



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

**Monday, October 4, 2010**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT  
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - PRESENT  
 CLAY AURELL – PRESENT @ 4:00 P.M.  
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT  
 GARY MOSEL – PRESENT @ 3:10 P.M.  
 PAUL ZINK – PRESENT  
 KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

BRUCE BARTLETT – ABSENT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT @ 4:30 UNTIL 5:48 P.M.  
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician – PRESENT  
 KATHLEEN GOO, Alternate Commission Secretary - PRESENT

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<p><u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas &amp; neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal &amp; each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing &amp; proposed structures, building &amp; area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading &amp; retaining walls, &amp; existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing &amp; proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete &amp; thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial &amp; multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees &amp; shrubs &amp; plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" &amp; detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings &amp; must be complete &amp; accurate.</p>
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting &amp; irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, &amp; plumbing where applicable.</p>

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr). **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman, at (805) 564-5470, extension 4539, between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at [tboughman@SantaBarbaraCa.gov](mailto:tboughman@SantaBarbaraCa.gov). Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

1. On Wednesday, September 29, 2010, the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr).
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr) and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL:**

Members present: Manson-Hing, Sherry, Mosel, Aurell (in at 4:00 p.m.), Zink, Rivera, and Gilliland  
Members absent: None

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **September 20, 2010**, as submitted.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 3/0/2. Motion carried. (Zink/Sherry abstained, Aurell/Mosel absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 27, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink and Chris Gilliland.

Action: Rivera/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell/Mosel absent).

The Consent Calendar of October 4, 2010 was cancelled.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Board member Zink announced he will be stepping down from Item #3, 401½ Old Coast Highway.
- 2) Board member Rivera announced he will be stepping down from Item #1, 3869 State Street, and Item #2, 2550 Treasure Drive.
- 3) Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:
  - a) Item #4, 1085 Coast Village Road was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.
  - b) Item #5, County Property (455, 457, 459 Hope Ave) was postponed two weeks to the Single Family Design Board since the project is within their purview.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****1. 3869 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-037  
Application Number: MST2010-00148  
Owner: Grace Lutheran Church of Santa Barbara  
Architect: Todd Jespersen  
Applicant: Earl Ensberg

(Proposal for a new three-story 10,832 square foot mixed-use building consisting of a 2,980 square foot childcare facility on the first floor and 16 one-bedroom affordable senior housing units on the second and third floors. The one-acre lot is currently developed with an existing 3,440 square foot church and a 7,135 square foot administration building. The project requires Development Plan approval for 2,980 square feet of non-residential floor area. The parking lot will be reconfigured to provide 66 spaces.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission.)**

(3:05)

Present: Todd Jespersen, Architect; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect; and Earl Ensberg, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m.

Mr. Kip Bradley spoke with concerns regarding the bulk, mass, and scale, and the "zero" lot line development, and parking lease issues of the property.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:28 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Reduce the apparent mass, bulk, and scale of the upper floors; significantly reduce the extensive cantilevers on the second and third levels and the upper floor overhanging mass; the expansive balcony is not supported.
- 2) Provide a cross-section of the building at ¼ scale.
- 3) Integrate the architectural style throughout the project.
- 4) Integrate the stairs and the elevator into the project.
- 5) Reduce the plate heights as much as possible.
- 6) Provide additional detailing for the side elevations.
- 7) Restudy the private open yard balconies.

Action: Sherry/Mosel, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell absent, Rivera stepped down).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****2. 2550 TREASURE DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-330-003  
Application Number: MST2008-00469  
Owner: The Samarkand of Santa Barbara Inc.  
Agent: Susan Basham, Price Postel & Parma  
Architect: Todd Kilburn  
Landscape Architect: Bob Cunningham, Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for a new LifeCenter facility at the Samarkand Retirement Community. The project consists of the demolition of an existing one-story, 1,665 square foot maintenance building and the construction of a 9,455 square foot, two-story LifeCenter consisting of an aerobics/multi-purpose room, computer room, committee office, TV studio, gallery, campus market, mechanical room, electrical room, storage and bathrooms on the first floor and a café, juice bar, fitness area, office, wellness suite, storage, and bathrooms on the second floor. The proposal would result in the reorganization of some of the existing areas and uses onsite. The proposal requires an Amendment to the existing Conditional Use Permit.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of an Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit.)**

(4:05)

Present: Susan Basham, Price Postel & Parma; Todd Kilburn, Architect; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:24p.m.

