



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

Monday, May 16, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair
 CLAY AURELL
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
 GARY MOSEL
 KEITH RIVERA
 PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE)

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

BRUCE BARTLETT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE)

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final ABR approval.
- Concept review comments are generally valid for one year. Per SBMC 22.68.110, a project design approval is valid for three years from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted or a building permit has been issued. Projects with a valid land use approval will also automatically extend the project design approval expiration date.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470, extension 4577. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman, at 805-564-5470, extension 4539, or by email at tboughman@santabarbaraca.gov. office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. On Thursday, May 12, 2011, the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
- B. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at Noon and the following Monday at 9:00 a.m. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Manson-Hing.

Members present: Aurell, Gilliland, Manson-Hing (left at 5:02), Mosel (arrived at 3:06), Rivera, Sherry, Zink

Members absent: None

Staff present: Boughman, Shafer

- A. Public Comment: No public comment.
- B. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of Monday, May 2, 2011.
- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of May 2, 2011, as submitted.
- Action: Rivera/Aurell, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing abstained, Mosel absent)
- C. Consent Calendar.
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of May 16, 2011. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gilliland
- Action: Aurell/Rivera, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel absent)
- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. Mr. Gilliland and Mr. Aurell announced that they will step down from item #1, 903 W. Mission St.
 2. Mr. Manson-Hing announced that he will be leaving at 5:00 p.m.
 3. Mr. Boughman reported that the project at 740 Dolores has been withdrawn.
- E. Subcommittee Reports.
- None.

FINAL REVIEW**1. 903 W MISSION ST****R-2 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-113-009
 Application Number: MST2009-00388
 Owner: Heidi Feguson
 Architect: AB Design Studio
 Architect: Kenneth & Harbaugh

(Revised proposal to construct a new 525 square foot second-story accessory dwelling unit above a new 623 square foot, three-car garage on a 5,000 square foot lot. The proposal includes demolition of the existing 317 square foot non-conforming garage, and a 25 square foot covered porch to the existing main residence, and a 32 square foot addition to the main residence. The project will result in an 876 square foot main residence, a 525 square foot new accessory dwelling unit and a new 623 square foot three-car garage. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to provide less than the required 600 square feet of open yard and to allow the garage to encroach into the required 20-foot front-yard setback.)

(Project was last reviewed on March 7, 2011.)

Actual time: 3:07

Present: Josh Blummer and Anthon Ellis, AB Design Studio; Heidi Ferguson, Owner.

Public comment was opened at 3:19 p.m.

Mercedes Greenburg, Mimi Greenburg, David Jenkins ceded their speaking time to Pam Brandon.

1. Pam Brandon, opposed to reinstatement of the previously voided project design approval, lack of new noticing, storage space in garage is located within setback, and lack of neighborhood compatibility (submitted a petition containing signatures of 40 neighbors opposed to the project).
2. Sue Young, spoke in support of the project. Ms. Young stated that 76 signatures in support of the project were obtained (signatures were not submitted).
3. Diane Soto, representing Upper Westside Neighborhood Association, spoke in opposition to the lack of neighborhood compatibility (submitted a letter containing nine signatures of neighbors opposed to the project).
4. Wayne Dorfman, opposed to lack of compatibility of the proposed materials and lack of neighborhood compatibility.
5. Russell Clay Ruiz, opposed to erosion of the neighborhood's Spanish style architecture.
6. Kellam DeForest, opposed to the industrial style and the metal material's incompatibility with the neighborhood.

Mr. Boughman acknowledged nine letters received in support and four letters opposed to the project.

Public comment was closed at 3:45 p.m.

Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner provided clarification of the project's previously voided and subsequent reinstated Project Design Approval. Ms. Brodison responded to questions from the Board.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Rivera/Sherry, 3/1/1. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, Zink abstained, Aurell and Gilliland stepped down.)

FINAL REVIEW**2. 512 BATH ST**

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-161-035
Application Number: MST2009-00469
Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(The project consists of the demolition of an existing two-story, ten-unit apartment building and carport, and the construction of a two and three-story apartment complex on a 1.10 acre lot by the Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara. The proposal includes 53 studio efficiency apartments ranging in size between 320 and 445 square feet, affordable to very low- and low-income households to be occupied by tenants with special needs and downtown workers, one two-bedroom 921 square foot managers apartment, two 138 square foot laundry rooms, a 610 square foot recreation room, and a 1,432 square foot community center, 13 covered and 17 uncovered automobile parking spaces, and 29 covered and 6 uncovered bicycle parking spaces. The project also includes a transfer of funds from the Housing Authority to the City of Santa Barbara for construction of a portion of the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval for requested zoning modifications for lot area, parking, distance between buildings, and an interior setback encroachment on 6/16/10 (Resolution No. 029-10).

