



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

Tuesday, May 29, 2012

630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

DAWN SHERRY, *Chair*
PAUL ZINK, *Vice Chair*
CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
GARY MOSEL
KEITH RIVERA
KIRK GRADIN
STEPHANIE POOLE

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high-speed internet access at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and click *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Sherry.

Members present: Gilliland, Gradin, Mosel, Poole, Rivera, Sherry, Zink

Members absent: None

Staff present: Boughman, Shafer

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the ABR meeting of May 14, 2012 – Postponed until June 11, 2012.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of May 21, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Rivera/Zink, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of May 29, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Mr. Rivera announced that his Consent Calendar rotation begins June 4.
- b. Mr. Zink announced that he would step down from item #5, 1025 E. Cota Street.
- c. Mr. Gradin announced that he would leave at 6:05 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports. No reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1. 1130 N MILPAS ST

E-1/R-3 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
Application Number: MST2009-00551
Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
Architect: Steve Carter
Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new 2,210 square foot (net) one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,700 cubic yards of cut and 1200 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires City Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only. Project requires environmental assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on April 16, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:05 p.m.

Present: Steve Carter, Agent; Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect; Trish Allen, Agent.

Staff comments: Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, requested clarification of the fence height which is proposed to be over 8 feet. Mr. Carter explained that the fence is proposed to be a maximum of 8 foot high and will not require a modification.

Public comment was opened at 3:16 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:

1. The Board felt the architecture and landscape design for the administrative building are exceptional and fit in with the remodel of County Bowl and with the nearby historic building.
2. The use of traditional materials was appreciated.
3. Some Board members felt the chimney element could be removed.
4. The Board found the modifications pose no negative aesthetic impacts.
5. Provide elevations, details, and landscaping for all retaining walls proposed for Lowena Drive, include gates or other features associated with the walls.
6. Soften the edge of hardscape line between the begonia garden and plaza area.
7. Extend the planter in front of the freestanding wall that screens the condenser unit.
8. Match the hardscape type for the Drier Administration Building crosswalk area to the new box office building and the apron adjacent to the handicapped parking area.
9. Project Compatibility criteria were analyzed with the conclusion that the project does not pose inconsistencies with the criteria.

Action: Gradin/Gilliland, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**2. 822 E CANON PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-042-006
 Application Number: MST2011-00182
 Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Southern Santa Barbara County
 Architect: Devicente & Mills

(Proposal for construction of 12 new two- and three-story residential condominium units, restricted to affordable covenants. The units will vary in size between 691 square feet and 1,347 square feet, and includes 8 two-bedroom units, 2 three-bedroom units, and 2 one-bedroom unit. A total of 15 on-site parking spaces will be provided, which include 12 one-car garages and 3 guest parking spaces. The proposal involves the demolition of two existing residential units, two garages, and a carport, and a voluntary lot merger to merge two existing parcels into one approximately 19,303 square foot parcel. The Planning Commission approved a Tentative Subdivision Map and zoning modifications for lot area, interior setback encroachment, and number of parking spaces [PC Resolution No. 001-12].)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 001-12.)

Actual time: 3:33 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect and Edward Devicente, Architect, DMA.

Public comment was opened at 3:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Generally, there was support for the use of stucco siding. Study the detailing to be more consistent with the different cladding materials.
2. It was felt that where the two materials are used on the same building, changing colors should occur.
3. Study the gable porches. Consider changing the roof forms or other ways for the structures to be supported.
4. There was no support for the plaster horizontal bands.
5. Study the layout of detectable pavers and alignments with adjacent conditions. Provide paving samples.
6. The use of wood trim around the windows was encouraged; consider the details for consistency.
7. Consider realigning the horizontal trim given the material changes.
8. Study the sizes and proportions of wood members to be consistent with the architectural style.
9. Comments 3 and 4 from the minutes of March 5, 2012 were carried forward: 3) Study options for introduce landscaping at the rear fencing. 4) Provide a preliminary landscape plan of the adjacent parcel being impacted.

Action: Rivera/Gradin, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 901 OLIVE ST****C-2 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-018
Application Number: MST2012-00048
Owner: 433 ECP LP
Architect: Design ARC
Owner: 901 Holdings LLC

(Proposal to construct 10 one-story studio apartment units, and 9 two-story one-bedroom apartment units above a new two-level, 59 space parking structure. The 19 new apartment units and new parking structure will be added to an existing two-story, 18,276 office building. Project also includes alterations to the existing office building including façade improvements on all sides, new elevator, new roof with light wells, solar panels and a new 474 square foot basement-level mechanical room. Total development proposed is 60,060 square feet with a maximum height of 51 feet on a 33,005 square foot lot. Seven existing parking spaces will remain for a total of 66 proposed parking spaces. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification was granted for a reduction of required parking spaces.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 016-12.)

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, DesignArc; Melisa Cinarli, Project Manager, DesignArc; and Phil Suding, Landscape Architect; Pete Lewis, Owner.

Public comment was opened at 4:33 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, expressed concern about the project's lack of neighborhood compatibility and proximity to two historic landmarks and the EPV district.

Grant Castleberg, expressed concern that the architecture is not compatible with the neighborhood.

A letter from Donald Sharp in opposition to the architectural style, and a letter in support from Monique Mansfield were acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 4:42 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Provide elevations with the metal siding and corrugated metal reduced or removed, and incorporating different design ideas for the building material. Some metal is acceptable in some locations; however the amount of metal is a concern.
2. Positive comments were given for the dynamic building and proportions and scale that are appropriate to the neighborhood, and for the care in minimizing the proposed building height, and in preserving the existing tree and recognizing the existing trees along Olive Street.
3. Some Board members felt there are still opportunities for further reduction in building height.

