



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

#### MINUTES

**Monday, May 14, 2012**

**630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room**

**3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

DAWN SHERRY, *Chair*  
PAUL ZINK, *Vice-Chair*  
CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND  
GARY MOSEL  
KEITH RIVERA  
KIRK GRADIN  
STEPHANIE POOLE

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** BRUCE BARTLETT

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor  
TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician  
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high-speed internet access at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr) and click *Online Meetings*.

#### **GENERAL BUSINESS:**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Sherry.

Members present: Gilliland, Gradin, Mosel, Poole, Rivera, Sherry, Zink

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Boughman, Limon (left at 4:10), Shafer

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of April 30, 2012, as amended.

Action: Rivera/Poole, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Rivera abstained.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of May 7, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Rivera/Zink, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of May 14, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals. No Announcements.

E. Subcommittee Reports. No reports.

### **DISCUSSION ITEM**

**(3:10)** City Attorney presentation on Fair Political Practices Commission conflict of interest rules applicable to design review board members. Staff: Steve Wiley, City Attorney

Mr. Wiley provided handouts and gave a presentation concerning FPPC conflict of interest rules, as they apply to design review boards. Discussion topics included ramifications of the FPPC, defining/determining a “general conflict of interest” and advocating versus reviewing projects. Mr. Wiley responded to comments/questions from the Board.

### **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

#### **1. SYCAMORE CREEK, PUNTA GORDA STREET**

**(3:30)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: ROW-001-603  
Application Number: MST2009-00374  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Applicant: Jessica Grant

(Proposal for the Lower Sycamore Creek Channel Widening and Punta Gorda Street Bridge Replacement Project. The project includes channel improvements beginning at the north side of the Caltrans right-of-way line and extending to a point approximately 75 feet upstream of the Punta Gorda Street Bridge. The project includes the replacement of the Punta Gorda Street Bridge and a creek restoration plan.)

**(Project was last heard on April 30, 2012.)**

Actual time: 3:50 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner and John Ilasin, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara Public Works.

Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, was available to respond to questions from the Board. Ms. Kennedy provided comments concerning ABR conditions of approval applicable to the project.

Public comment was opened at 4:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval to the Consent Calendar with return to the following comments:

1. Study moving the pole to be at least an arm’s length away from the bridge railing.
2. Further recess the utility pipes under the bridge as far as possible.
3. The “Ashlar” stone pattern presented is acceptable.
4. Study enhancements to the sidewalk patterns.
5. Study lowering the chain link fence adjacent to the bridge from a distance of at least 10 feet back as it approaches the bridge, to a height matching the railing.
6. Provide a detailed planting plan.

7. Return to Full Board if the electrical pole is to remain in its proposed location, return to Consent if the electrical pole is to be moved further away from the railing.
8. Approval is subject to the ABR Conditions of Approval as listed in the staff report dated April 30, 2012, and Planning Commission recommendations that require: a) a no trash dumping sign, b) an anti-dumping notice with the City water bill, and c) native landscaping.

Action: Gradin/Zink, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Rivera abstained.)

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

### **2. 501 NINOS DR**

**P-R/SD-3 Zone**

**(4:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-362-005  
Application Number: MST2012-00166  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to replace the softball field lighting for the Dwight Murphy ball field. Eight existing light poles will be replaced with seven new ones with energy-efficient lighting. The height of four of the poles will increase from 50 to 70 feet.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Actual time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Patrick Shanahan, Facilities Construction Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment was opened at 4:35 p.m.

Francis Kliza expressed concerned about height of poles and brightness of the proposed lighting fixtures.

Public comment was closed at 4:38 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. The reduction in the number of electrical poles, and the reduction in number of light fixtures are appreciated. It is understood that pole height will increase; however, the effect will be a reduction in light spill.
2. Provide a photometric study that extends beyond the property lines; work with staff to determine the distance beyond.
3. Provide a photograph of typical utility boxes to be mounted on the poles. Provide the smallest box possible or remove the box completely.
4. Indicate the padding color that will surround the utility pole, and indicate the pole color.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**FINAL REVIEW****3. 900 CALLE DE LOS AMIGOS****A-1 Zone**

**(4:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-040-050  
Application Number: MST2005-00742  
Owner: American Baptist Homes of the West  
Applicant: Tynan Group  
Agent: Cameron Carey  
Architect: Keith Nolan

