



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, January 11, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
- DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - PRESENT
- CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
- CAROL GROSS – PRESENT @ 3:11 P.M.
- GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
- PAUL ZINK – PRESENT
- CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – ABSENT
- KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - PRESENT
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Thursday, January 7, 2010 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Sherry, Mosel, Zink, Aurell, and Rivera.
Members absent: Gross, Gilliland.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Election of Chair and Vice-Chair for the 2010 Calendar year.

Ms Bedard called for the nominations and elections of Chair and Vice-Chair for the 2010 calendar year.

Results were as follows:

Dawn Sherry nominated Christopher Manson-Hing for the Chair position. As no other nominations were made for the Chair position, an oral vote was conducted and the nomination was unanimously approved: 5/0/1 (Manson-Hing abstained, Gross absent).

Christopher Manson-Hing nominated Dawn Sherry for the Vice-Chair position. As no other nominations were made for the Vice-Chair position, an oral vote was conducted and the nomination was unanimously approved: 5/0/1 (Sherry abstained, Gross absent).

Congratulations to the Chair Christopher Manson-Hing and Vice-Chair Dawn Sherry.

- B. Appointment of Consent Reviews:

Chair Mr. Mason-Hing called appointments for the ABR Consent Review, Liaisons and Subcommittee appointment updates for the 2010 calendar year.

Results were as follows:

Clay Aurell and Gary Mosel are to retain their appointments as ABR Consent Reviewers.

- C. Appointment of Liaisons & Subcommittees

- 1) Dawn Sherry volunteered to maintain her appointment as Sign Committee liaison.
- 2) Paul Zink nominated Keith Rivera to act as alternate liaison to the Sign Committee. Keith Rivera was appointment as Sign Committee alternate liaison.

All other remaining Liaisons and Subcommittee appointments will maintain status quo.

- D. Public Comment:
No public comment.

- E. Approval of Minutes:
Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of December 14, 2009, as amended.
Action: Zink/Rivera, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Gross abstained, Gilliland absent).
- F. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of January 4, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Clay Aurell.
Action: Zink/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of January 11, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Clay Aurell.
Action: Rivera/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland absent).
- G. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- 1) Ms. Bedard announced that the City Council appeal hearing for 803 N. Milpas St. will be held on Tuesday, January 26, 2010.
 - 2) Mr. Limon presented the new "Resident's Guide to Navigating the Planning Process" brochure, and the City's "Planning Central" website.
 - 3) Board member Rivera announced that he will be stepping down from Item #1, 825 De La Vina Street.
- H. Subcommittee Reports.
Chair Manson-Hing reported on the day's NextG subcommittee task meeting and requested that this subcommittee be added to the 2010 Subcommittee list.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1. 825 DE LA VINA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-024
Application Number: MST2007-00400
Owner: 825 De La Vina, LLC
Architect: Keith Rivera

(Proposal for two new three-story mixed-use buildings to include a total of seven residential condominiums and three commercial condominiums on an existing 14,750 square foot lot. The proposal includes four, one-bedroom and three, two-bedroom residential units, varying in size from 752 to 1,662 square feet. The commercial units will range in size from 218 to 250 square feet. The proposal will result in 8,191 square feet of residential area and 686 square feet of commercial area for a total of 8,877 square feet. A total of 19 parking spaces will be provided on site (14 covered and five uncovered). Planning Commission approval is requested for a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review of a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(3:19)

Present: Jeffrey Donner, Co-owner; Lorne Henkel, Architect Representative; and Lori Romano, Landscape Architect; Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner; and Chelsey Swanson, Assistant Transportation Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m.

The following public comment spoke either in support or in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Judy Lawrence, in opposition.
- 2) Steve Hausz, in opposition.
- 3) Don Sharpe, (submitted letter) in opposition.
- 4) Norm Papp, (co-owner of proposed project) in support.
- 5) Don Elconin, in support.
- 6) Susan Thompson, (submitted letter) in opposition.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 3:55 p.m.

Ms. Brodison read to the Board the December 3, 2009, Planning Commission draft comments.

