



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

Monday, April 16, 2012

630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

DAWN SHERRY, CHAIR
PAUL ZINK, VICE-CHAIR
CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
GARY MOSEL
KEITH RIVERA (Consent Calendar Representative)
KIRK GRADIN
STEPHANIE POOLE

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high-speed internet access at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and click *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Chair Sherry.

Members present: Gilliland, Mosel (arrived at 3:07), Poole, Sherry, Zink

Members absent: Gradin, Rivera

Staff present: Boughman, Limon (left at 3:40), Shafer

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of April 2, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of April 2, 2012, as amended.

Action: Zink/Gilliland, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Zink abstained. Gradin, Mosel, and Rivera absent)

C. Consent Calendar of April 9, and April 16, 2012.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of April 9, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Zink with landscaping reviewed by Gilliland.

Action: Gilliland/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin, Mosel, and Rivera absent)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of April 16, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Zink with landscaping reviewed by Gilliland.

Action: Zink/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin and Rivera absent)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Boughman announced the following changes to the agenda:

a) Item 7, 500 Block of West Anapamu, is postponed to April 30, at the applicant's request.

2. Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:

a) Keith Rivera and Kirk Gradin will be absent from today's meeting.

b) The Semi-annual requirement is in progress. Resignation deadline is Wednesday, April 18. Application deadline is Monday, May 7. Appoints will be made on Tuesday, June 26.

c) The Annual City Advisory Group Workshop will be held on Wednesday, April 25, 2012, from 4:30 p.m. to 5:30 p.m. at the Faulkner Gallery, 40 East Anapamu Street.

3. Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner announced that the Lower Sycamore Creek Channel Widening and Punta Gorda Street Bridge Replacement Bridge Project will return to the ABR on April 30. Ms. Kennedy stated that the ABR has purview over reviewing the project as well as adoption of the Final Mitigated Negative Declaration. Chair Sherry expressed concerns that some issues (i.e. air quality, transportation) are outside of the ABR's purview.

E. Subcommittee Reports. No reports.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 336 N MILPAS ST

C-2 Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-371-021

Application Number: MST2006-00236

Architect: Perkowitz + Ruth Architects

Owner: Fresh & Easy Neighborhood Market

(A revised proposal for a new one-story 11,680 square foot commercial building for Fresh and Easy Neighborhood Market. The proposal includes 51 parking spaces, a voluntary merger of three lots totaling 39,130 square feet, and demolition of three existing non-residential buildings totaling 12,919 square feet. The project will result in a Measure "E" credit of 1,451 square feet.)

(Review of the as-built relocation of perimeter site walls and associated reduction in landscaping planting area. A waiver is requested to provide less than the required depth of the perimeter planters.)

Actual time: 3:16

Present: Chris Perry, Project Manager, Perkowitz + Ruth Architects; Jeremy Salt, Engineer, Penfield & Smith; Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect.

Public comment was opened at 3:22 p.m.

Clark Ortone, adjacent resident to the east, expressed appreciation of Fresh & Easy for relocating the site walls and resolving the problem related to his driveway.

Constantine Frangos, expressed concern that the wall does not comply with the City Council's condition that the wall be less than 6 feet tall on the south side of the property.

Public comment was closed at 3:27 p.m.

Staff comments: Jaime Limon, Design Review Supervisor, provided a background of the appeal to City Council. He explained that it was Council's direction that more sidewalk width be obtained along Milpas Street, and the wall at Mr. Frangos's property line be kept to a maximum of 6 feet height. Mr. Limon stated that inspections were obtained for the relocated site walls, and explained that the wall on the south side of the property does generally comply with City Council direction to be no taller than six feet.

