



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, September 20, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:03 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - ABSENT
 CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT UNTIL 4:30 P.M.
 GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
 PAUL ZINK – ABSENT
 KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT – ABSENT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT UNTIL 3:12 P.M.
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman, at (805) 564-5470, extension 4539, between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at tboughman@SantaBarbaraCa.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Wednesday, September 15, 2010, at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Mosel, Aurell, Rivera, and Gilliland (present until 4:30 p.m.).
Members absent: Sherry and Zink.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **September 7, 2010**, as submitted.
Action: Rivera/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Zink absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 13, 2010**. **Clay Aurell** and **Chris Gilliland** were present to review the postponed Consent Calendar items.
Action: Aurell/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Zink absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 20, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Chris Gilliland**.
Action: Rivera/Mosel, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Zink absent).

Motion: To postpone ratification of the Sign Consent Calendar Review of **September 7, 2010**, to the next scheduled meeting of **October 4, 2010**.
Action: Mosel/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Zink absent).

D. Listing of Approved Conforming Signs:

The listing of Conforming Sign Review of **September 14, 2010**, was postponed to the next scheduled meeting on **October 4, 2010**.

- E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- 1) Board member Aurell announced that he will be absent from the next scheduled Consent Calendar meeting on September 27, 2010. Board member Zink will review Consent Calendar items scheduled for that date. Board member Mosel, as alternate, will be reviewing Consent Calendar items for the next three months.
 - 2) Mr. Boughman made the following announcements:
 - a) Board member Sherry will be absent from the meeting.
 - b) Board member Zink will be stepping down on agenda Item #1, 401 ½ Old Coast Highway.
 - c) The ABR approval of 903 W. Mission Street was appealed to City Council and the appeal hearing is scheduled on October 19, 2010. Board member Rivera volunteered to represent the Board at that hearing.
 - d) Board members are welcome to attend the Tuesday, October 12, 2010, Ordinance Committee meeting for a presentation of the Revised Sign Ordinance and new Sign Consent Review procedures.
- F. Subcommittee Reports.

Jaime Limón, Senior Planner reported that the Santa Barbara County Association of Governments (SBCAG) would like to meet with a joint subcommittee of the Planning Commission, ABR, and Historic Landmarks Commission to discuss Highway 101 HOV lane improvements. ABR member representatives are requested to consist of at least two ABR representatives, including a landscape architect.

Discussion held: Chris Manson-Hing and Chris Gilliland volunteered to be on the Highway 101 Joint Subcommittee.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

- 1. 401 1/2 OLD COAST HWY C-P/R-2 Zone**
- Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-291-010
 Application Number: MST2009-00500
 Owner: William Pritchett
 Architect: Garcia Architects, Inc.

(This is a revised proposal to abate violations of ENF2008-01303 and permit an "as-built" conversion of an existing 995 square foot commercial unit into a new 841 square foot three-bedroom residential unit. The proposal will demolish 194 square feet from unit 2 which is located in the required interior setback. The site is currently developed with two residential units and one commercial space and will result in a total of three residential units, including a 434 square foot residential unit, a 918 square foot residential unit, and an 841 square foot residential unit. A total of six parking spaces are proposed, five uncovered and one covered. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow living space to be permitted in the required rear setback.)

(Project was referred by the City Council and requires compliance with Council Resolution.)

(3:12)

Present: Gil Garcia and Everett Woody, Garcia Architects, Inc.; Ricardo Castellanos, Landscape Architect at the Office of Katie O'Reilly Rogers; Tony Fischer, attorney representing the applicant.

N. Scott Vincent, Assistant City Attorney, explained that an access and parking easement is under dispute and will not be resolved by the City. He clarified that the Board should review the project as

presented by the applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m.

The following public comment spoke either in support or in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Silvio Guadagnini, opposed; concerns regarding proposed trees and landscaping.
- 2) Eustacchio Guadagnini, opposed; concerns regarding location and proximity of the proposed patio area and the proposed trees and landscaping.
- 3) David Muñoz, (property owner of 401 Old Coast Hwy) opposed; concerns regarding limited access to easement (daylight only), and suggested a concrete wall instead of the proposed cinder block wall for safety.
- 4) Angie Muñoz, (property owner of 401 Old Coast Hwy) opposed; concerns regarding proper disposal of dog waste, parking, landscape irrigation and water drainage, sidewalk deterioration, and proper use of easement.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:45 p.m.