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 008-10. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2011.)

Actual time: 4:07

Present: Bonnie Sangster, Piekert Group Architects; David Black, Landscape Architect; Skip Symanski, Deputy Director, Housing Authority.

Public comment was opened at 4:16 p.m.

Eddie Harris, Santa Barbara Urban Creeks Council: explained concerns about development near the creek; suggested elevating the area for platform viewing.

Public comment was closed at 4:18 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 5/2/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing and Mosel opposed.)

The Board recessed at 4:26 p.m. and reconvened at 4:28 p.m.

FINAL REVIEW**3. 3761 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-053
 Application Number: MST2011-00093
 Owner: Regency Centers, LP
 Designer: Deborah English
 Architect: Cearnal, Andrulaitis

(Proposal for a partial facade remodel for Whole Foods.)

Actual time: 4:28

Present: Deborah English, DL English Design.

Public comment was opened at 4:33 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:
 1) Study the smaller arches at the front elevation; look for ways to widen the arches slightly. Simplify the top of the arches.
 2) Study the area at the transition between the trellis and roof.
 3) Provide construction details.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 5/0/2. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing and Sherry abstained.)

The Board recessed at 4:43 and reconvened at 4:44 p.m. Vice Chair Sherry presided over the remainder of the meeting.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 215 PESETAS LN****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-203-003
 Application Number: MST2011-00166
 Owner: Sansum-Santa Barbara Medical Foundation
 Architect: Darci Hernandez
 Agent: Trish Allen

(Proposal to demolish and remodel the first-floor entry canopy, vestibule, lobby and lab. The project includes a 250 square foot addition to the lobby and 6,444 square feet of remodel on the first floor of the existing building at the entry, lobby, reception, and lab. A temporary office lab trailer would be located on site to maintain operations during construction. This project also includes permitting the existing 376 square foot MRI trailer to permanently remain on site.)

(Second review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2011.)

Actual time: 4:44

Present: Trish Allen, Agent; Darci Hernandez, Architect; Paul Jaconette, Sansum Foundation.

Public comment was opened at 4:53 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:
- 1) The alternate white, tube steel and glass canopy design is preferred. Provide continuity of detailing for review.
 - 2) The landscape design is moving in a positive direction. Additional seating and waiting areas adjacent to the entry and existing picnic area are encouraged.
 - 3) The tall green screen at the MRI trailer is not acceptable. Study a combination of landscaping and fixed site elements to screen the trailer; consider lowering the trailer parking space to minimize visible height. Provide screening from all sides.
- Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing absent [left at 5:02].)

SCHEDULED RECESS

The Board recessed at 5:33 and reconvened at 5:52 p.m.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 27 E COTA ST

C-M Zone

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-033
 Application Number: MST2011-00146
 Owner: The Lyon Building
 Applicant: Tricia Knight
 Architect: Omni Design Group
 Owner: Lyon Building

(Proposal for the installation of an additional wireless communications facility consisting of 12 new roof mounted antennas for AT&T Mobility. The existing rooftop HVAC screening enclosure will be extended to screen the new antennas.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires a finding of No Visual Impact. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2011.)

Actual time: 5:52

Present: Tricia Knight, Applicant.

Public comment was opened at 5:55 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion: Project Design Approval as submitted with the finding of no visual impact; and continued to Consent Calendar for final approval.
- Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell stepped down; Manson-Hing absent)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 513 GARDEN ST****C-M Zone**

(6:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-009
Application Number: MST2010-00168
Architect: Barry Winick
Owner: Macy Cornerstone LLC
Architect: Mark Macy

(Proposal for a two-story, mixed-used project consisting of 2,730 square feet of new commercial space and 3,600 square feet of new residential space in nine residential studio units. The existing 1,144 square foot commercial building will remain on the 14,500 square foot lot.)

(Project requires Development Plan Approval findings and compliance with Conditions of Approval document. Project was last reviewed on January 10, 2011.)

Actual time: 5:58

Present: Mark Macy, Architect; Allan Macy, Owner; David Black, Landscape Architect.

Public comment was opened at 6:08 p.m.

Ginny Brush, Executive Director of the County Arts Commission: spoke in favor of the project.

