



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, April 30, 2012

630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: DAWN SHERRY, Chair
PAUL ZINK, Vice-Chair
CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
GARY MOSEL
KEITH RIVERA
KIRK GRADIN
STEPHANIE POOLE

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high-speed internet access at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and click *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:06 p.m. by Chair Sherry.

Members present: Gilliland (left at 6:45), Gradin (left at 6:45), Mosel, Poole, Sherry, Zink

Members absent: Rivera

Staff present: Boughman, Shafer

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of April 16, 2012, as amended.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin abstained, Rivera absent.)

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of April 23, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink/Keith Rivera and Chris Gilliland.

Action: Zink/Gilliland, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of April 30, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink/Keith Rivera and Chris Gilliland.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:

a. An appeal to City Council concerning the April 16 ABR Approval of the Review After Final for 336 N. Milpas, Fresh & Easy, has been received. A City Council hearing date has not been set.

b. Board member Rivera will be absent from the meeting.

2. Board members Gilliland and Gradin announced that they will step down from item 8, 25 E. Mason Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports. No reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM

(3:10) Overview of the proposed Financial Plan for Fiscal Year 2013 with highlights for the Community Development Department (CDD). On April 17, 2012, the City Administrator presented the proposed Financial Plan to the City Council. A Council hearing to review the CDD budget is scheduled for Wednesday May 16, 2012. Staff: Bettie Weiss, City Planner

Ms. Weiss provided a presentation, aided by PowerPoint graphics, regarding the proposed citywide and department FY 2013 budget, decrease in revenues, Redevelopment Agency impacts, proposed cost cutting measures, fee increases, and PlanSB phase out. The budget will be heard by City Council on Wednesday, May 16, 2012. Ms. Weiss responded to questions and comments from the Board.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW AND ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

1. SYCAMORE CREEK / PUNTA GORDA STREET

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-603
Application Number: MST2009-00374
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Jessica Grant

(Proposal for the Lower Sycamore Creek Channel Widening and Punta Gorda Street Bridge Replacement Project. The project includes channel improvements beginning at the north side of the Caltrans right-of-way line and extending to a point approximately 75 feet upstream of the Punta Gorda Street Bridge. The project includes the replacement of the Punta Gorda Street Bridge and a creek restoration plan. The Architectural Board of Review will consider approval of the Mitigated Negative Declaration prepared for the project pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines Section 15074.)

(Project Design Approval and adoption of the Mitigated Negative Declaration are requested. Project was last heard on April 4, 2011.)

Actual time: 3:34

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner; John Ilasin, Project Engineer; David Black, Landscape Architect; Craig Drake, Project Manager. Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, and Danny Kato, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, provided staff comments regarding the projects history and provided information about required findings applicable to the project.

Public comment was opened at 3:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: To Adopt the Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration as presented.

Action: Zink/Gilliland 3/0/3. Motion carried. (Gradin/Mosel/Sherry abstained, Rivera absent)

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Utility pipes or lines are not to be visible.
2. Work with Edison for different solutions for relocating or reducing the height and/or diameter of the utility pole, or acquire additional right of way to physically move the pole from the sidewalk.
3. Provide one plan view showing all new features of the proposed bridge design, sidewalks and adjacent affected areas.
4. Show exact locations of chain link and wrought iron fencing.
5. Show the finished pattern of the sandstone and sidewalks, and study adding enhanced treatments of the new sidewalks.
6. Look for ways to add mature planting wherever possible to deter potential graffiti and to screen the power pole.
7. Show where the bus stop and trash receptacles will be located.
8. The Board carried forward Planning Commission recommended conditions of approval that require: a) a no trash dumping sign, b) an anti-dumping notice with the City water bill, and c) native landscaping.

Action: Zink/Gradin, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 200 BLK W. COTA ST

1989 SEG ID

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-989
 Application Number: MST2011-00054
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jeff Palmer
 Applicant: Jessica Grant

(Proposal to demolish an existing bridge deck and abutments and replace them with cast-in-steel shell piles supporting a reinforced concrete pile cap at each end of the bridge. New bridge deck to be installed atop the new abutments.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 4:31

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner and James Colton, Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment was opened at 4:38 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:
1. Provide options for aesthetic treatment of the bridge railings.
 2. Conceal all utilities wherever possible.
 3. Underground the electrical lines if proposed to be relocated.
 4. Mitigate opportunities for graffiti with planting wherever possible.
 5. Show trash receptacle locations.
 6. Minimize the use of chain link fencing.
- Action: Gradin/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

3. 500 FOWLER RD

A-F/SD-3 Zone

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003
 Application Number: MST2012-00158
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: John Blankenship

(Proposal for a Marine Corps Air Station Tribute at the Santa Barbara Airport consisting of large sculpted glass wings located in front of the terminal building. The sculpture is proposed to be 20 feet tall and illuminated from below.)

(Concept Review only; project requires Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 4:45

Present: Karen Ramsdale, Airport Director; Douglas Lochner, project artist.

Public comment was opened at 4:54 p.m.

Pete Shank, spoke in favor of the tribute.