(This is a revised proposal for residential and non-residential additions to the Valle Verde Retirement Community. The proposal includes the construction of 40 new senior independent living units across the existing campus, for a total of 251 residential units. The non-residential component includes 13,945 square feet of demolition, and 14,902 square feet of new construction, resulting in a 957 net square feet addition, and 10,461 square feet to be remodeled. The proposal would result in the addition of 58,436 square feet of structures, bringing the total on site development to 317,741 square feet. Proposed are 83 new parking spaces for a total of 414 parking spaces. Proposed are 11,520 cubic yards of cut, 13,300 cubic yards of fill, and 1,780 cubic yards of imported soils on the 59.75-acre site. The project received Planning Commission approval for an amendment to the existing Conditional Use Permit, Lot Line Adjustment and Modifications for building separation and yard encroachments.)

**(Final approval of the non-residential Common Building is requested. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 11-061.)**

Actual time: 4:50 p.m.

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Architect, On Design Architects.

Public comment was opened at 5:16 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. In general, the mass, bulk, and scale are acceptable as presented, with the following isolated issues:
2. The span of supports and the supporting beam at the bus stop is too large.
3. Some board members felt the pillars, especially the prominent pillars at the entry, should be tapered as shown on the original submittal.
4. Study adding one additional vertical mullion to the upper windows on the new building.
5. In general, study a more uniform craftsman approach to the building.
6. Study reducing the overhang on the stone cap at the pillars.
7. On the south elevation of the administration building, second floor, study adding an additional fenestration element to break up the large plaster mass.
8. On the west elevation of the administration building, study adding a more vertical element on the tower.
9. On the east elevation of the administration building, second floor, study adding additional detailing or enhancement of equipment well.
10. On the north elevation of the common building, study adding additional detailing on the gable ends of the new administration building and the new multipurpose remodel.
11. On the south elevation of the Common building, study adding enhancements to the large gable end of the existing lounge area to integrate better with the new style.
12. Study an alternative to the ADA wall sconce to be more in keeping with the rest of the craftsman style fixtures.

13. Study reducing the equipment well.  
Action: Gradin/Rivera, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland stepped down.)

#### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **4. 635 OLIVE ST**

**C-M Zone**

**(5:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-012  
Application Number: MST2012-00156  
Owner: David Potter  
Architect: Michael Porter

(Proposal to demolish the existing 940 square foot one-story, single-family residence and construct a three-story mixed-use building with a basement. The project consists of 2,973 square feet of commercial wine production and storage space, and 1,372 square feet of residential space with an attached 442 square foot two-car garage and 3 uncovered parking spaces.)

**(Early Concept Review is requested. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)**

Actual time: 5:43 p.m.

Present: Michael Porter, Architect; Stephanie Dotson, Owner; Alexa Schloh, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 5:49 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

1. Provide more extensive neighborhood context documentation, including composite street photos of the immediate surroundings and an aerial photo of the area.
2. Provide composite elevations showing the proposed project in context with the adjacent structures. The adjacent structures may simply be outlined.
3. Some board members are concerned about the height and expanse of the blank walls at the property lines. Overall, the Board feels the need to see the project in context in order to make more informed opinions.
4. Provide more detailed information about the material. Provide a material board and photographic examples.
5. Provide more information about floor-to-floor plate heights (sections and elevations).
6. Study the fenestration in relation to the building mass. Develop a more coherent fenestration layout.
7. Consider maximizing landscape opportunities, potentially including the parkway.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\*MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:16 P.M.\*\***

**CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)**

Representatives present: Gilliland and Zink  
Staff present: Boughman

**ABR - CONTINUED ITEM****A. 721 CARPINTERIA ST M-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-162-018  
Application Number: MST2012-00173  
Owner: Lash Construction Inc  
Agent: Eddie Deras

(Proposal to install two light poles each with two light fixtures for security lighting within the existing construction yard.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Final Approval with the condition that the pole and fixture are to be a dark green color.

**ABR - CONTINUED ITEM****B. 3900 BLK LA COLINA RD 2636 SEG ID**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-636  
Application Number: MST2012-00155  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Applicant: Public Works

(Proposal for a new accessible infill sidewalk along the south side of La Colina Street for the safe routes to school project. The project includes new sidewalk, curbing, ramps, and new landscaping in the right-of-way. La Colina Street will be reduced in width from 40 to 36.5 feet. Existing street trees are proposed to be removed and replaced with new street trees.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Final Approval with the condition to enlarge slightly the planter adjacent to 3995 La Colina Street. Owner is encouraged to ask whether the neighbor at 4005 La Colina would like to have a tree installed in front of his property.