Mr. Ray Sargeant spoke with concerns about additional commercial development in the residential neighborhood.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:31 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission and return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Compatibility Analysis is as follows:
  - a. The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
  - b. The project's design is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood.
  - c. The project's mass, size, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood, given compliance with the comments provided here.
  - d. There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or nearby designated historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, or natural features.
  - e. The project's design does not block established public views of mountains or ocean.
  - f. The project's design provides an acceptable/appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

- 2) The project mass, bulk and scale is appropriate for the site. The Board appreciates the overall design of the project.
- 3) Study incorporating the mechanical well as a tower element or architectural element or remove completely.
- 4) Study the elevator tower entry.
- 5) Study the overall architecture of the entry to either center the doors and/or raise the roof.
- 6) On the south elevation, study the shed roof and column extending from the lower floor.
- 7) On the east elevation, study the cantilever, the width of columns, and the overall depth of the overhang.
- 8) On the east elevation, simplify the architectural elements (ornate handrail, lights on each column, elaborate trellis, etc.) to be consistent with the simplicity of the rest of the project.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Restudy the entry walk from cottage road to reduce the straight lines and rigidity.
- 2) Study the potential use of either fencing or a seat wall in lieu of the proposed site walls on the south elevation of the plaza.

Action: Aurell/Gilliland, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Rivera stepped down).

### **PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

#### **3. 401 1/2 OLD COAST HWY**

C-P/R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-291-010

Application Number: MST2009-00500

Owner: William Pritchett

Architect: Garcia Architects, Inc.

(This is a revised proposal to address violations of ENF2008-01303 and permit an "as-built" conversion of an existing 995 square foot commercial unit into a new 841 square foot three-bedroom residential unit. The proposal will demolish 194 square feet from unit 2 which is located in the required interior setback. The site is currently developed with two residential units and one commercial space and will result in a total of three residential units, including a 434 square foot residential unit, a 918 square foot residential unit, and an 841 square foot residential unit. A total of six parking spaces are proposed, five uncovered and one covered. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow living space to be permitted in the required rear setback.)

**(Project was referred by the City Council and requires compliance with Council Resolution.)**

(4:49)

Present: Everett Woody, Garcia Architects, Inc.; and Chelsey Swanson, Transportation Planner. Mr. Limon clarified that the applicant attempted to comply with previous requests made by the Board, and prepared various site plan changes for the relocation parking design to open areas of the proposed project for entry-identification. Mr. Limon also clarified the Board role with respect to this project and the requirements for the adaptation or re-use of a building and what the ABR has historically required in the past. In this case, it may be prudent to allow the sloped portion of the roof to be maintained, even though it may intensify the modification request to the rear of the property.

Public comment opened at 5:02 p.m. (on the revised plans presented today).

The following people spoke in opposition to the project:

- 1) Angie Munoz expressed concerns regarding proposed easement and parking issues.
- 2) Silvio Guadagnini expressed concerns regarding the stability of the proposed sloped roof, and the proposed night-time lighting.
- 3) Eustacchio Guadagnini expressed concerns regarding the safety of the as-built sloped roof, and proposed palm trees, and the location of common area.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Mr. Limon clarified for the Board that there is no easement agreement for parking with neighbors at this time. Mr. Limon requested direction from the Board as to the preference of a flat or sloped roof, and clarified that a roof in close proximity to the property line would require the roof to be in compliance with fire and building codes.

Public comment closed at 5:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Carry forward the previous 09/20/10 motions #4, 5, 6, and 9, as follows: #4) *“Study the pedestrian circulation and access to the units to minimize conflicts with parking and access through parking areas”* with an emphasis on accessibility to the trash and recycling. #5) *“Study architectural treatment of the roofs and fenestration to unify the style and architectural expression of the elevations.”*; #6) *“Study the tree selections with regard for property lines.”* and #9) *“Define an entryway for each unit, particularly Unit #3 which does not have a defined entry.”*
- 2) Provide an updated landscape to soften the hardscape and the façade of the building.
- 3) Provide drawings that reflect fenestration changes, provide a sense of entry, and demonstrate quality materials. Provide a roof plan, sections, and a demolition plan.

