



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

Monday, January 24, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:
 CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair
 CLAY AURELL
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
 GARY MOSEL
 KEITH RIVERA
 PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE)

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE)

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final ABR approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. Project Design Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman, at 805-564-5470 extension 4539, or by email at tboughman@santabarbaraca.gov. office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. On Thursday, January 20, 2011, the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at Noon and the following Monday at 9:00 a.m. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Manson-Hing.

Members present: Aurell (left at 4:10), Gilliland, Manson-Hing, Mosel, Rivera (left at 5:51), Sherry, Zink (left at 5:10)

Members absent: None

Staff present: Boughman, Limon (out at 3:23), Shafer

- A. Election of Officers: Mr. Manson-Hing opened nominations for the offices of Chair and Vice-Chair.

Members Manson-Hing and Aurell were nominated for office of Chair. Mr. Manson-Hing was elected by paper ballot vote.

Member Sherry was nominated for office of Vice- Chair and elected by unanimous voice vote.

- B. Consent Calendar and Subcommittee Appointments. Additions and changes from last year as follows:

Liaisons:

ABR Consent Calendar: Rivera appointed; Mosel stepped down; Gilliland continues to serve.

VAPP: Mosel appointed, with Zink continuing to serve.

Ad-Hoc Subcommittees:

Lower Mission Creek Design: Mosel appointed, with Manson-Hing continuing to serve.

Boysel bike path (new subcommittee): Gilliland appointed.

- C. Public Comment: No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of January 10, 2011, as submitted.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of January 24, 2011. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Clay Aurell with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Boughman reported that Item 2, 29 N. Milpas Street, has been postponed to February 7, at the applicant's request.

2. Boardmembers made the following announcements:

a) Mr. Aurell reported that he will step down from Item 1, 432 W. Islay Street.

b) Mr. Zink reported that he will leave at approximately 5:00 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. Gilliland provided a report on the Hwy 101 Subcommittee which looked at two options illustrating the effects of landscaping removal due to proposed additions of a third lane and a sound wall.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**1. 432 W ISLAY ST****R-4 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-011-016

Application Number: MST2005-00512

Owner: Perry Family Trust

Architect: Brian Nelson

Agent: Mike Gones

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,771 square foot single-family residence, garage, and accessory structure, and construct a new three unit, two-story, two-bedroom, 5,007 square foot residential condominium development on a 7,250 square foot lot adjacent to Mission Creek. The 5,007 square foot development is comprised of three residential units at 1,268 square feet, 1,172 square feet, and 1,256 square feet; three 400 square foot, attached two-car garages (1,200 square foot total); three 28 square foot storage areas (84 square foot total), and three 9 square foot trash enclosure areas (27 square foot total). A total of 1,095 cubic yards of grading is proposed, primarily involving fill and recompaction. The project requires review by the Planning Commission for a Tentative Subdivision Map and three requested zoning modifications for encroachment into the front and interior setbacks, and to allow a fence to exceed the maximum 3.5 foot height in the front setback.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map and requested Modifications.)

Actual time: 3:23

Present: Brian Nelson, Architect; Jack Kiesel, Landscape Architect; Faith Perry, Owner.

Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, clarified Staff's position regarding the requested modifications.

Public comment was opened at 3:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:**
1. Project compatibility analysis is as follows:
 - a. The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
 - b. The project's design is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood.
 - c. The project's mass, size, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood, given compliance with the comments provided here.
 - d. There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or nearby designated historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, or natural features.
 - e. The project's design does not block established public views of mountains or ocean.
 - f. The project's design provides an acceptable/appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
 2. The Board is pleased with the well-articulated design. The modifications will have no negative aesthetic impacts and are reasonable given the additional setback at the creek.
 3. Study the roof cover at entry to unit B for more weather protection.
 4. Study reducing the amount of entry paving to unit A.
 5. Provide examples for the planted paver system.
- Action: Rivera/Sherry, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Zink opposed, Aurell stepped down.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

2. 29 N MILPAS ST

C-2 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-123-014
 Application Number: MST2009-00259
 Owner: McDonalds Corporation
 Architect: Elord Fajardo

(Proposal for a façade remodel and a 300 square foot addition at the existing McDonald's Restaurant. The addition will result in a 4,497 square foot building (including the existing 1,305 square foot basement) on a 26,212 square foot lot in the C-2 Zone. The existing 47 parking spaces and landscaping will remain.

(Review After Final to address violations in ENF2010-00334 with a proposal to remove as-built lighting mounted on the building and provide pole-mounted parking lot lighting, and review of landscaping.)

Postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

FINAL REVIEW**3. 535 E MONTECITO ST****M-1 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-351-010
Application Number: MST2006-00530
Architect: William Hezmalhalch Architects Inc.
Applicant: Bill McReynolds
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly Rogers
Owner: City Ventures

(The proposal is a redesign of a project previously approved by the Planning Commission. The proposed project consists of 48 residential condominium units in four, two- and three-story buildings, on a 1.8-acre vacant lot. The size of the residential units would vary, ranging between 994 and 2,086 square feet. Each of the four buildings would contain twelve residential units and would have individual courtyards. All units would have a two-car garage, with a mix of side by side configuration and tandem configuration. Four guest parking spaces would be provided, resulting in a total of 100 on-site parking spaces. Vehicle access would be provided from both East Montecito Street and Calle Cesar Chavez. Forty of the 48 units would be sold as below-market rate units. A 14-foot wide shared access easement is provided along the western perimeter of the project site. The prior approvals consisted of a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Modification to provide less than the required amount of guest parking and City Council approval of a Specific Plan (SP-10). The redesigned project received a Substantial Conformance Determination at the Planning Commission on 11/19/2009.)

