



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, May 3, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
- DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair – PRESENT @ 4:24 P.M.
- CLAY AURELL – PRESENT @ 3:15 P.M.
- CAROL GROSS – ABSENT
- GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
- PAUL ZINK – PRESENT
- CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – ABSENT
- KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT – ABSENT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT UNTIL 5:35 P.M.
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Wednesday, April 28, 2010, at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Sherry (present @ 4:24 p.m.), Mosel, Zink, Aurell (present @ 3:15 p.m.), and Rivera.
Members absent: Gilliland and Gross.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **April 19, 2010**.
Action: Zink/Rivera, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Gross/Sherry absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 26, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Gary Mosel**.

Action: Rivera/Zink, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Gross/Sherry absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 3, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Gary Mosel**.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Gross/Aurell/Sherry absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Ms. Bedard announced that Board member Sherry will be arriving late to the meeting.
- 2) Mr. Limon announced to the Board:
 - a) A staff report scheduled for review by Council on Tuesday, May 4th regarding the temporary recruitment of an additional landscape architect member to the Board.
 - b) An update on the status of the NextG application, which is proceeding through permitting. Staff is reviewing five additional sites presented recently, three of the five are within the ABR's purview, and staff is in the process of researching these additional sites and the associated equipment.
 - c) Brief discussion on a selection of colors and contrast of truncated domes used in various applications.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

DISCUSSION ITEM:**(3:18)****PRESENTATION OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT BUDGET INFORMATION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2011**

City Staff Presenter: Bettie Weiss, City Planner.

Discussion held.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**1. 1150 SAN ROQUE RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-171-007
Application Number: MST2009-00517
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: KBZ Architects
Agent: Joe Wilcox

(Proposal to construct three new water treatment buildings and two new treatment tank enclosures at the Cater Water Treatment Plant. The proposal involves 7,999 square feet of new buildings and 5,890 square feet of new structures for a total of 13,889 square feet. The existing site is currently developed with 20,052 square feet of buildings and 139,252 square feet of other structures to the existing 159,304 square foot facility. The proposal also includes the relocation of 12 existing parking spaces, new accessible walkways and new site landscaping. The proposal will result in a 173,193 square foot water treatment facility and will bring the existing facility into conformance with new U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) regulations. The project received Planning Commission approval on 4/22/10 for a Conditional Use Permit for a non-residential use in a residential zone and Zoning Modifications for parking and encroachments into the required front and interior setbacks.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 003-10. Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(3:46)

Present: Patricia W. Saley, Contract Case Planner; Cathy Taylor, Water System Manager; Joe Wilcox, KBZ Architects; and David Black, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:07 p.m.

John Elliston spoke on concerns regarding noise abatement.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 4:11 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary approval of architecture and continued indefinitely to Consent for preliminary and final of landscaping and final of architecture with comments:

- 1) Provide a roof plan indicating the PV locations, and study maximizing the potential for their use.
- 2) Study integration of the 24-inch pipes to conceal their appearance.
- 3) Utilize the “deacon finch” color.
- 4) Reduce the length of the sidewalk and change the perimeter fencing at the new exit at the electrical room.
- 5) Landscape plan details are to show a screen check valve and back flow preventer.
- 6) Return with details of the screen wall for noise abatement.

Action: Rivera/Zink, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Sherry abstained, Gilliland/Gross absent).

FINAL REVIEW

2. 3052 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 053-342-033
 Application Number: MST2010-00016
 Owner: Timothy and Claudia Garrett
 Contractor: Terra Nova Industries
 Business Name: Beverages & More, Inc.
 Architect: Hayashida Architects

(Proposal for an exterior facade remodel to include the demolition of a 1,288 square foot detached warehouse, demolition of 1,758 square feet of an existing 10,757 square foot building, to result in one 8,999 square foot commercial building with a 3,046 credit of Measure E square footage. The proposal includes site alterations to include 12 new parking spaces for a total of 34 on-site parking spaces, and revised parking lot and site landscaping to include the removal of two existing trees and the addition of nine new trees. The proposal will abate the violations of ENF2009-00505.)

