



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

Monday, December 13, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair
 CLAY AURELL
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
 GARY MOSEL
 KEITH RIVERA
 PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE)
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE)

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final ABR approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman, at (805) 564-5470 extension 4539, or by email at tboughman@santabarbaraca.gov. Office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. On Thursday, December 9, 2010, the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at Noon and the following Monday at 9:00 a.m. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Chair Sherry.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gilliland, Manson-Hing (in at 3:52), Mosel (out at 4:43), Rivera, Sherry (out at 3:53), Zink
Members absent: Aurell
Staff present: Boughman, Limon (4:49 to 4:54), Shafer

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment: None.
- B. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of November 29, 2010.
Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of November 29, 2010 as submitted.
Action: Zink/Rivera, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Gilliland abstained, Aurell and Manson-Hing absent)
- C. Consent Calendar.
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of December 6, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gary Mosel with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.
Action: Zink/Rivera, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell, Manson-Hing, and Mosel absent)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of December 13, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Dawn Sherry with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.
Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell, Manson-Hing, and Mosel absent)
- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
 1. Mr. Boughman announced that Item B on today's Consent Calendar was referred to the Full Board and will be the first item heard.
 2. Mr. Rivera announced that he will step down from Item 1.
 3. Mr. Gilliland announced that Mr. Aurell will be absent.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. Gilliland reported on a recent Highway 101 Subcommittee meeting. Caltrans would like to add a bike lane at the Hot Springs underpass and is also considering adding a third vehicle lane at Salinas Street and hopes to add these items to the current application. Mr. Gilliland stated that if the items were approved, the median and the planting along the wall would be eliminated. The subcommittee will meet Wednesday, December 15, with DRT.

ABR – FINAL REVIEW**Referred from today's Consent Calendar****B. 330 W. CANON PERDIDIO ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-024
 Application Number: MST2010-00278
 Owner: Stephen and Celeste Harrel
 Architect: Stephen Harrel

Proposal to demolish an existing one-story single-family residence and construct a new two-story duplex consisting of a 1,080 square foot unit, a 1,197 square foot unit, an attached 429 square foot two-car garage, an attached 495 square foot two-car garage with a new driveway from Castillo Street, and fences, walkways, and landscaping. The proposed total development of 3,201 square feet is located on a 5,000 square foot lot.

(Final approval of architecture and landscaping is requested.)

Actual time: 3:12

Present: Stephen Harrell, Architect/Owner.

Motion: Final Approval of the architecture as submitted with Final Approval of the landscape with conditions:

- 1) Plantings in the parkway strip and north of driveway are to be Verbena or Dimondia.
- 2) If the bioswale excavation around the roots of the two avocado trees results in their loss, the trees must be replaced.

Action: Zink/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell and Manson-Hing absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**1. 4151 FOOTHILL RD****County Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 059-160-017
 Application Number: MST2008-00496
 Owner: Webster Properties LP
 Applicant: Michael Towbes
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects

Proposal to construct two, two-story, commercial office buildings, for a total of 56,887 square feet to be used by Sansum, on a proposed four acre site in the proposed C-1 and SD-2 Zones. Building A is proposed to be 45,105 square feet. Building B is proposed to be 13,532 square feet each. The proposal includes the demolition of the existing 1,750 square foot gas station and on-site remediation. The project proposes 57,173 square feet of landscaping, bio-swales, 226 parking spaces and 24 bike spaces, and public improvements including sidewalks, and parkways. 17,747 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The project requires Planning Commission review for Annexation, General Plan Amendment, Zone Change, and Development Plan Approval.

(Concept Review of revised project. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review for an Annexation, General Plan Amendment, Zone Change, and Development Plan Approval.)

Actual time: 3:19

Present: Richard Six, Architect; Michael Towbes, Applicant; Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect.

Dan Gullett, Associate Planner, reported on the project's current status. A development application resubmittal that includes the proposed changes, parking demand information, and traffic impact information is expected.

Public comment was opened at 3:35 p.m.

Kellam DeForest: commended the applicant on the proposed development and landscaping; however, he would prefer a Spanish Revival style more in keeping with the vision of Pearl Chase for Santa Barbara.