(Review After Final for addition of roof-mounted solar panels on all buildings and change of roof material.)

Actual time: 4:09

Present: Thierry Alicourtis, Project Manager, SunPower Corporation.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Return with the most efficient and most aesthetically pleasing configuration and orientation for the proposed solar panel arrays.
- 2) Carried forward comments 1 and 2 from the minutes of 12/13/10: 1. Provide architectural details of the eave and gable ends. Illustrate the proposed solar mounting; include vertical and horizontal setback dimensions. 2. Study minimizing equipment service access areas along roof eaves.
- 3) Review all previous meeting minutes and meeting videos for guidance.

Action: Sherry/Gilliland, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell absent.)

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**4. 826 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-042-001
Application Number: MST2010-00289
Owner: Gold Lab, LLC
Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal to remodel the south and west elevations consisting of thickening exterior walls, recessing windows, and stuccoing the exterior.)

Actual time: 4:34

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 4:41 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued one week to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. Show the existing site wall location, detail the wall similar to the architecture with no wall cap.
2. Provide complete architectural details.
3. Remove the iron bars from windows and doors, articulate windows similar to other window details.
4. Provide a south elevation drawing.

Action: Rivera/Sherry, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell absent)

** The Board recessed from 4:51 until 5:10 p.m. **

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 226 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-3 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-252-013
Application Number: MST2010-00381
Architect: On Design
Owner: Ed St. George

(Proposal for a new three-story 2,439 square foot single residential unit with attached 327 square foot one-car garage and a new 478 square foot two-car garage at the rear of a site currently developed with two detached single residential units.)

(Requires Project Compatibility Analysis.)

Actual time: 5:10

Present: Justin Van Mullen, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 5:22 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the following comments:

1. Continue to study and articulate the roof split pitch.
2. Continue to refine the window and door locations.
3. Coordinate the plans and elevations.
4. Study the introduction of vertical siding on the third story element.
5. Study ways to introduce character compatible with the 2 existing one story structures.
6. Study ways to provide direct access to the outdoor living spaces of the rear unit.
7. Address privacy issues of the rear southwest facing second-story window at bedroom #3.
8. Provide revised garage elevations with an accurate depiction of the garage doors.
9. Provide composite elevations through the site showing the third story in relation to the project.
10. Relocate the fence and gate between the garage and building to the north away from the window.
11. Consult with a landscape architect.
12. Reconfigure the stepping stone path to accommodate walking movement.
13. Reexamine the overall landscape plan to incorporate a greater variety of size appropriate planting and material on the site.
14. Consider using a vertical planting element at the north side of the garage.

Action: Sherry/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell and Zink absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**6. 3851 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(5:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-011
 Application Number: MST2011-00014
 Owner: Macerich La Cumbre, LLC
 Business Name: Panera Bread
 Applicant: Fancher Development

(Proposal for exterior building alterations, a new trellis, and a new outdoor dining patio for Panera Bread. Two parking spaces are proposed to be eliminated.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:51

Present: Christopher Wadleigh, Project Manager; Clarence Mah, Applicant.

Public comment was opened at 6:00 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Study ways to incorporate a cohesive architectural program with authentic detailing. Utilizing the La Cumbre Plaza Design Guidelines; especially at this important corner element. Study the corner element's size, proportion, function, detailing, and location.
2. Introduce landscaping where possible.
3. Return with comments regarding the proposal from La Cumbre Mall Management.
4. Clarify fence locations.

Action: Sherry/Mosel, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell, Rivera and Zink absent)

ADJOURNED

The Full Board meeting was adjourned at 6:23 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

Representatives Present: Clay Aurell and Chris Gilliland

Staff Present: Tony Boughman

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**A. 608 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-151-017
Application Number: MST2010-00362
Owner: Jason D. Leggitt
Architect: James Wilson

(Proposal to create a new exterior patio for outdoor dining. Proposed is a new exterior door and openable windows, new outdoor patio furniture including tables, chairs and umbrellas, and a new landscape plan. The project will address violations in ENF2010-00811.)

Continued two weeks to Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) Provide more information where and how building color change occurs. 2) Reduce pavers in parkway. 3) Study style of iron railing. 4) Remove paving where bench was removed near entry. 5) Add a vine trained on the corner of the building. 6) Show landscaping in parkway in front of entry area. 7) Add come Carex as accents in parkway plantings. 8) Bring updated photos of building and site. 9) Add vine pocket at wall of building at center of proposed patio. 10) Move the existing large Bird of Paradise from the proposed patio area to where the tree was removed near entry door.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 3943 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-021
Application Number: MST2011-00028
Owner: FW Ca-Five Points Shopping Center
Architect: Craig Shallenberger

(Trash enclosures on site are proposed to be remodeled and consolidated at the Five Points Shopping Center.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval with the condition to study adding vines on the wall of the enclosure in front of the stores.

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**C. 936 SAN PASCUAL ST BLD D****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-292-019
Application Number: MST2010-00319
Owner: Dario Pini
Agent: Catherine Dunbar

(Proposal to permit as-built window and door changes and paint color changes, and review of landscaping for an existing apartment complex. The proposal will address the violations outlined in ENF2010-00384.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval with the following conditions: 1) Reduce the number of trumpet vine plants.
2) Proposed Agave plants are to be 5 gallon size.