Ginny Brush, County of Santa Barbara Arts Commission, spoke in favor of the tribute.

Bob Handy, spoke in support of the project.

Jack Harris, representing Military Order of the World Wars, spoke in favor of the project.

Barry Winick, HLC member, spoke in support of the project.

Fermina Murray, HLC member, spoke in support of the project, and requested the ABR consider the height of the sculpture and potential for obstructed views with regard to the historic terminal.

Leoda Daniel, written comments in opposition were acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 5:05 p.m.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:
1. Some board members prefer relocating the proposed sculpture further away from the historic terminal. It was suggested shifting the sculpture further southwest, away from the highest point of the grass to the lower point of the grass, thus lowering the apparent height from the sidewalk.
 2. Reduce the amount of proposed new walkways to the sculpture.
 3. Study keeping the sculpture base height at bench height.

4. It was suggested to shift the existing benches to face the sculpture, and no additional benches.
5. The proposed size and scale are appropriate, with a reduction in base height to two feet.
6. Project Compatibility criteria was analyzed with the conclusion that the project does not pose major inconsistencies with the criteria, with the following comments: a) the project complies with all City regulations; b) the project is compatible with the existing architecture; c) in general, the size, bulk, and scale of the sculpture seem to be appropriate; d) the project location appears to be sensitive to the adjacent historic terminal with some minor adjustments, as suggested.

Action: Gradin/Zink, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 500 BLOCK W ANAPAMU

NONE Zone

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-010-0RW
 Application Number: MST2012-00118
 Owner: Caltrans
 Agent: Margaret Chang
 Applicant: AT&T

(Proposal to replace two existing 35-foot tall AT&T cellular antenna monopoles. The diameter of one monopole would increase from 19 inches to 24 inches; the diameter of the second monopole would increase from 19 inches to 30 inches. The increase will accommodate replacement of the three existing antennas in each. Heights will not exceed the existing approved 35 feet. Equipment cabinets would be added within existing fenced lease area located under the pedestrian bridge.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires a finding of no visual impacts.)

Actual time: 5:37

Present: Margaret Chang, Agent.

Public comment was opened at 5:41 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. Add two palm trees to screen the northwesterly monopole. The new palms are to match the existing Canary Date palms, and be similar in height.
2. Study adding planting around the base of the poles to prevent further graffiti.
3. Return to Consent Calendar if Caltrans allows the palm trees to be planted in the right-of-way, return to Full Board if the palms are not allowed.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera absent)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**5. 1720 SAN ANDRES ST****R-3 Zone**

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-191-015
Application Number: MST2008-00066
Owner: Cameron Porter
Architect: Thomas Moore

(The project was previously approved by the ABR when it was discovered that the required open yard area requires a zoning modification. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification is requested to allow the open yard to be 13.5 feet wide rather than the required 15 feet. Proposal to construct a new 802 square foot two-bedroom residential unit above a new 460 square foot, two-car garage, and 160 square foot, attached storage room on a 5,040 square foot lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposal also includes a 63 square foot first floor addition to the existing 558 square foot one-story two-bedroom residential unit and the demolition of an existing 250 square foot, legal non-conforming, single-car garage and a 75 square foot shed. A total of four parking spaces (two covered and two uncovered) will be provided on site. The project involves the removal of two existing palm trees.)

(Project is referred from Consent Calendar on April 23, 2012. Review After Final for a change from the approved composition shingles to a standing seam metal roof.)

Actual time: 5:52

Present: Thomas Moore, Architect; Cameron Porter, Owner.

Public comment was opened at 5:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Approved the Review After Final as submitted with the comment that the gutters will be metal to match existing.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed. Rivera absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**6. 528 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-029
Application Number: MST2012-00147
Owner: Thomas P Ziegler Trust
Architect: Ted Meeder

(Proposal to remodel the exterior of the existing 3,218 square foot commercial building and construction of a new 797 square foot outdoor dining patio with associated alterations to the parking lot and landscaping.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:00

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect; Julie Mayer, Owner; Todd Stewart, Applicant.

Public comment was opened at 6:06 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Overall, the proposed design concept is acceptable with the following changes:
 - a. Locate the trash enclosure away from the sidewalk.
 - b. Provide more landscaping adjacent to the patio and/or elsewhere on the site.
 - c. Study reducing the width of the curb cut off Anacapa Street in order to add more landscaping.
2. Verify that proposed patio improvements around the existing tree will not jeopardize the tree.
3. Show compliance with Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements and integrate into landscape plan.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry stepped down. Rivera absent.)

FINAL REVIEW

7. 900 CALLE DE LOS AMIGOS

A-1 Zone

(6:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-040-050
 Application Number: MST2005-00742
 Owner: American Baptist Homes of the West
 Applicant: Tynan Group
 Agent: Cameron Carey
 Architect: Keith Nolan

(This is a revised proposal for residential and non-residential additions to the Valle Verde Retirement Community. The proposal includes construction of 40 new senior independent living units across the existing campus, for a total of 251 residential units. The non-residential component includes 13,945 square feet of demolition, 14,902 square feet of new construction, resulting in a 957 net square feet addition, and 10,461 square feet to be remodeled. The proposal would result in the addition of 58,436 square feet of structures, bringing the total on site development to 317,741 square feet. Proposed are 83 new parking spaces for a total of 414 parking spaces. Also proposed on the 59.75-acre site are 11,520 cubic yards of cut, 13,300 cubic yards of fill, and 1,780 cubic yards of imported soils. The project received Planning Commission approval for an amendment to the existing Conditional Use Permit, Lot Line Adjustment and Modifications for building separation and yard encroachments.)

