



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

Monday, February 7, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair
- DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair
- CLAY AURELL
- CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
- GARY MOSEL
- KEITH RIVERA
- PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE)

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

BRUCE BARTLETT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE)

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
- TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
- GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final ABR approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. Project Design Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman, at 805-564-5470 extension 4539, or by email at tboughman@santabarbaraca.gov. office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. On Wednesday, February 2, 2011, the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at Noon and the following Monday at 9:00 a.m. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m. by Manson-Hing.

Members present: Aurell (in at 3:12), Gilliland, Manson-Hing, Mosel, Rivera, Sherry (in at 3:15), Zink (in at 3:09)

Members absent: None

Staff present: Boughman, Shafer

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of January 24, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of January 24, 2011, as submitted.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry, Aurell, Zink absent)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of January 31, 2011. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Clay Aurell with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry, Aurell, Zink absent)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of February 7, 2011. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Clay Aurell with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Gilliland/Mosel, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry, Aurell, Zink absent)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Gilliland announced that he will step down from Item 7, 735 W. Micheltorena St.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No reports.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. U.S. HIGHWAY 101 AT SALINAS STREET**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 099-MSC-PW
Application Number: MST2004-00701
Owner: City of Santa Barbara and State of California
Applicant: Michael Sandeck, Caltrans

(This is a request of Caltrans to perform operational improvements between Milpas Street and Hot Springs and Cabrillo Boulevard. The project is a wetland mitigation site situated on Parks and Recreation property consisting of approximately 400 cubic yards of soil and concrete rubble removal to be replaced with landscaping and irrigation. The project requires Planning Commission approval for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Review After Final to amend the approved Coastal Development Permit for the Highway 101 Milpas to Hot Springs/Cabrillo Operational Improvements Project, to widen Highway 101 to three lanes in the vicinity of the Salinas Street on/off-ramps. The project will require the reduction or elimination of previously improved landscaping in the median (between the northbound and southbound lanes) and the area adjacent to the new soundwalls. The project also includes relocation of a portion of the soundwall near the end of the offramp and installation of guard railings. Project requires Compatibility Analysis comments and Planning Commission review to amend a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 3:07

Present: David Beard, Project Manager; David Emerson, Landscape Architect; Jim Porano, Design Manager

Mr. Beard provided background information about the project and responded to questions from board members.

Public comment was opened at 3:36 p.m.

Philip Suding, opposed: concerned about the median reduction and lack of design exception for the corridor.

Caroline Klein, opposed: concerned about the negative construction impacts of her property and safety.

Fatima Nurray, opposed to the added lane and the spending public funds for construction.

Public comment was closed.

Phil Suding: clarified that what is being called the third lane was designed as a transition lane onto Hot Springs.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

The project is not supportable as presented. The proposal is not consistent with the aesthetic design guidelines for the Salinas Street portion of Highway 101 as a gateway into the City.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 535 E MONTECITO ST****M-1 Zone**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-351-010
Application Number: MST2006-00530
Architect: William Hezmalhalch Architects Inc.
Applicant: Bill McReynolds
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly Rogers
Owner: City Ventures

(The proposal is a redesign of a project previously approved by the Planning Commission. The proposed project consists of 48 residential condominium units in 4 two- and three-story buildings, on a 1.8-acre vacant lot. The size of the residential units would vary, ranging between 994 and 2,086 square feet. Each of the four buildings would contain twelve residential units and would have individual courtyards. All units would have a two-car garage, with a mix of side by side configuration and tandem configuration. Four guest parking spaces would be provided, resulting in a total of 100 on-site parking spaces. Vehicle access would be provided from both East Montecito Street and Calle Cesar Chavez. Forty of the 48 units would be sold as below-market rate units. A 14-foot wide shared access easement is provided along the western perimeter of the project site. The prior approvals consisted of a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Modification to provide less than the required amount of guest parking and City Council approval of a Specific Plan (SP-10). The redesigned project received a Substantial Conformance Determination at the Planning Commission on 11/19/2009.

(Fourth review of Review After Final for addition of roof-mounted solar panels on all buildings and change of roof material.)

Actual time: 4:21

Present: Thierry Alicourtis, Project Manager; Bill McReynolds, Applicant.

Public comment was opened at 4:34 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued one week to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Provide tile substitution specifications. Provide material samples and details for the third floor roof.
- 2) Provide solar panel dimensions on the plans.
- 3) Ready for final approval on Consent Calendar.

Action: Aurell/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**3. 29 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-123-014
 Application Number: MST2009-00259
 Owner: McDonalds Corporation
 Architect: Elord Fajardo

(Proposal for a façade remodel and a 300 square foot addition at the existing McDonald's Restaurant. The addition will result in a 4,497 square foot building (including the existing 1,305 square foot basement) on a 26,212 square foot lot in the C-2 Zone. The existing 47 parking spaces and landscaping will remain.)

(Review After Final to address violations in ENF2010-00334 with a proposal to remove as-built lighting mounted on the building and provide pole-mounted parking lot lighting, and review of landscaping.)

Actual time: 4:49

Present: David Peterson, McDonald's Corporation; Cherry Protacio, Architect.

Motion: Continued four weeks back to the Full Board with the comment to return with a revised lighting design.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The Board recessed from 4:57 p.m. until 5:02 p.m.

FINAL REVIEW**4. 136 S HOPE AVE B-10****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-007
 Application Number: MST2010-00165
 Business Name: GNC
 Agent: Permits Today
 Architect: Ryan Mills, DMA
 Owner: Macerich La Cumbre, LLC

(Proposal for minor facade alterations and new rooftop equipment at an existing tenant space in the La Cumbre Plaza. Project requires compliance with the La Cumbre Plaza Tenant Design Criteria.)

