



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, August 9, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
- DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - ABSENT
- CLAY AURELL – PRESENT (ABSENT FROM 4:30 – 4:43 P.M.)
- CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT
- GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
- PAUL ZINK – PRESENT
- KEITH RIVERA - ABSENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT – ABSENT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT AT 3:52 P.M.
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician – ABSENT
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Wednesday, August 04, 2010, at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Mosel, Zink, Aurell, and Gilliland.
Members absent: Sherry and Rivera.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **July 26, 2010, as amended.**
Action: Zink/Aurell, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Mosel abstained, and Gilliland abstained from Items #5, 6, and 7; Sherry/Rivera absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 2, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Gary Mosel** and **Chris Gilliland**.
Action: Aurell/Mosel, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Rivera absent).
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 9, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Gary Mosel** and **Chris Gilliland**.
Action: Mosel/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Rivera absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Chair Manson-Hing announced that Board member Rivera will be absent.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. 500 FOWLER RD****A-F/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003
Application Number: MST2007-00002
Owner: Santa Barbara Airport
Architect: Fred Sweeney
Architect: Joseph Grogan

(Proposal for the construction of a new two-story Airline Terminal facility measuring approximately 66,045 square feet. The new facility would be located south of the existing 20,000 square foot main Terminal building, which would remain in operation during construction. The original 5,000 square foot 1942 Terminal building would be rehabilitated, with additions constructed in 1967 and 1976 to be removed. The 1942 building would be relocated and incorporated as part of the new facility. The existing rental car/security operations building, airline trailers and baggage claim pavilions, which are currently part of the existing Terminal complex, would also be removed and the uses would be incorporated into the new terminal. The existing short-term parking lot would be reconfigured and the loop road would be revised to incorporate an alternative transportation lane for buses, taxis, and shuttles. Project received Planning Commission Approval on 9/20/2007 (Resolution No. 037-07). The project received Final Approval by the ABR on 5/19/08.)

(Review After Final for the addition of seven glass flag stands which will contain artistic elements to commemorate the use of the airport property by the U.S. Marines during World War II.)

(3:06)

Present: Fred Sweeney, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide more information regarding the proposed LED lighting or edge lighting for the flags.
- 2) Study widening the sidewalk or providing viewing areas between the panels.
- 3) In an attempt to increase the visual clarity and impact of the each panel of the proposed project, the applicant was requested to:
 - a) Study reducing the number of flags to provide or enhance the pedestrian experience.
 - b) Provide a revised landscape/hardscape plan in the area of the flags.

Action: Aurell/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Rivera absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 1032 E MASON ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-133-005
Application Number: MST2009-00332
Owner: Second Baptist Church of Santa Barbara
Architect: Bill Spencer

(Proposal for a new two-story, six-unit, affordable residential complex on an existing 24,979 square foot lot. The proposed residential complex will be comprised of six, one-bedroom, 540 square foot units, totaling 3,240 square feet. Each unit will include 120 square feet of private outdoor living space. The lot is currently developed with a 2,265 square foot church and an existing two-story 2,319 square foot residential duplex. The proposal involves converting 1,599 square feet of the existing duplex to non-residential use for a fellowship hall and requires Measure E square footage. The remaining 720 square foot "care taker's unit" on the second floor is proposed to remain. A total of 21 parking spaces will be provided to include two accessible spaces. The proposed development will result in 3,864 square feet of non-residential use and a total of seven residential units, totaling 3,960 square feet. Planning Commission review and State Density Bonus concessions or incentives are requested for a six-unit building in the R-2 Zone, parking modification, outdoor living space modification, interior setback modification, two front setback modifications, Development Plan Approval, and a Conditional Use Permit for a church in a residential zone.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review and State Density Bonus concessions for zoning modifications, Development Plan Approval, and a Conditional Use Permit for a church in a residential zone.)

(3:35)

Present: William (Bill) Spencer, Architect; Lisa Plowman, Planner with Peikert Group.

Dan Gullett, Associate Planner, gave the staff presentation and clarified the CUP and density incentives.

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Compatibility Analysis for the three requested waivers in addition to the modifications for parking and bicycle parking along the front elevation, is as follows:
 - a. The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
 - b. The project's design compatibility with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood is close to completion, but the Board is still reviewing the exterior architectural details and still has some concerns.
 - c. The project's mass, size, bulk, height, scale, and square footage are appropriate for the neighborhood. Study refining and reducing the overall second floor mass of the structure.
 - d. There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or established public views of mountains or ocean.
 - e. The project's design does not block established public views of mountains or ocean, and is not an issue.

- f. The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and further landscaping details will be provided with the proposed common outdoor living area.
- 2) Study the roof plan to reduce the roof elements over the second floor outdoor living spaces.
- 3) Study the stairs to the second floor and removing the pilasters at the sides of the stairs.
- 4) Provide a landscape and hardscape plan for the entire site from a licensed landscape architect. Find opportunities for plantings on the front elevation along Mason Street.
- 5) The Street Tree Committee should review the removal of the Pepper tree, and make recommendations for replanting.
- 6) Return with plate heights (at 9 feet on both floors) and finished floor elevations on the elevations.
- 7) Provided there is a quality landscape solution, there would be no negative aesthetic impact of the proposed modifications.