(Project requires compliance with the Upper State Street Design Guidelines. Preliminary Approval was granted 4/5/2010. Final Approval is requested.)

(4:31)

Present: Eric Marquart, Agent for Beverages & More, Inc.; Don Inaba, Hayashida Architects; and Tom Boranick, Project Manager of Terra Nova Industries; and Roger Deutschman, for Mike Lombardi Landscape Architects.

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

The following public comment spoke with concerns regarding the proposed project:

- 1) Camille Scott (submitted alleyway photo), expressed concerns regarding the use of the alley and increased deliveries.
- 2) John Reynolds, concerns regarding deliveries, alley use, and safe fire department access.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a different color instead of the proposed "peach" wainscoting and provide color samples.
- 2) Change the green window trim to a bronze color to match the existing store front windows that are to remain.
- 3) Provide a stain for the wood lintel detail, and provide a color for the wood roof overhang.
- 4) Indicate on the plans where the truncated domes of contrasting color will be located.
- 5) Study removing two pole-mounted lighting fixtures adjacent to the building and replace with one wall-mounted light fixture.
- 6) Study the block wall cart storage; the Board suggests the applicant return with an open air solution.
- 7) Study removing the proposed trellises along the building (including those to the rear and along the walkway) and replace with an organic clinging vine where vines would be necessary.
- 8) Study the front planter, at ground level directly behind the existing sidewalk, making it larger in size.
- 9) On Sheet A5.1, show the opaque window material not to exceed the underside of the first mullion.
- 10) Indicate the height of signage on the south and east elevations to be of the same height.
- 11) Modify the existing awning detail to remove the horizontal frame.
- 12) Study the height of the wainscoting for the rear portion of the building, and consider lowering to the height of the proposed doors.

Action: Zink/Sherry, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, Gilliland/Gross absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 1008 CHINO ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-242-015

Application Number: MST2007-00646

Owner: DB Partners, LLC

Architect: Ken Kruger

(Proposal to demolish two existing residential units and a detached garage and storage shed, with an existing 1,878 square foot building footprint, and construct three new two-story, single-family residential condominiums with three attached two-car garages, on an 11,250 square foot lot in the R-2 Zone. Unit A and B are proposed to be 1,232 square feet and Unit C is proposed to be 1,132 square feet. Each unit will include a 440 square foot attached two-car garage. A total of 258 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map on 1/27/2010.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 005-10. Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(5:35)

Present: Ken Kruger, Architect; Ed Bertling, Owner; and Dan Gullett, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:39 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Preliminary Approval as submitted and continued indefinitely to Consent.

Action: Rivera/Sherry, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, Gilliland/Gross absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

4. 2936 DE LA VINA ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-180-025
 Application Number: MST2010-00129
 Owner: Tan DLV, LLC
 Architect: Peter Ehlen
 Agent: Kathy Stuva

(Proposal for a 112 square foot addition and minor exterior remodel to an existing 7,661 square foot two-story commercial building on a 12,000 square foot lot. The proposal involves minor site alterations to include a reduced driveway width, a new sidewalk, a new ADA path of travel, the removal of two existing trees, and a new backflow device. The parcel includes 16 existing parking spaces to remain.)

(Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

(5:52)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect.

Staff announced that the tree proposed for removal is located within the 20-foot setback and will be reviewed by the Parks and Recreation Commission. The applicant is required to submit an application for a tree removal within the setback to the Parks Department. Landscaping comments from the Board regarding the proposed tree removal are welcome and will be forwarded to the Parks and Recreation Commission.

Public comment opened at 5:58 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the project is ready for Preliminary Approval.
- 2) The Board finds no issue with the proposed tree removal provided there is an appropriate replacement tree.
- 3) Study screening the HVAC unit equipment.