Public comment was closed at 3:39 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

- 1) The Board likes the direction and the art deco style.
- 2) Provide color studies.
- 3) Provide details for the soffit at the upper-story roof.
- 4) Study the replacing the parking lot tree with a larger canopy tree.
- 5) Study opportunities to add a pedestrian sidewalk to lawn within the triangular island in the parking lot. Study opportunities to meander the sidewalk along Cieneguitas and Foothill Roads.
- 6) Carried forward comments 1, 2, and 3 from the minutes of January 25, 2010:
 1. The Board appreciates the generous setbacks and significant amount of open space along Foothill Road. The Board finds the project provides minimal visual impact to the Scenic Highway 154 due to significant plantings along the property line that will in time provide visual screening, the buildings will be broken into several elements and not perceived as one large building, and the building floor elevations are five feet apart and will vary in height.
 2. The Board appreciates the continuous parking lot circulation plan as designed.
 3. The Compatibility Analysis is as follows:
 - a. The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
 - b. The project's design is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood.
 - c. The project's mass, size, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood. The Board appreciates the level of details and how it relates to the neighborhood as the proposed buildings do not have a sterile appearance.
 - d. There is no impact to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or established public views of mountains or ocean.
 - e. The project's design provides significant amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Rivera stepped down. Manson-Hing abstained. Aurell absent.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 535 E MONTECITO ST****M-1 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-351-010
 Application Number: MST2006-00530
 Owner: City Ventures
 Applicant: Bill McReynolds
 Architect: William Hezmalhalch Architects, Inc.
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly Rogers

The proposal is a redesign of a project previously approved by the Planning Commission. The proposed project consists of 48 residential condominium units in four, two- and three-story buildings, on a 1.8-acre vacant lot. The size of the residential units would vary, ranging between 994 and 2,086 square feet. Each of the four buildings would contain twelve residential units and would have individual courtyards. All units would have a two-car garage, with a mix of side by side configuration and tandem configuration. Four guest parking spaces would be provided, resulting in a total of 100 on-site parking spaces. Vehicle access would be provided from both East Montecito Street and Calle Cesar Chavez. Forty of the 48 units would be sold as below-market rate units. A 14-foot wide shared access easement is provided along the western perimeter of the project site. The prior approvals consisted of a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Modification to provide less than the required amount of guest parking and City Council approval of a Specific Plan (SP-10). The redesigned project received a Substantial Conformance Determination at the Planning Commission on 11/19/2009.

(Review After Final for addition of solar panels and change of roof material.)

Actual time: 3:58

Present: Bill McReynolds, Applicant; Addison Marks, SunPower Corporation.

Public comment was opened at 4:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued four weeks to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide architectural details of the eave and gable ends. Illustrate the proposed solar mounting; include vertical and horizontal setback dimensions.
- 2) Study minimizing equipment service access areas along roof eaves.
- 3) Investigate rotating the orientation of solar panels to allow for increased setbacks at eave; possibly simply eave configurations. Of particular concern are the panel arrays along the public way at buildings 1, 4, and 200.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell and Sherry absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**3. 1216 E. MONTECITO ST****R-2 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-062-004
Application Number: MST2010-00378
Owner: Jose Luis Gonzalez
Designer: Jose Esparza

Proposal to demolish the existing 749 square foot single-family residence and construct two new detached units on a 5,300 square foot lot. Proposed is a 1,196 square foot two-story single-family residence at the front of the lot and a detached two-story structure at the rear of the lot consisting of a 600 square foot accessory dwelling unit and a 526 square foot two-car garage. One uncovered parking space is also proposed. The project will address violations listed under enforcement case number ENF2009-01426.

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 4:35

Present: Jose Esparza, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 4:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The overall mass, bulk, and scale, and architecture are acceptable.
- 2) Develop the fenestration and architectural details of the rear unit to more directly relate to the architecture of the front building.
- 3) Provide a preliminary landscape plan.
- 4) Study pedestrian way finding and pathway to rear accessory unit.
- 5) Show a trash enclosure location.
- 6) Study additional fenestration on the north wall of the front porch of the front unit.
- 7) Study proportions of the second-story window over the porch of the front building. Show detail of the second floor cantilever as it connects to porch along the east elevation.
- 8) The Board finds that a turnaround or the current configuration has no adverse aesthetic impact.

Action: Rivera/Zink, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel stepped down. Aurell and Sherry absent.)