Motion: Approval of the Review After Final with the following comments:
 1. The height of the wall as interpreted by City Planning staff is satisfactory.
 2. A waiver for a reduction of landscaping is supported and proposed landscaping is sufficient.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Rivera absent)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 1255 COAST VILLAGE RD C-1/SD-3 Zone **(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-291-018
 Application Number: MST2011-00220
 Owner: Black Valner LLC
 Applicant: Dudek
 Architect: Cearnal, Andrulaitis

(Proposal to demolish the existing nursery and construct a new three-story mixed use condominium building, comprised of 8,025 square feet of non-residential, and two residential units totaling 3,268 square feet, and a total of 42 covered parking spaces. Planning Commission approvals were granted for a Tentative Subdivision, Development Plan Approval, Coastal Development Permit and zoning modification requests for setback encroachments.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 005-12.)

Actual time: 3:37

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Phil Suding, Landscape Architect.

Suzanne Riegler, Assistant Planner, was available to respond to questions.

Public comment was opened at 3:54 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:
 1. Study screening, or an alternative location for the electrical transformer.
 2. Provide a larger tree in front of the trash enclosure along the east elevation to screen the existing building to the south.
 3. Delineate locations and screening of gas meters.

4. Study lowering the height of the sandstone wall along the Coast Village Circle elevation.
5. Project Compatibility criteria was analyzed with the conclusion that the project does not pose major inconsistencies with the criteria.

Action: Zink/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Rivera absent)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 1820 DE LA VINA ST

R-4 Zone

(4:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-022-022
 Application Number: MST2009-00536
 Owner: Maldonado Living Trust
 Architect: Hochhauser Blatter Architects
 Engineer: Mario Alarcon
 Applicant: Maldonado

(Proposal to construct a new two-story, 22,775 square foot residential care facility for the elderly, to include 40 studio units varying between 294 to 376 square feet, on a proposed 27,217 square foot lot. The proposal involves the demolition of 8,251 square feet of existing on-site development, comprised of five existing residential units and all garages and other related structures, the removal of 7 existing trees, and 2,800 cubic yards of grading. A total of 19 on-site parking spaces are proposed. The project requires Planning Commission approvals were granted for a Voluntary Lot Merger of three lots, a Conditional Use Permit to allow a Residential Care Facility, and three Zoning Modifications for the required common open yard area, a reduction in the required number of parking spaces, and over height walls within the required front setback.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 019-11.)

Actual time: 4:12

Present: Jay Blatter, Architect; David Black, Landscape Architect.

Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, provided project background and was available to respond to questions.

Public comment was opened at 4:26 p.m.

Dawn Barnier, neighbor across the street, expressed concern about the lack of adequate parking spaces for the number of proposed units and about impacts from delivery trucks.

Public comment was closed at 4:29 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval of the architecture and the landscape and return to Full Board for in-progress review with the following comments:

1. Project Compatibility criteria was analyzed with the conclusion that the project does not pose major inconsistencies with the criteria, with the following comments:
 - a) project blends with the neighborhood; b) detail is a wonderful craftsman style; c) compatible with the architectural character; d) appropriate size bulk, and scale; and e) preserves the Oak tree.
2. Study the relationship between the window head heights and the corbel bracket detail on the gabled elevations.