Roxanne Milazzo, Assistant Planner, clarified that the proposed parking has been reviewed by Transportation Planning staff and it does require access over the adjacent property, and that City Council approved a change of use in the rear setback and a modification for building separation.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a site plan that indicates the adjacent buildings and uses per the ABR's submittal requirements.
- 2) Study the location of the trash enclosures.
- 3) Study the layout and disposition of the open spaces so they are more cohesive and less fragmented.
- 4) Study the pedestrian circulation and access to the units to minimize conflicts with parking and access through parking areas.
- 5) Study architectural treatment of the roofs and fenestration to unify the style and architectural expression of the elevations.
- 6) Study the tree selections with regard for property lines.
- 7) Study the privacy and screening of private outdoor open spaces from adjacent pedestrian circulation.
- 8) Study the disposition and location of the exterior open spaces; suggestion to aggregate these open spaces into one larger area to mitigate the visual impacts of the parking areas.
- 9) Define an entryway for each unit, particularly Unit #3 which does not have a defined entry.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 3/1/1. Motion carried. (Aurell opposed, Gilliland abstained, Zink stepped down, Sherry absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 814 ORANGE AVE****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-024-007
Application Number: MST2010-00256
Owner: Edward St. George
Applicant: On Design

(Proposal to construct two two-story 1,553 square foot detached residential units and a detached 413 square foot two-car garage and two uncovered parking spaces on a 5,515 square foot vacant lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(4:22)

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:28 p.m.

Belinda Olivera; concerned about parking impacts to neighborhood, and privacy between neighbors.

Public comment closed at 4:33 p.m.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the project's overall mass, bulk and scale, and architectural treatment.
- 2) Return with a preliminary landscape plan that indicates the property line fencing and considers screening of the trash areas.
- 3) Study the pedestrian circulation from Orange Avenue to the rear unit, and enhance the street presence of that rear unit.
- 4) Study adding additional fenestration to the sides of the project in a way that does not cause privacy concerns.
- 5) Consider use of architectural elements for additional scale.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Gilliland abstained, Zink/Sherry absent).

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**ABR - NEW ITEM****A. 604 SANTA BARBARA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-014
Application Number: MST2010-00269
Owner: Terri Tompkins
Architect: Vadim Hsu
Applicant: Meichelle Arntz

(Proposal for the conversion of an existing 869 square foot single family residence to a new commercial building with three new uncovered parking spaces. The project will address violations in ENF2010-00462.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued one week with comments.

- 1) Provide hedge at the front of property to screen accessible space.
- 2) It is acceptable to relocate stair and alter front porch, if necessary.
- 3) Show handicap lift and path of travel on plans.
- 4) Screen the lift from the street.
- 5) Move accessible space and loading area away from property line to allow space for landscaping.
- 6) Tumbled pavers are recommended.
- 7) The use of turf block is appreciated.

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 2222 BATH ST****C-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-181-019
Application Number: MST2008-00565
Owner: MSB Properties, Inc.
Architect: Patrick Marr
Business Name: Rabobank

(Review After Final for a revised proposal for minor alterations to an existing 1,452 square foot commercial building to eliminate the previously approved 74 square foot addition, eliminate the new ADA path of travel, revise the parking configuration of the 7 on-site parking spaces, and the addition of 14 removable bollards. The remaining components of the existing approved project include replacement of the existing front entry porch, a new ADA parking space, loading zone, and path of travel at the rear of the building, the demolition of the existing fireplace, and replacement of the existing trash enclosure.)

(Second review of Review After Final to provide handicap access lift at the front of the building.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued one week with comments.

- 1) Reorient the entrance of the lift to face the side yard.
- 2) Adjust the concrete walkway, screening hedge, and landscaping.
- 3) Add a post at the handrail extension.
- 4) Note colors on plans.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 614 E HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-293-004
Application Number: MST2010-00268
Owner: Bertha Claveria, Trustee
Architect: Karl Kras
Contractor: Bomo Design
Business Name: Duo Catering & Events

(Proposal to replace the existing aluminum store front entrance door with a new wood and steel door.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval with the condition to paint existing window and door trim to match the matte black on new door.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**D. 431 VISTA DE LA PLAYA****E-3/PUD Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-200-028
Application Number: MST2010-00199
Owner: Lawrence Fealy
Architect: Sophie Calvin

(Proposal for minor alterations to an existing two-story, 2,347 square foot residence on an E-3 lot. The site is currently developed with 13 residential units as a Planned Unit Development (PUD). The alterations include the addition of a new door at the garage, new exterior stairs, a new trellis, outdoor fireplace, BBQ, retaining wall, and site landscaping. The project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for a zoning modification for alterations within the required setbacks.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 042-10.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval as submitted.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Chris Gilliland**.