Action: Sherry/Gilliland, 4/1/1. Motion carried. (Aurell opposed, Rivera abstained, Zink stepped down).

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

### **4. 1085 COAST VILLAGE RD**

**C-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-281-003  
Application Number: MST2010-00026  
Owner: Janda Partners, LP  
Architect: DesignArc

(The project is for a Coastal Development Permit and a Conditional Use Permit to convert an existing lube bay and snack shop to a foodmart and construct a new car wash structure. The project will include a partial demolition of the existing structure and adding on to the existing structure for a total combined development of 4,246 square feet. Approximately 339 square feet of the existing 2,317 s.f. building on the south side will be removed to allow the addition of the car wash structure and approximately 599 square feet will be added to the existing building on the north side for a total of 2,577 square feet of retail use. The car wash structure will be 1,668 square feet. A 510 square foot trellis will be located on the west side of the lot and will be the area for car detailing. The permit requests also include a Modification to reduce the required parking and a Modification to allow a automated pay kiosk in the required front yard setback along Coast Village Circle. A driveway providing access to Coast Village Road will be relocated further west from Coast Village Circle. The existing gas pumps will remain.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit and a Conditional Use Permit.)**

Postponed indefinitely to the Full Board at the applicant's request.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

5. **\*COUNTY PROPERTY\* (455, 457, 459 Hope Ave)** **\*\*COUNTY Zone**  
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-012  
 Application Number: MST2006-00564  
 Owner: Giardini Di Cipriani, LLC  
 Architect: Trudi Carey

(Proposal to create 9 lots for new single family residences on a 2.92 acre vacant lot currently in the County of Santa Barbara. Due to the utilities being serviced by the City of Santa Barbara and the property being located within the City's sphere of influence, it will be required to be annexed. Because of the annexation, the project will include a General Plan Amendment and a Rezone. A new public road along the northern lot line will provide access to the parcels. No development of the individual lots is proposed with the subdivision.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of a General Plan Amendment and rezoning.)**

Postponed one week to the Single Family Design Board.

**\*\* ITEMS 6 AND 7 WERE HEARD IN REVERSE ORDER. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

6. **330 W CANON PERDIDO ST** **R-4 Zone**  
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-024  
 Application Number: MST2010-00278  
 Owner: Stephen and Celeste Harrel

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story single-family residence and construct a new two-story duplex consisting of a 1,080 square foot unit, a 1,197 square foot unit, an attached 429 square foot two-car garage, an attached 495 square foot two car garage with a new driveway from Castillo Street, and fences, walkways, and landscaping. The proposed total development of 3,201 square feet is located on a 5,000 square foot lot.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)**

(6:00)

Present: Stephen Harrel, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m.

Mr. Jeff Kone spoke in support of the proposed project.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.



Public comment closed at 6:09 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar with comments:  
 1) Ready for Preliminary Approval at Consent pending completion of environmental assessment.  
 2) Architecture and detailing is exemplary; mass, bulk, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan with additional variety of plantings.
- 2) Study moving the wall back approximately 12-inches to 14-inches back, either whole or part, from the face of the sidewalk to provide space for additional plantings.
- 3) Address and incorporate the required Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) into preliminary drawings.

Action: Zink/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**

**7. 814 ORANGE AVE**

**R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-024-007  
 Application Number: MST2010-00256  
 Owner: Edward St. George  
 Applicant: On Design

(Proposal to construct two two-story 1,553 square foot detached residential units and a detached 413 square foot two-car garage and two uncovered parking spaces on a 5,515 square foot vacant lot.)

**(Second Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(5:48)

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 5:55 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:  
 1) Return with a preliminary landscape plan, including a preliminary plant selection and layout.  
 2) The applicant's suggestion for the metal awnings on south elevations are acceptable.  
 3) Return with a proposed alternate entry on the south side of 816 Orange Avenue.  
 4) Study pedestrian circulation with regard to planting opportunities in the proposed landscape plan.

Action: Rivera/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 6:19 p.m.

The Consent Calendar of October 4, 2010 was cancelled.