3. Study having deeper roof overhangs, 30-36 inches is suggested if it complies with side yard setback encroachment requirements.
4. Provide cut sheets of proposed exterior lights keeping in character with the structure.
5. Provide screening of the transformer.
6. Study ways to recess the windows to create a deeper shadow line. Also study the scale of the window trim.
7. Project design approval of the landscape with the condition to provide landscaping at the front at each side of driveway. The plans with a curved sidewalk with seven trees along the south elevation are approved. No flagstone or active use under the oak tree.
8. The proposed monument sign will be reviewed by the Sign Committee and is not a part of this approval.
9. Carry forward the Oak tree protection measures from the Planning Commission Resolution No. 019-11:
 1. **Oak Tree Protection Measures.** The landscape plan and grading plan shall include the following oak tree protection measures, intended to minimize impacts on the existing oak tree:
 - a. Mulch dripline with four to five inches of wood chips (keep off tree base) to improve soil conditions and minimize future soil compaction.
 - b. Install Oak compatible plantings within the Oak dripline. Keep number minimal and use smaller pot sizes.
 - c. Incorporate hardscape materials and design that minimize root compaction, and promote water percolation and gas exchange.
 - d. No irrigation system shall be installed within three feet of the dripline of any oak tree.
 - e. The use of herbicides or fertilizer shall be prohibited within the drip line of any oak tree.
 - f. Contract with a Certified Arborist to inspect tree before, during and after development.
 - g. During Construction:
 - Deep root aerate and fertilize Oak root zone prior to construction to improve soil conditions and promote healthy generation of new foliage and roots.
 - Install temporary six-foot tall chain link fence five feet beyond the dripline as feasible, and in no case closer than the edge of the dripline, prior to project commencement.
 - Designate tree dripline as a “no dump, wash or staging area” during construction.
 - No heavy equipment, storage of materials or parking shall take place within five (5) feet of the dripline of the oak tree.
 - If any excavation is required beneath the dripline of the oak tree, a qualified Arborist shall be present. All excavation within the dripline of the tree shall be minimized and shall be done with hand tools. Any roots encountered shall be cleanly cut and sealed with a tree-seal compound. Any root pruning and trimming shall be done under the direction of a qualified Arborist.

Action: Zink/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Rivera absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 1130 N MILPAS ST****E-1/R-3 Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00551
 Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
 Architect: Steve Carter
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new 2,210 square foot (net) one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,430 cubic yards of cut and 600 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on February 21, 2012.)

Actual time: 4:50

Present: Trish Allen, Agent; Steve Carter, Architect; Guillermo Gonzalez, Landscape Architect.

Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, was available to respond to questions.

Public comment was opened at 5:02 p.m.

Peggy Martens, spoke in favor of the project. Ms. Martens appreciated that the turnaround has been enlarged.

Public comment was closed at 5:03 p.m.

Failed

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the comment to redesign the project to be less contemporary, incorporating more of the building forms found elsewhere on the property.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 2/3/0. Motion failed. (Gilliland, Poole, Sherry opposed. Gradin/Rivera absent)

Substitute

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

1. Study additional methods of designing the building to be more compatible with the existing Drier Administration building, by either incorporating additional material and/or color choices from elsewhere on the site and surrounding neighborhood.
2. The proposed Queen Palms may not be compatible with the site. Use an irregular planting pattern for the Oak trees.
3. Study the possibility of utilizing various roof materials and forms from the site and surrounding neighborhood.

Action Gilliland/Poole, 3/1/1. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, Sherry abstained. Gradin/Rivera absent.)

FINAL REVIEW**5. 3707 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-590-024
 Application Number: MST2011-00304
 Owner: McColm Family Trust
 Applicant: Kerr Project Services
 Business Name: Chick- Fil-A
 Architect: CRHO

(Proposal to remodel existing building and convert from Burger King to Chick-Fil-A restaurant. Existing drive-thru to remain. Remodeled outdoor seating with new furniture. Replace existing landscaping, new paint and stucco covering existing brick areas, two new trellises over patio dining areas, ADA upgrades and parking relocated. Some parking paving to be replaced with permeable paving. Replace all windows and doors, three new clerestory windows in kitchen, new exterior lighting, remove two signs that were integrated into the building walls.)

Actual time: 5:24

Present: Deborah Kerr, Applicant.

Public comment was opened at 5:36 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: how many members are concerned with the contemporary light fixture? 3/2 (majority).

Motion: Final Approval of the project and return to Consent for review of the details with the following comments:

1. Provide a less aggressive vine for the trellis.
2. Relocate the Cassia tree forward into the front yard.
3. Select a more traditional exterior light fixture appropriate to the style of architecture.
4. Eliminate the window plaster surround at the drive through window.
5. Select a stain instead of the opaque paint for the trellis.
6. Incorporate irrigation and planting details and water compliance statement on the plans.

