1. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for Condominium Conversion, a Tentative Subdivision Map, and a Modification.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of a Condominium Conversion, Tentative Subdivision Map, and Zoning Modification.)

Postponed one week to the January 28, 2013, Consent meeting.

ABR - NEW ITEM**E. 1013 BATH ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-018
Application Number: MST2013-00026
Applicant Tom Ochsner
Owner Perera Laxman
Business Name: Sushi Teri

(Proposal to replace the existing front deck for accessibility, to permit the as-built 48 square foot walk-in cooler, to permit the as-built 93 square foot storage addition, and for a new van-accessible parking space for the existing Sushi Teri restaurant.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program compliance is required.)

Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with conditions:

- 1) The siding on cooler to match existing building; provide screening for equipment for cooler.
- 2) Both roof and walls of the storage to match the existing building.
- 3) Show roof line of the building on the floor plan and the extent of the trellis.
- 4) Clarify if the awning is to remain on the plans.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.