ADJOURNMENT

The Full Board meeting was adjourned at 4:54 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)**ABR – FINAL REVIEW****A. 216 NATOMA AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-062-019
Application Number: MST2010-00145
Owner: Nancy Mammel
Agent: Bill Wolf, Pacific Architects

Proposal for alterations and additions to an existing 1,803 square foot, two-story duplex, on a 6,000 square foot lot, to include a new 101 square foot, one-story addition and a 220 square foot, two-story addition, to total 2,124 square feet, the demolition of the existing detached 460 square foot garage and construction of two new one-car garages, totaling 613 square feet. The proposal includes replacing the existing driveway, construction of new site walls at the front and rear, replace all existing doors and windows, construct a new ground-floor patio, add new wooden decks, a new trash/recycle enclosure, and permit an "as-built" outdoor fire place in the rear yard. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for alterations within the required interior setback. The parcel is located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires coastal review and monitoring for any ground disturbance.

(Final approval of landscaping is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 051-10.)

Final Approval of the landscaping with the condition that permeable pavers are to be used instead of turf block at the front of the driveway.

ABR – FINAL REVIEW**B. 330 W. CANON PERDIDIO ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-024
Application Number: MST2010-00278
Owner: Stephen and Celeste Harrel
Architect: Stephen Harrel

Proposal to demolish an existing one-story single-family residence and construct a new two-story duplex consisting of a 1,080 square foot unit, a 1,197 square foot unit, an attached 429 square foot two-car garage, an attached 495 square foot two-car garage with a new driveway from Castillo Street, and fences, walkways, and landscaping. The proposed total development of 3,201 square feet is located on a 5,000 square foot lot.

(Final approval of architecture and landscaping is requested.)

Referred to today's Full Board meeting: see Full Board minutes above.

ABR – FINAL REVIEW**C. 1720 SAN ANDRES ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-191-015
Application Number: MST2008-00066
Owner: Cameron Porter
Architect: Thomas Moore

Proposal to construct a new 802 square foot two-bedroom residential unit above a new 460 square foot, two-car garage, and 160 square foot, attached storage room on a 5,040 square foot lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposal also includes a 63 square foot first-floor addition to the existing 558 square foot one-story two-bedroom residential unit and the demolition of an existing 250 square foot, legal non-conforming, single-car garage and a 75 square foot shed. A total of four parking spaces (two covered and two uncovered) will be provided on site. The project involves the removal of two existing palm trees.

(Final approval of architecture and landscaping is requested.)

Final Approval of the architecture and landscape with conditions: 1) The false beams at the south cantilever are to be three 6x8 beams. 2) The Pineapple Guava is to be a maximum of 42" height at the street.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**D. 219 SYCAMORE LN****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-073-046
Application Number: MST2009-00482
Owner: City of Santa Barbara Housing Authority
Agent: Design ARC

Proposal to construct 20 new private laundry rooms, totaling 692 square feet, for 20 units at an existing multi-family duplex development. The proposal also includes exterior alterations to the existing structures including new balconies and conversion of the existing commons building to a multi-purpose room for the residents. Zoning modifications are being requested to allow minor architectural projections into the interior and front yard setbacks and for distance between buildings at three locations for the additional laundry facilities.

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 007-10.)

Final Approval of the architecture and landscape as submitted.

ABR – REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 3025 DE LA VINA ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-172-020
Application Number: MST2007-00592
Owner: SLO Trader's LLC
Architect: Michael Holliday

This is a revised Project. Proposal to reinforce an existing retaining wall which ranges from 8' 6" to 23' 6" at the rear property line for 3025-3045 De La Vina Street. The current design has been revised from the design approved on 4/11/05 (MST2005-00111). The proposed design will not affect the existing parking configuration.

(Final approval of review after final is requested.)

Approval of the Review After Final with the condition to restore the vine planting and star jasmine, per landscape plan. The applicant is strongly urged to restore other site landscaping which has deteriorated.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**F. 1015 SAN ANDRES ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-242-011
Application Number: MST2006-00438
Owner: The Rodriguez/Espinosa Family Trust
Agent: Ben Woodall

Proposal to demolish the existing 1,581 square foot single-family residence and detached two-car garage and construct a new 4,510 square foot two-story duplex on an 8,000 square foot lot in the R-2 Zone. Unit one is a proposed two-story, three-bedroom, 2,107 square feet. Unit two is a proposed two-story, three-bedroom 2,403 square feet, including a two-car garage for each unit.

Final Approval with the condition that the gravel driveway strip shown on site plan is to be planted as shown on the landscape plan.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Dawn Sherry with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland. Staff present: Tony Boughman, Planning Technician II.