Action: Poole/Zink, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Rivera absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 400 W PUEBLO ST (COTTAGE HOSPITAL)****SP-8 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-100-001
 Application Number: MST2012-00091
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital
 Agent: Sac Wireless Engineering Group

(Proposal for a new wireless communications facility for Verizon Wireless. The proposal consists of a new 336 square foot, 8 foot tall equipment platform enclosure on the hospital roof, a new 49 square foot, 8-foot tall antenna screening enclosure on the existing penthouse roof to contain six new wireless antennas, and three new antennas mounted on the exterior of the penthouse.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires a finding of no adverse visual impacts and compatibility analysis.)

Actual time: 5:53

Present: Trisha Knight, Verizon Wireless

Public comment was opened at 5:58 p.m.

Eric Lassen, expressed concern that the current proposal was not considered with overall project.

Public comment was closed at 5:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Provide a design that includes all proposed antennas at a height no greater than the existing mechanical penthouse. It is suggested to relocate the three antenna arrays on three sides of the existing mechanical penthouse.
2. Conceal all proposed antennas.
3. Conceal all exposed cable trays, either interior to the building or with an appropriate architectural solution.

Action: Zink/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Rivera absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 500 BLOCK W ANAPAMU

(6:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-010-0RW
Application Number: MST2012-00118
Owner: Caltrans
Agent: Margaret Chang

(Proposal to replace two existing 35-foot tall AT&T cellular antenna monopoles. The diameter of one monopole would increase from 19 inches to 24 inches; the diameter of the other monopole would increase from 19 inches to 30 inches. The increase will accommodate replacement of the three existing antennas in each. Heights will not exceed the existing approved 35 feet. Equipment cabinets would be added within existing fenced lease area located under the pedestrian bridge.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires a finding of no visual impacts.)

Postponed to April 30, 2012 at the applicant's request.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:07 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

Representatives present: Gilliland and Zink
Staff present: Boughman

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**A. 3230 STATE ST C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-332-030
Application Number: MST2012-00050
Owner: Victor W. and Susan M. Schaff
Architect: J. Michael Holliday

(Proposal for alterations to an existing commercial building. The project consists of a new ADA accessible ramp, parking, walkway; new rooftop mechanical equipment with new screening, minor window changes, a 20 square foot addition and new planters.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued one week with the following comments: 1) Concept is approvable; 2) provide a color board; 3) provide a plant list with botanical and common name, quantity, and sizes; 4) minimum plant sizes as noted on the plan, otherwise one gallon; 5) provide valve locations, type, and details; 6) provide backflow device location and type; 7) provide planting details.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**B. 1711 & 1713 LOMA STREET R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-153-008
Application Number: MST2011-00460
Owner: William C. Haack
Designer: Debra Sorensen
Engineer: Kevin Vandervort

(Proposal for alterations to the existing two-story duplex including window replacement, minor roof alterations, change siding to stucco, remove front fences, new metal railings, new privacy screen at the front of the building, replace east side fence, expansion of driveway at rear and repaving with pavers, new retaining wall at rear, and expand second story decks at rear. The Staff Hearing officer approved zoning modifications for alterations to the building within the front setback, the new railing to exceed 3.5 feet within ten feet of the front lot line and along the garage, and for a reduction of required open yard area under Resolution No. 010-12.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 010-12.)

Continued one week with the following comments:

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**C. 329 S SALINAS ST****C-P/R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-262-011
Application Number: MST2012-00127
Owner: Hutton Foundation
Architect: Robert Miller

(Proposal for a new ADA ramp and handrail in front of an existing commercial building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval as noted on the plans, with the following comments: 1) create a curving transition;
2) line up the new curb with existing curb, or eliminate the necessity of the new curb.