



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

#### MINUTES

**Monday, June 11, 2012**      **630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room**      **3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**      DAWN SHERRY, *Chair*  
PAUL ZINK, *Vice Chair*  
CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND  
GARY MOSEL  
KEITH RIVERA  
KIRK GRADIN  
STEPHANIE POOLE

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      DALE FRANCISCO  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      BRUCE BARTLETT

**STAFF:**      JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - Absent  
TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician  
KATHLEEN GOO, Alternate Commission Secretary

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high-speed internet access at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr) and click *Online Meetings*.

#### GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Dawn Sherry.

Members present:      Gilliland, Mosel, Poole, Rivera, Sherry (present until 4:51 p.m.), and Zink.

Members absent:      Gradin.

Staff present:      Boughman and Goo.

A.      Public Comment:      No comments.

B.      Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meetings of May 14 and May 29, 2012.

Motion:      Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of May 14, 2012, as amended.

Action:      Rivera/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent)

Motion:      Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of May 29, 2012, as submitted.

Action:      Rivera/Gilliland, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent)

C.      Consent Calendar.

Motion:      Ratify the Consent Calendar of June 4, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Keith Rivera with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action:      Zink/Rivera, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of June 11, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Keith Rivera with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Gilliland/Zink, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:

a) Board member Kirk Gradin will be absent from today's June 11<sup>th</sup> meeting.

b) Chair Dawn Sherry will be leaving the meeting at 4:45 p.m., and Vice-Chair Paul Zink will chair the remainder of the meeting.

c) Board member Paul Zink will absent from the June 25, 2012 Full Board meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports. No reports.

### **FINAL REVIEW**

#### **1. 822 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

**C-2 Zone**

**(3:10)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-042-006

Application Number: MST2011-00182

Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Southern Santa Barbara County

Architect: Devicente & Mills

(Proposal for construction of 12 new two- and three-story residential condominium units, restricted to affordable covenants. The units will vary in size between 691 square feet and 1,347 square feet, and includes 8 two-bedroom units, 2 three-bedroom units, and 2 one-bedroom units. A total of 15 on-site parking spaces will be provided, which include 12 one-car garages and 3 guest parking spaces. The proposal involves the demolition of two existing residential units, two garages, and a carport, and a voluntary lot merger to merge two existing parcels into one approximately 19,303 square foot parcel. The Planning Commission approved a Tentative Subdivision Map and zoning modifications for lot area, interior setback encroachment, and number of parking spaces (PC Resolution No. 001-12).)

**(Project was last reviewed on May 29, 2012. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 001-12.)**

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Edward deVicente, Architect; and Courtney Mills, Landscape Architect.

Public comment was opened at 3:30 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) A majority of the Board feels that the proposed project still needs more development for consistency with materials and architectural style. Applicant to provide the following: a) Solar installation details. b) Corner detailing of the horizontal siding; study utilizing a corner trim. c) Details on window trellis diagonal members. d) Dimensions and detailing at trims, flashings, and railings. e) Additional articulation details at the ends of corbel members. f) Restudy or provide more articulation on the use of the horizontal bands at the plaster buildings. g) Provide elevation details of window trims to indicate extensions, changes in depth, etc.

- 2) Continue resolving the elevation of Building 12 that faces Canon Perdido Street.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent.)

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****2. 901 OLIVE ST****C-2 Zone**

**(3:40)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-018  
Application Number: MST2012-00048  
Owner: 433 ECP LP  
Architect: Design Arc  
Owner: 901 Holdings LLC

(Proposal to construct 10 one-story, studio apartment units and 9 two-story, one-bedroom apartment units above a new two-level, 59 space parking structure. The 19 new apartment units and new parking structure will be added to an existing two-story, 18,276 office building. Project also includes alterations to the existing office building including façade improvements on all sides, new elevator, new roof with light wells, solar panels and a new 474 square foot basement-level mechanical room. Total development proposed is 60,060 square feet with a maximum height of 51 feet on a 33,005 square foot lot. Seven existing parking spaces will remain for a total of 66 proposed parking spaces. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification was granted for a reduction of required parking spaces.)

**(Project last reviewed on May 29, 2012. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 016-12.)**

Actual time: 4:05 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, Melisa Cinarli, Project Manager, and Phil Suding, Landscape Architect.

Public comment was opened at 4:14 p.m.

- 1) Donald Sharpe, opposed; expressed concerns regarding the ABR not adhering to their stated goals and guidelines, project's proximity to the El Pueblo Viejo District (EPV), 50 foot building height, contemporary style not compatible with nearby craftsman style houses, not compatible with the neighborhood.
- 2) Ernest A. Watson, opposed; expressed concerns about lack of Santa Barbara architectural style, industrial style is not compatible in Santa Barbara, narrowness of Olive Street (also submitted letter suggesting widening Olive Street and on-street parking).
- 3) Mary Louise Days, opposed; expressed concerns that the proposed modern architecture is not consistent with Santa Barbara's reputation and heritage of traditional architecture, neighborhood incompatibility, and proximity to EPV.
- 4) Monique Mansfield, in support; appreciates increased landscaping including retention of Olive trees and Palm trees, reduction of building height, addition of residential component, proposed style is compatible with this neighborhood, the project is not located in EPV.

Letters in support from Mark Mansfield and Mark Wienke; and a letter in opposition from Ernest A. Watson were acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 4:27 p.m.

- Motion: Project Design Approval and return to the Full Board with the following comments:
- 1) The continued reduction of the mass, bulk and scale, and height, particularly along Olive Street and the elimination of the corrugated metal were appreciated. No further reduction is required.
  - 2) Study alternatives to the perforated metal at the balcony railings.
  - 3) Study additional opportunities to utilize a trellis on other elevations in addition to those on Canon Perdido Street.