Action: Zink/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Rivera absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

3. 199 N HOPE AVE

E-3/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-240-023
 Application Number: MST2010-00171
 Owner: Roman Catholic Archbishop L. A.
 Architect: Garcia Architects

(Revised proposal to demolish an existing one-story, 2,573 square foot pre-manufactured maintenance building and construct a new one-story, 25 foot tall, 3,037 square foot maintenance building, including a 464 square foot mezzanine floor area addition, located at an existing cemetery on a 20-acre parcel in the E-3 Zone. The new building will be constructed within the existing building footprint located on the northwesterly portion of the parcel. The project requires Planning Commission review for an amendment to the existing Conditional Use Permit for a non-residential use on a single-family residentially zoned parcel.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review for an amendment to the Conditional Use Permit.)

(4:30)

Present: Gil Garcia, Architect; and Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:35 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Compatibility Analysis is as follows:
 - a. The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
 - b. The project's design is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood.

- c. The project's mass, size, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood, as the proposed structure is below 25 feet in height and complies with solar access requirements.
 - d. There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or established public views of mountains or ocean.
 - e. There are no public views of mountains or ocean that relate to the structure.
 - f. There is no proposed new open space and no new landscaping proposed.
- 2) The applicant was requested to return with a color board, and other Planning Commission requirements.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell stepped out, Sherry/Rivera absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 220 W MONTECITO ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-244-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00493
 Owner: Montecito Trust
 Applicant: T-Mobile
 Architect: MSA Architecture & Planning
 Agent: Synergy Development Services

(Proposal for a new wireless facility consisting of the installation of nine rooftop panel antennas to be located within two screen enclosures and four radio equipment cabinets to be installed on grade behind a new 7'-6" tall concrete masonry unit wall with rolling gate at an existing mixed-use building on an approximately 25,000 square foot parcel.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Findings of No Visual Impact.)

(4:43)

Present: Ryan Shields (Agent), Synergy Development Services.

Public comment opened at 4:48 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Return with a completely revised plan that does not increase the height of the existing building, and does not appear to be massive in scale as the proposed project currently does.
- 2) Any additions to the building should be appropriate to the architecture and appropriate in scale.

Action: Mosel/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Rivera absent).

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 5:06 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REFERRED BY FULL BOARD****A. 1921 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-352-009
 Application Number: MST2010-00118
 Owner: Joan Chapin Robertson, Trustee
 Architect: Ken Kruger
 Engineer: John Oeltman
 Contractor: Cunningham-Parris Construction

(Proposal to construct a 192 square foot second-story addition to an existing one-story 1,580 square foot residence, resulting in 1,772 square feet. The 7,500 square foot lot is currently developed with two residential units, the existing one-story 1,580 square foot front residence and the existing two-story 822 square foot rear unit. No alterations are proposed to the existing 822 square foot residence. Each residence has one covered parking space provided within the existing two-car garage.)

(Preliminary Approval was granted on 6/14/10. Final Approval is requested.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Provide two-piece mission tile with a double starter row of tile.
- 2) Change the 2"X6" rafter to 4"X6" lookouts to match the existing details.

NEW ITEM**B. 333 CONSUELO DR****R-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 059-212-003
 Application Number: MST2010-00217
 Owner: Leslie K. Egst Houston, Trust
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for a 234 square foot one-story addition and an interior remodel to the existing 1,079 square foot residence of an existing one-story 1,903 square foot residential duplex. The proposal includes the demolition of an "as-built" patio cover and construction of a new covered entrance, new covered patios on the west and north elevations, five new skylights, a new air conditioning unit, gas service, and a new exterior barbeque. Three on-site covered parking spaces are proposed to remain unaltered. No alterations are proposed to the existing front residence. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification for the configuration of the required open space.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued to Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

- 1) The Compatibility Analysis is as follows:
 - a. The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
 - b. The project's design matches and is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood, given compliance with the comments provided here.
 - c. The project's mass, size, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood.

- d. There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or established public views of mountains or ocean.
- e. The project's design does not block established public views of mountains or ocean.
- 2) Applicant to change the eave lighting to low pathway lighting on the north elevation.
- 3) There are no aesthetic impacts on the requested zoning modification for the configuration of the required open space.

NEW ITEM

C. 900 CALLE DE LOS AMIGOS E-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-040-053
 Application Number: MST2010-00236
 Owner: American Baptist Homes of the West
 Architect: Craig Burdick

(Proposal to combine two existing 510 square foot units, at 811 Senda Verde units C & D, into one combined unit and add a 200 square foot addition to total one 1,220 square foot residential unit within the Valle Verde Retirement Community. The proposal includes relocating the existing fence 4 feet, 6 inches out from the existing location along the south elevation.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval with condition that the colors of the roof, plaster, and fascia are to match the existing architecture.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD

D. 402 S HOPE AVE E-3/PD/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-017
 Application Number: MST2010-00141
 Owner: Cutter Properties Ltd.
 Contractor: Lusardi Construction Co.
 Architect: Davy Architecture
 Landscape Architect: Bob Cunningham, Arcadia Studio

(Proposal to enclose an existing covered display area for a 450 square foot addition to the existing 33,105 square foot Mercedes Benz Auto Dealership, resulting in a 33,555 square foot building on a 4.37 acre lot. The parcel is also currently developed with an existing 7,120 square foot BMW Auto Dealership. No changes are proposed to the existing BMW Dealership. The non-residential addition requires Planning Commission Review for a Development Plan in the P-D Zone.)

(Final approval of architecture was granted on 8/2/10. Final approval of landscaping is requested.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval of landscaping.