Ms. Swanson clarified for the Board the Ordinance requirements regarding vehicle lifts, use, and allowed vehicular maneuvering space and setback requirements.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Carry forward previous 11/16/09 comment #3: *“Study the architectural starkness of the project, and provide additional detailing of the proposed design style.”* Provide an integrated design at all four elevations. Redesign the exposed north west elevation to be less massive and in keeping with the architectural style.
- 2) Remove the overhang on the third level as it does not represent the proposed style.
- 3) Consider additional planting at the southeast elevation, and consider removing the southern entry arch.
- 4) Consider an appropriate solution to the mail boxes.
- 5) Provide building sections with plate heights and property lines.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Confirm with the Transportation Division staff to maximize the landscaping potential at the south property line.
- 2) Study an appropriate design for integration of trees on the south property line.
- 3) Increase the width of the proposed 18-inch landscaping planting strip, which is to minimal.

Action: Sherry/Zink, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, Rivera stepped down, Gilliland absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 535 E MONTECITO ST****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-351-010
 Application Number: MST2006-00530
 Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: John Campanella
 Architect: William Hezmalhalch Architects, Inc.
 Applicant: Bill McReynolds

(The proposal is a redesign of a project previously approved by the Planning Commission. The proposed project consists of 48 residential condominium units in four, two- and three-story buildings, on a 1.8-acre vacant lot. The size of the residential units would vary, ranging between 1,100 and 1,700 square feet. Each of the four buildings would contain twelve residential units and would have individual courtyards. All units would have a two-car garage, with 50% in a side by side configuration and 50% in a tandem configuration. Six guest parking spaces would be provided, resulting in a total of 102 on-site parking spaces. Vehicle access would be provided from East Montecito Street, with emergency access only from Calle Cesar Chavez. Forty of the 48 units would be sold as below-market rate units. A 14-foot wide shared access easement is provided along the western perimeter of the project site. The prior approvals consisted of a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Modification to provide less than the required amount of guest parking and City Council approval of a Specific Plan (SP-10). The redesigned project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination at the Planning Commission.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination.)

(4:53)

Present: John Campanella, Applicant/Bermant Homes; Bill McReynolds, Developer/Partner from City Ventures, Inc.; and Jeff Chelwick from William Hezmalhalch, Architects; Katy O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

The Applicant clarified that other site plans were explored and researched.

Kathleen Kennedy, the case planner, indicated that a Specific Plan was approved for the project site which allows for zero setbacks for this project.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board feels that that site plan is inappropriate and needs more study, suggestions include integrating the courtyards to provide a more village-like feel to the site planning. Study ways to design and then phase the project, rather than allowing phasing to dictate the design.
- 2) The applicant is encouraged to move away from the "pin-wheel" design and the repetitiveness of the four-quadrants; however, repetitive buildings could work on the site if there is more of a village feel and the site plan and courtyards work together.
- 3) The architecture seems appropriate for the site; however, the Board reserves further architectural comments until the site planning is resolved.
- 4) Provide composite elevations of all four sides, including the interior alleys, if applicable.

Action: Aurell/Gross, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 920 E ORTEGA ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-182-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00480
 Owner: Brett Vernon
 Architect: Leonard Grant

(Proposal to demolish an existing 297 square foot detached one-car garage and construct a new 594 square foot detached two-car garage and a new 449 square foot second-story accessory dwelling unit above on a 5,000 square foot lot. The proposal includes a minor alteration to the existing 1,121 square foot residence, to include a 36 square foot demolition and 63 square foot addition resulting in a 1,148 square foot residence. A total of three parking spaces are proposed, including two covered and one new uncovered tandem parking space. Proposal will include abatement of violations listed in ZIR2009-00224.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(5:39)

Present: Leonard Grant, Architect; Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect; and Brett Vernon, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:45 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with the condition to add additional plantings along the driveway and opportunity for vines on the trellis.

Action: Rivera/Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 3763 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-052
 Application Number: MST2009-00560
 Owner: Regency Centers, LP
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architecture
 Owner: Regency Centers
 Business Name: Whole Foods Market

(Proposal to demolish an existing 5,154 square foot one-story commercial building and construction of 35 new vehicle parking spaces and 28 bicycle spaces. The proposal will include a new pedestrian friendly connection from State Street to Whole Foods, new bioswales and landscaping to include the removal and relocation of 12 trees and 25 new trees, new exterior lighting on Whole Foods, 5 new parking lot fixtures, and bollard lighting within the pedestrian pathway.)