(Final approval of commercial portion of project is requested. This includes an addition to the Assisted Living building and carports. This review also includes a Review After Final for relocation of Unit 40 a few feet to avoid utilities.)

Actual time: 6:22

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 6:30 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments regarding the carports:

1. Restudy the proposed color for the structure beams and posts, or provide evidence of the appropriateness of the proposed color. Some board members prefer a lighter or brown color.
2. Provide a concealed structural connection at the post to beam and at the base to post detail. Provide a base detail.
3. Reduce the length of built up roofing sections.

4. Provide a drawn detail of the beam-ends.
5. Show proposed landscaping between the street and the carport.

Action: Gradin/Mosel, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Sherry opposed. Rivera absent)

The Board recessed from 6:45 p.m. until 7:04 p.m.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

8. 25 E MASON ST

OC/HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(6:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-012
 Application Number: MST2012-00058
 Owner: East Mason SB, LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for alterations to the existing 46,785 square foot, three story commercial building located on two separate parcels totaling 26,136 square feet in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. Alterations include a new 7,090 square foot raised platform roof deck, a new enclosed roof access stairway, replacement of an existing freight elevator with two new elevators, 5,860 square feet new roof landscape planters, and a total of 300 square feet of rooftop areas for a new photovoltaic solar panel system. Project also includes new windows and doors on the first floor, new windows on all elevations of the second and third floors, an alteration to the existing roof stairway enclosure to meet ADA requirements, and new windows and doors in each stairway enclosure. Parking includes 21 on-site parking spaces and 12 off-site parking spaces. No new additional floor area is proposed.)

(Third Review. Project was last reviewed on April 2, 2012.)

Actual time: 7:04

Present: Josh Blummer, Architect; Anthon Ellis, Landscape Architect, AB Design Studio.

Staff comments: Mr. Boughman requested that board members review carefully the proposed location of the mechanical equipment at the top of the stair towers.

Public comment was opened at 7:18 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent Calendar with the following conditions:

1. Relocate the air conditioning equipment to a location other than the stairwell roofs.
2. Provide a color and material board for the roof plan.
3. Provide additional information for the building exterior finish.
4. Study removing the sidewalk at the parking lot adjacent to the railroad tracks and replace with landscaping and trees.
5. An HLC or SFDB landscaping representative is requested to provide comments on the landscape plan prior to returning to Consent.
6. Project Compatibility criteria were analyzed with the conclusion that the project does not pose major inconsistencies with the criteria, with the following comments: a) the project complies with all City regulations; b) the project is compatible with the existing architecture; c) mass and scale are unchanged; d) provides views on roof top deck; e) increases the amount of open space.

Action: Zink/Poole, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Gradin stepped down. Rivera absent)

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:39 P.M. ******CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)**

Representatives present: Gilliland and Zink
Staff present: Boughman

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**A. END OF MESA LN****ROW Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 000-000-0RW
Application Number: MST2011-00280
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to replace the lower portion of the existing beach access stairs located at the end of Mesa Lane. The project would replace the existing lowest landing and bottom flight of stairs to the beach. The project includes Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-11.)

Final Approval with the condition to use blue or other dark color to meet the contrasting color requirement for the stair treads.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 3900 BLK LA COLINA RD 2636 SEG ID**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-636
Application Number: MST2012-00155
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Public Works

(Proposal for a new accessible infill sidewalk along the south side of La Colina Street for the safe routes to school project. The project includes new sidewalk, curbing, ramps, and new landscaping in the right-of-way. La Colina Street will be reduced in width from 40 to 36.5 feet. Existing street trees are proposed to be removed and replaced with new street trees.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks with comments: 1) provide photos of other built sandstone walls similar to those proposed at the trees; 2) provide an overall site plan showing existing trees, including those on private property, and proposed replacement trees; 3) study the transition point and alignment of the sidewalk.

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 415 E DE LA GUERRA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-022-008
Application Number: MST2004-00243
Owner: Valentino and Edith Ziliotto Trustees
Designer: Gina Giannetto
Architect: Pete Ehlen

(Proposal to construct a 1,657 square foot residential unit and a 258 square foot garage on a mixed-use site. There is an existing mixed-use building consisting of 4,350 square feet of commercial space, two existing residential units totaling 2,755 square feet, and a 400 square foot garage on the site, which are proposed to remain. There are currently 15 uncovered parking spaces on the lot. Modifications were approved for parking and setback encroachments along two property lines.)

(Review After Final for redesign and relocation of the trash enclosure and parking spaces.)

Continued indefinitely with comment that the proposed trash location in the front of the parking lot is not acceptable. Keep the current approved location, or study other options.