Action: Zink/Poole, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 528 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-029
Application Number: MST2012-00147
Owner: Thomas P. Ziegler Trust
Architect: Ted Meeder
Business: The French Press

(Proposal to remodel the exterior of the existing 3,218 square foot commercial building, and construction of a new 797 square foot outdoor dining patio, with associated alterations to the parking lot and landscaping.)

(Second review; project was last reviewed on April 30, 2012. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:09 p.m.

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect; Tod Stewart and Julia Mayer, Tenants.

Public comment was opened at 5:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Design Approval with return to Consent Calendar with comments:

1. Provide photographs of the as-built wood fence and trash enclosure.
2. Verify that the handrail extensions at proposed steps comply with Building Division requirements.
3. Verify that proposed parking layout comply with ADA and landscape requirements.
4. Additional planting on the east side of the patio is encouraged.
5. Provide a detail of the site wall.
6. Provide a color board. Applicant indicated that the entire building will be painted.
7. Provide planting and irrigation plan details. Show backflow device and screening on irrigation plans.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry stepped down.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1025 E COTA ST****R-2 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-185-014
Application Number: MST2012-00054
Owner: Anita David
Designer: Raymond Costantino

(Proposal for a new, two-story, 1,200 square foot dwelling unit and an attached 600 square foot accessory dwelling unit. The proposal includes roof decks, two attached one-car garage spaces and one uncovered parking space.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:23 p.m.

Present: Raymond Costantino, Owner/Designer; Anita David, Owner.

Public comment was opened at 5:30 p.m.

Leslie Colasse, neighbor, expressed concern that the standing seam roof and the the on-grade level of accessory structure cantilevers are incompatible with the neighborhood; supports a higher parapet for concealment due to potential solar panel reflectivity.

Public comment was closed at 5:35 p.m.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:
1. The Board was in support of the general site plan and project layout.
 2. Provide photos of adjacent neighboring structures for window privacy.
 3. The overall mass, bulk, and scale were supported.
 4. Study the cantilever of the front unit along the driveway.
 5. Study the fenestration and develop a cohesive, unified strategy for window placement and design.
 6. Study the neighboring structures of similar style, particularly for parapet detailing, window awnings, etc.
 7. A majority of the board felt the standing seam roofing is not compatible; provide alternative roof materials.
 8. Provide a preliminary landscape plan that includes a paving design.
 9. Indicate trash and recycling locations on the plans.
- Action: Rivera/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink stepped down.)

****MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:52 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR

Representatives present: Gilliland

Staff present: Boughman

ABR - FINAL REVIEW

A. 501 NINOS DR P-R/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-362-005
 Application Number: MST2012-00166
 Applicant/Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to replace the softball field lighting for the Dwight Murphy Ballfield. Eight existing light poles will be replaced with seven new ones with energy-efficient lighting. The height of four of the poles will increase from 50 to 70 feet.)

Public comment:

Cheryl Palmer, submitted letter from El Escorial Homeowners Association in opposition to the increased height of utility poles increasing the brightness of light trespass. Appreciates the shielded light fixtures. Frances Kliza: expressed concern about the brightness of field lighting.

Final Approval as submitted.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 718 & 720 SAN PASCUAL STREET****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-063-016
Application Number: MST2012-00201
Owner: Robert L Johns Trust
Applicant: Mark Morando

(Proposal for alterations to two single-family units. The project would permit the as-built conversion of the carport at the alley to a garage, remodel the front porch of the front unit, a new 58 square foot raised wood deck at rear of the front unit, relocate the trash enclosure from the setback, remove a storage shed, permit the as-built wood fence at front of property, a new six foot fence at alley, locate a washer/dryer in garage, and remodel the kitchen and utility area.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval with conditions: 1) use 6x6 posts at the front porch; 2) provide a color board.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**C. 3707 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-590-024
Application Number: MST2011-00304
Owner: McColm Family Trust
Applicant: Kerr Project Services
Business Name: Chick- Fil-A
Architect: CRHO

(Proposal to remodel existing building and convert from Burger King to Chick-Fil-A restaurant. Existing drive-thru to remain. Remodeled outdoor seating with new furniture. Replace existing landscaping, new paint and stucco covering existing brick areas, two new trellises over patio dining areas, ADA upgrades and parking relocated. Some parking paving to be replaced with permeable paving. Replace all windows and doors, three new clerestory windows in kitchen, new exterior lighting, remove two signs that were integrated into the building walls.)

(Final review of details is requested. Project received a final approval on April 16, 2012.)

Final Approval of the details and revised landscaping.

ABR - NEW ITEM**D. 320 & 322 W CANON PERDIDO STREET****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-017 & 039-302-027
Application Number: MST2012-00136
Owner: Martin Peter and Maureen Connolly
Designer: Wynn Landscape

(Proposal to replace existing landscaping, resurface the parking lots, revise the trash locations, and provide two new accessible parking spaces for the existing apartment complex. The project will address violations in ENF2011-01050 and ENF2011-01051. A waiver is requested for the non-conforming property to have less than the required perimeter landscaping areas.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued indefinitely with comments: 1) study a Tipuana for the parking lot tree; 2) provide landscaping to screen the backflow device; 3) resolve the trash container issues with Karen Gumtow, Solid Waste Specialist; 4) provide one handicapped parking space on each lot as required.

ABR - NEW ITEM**E. 1016 CASTILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-029
Application Number: MST2012-00203
Owner: Kenneth R and Betty R Larson Trust
Applicant: Justin Van Mullem

(Proposal to replace all of the existing aluminum windows, within the existing openings, with new dual glazed Jeldwen Vinyl windows on an existing 12-unit multi-family apartment complex. No other exterior alterations are proposed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval with the condition that there is no change to the front elevation. Windows will not be replaced on the front elevation.