Public comment was closed at 6:09 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval in consideration of Compatibility Analysis criteria as stated in Subsection 22.22.145.B and 22.68.045.B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and with the finding that the Development Plan Approval findings have been met as stated in Subsection 28.87.300.D of the City of the SBMC, and return to the Full Board with the following comments and conditions:

- 1) Development Plan Findings:
 - a. The proposed development complies with all provisions of this Title; and
 - b. The proposed development is consistent with the principles of sound community planning; and
 - c. The proposed development will not have a significant adverse impact upon the neighborhood's aesthetics/character in that the size, bulk or scale of the development will be compatible with the neighborhood; and
 - d. The proposed development will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact upon City and South Coast affordable housing stock; and
 - e. The proposed development will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact on the City's water resources; and
 - f. The proposed development will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact on the City's traffic; and
 - g. Resources will be available and traffic improvements will be in place at the time of project occupancy.
- 2) Staff to verify that project's design includes all recommendations contained in the Archaeological Report, Drainage Report, Regional Water Quality Board letter, and the Geotechnical Report.
- 3) Lower the building mass at the north stairs to be similar to the mass at the south elevation stairs.
- 4) Study additional opportunities for more plant material, especially at the street front entry area.

- 5) Study and incorporate architectural features to added variety, scale and texture to the site walls.
- 6) Provide venting or remove the trash enclosure roof.
- 7) Consider the impact of trees along the south property line to the solar panels.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Zink opposed, Manson-Hing absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

7. 530 W COTA ST

R-3 Zone

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-102-024
 Application Number: MST2011-00124
 Owner: Terri Trevillian
 Agent: Mark Morando

(Proposal to replace a 48-inch tall section of CMU wall along San Pascual Street, replace railroad ties with a CMU wall not to exceed 36 inches in height along Cota and San Pascual Streets, install a new 5-foot wood fence 14.5 feet in length at the northeast property line. Zoning modifications are required for the CMU wall at San Pascual Street to exceed 42 inches in height at the front property line and for the new 5-foot wood fence to exceed 8 feet in height when its height is combined with existing retaining walls at the property lines. The project will address violations in ENF2010-00315.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of modifications. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2011.)

Actual time: 6:36

Present: Mark Morando, Agent.

Public comment was opened at 6:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The modification poses no aesthetic impacts, and is technical in nature.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell abstained, Manson-Hing absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 130 S ALISOS ST

R-3 Zone

(7:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-212-014
 Application Number: MST2011-00194
 Owner: Ed St. George
 Architect: Justin Van Mullem

(Proposal for a new two-story residential building with a 941 square foot four-car garage, and one dwelling unit consisting of 312 square feet of habitable space on the first floor and 1,156 square feet of habitable space on the second floor. There are one single-family dwelling, one triplex, and a carport to remain on the property. A new driveway and two new uncovered parking spaces are also proposed.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 6:45

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 6:50 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Study introducing more articulation in the massing, particularly at the two street elevations.
- 2) Study the proposed materials at east elevation.
- 3) Resolve noise issues for the outdoor living area.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan that addresses the two street frontages.

Action: Zink/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing absent)

The Full Board was adjourned at 7:08 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

Representatives present: Chris Gilliland

Staff present: Tony Boughman

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM

A. 3111 STATE ST P-R/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-112-018
 Application Number: MST2011-00181
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Cameron Benson

(Proposal to install permeable paving in portions of the MacKenzie Park parking lot to replace existing asphalt paving.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval with conditions: 1) Urban Forestry Superintendent to choose tree species for three new trees. 2) The concrete border is to match the color of the pavers.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW

B. VISTA DEL CAMPO E-1/PUD Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-400-014
 Application Number: MST2011-00170
 Owner: Vista Del Campo Properties Ltd
 Landscape Architect: Charles McClure
 Applicant: Elaine Jewell

(Proposal for a new landscaping plan for the eastern portion of Vista del Campo from Portsuello Road to the first up hill driveway in the area of units 2219 and 2209.)

(Final approval of landscape plan is requested.)

Public comment speakers: Michael Marans, Mary Jo McGrath, and Emma Lou Diemer.

Final approval of landscape plan with conditions: 1) Tree number 14 note number 1 is to be removed from the plans because lowering the height of the tree to the roofline of 2209 Vista Del Campo would be significantly altering the tree. 2) The basic existing shape of Tree number 14 is to remain and be slightly lowered and rounded to accommodate views while maintaining privacy between 2219 and 2209 Vista Del Campo. Low branches may be pruned on the uphill side near the bougainvillea hedge. A licensed arborist shall be present during the first pruning in May 2011 to see that best management practices are followed and that no more than 25% of the tree's biomass is removed. Pruning of Tree number 14 thereafter must only maintain its size and shape and be done by a licensed tree trimmer. 3) The condition of Project Design Approval that required owners of 2209 and 2219 Vista Del Campo be present during pruning is eliminated.

ABR - NEW ITEM

C. 4200 CALLE REAL

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 059-240-020
Application Number: MST2011-00201
Agent: Juan Diaz
Owner: St. Vincent's

(Add 61 linear feet of sidewalk within existing landscaped area to connect the parking lot with the senior housing building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.