(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

(5:49)

Present: Brian Cearnal and Adam Cunningham, Architects; and Susan Van Atta, Landscape

Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:54 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with conditions:

- 1) Provide cut sheets for both the parking lot lights and canopy lights on the drawings.
- 2) Show notation that the existing monument sign is to be removed at the building to be demolished.
- 3) Remove the colored concrete at the public right-of-way sidewalk.
- 4) Verify the existing 6-inch maximum curb at the boardwalk / wheel chair stops.

Action: Zink/Sherry, 5/2/0. Motion carried. (Gross/Mosel opposed, Gilliland absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 20 MINUTES AT 6:10 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 6:30 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 403 E MONTECITO ST

M-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-343-010
 Application Number: MST2009-00557
 Owner: A. R. Span, Trust
 Agent: Nick Gonzalez

(Proposal for an upgrade to an existing Sprint/Nextel wireless facility to include the addition of four new antennas (3 new panel antennas and 1 new parabolic antenna), 1 new radio equipment rack, and the replacement of 1 existing panel antenna. The proposed antennas will be located on the roof of an existing commercial building. The proposal involves the construction of one new 12 square foot faux chimney to match an existing faux chimney. The proposed 2 panel antennas and 1 parabolic antenna will be located within the new faux chimney and 1 new panel antenna and the replacement antenna will be located within the existing faux chimney. The site is currently developed with 6 panel antennas and the proposal will result in a total of 10 antennas. The project requires Findings of No Visual Impacts.)

(Project requires Findings of No Visual Impacts.)

(6:30)

Present: Nick Gonzalez, Agent for Sprint/Nextel.

Public comment opened at 6:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with the Findings of No Visual Impacts, and with the applicant to provide final design details of the faux chimney.

Action: Sherry/Rivera, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell/Gross/Gilliland absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 25 E MASON ST****O-C/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-012
Application Number: MST2009-00567
Owner: Santa Barbara Beach Properties, LP
Applicant: Clearwire
Agent: Nick Gonzalez

(Proposal for the installation of a broadband wireless telecommunications facility provided by Sprint/Clearwire consisting of 3 panel antennas and 2 parabolic antennas mounted on the roof of the existing building within existing rooftop screening, and a small radio equipment cabinet located in an existing equipment room within the building. This application was previously permitted under MST2007-00197, which expired before it was constructed. The project requires Findings of No Visual Impacts.)

(Project requires Findings of No Visual Impacts.)

(6:44)

Present: Nick Gonzalez, Agent for Sprint/Clearwire Wireless.

Public comment opened at 6:46 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

The Board acknowledged that there should be no visible structures added to the building.

Motion: Preliminary and Final Approval as submitted with the Finding of No Visual Impacts. The Board understands that there are no new exterior alterations proposed.

Action: Gross/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell/Gilliland absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 949 VERONICA SPRINGS RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-040-022
Application Number: MST2009-00561
Owner: First Baptist Church of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Nick Gonzalez

(Proposal for the installation of a new radio telecommunications facility provided by Sprint/Clearwire Wireless, to consist of 3 panel antennas, 3 parabolic antennas, and a small radio equipment cabinet located at an existing church. The proposal also includes an exterior alteration to the existing building to replace the existing wood siding with stucco. The proposed antennas will be located behind a transparent screening element attached to the existing rooftop cupola. The proposed radio equipment cabinet will be located on the ground and screened by a new 27 linear foot, 5 foot tall cmu wall. This proposal is aesthetically the same as the MST2007-00150 case and which subsequently expired on 9/4/09. The project requires Findings of No Visual Impacts.)

(Project requires Findings of No Visual Impacts.)

(6:51)

Present: Nick Gonzalez, Agent for Sprint/Clearwire Wireless.

Public comment opened at 6:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Applicant to research the feasibility of reducing the dimension, in plan view, of the proposed parapet.
- 2) The proposed conduit to be hidden within the existing structure (i.e., located in the interior of the building).
- 3) Return with all proposed finishes and detailing.

Action: Sherry/Gross, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell/Gilliland absent).

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 7:04 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR

CONTINUED ITEM

A. 3979 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-021
Application Number: MST2009-00435
Owner: Five Points Shopping Center
Applicant: Jim Craddock
Business Name: California Pasta

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to an existing commercial business in the Five Points Shopping Center. Alterations include permitting an "as-built" water fountain, and the removal of the "as-built" heaters. The proposal will abate enforcement case ENF2003-00949.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Preliminary Approval and Final Approval as noted.

Item on Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell**.