Action: Sherry/Rivera, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Gross absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 616 W MICHELTORENA ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-251-014
Application Number: MST2010-00043
Owner: Antonio J. Gijon
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to construct a new two-story 1,148 square foot single-family residence and attached 457 square foot two-car garage on a 4,450 square foot lot currently developed with an existing one-story 613 square foot single-family residence. The proposal also includes the demolition of an existing 57 square foot enclosed porch, a 100 square foot addition to the existing 613 square foot residence, a new 298 square foot one-car garage, and one new uncovered parking space. A total of four parking spaces will be provided, two for each unit, with three covered spaces and one uncovered space. A total of 14 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The project will abate the violations of enforcement case ENF2009-01334.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

(6:05)

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) Study the detailing of the entry porch on the front unit.
- 2) Indicate on the plans that the existing lattice is to remain on the rear unit's entry.
- 3) Study the window mullions for a more consistent pattern between the fenestration.

Action: Rivera/Sherry, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell abstained, Gilliland/Gross absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**6. 2017 CHAPALA ST****R-2/R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-302-007
Application Number: MST2010-00036
Owner: B.K. Rai
Architect: Garcia Architects

(Proposal for the conversion of an existing two-story 1,893 square foot commercial building into a single-family residence with parking below and to provide a new accessible parking space for the existing 1,451 square foot commercial building. in the front of the lot. The proposal will result in a 1,451 square foot commercial space and a 1,893 square foot single-family residence on a 10,950 square foot lot. A total of eight parking spaces will be provided, two for the single family residence and six for the commercial building. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval on 4/21/10 for zoning modifications to allow encroachments into the required interior setbacks.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 021-10. Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(6:20)

Present: Gil Garcia, Architect; and B. K. Rai, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:24 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of architecture and continued indefinitely to Consent for landscaping review.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Gross absent).

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 6:27 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM****A. 331 N ALISOS ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-371-005
 Application Number: MST2010-00063
 Owner: Richard and Joyce Axilrod, Trustees
 Architect: Pujo & Associates

(Proposal to abate violations in ENF2009-00377 by removing and permitting components of "as-built" construction and alterations. The proposal will restore the site to the last legal permitted conditions to include a total of three residential units, with a two-story duplex and a detached one-story residential unit, four covered parking spaces, remove the "as-built" residential unit above the garage and return to storage area, permit exterior changes to storage area, rebuild exterior stairs to access storage, return the "as-built" garages to carports, remove the "as-built" deck above the carport, permit the "as-built" exterior laundry porch, permit the "as-built" storage compartments, demolish and rebuild the trash enclosure and relocate out of the setbacks, remove "as-built" storage sheds and fences, and add new site landscaping and a play area.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval of Architecture as noted (Sheet A2.1):

- 1) Detail windows on addition (including apron, sills, style and header) to match.
- 2) Landscaping to be continued two weeks for review.

NEW ITEM**B. 1298 LAS POSITAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-034
 Application Number: MST2010-00117
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to install a 525 square foot treatment pad and 4 gas extraction wells for landfill gas collection and control system at Elings Park North. The equipment will be enclosed within a 6 foot tall concrete masonry unit (CMU) wall with a stucco finish, with chain-link dual access gates, and screened with existing and new landscaping.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Match the gate to the existing site trash enclosure gates.
- 2) Utilize white plaster finish at the CMU walls.

NEW ITEM**C. 805 SENDA VERDE A****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-040-053

Application Number: MST2010-00126

Owner: American Baptist Homes of the West

Architect: Craig Burdick

(Proposal to combine two 510 square foot one-bedroom units into one two-bedroom unit with a proposed 200 square feet addition to result in a 1,220 square foot residence located within the Valle Verde Retirement Community. The project includes minor door and window alterations, the demolition of the existing patios with a new 200 square foot patio, and the replacement of 45 linear feet of fence to match existing.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued indefinitely with the comment to center the porch eyebrow roof with the entry door.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Gary Mosel**.