- 4) Study opportunities to introduce additional locations for using sandstone, particularly on the existing masonry portion of the building along Canon Perdido St.
- 5) Restudy the color palette, particularly along Olive St., and to lighten the materials to relate more to traditional materials in the area; give some consideration to the adjacent red brick building to blend in with the neighborhood.
- 6) A majority of the Board supports the use of palm trees as street trees along the south elevation.
- 7) Project Compatibility criteria was analyzed with the conclusion that the project does not pose major inconsistencies with the criteria, with the following comments: a) the project is appropriate in size, mass, bulk, and scale; b) compatible with the desirable architectural qualities of the City; c) consistent with the design guidelines; d) compatible with the neighborhood; e) does not have impacts on adjacent landmarks or historic resources; f) does not have impacts on public views of oceans or mountains; g) provides appropriate landscaping; and h) preserves the existing large ficus tree.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin and Sherry absent.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **FINAL REVIEW**

#### **3. 900 CALLE DE LOS AMIGOS**

**A-1 Zone**

**(4:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-040-050  
 Application Number: MST2005-00742  
 Owner: American Baptist Homes of the West  
 Applicant: Tynan Group  
 Agent: Cameron Carey  
 Architect: Keith Nolan

(This is a revised proposal for residential and non-residential additions to the Valle Verde Retirement Community. The proposal includes the construction of 40 new senior independent living units across the existing campus, for a total of 251 residential units. The non-residential component includes 13,945 square feet of demolition, 14,902 square feet of new construction, resulting in a 957 net square feet addition, and 10,461 square feet to be remodeled. The proposal would result in the addition of 58,436 square feet of structures, bringing the total on site development to 317,741 square feet. Being proposed are 83 new parking spaces for a total of 414 parking spaces. Also proposed are 11,520 cubic yards of cut, 13,300 cubic yards of fill, and 1,780 cubic yards of imported soils on the 59.75-acre site. The project received Planning Commission approval for an amendment to the existing Conditional Use Permit, Lot Line Adjustment and Modifications for building separation and yard encroachments.)

**(Final approval of the non-residential Common Building is requested. Detail changes include colors, window locations, lighting, porch entrance, and elevator tower roof. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 11-061. This building was last reviewed on May 16, 2012.)**

Actual time: 4:51 p.m.

Present: Justin Van Mullen, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 4:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion: Final Approval with conditions:
- 1) Provide an alternative to the proposed wall sconce lighting fixture.
  - 2) Revise the plaster wainscot detail to bring the lower portion proud of the upper portion on detail #5, Sheet A-9.1 of the plans.
- Action: Rivera/Poole, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Gilliland abstained. Gradin and Sherry absent.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:09 P.M. \*\***

### **CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)**

Representatives present: Gilliland and Zink.

Staff present: Boughman.

### **ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**

#### **A. 628 W MICHELTORENA ST C-P Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-251-029  
 Application Number: MST2012-00208  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Neighborhood Clinics  
 Applicant: Terry Keller

(Proposal for a new ADA parking space. The project involves enlarging a paved area and removal of landscaping.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions: 1) Show backflow device and screening. 2) Provide Water Compliance Statement on the plans. 3) Add additional plants as noted on the plans to break up the expanses of low ground cover.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **ABR - FINAL REVIEW**

#### **B. 1812 & 1814 SAN PASCUAL ST R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-163-011  
 Application Number: MST2010-00097  
 Owner: Michael Szymanski  
 Architect: Yuzon and Associates  
 Applicant: Ubaldo Diaz

(Revised proposal returning to the original proposed four residential units. The project would demolish the existing single-family residence at the rear of the property; construct a two-story 2,138 square foot duplex with a detached four-car carport and two uncovered parking spaces. The existing one-story duplex and two uncovered parking spaces will remain at the front of the 11,580 square foot lot. The proposal will address violations under enforcement case ENF2005-00016.)

Final Approval with conditions: 1) Increase the battens to 2X4s and 2X6s at the corners. 2) All pear trees are to be 24-inch box size.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **ABR - NEW ITEM**

#### **C. 1018 E GUTIERREZ ST**

**R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-372-002  
Application Number: MST2012-00215  
Owner: Javier Steven and Louise Ann Cruz  
Architect: Eric Swenumson

(Proposal to permit alterations to the rear unit on a site with two detached residences and a detached two-car garage. The proposal would permit the as-built window alterations to the rear unit and stucco the entire exterior of the building. The as-built carport/patio cover and 24 square foot addition are proposed to be removed as well as additional interior work to address violations in ENF2012-00049.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted; the Frazee "Arrowroot" color #CL2771W is acceptable for the stucco color.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **ABR - FINAL REVIEW**

#### **D. 500 BLOCK W ANAPAMU**

**NONE Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-010-0RW  
Application Number: MST2012-00118  
Owner: Caltrans  
Agent: Margaret Chang

(Proposal to replace two existing 35-foot tall AT&T cellular antenna monopoles. The diameter of one monopole would increase from 19 inches to 24 inches; the diameter of the other monopole would increase from 19 inches to 30 inches. The increase will accommodate replacement of the three existing antennas in each. Heights will not exceed the existing approved 35 feet. Equipment cabinets would be added within existing fenced lease area located under the pedestrian bridge.)

**(Project requires a finding of no visual impacts.)**

Final Approval with the finding of no visual aesthetic impacts, and with the condition that the two new 25-foot tall palm trees are to be the Canary Island Date Palm variety.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.