Actual time: 5:02

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 5:09 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1) Return the parapet moulding on the Foot Locker canopy to the proposed GNC façade.
- 2) Show a 45 degree tile at the corner of the parking lot elevation.

Action: Zink/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

** The Board recessed from 5:19 until 5:20 p.m.**

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

5. 226 S VOLUNTARIO ST

R-3 Zone

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-252-013
Application Number: MST2010-00381
Architect: On Design
Owner: Ed St. George

(Proposal for a new three-story 2,439 square foot single residential unit with attached 327 square foot one-car garage and a new 478 square foot two-car garage at the rear of a site currently developed with two detached single residential units.)

(Requires Project Compatibility Analysis.)

Actual time: 5:20

Present: Justin Van Mullen, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 5:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval of the project with the finding that the Compatibility Analysis criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.22.14.B and 22.68.045.B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued one week to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Revise window details showing recessed windows.
- 2) Terminate the north elevation porch with a shed roof.
- 3) Verify and use the same spacing for the board and batten.
- 4) Provide a final landscape plan to include quantities and sizes. Provide an irrigation plan with water compliance statement.
- 5) Relocate the Acacia tree away from existing hedge.
- 6) Reduce the quantity of Happy Wanderer vines under the Arbutus tree.
- 9) Project is ready for final on Consent Calendar.

Action: Sherry/Gilliland, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 1226 E MONTECITO ST****R-2 Zone**

(6:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-062-007
 Application Number: MST2011-00034
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Architect: On Design

(Proposal for a new 782 square foot one-story residential dwelling unit and 500 square foot attached two-car garage to be attached to an existing 1,279 square foot one-story single-family dwelling to create a duplex. An existing detached two-car garage will be demolished. The existing 1,297 square foot one-story single-family dwelling and 475 square foot detached two-car carport will remain on the 11,667 square foot lot. The project will address violations in ENF2010-00756 by replacing the required parking spaces.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 5:46

Present: Justin Van Mullen, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 5:51 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Overall the board supports the site plan and mass, bulk, and scale.
- 2) Study shifting the new unit to create more separation/distinction from the two masses on either side.
- 3) Study the proportions and architectural detailing of new units entry porch.
- 4) Consider the architectural definition and relation between the 3 architectural forms. More alike or more dissimilar, or justification why they are so articulated.
- 5) One board member is not comfortable with the height of the garage; perhaps resolution of the pieces will address the garage.

Action: Rivera/Sherry, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Zink abstained.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 735 W MICHELTORENA ST****R-2 Zone**

(6:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-032-001
 Application Number: MST2010-00293
 Owner: Elias Khoury
 Architect: Sherry and Associates Architects

(Proposal for a 736 square foot two-story addition to an existing 530 square foot one-story single-family residence that was damaged by fire. The residence would be attached to the existing one-story 1,570 square foot commercial building. Staff Hearing Officer review of zoning modifications is requested for the project to encroach into the interior setback and rear setback, and to provide less than the required open yard area.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 6:12

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 6:26 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Mr. Boughman reported that Staff does not support the requested modifications.

Motion: Continued two weeks back to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The quality of architecture and setbacks with design changes are appreciated.
- 2) Remove the skylight over the bedroom dormer on the east elevation.
- 3) Provide composite elevation along Chino Street showing the market to remain and showing the market as it appears from public view.
- 4) The requested modifications pose no aesthetic impacts.
- 5) Provide heights and uses of the surrounding area.
- 6) Provide composite elevations of all surrounding areas, and photographs of the adjacent area.
- 7) Study the relationship of the dormers on the east elevation.
- 8) Study having a shed roof above the entry porch versus the gable.
- 9) Indicate materials on the elevation.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland and Sherry stepped down.)

ADJOURNMENT

The Full Board meeting was adjourned at 7:40 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

Representatives present: Aurell and Gilliland

Staff present: Boughman

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 3825 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014

Application Number: MST2010-00355

Owner: Nettleship Family Trust

Architect: DMA

(Proposal for a new ground mounted automated teller machine (ATM) that will be attached to the wall of the building within La Cumbre Plaza Mall.)

(Review After Final to add a stucco surround to the approved ground-mounted automatic teller machine.)

Review After Final approved as submitted.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 1600 ANACAPA ST R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-191-007
Application Number: MST2011-00038
Owner: Robert C. and Helen E. Wiley Trust
Architect: Chris Manson-Hing

(Proposal to repair and resurface exterior walkways, entry court and steps. Also proposed is to add new handrail to existing exterior steps.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**C. 608 ANACAPA ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-151-017
Application Number: MST2010-00362
Owner: Jason D. Leggitt
Architect: James Wilson

(Proposal to create a new exterior patio for outdoor dining. Proposed is a new exterior door and openable windows, new outdoor patio furniture including tables, chairs and umbrellas, and a new landscape plan. The project will address violations in ENF2010-00811.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Postponed one week to Consent Calendar.

ABR - NEW ITEM**D. 2320 BATH ST C-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-112-020
Application Number: MST2011-00046
Applicant: The Cancer Foundation 3T MRI Suite
Applicant: Advanced Medical Builders
Owner: Pueblo Medical Commons

(Proposal to add a vertical wall duct for HVAC on the exterior of the existing three-story medical office building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the condition to stack the HVAC pipes to reduce the width of chase to 18" maximum x 10" deep.