



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, August 10, 2009 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:09 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
- DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - ABSENT
- CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
- CAROL GROSS – PRESENT @ 3:42 P.M.
- GARY MOSEL - ABSENT
- PAUL ZINK – PRESENT
- CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – ABSENT
- KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician – ABSENT
 JOANNE LA CONTE, Assistant Planner – PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Thursday, August 6, 2009 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:09 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Zink, Gross (present @ 3:42 p.m.), Aurell, and Rivera.
Members absent: Sherry, Mosel, and Gilliland

Staff present: La Conte and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **July 27, 2009**, as amended.
Action: Zink/Aurell, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing abstained, Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland/Gross absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 10, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Carol Gross**.
Action: Rivera/Aurell, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland/Gross absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 3, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Carol Gross**.
Action: Aurell/Rivera, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland/Gross absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Ms. LaConte made announced that Board members Sherry, Mosel, and Gilliland will be absent from the meeting.
- 2) Board member Zink announced that he will be stepping down from agenda Item #1, 421 N. Milpas Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

CONTINUED DISCUSSION ITEM:**(3:10)****REVIEW OF REVISED AUGUST 2009 DRAFT OF UPPER STATE STREET DESIGN AREA GUIDELINES.**

City Staff Presenter: Heather Baker, Project Planner; and Bettie Weiss, City Planner.

Staff reported edits and updates made to the August 2009 Draft of the Upper State Street Design Area Guidelines (Guidelines).

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m.

Paul Hernadi (submitted letter from Naomi Kovacs-Citizens Planning Assoc.): expressed concern regarding further reinforcement of S-D-2 Zone; requested a general statement be included on need to improve air quality; requested the square footage of all required open spaces, sidewalks, and driveways be subtracted from a two-story structure's buildable size; and requested a change on the statement regarding "community benefits."

Regarding the requested "community benefits" phrasing, Staff recommended replacing the phrase "with the provision of substantial community benefits..." for "with the inclusion of benefits for the community at large, provided in quantity and quality beyond customary requirements..." on Page 5-4 of the final draft of the Guidelines to be consistent with Guideline 24. The Board concurred.

The Board acknowledged public comment email and letters from Richard Solomon (regarding the S-D-2 Zone required 20-foot setback) and Paula Westbury.

Public comment closed at 3:24 p.m.

Staff confirmed the Draft Guidelines will be ready for review by City Council after comments are incorporated from this meeting.

Discussion held.**Board Suggestions and Comments:**

1. Table of Contents: Change Chapter 3 to new title "Design Elements".
2. Clarify a statement that photo examples are to be reviewed in the context of what they are illustrating only, but not to consider each building or site layout pictured as a complete appropriate solution.
3. Clarify that although City transportation and other public improvement projects are subject to these Guidelines, the Guidelines mainly address development projects on individual properties.
4. Page 1-6: Delete reference to "North State" in the text, since it is not illustrated.
5. Chapter 3: Correct pagination/formatting in Chapter 3, and on Page 3-2.
6. Page 3-2: Correct Figure 5 to show Mac Kenzie Park as on the south side of the street.
7. Page 4-2 Guideline 59: Soften this language regarding removing parking lot barriers. The practicality of suggestions such as linking parking lots together and removing barriers between lots is questionable, and cannot be legally enforced in adjusting private and commercial property lines.
8. Page 4-3 – Goal: Delete or clarify the phrase "or district" in the goal.
9. Examine Guideline 11 on page 3-4 and compare to reference on Mediterranean architecture on Page 3-14.
10. It would be better if the Guidelines could provide guidance to assist in "fine-tuning" Board decisions on land-use and density issues. Guidelines could provide a stronger "vision" for the area.

11. Some contradictions exist in the Guidelines and the lack of clear direction provided for possible future situations such as encouragement and provision for outdoor pedestrian-friendly environments. In some cases, it provides over-broad direction regarding “key characteristics” mentioned. In addition, some graphic diagrams (Fig. 3-3) should be clarified.
12. Correct the name of Loretto vs. San Roque Plaza.

Ms. Weiss requested the Board to specifically review the “compatibility” section of the Draft Guidelines in Chapter 5.

Motion: To forward the Upper State Street Area Design Guidelines to City Council with a recommendation for adoption with the recommended minor changes incorporated:

- 1) The Board looks forward to the Plan Santa Barbara process creating a comprehensive vision for the Upper State Street area and a future update to the Upper State Street Area Design Guidelines to communicate that vision.
- 2) The Board has concerns regarding implementation of draft Guideline 59, regarding removing parking lot barriers, and would like to see a revision and softened language for this Guideline.

Action: Zink/Rivera, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell abstained, Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

1. 421 N MILPAS ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-303-021
 Application Number: MST2009-00321
 Owner: Steven Wells
 Architect: Burnell Branch & Pester

(Proposal for minor alterations to the existing two-story, 2,366 square foot mixed-use building, comprised of 1,528 square feet of commercial space and an 838 square foot second story residential unit. The proposed alterations include new doors and windows, new wrought iron railing, new awnings, improvements to the courtyard, a new plaster wall, new landscaping, and site improvements including the demolition of an existing shed and "as-built" canopy structure. The proposal includes a change of use from a restaurant/bakery to office. No new square footage is proposed. An existing, detached 515 square foot single-family residential unit will remain unaltered. The proposal will abate ENF2009-00253.)

(Preliminary and Final Approval are requested.)

(4:02)

Present: Tracy Burnell and Britt Jewett, Architects; and Derek Eikenberger, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:08 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) On the east elevation, the small window is to match the adjacent window.
- 2) Applicant has the option to submit an application to install grills on the windows at a later date.
- 3) The two new windows along Milpas Street are to be recessed in the same dimension as the proposed door on the Milpas Street elevation.

Action: Gross/Aurell, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink stepped down, Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

FINAL REVIEW**2. 810 BOND AVE****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-234-022
Application Number: MST2004-00351
Owner: Peter Kurrels
Agent: Steve Orosz

(Proposal to convert an existing four-story 6,171 square foot mixed-use development to condominiums. The 7,185 square foot lot is currently developed with three multi-family residential units totaling 3,000 square feet and 3,171 square feet of commercial space. The residential units to be converted to condominiums consist of one 601 square foot one-bedroom unit, one 1,137 square foot two-bedroom unit, and one 1,262 square foot three-bedroom unit. The commercial space would become a commercial condominium. Seven parking spaces are provided onsite. No exterior architectural alterations are proposed. Planning Commission is required for review of the Tentative Subdivision Map and Condominium Conversion.)

(A Substantial Conformance Determination approval was recommended at Planning Commission on 7/23/09. Preliminary and Final Approval are requested.)

(4:33)

Present: Steve Orosz, Agent; and David Black, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Final Approval with the condition for the applicant to add another potted plant at the angled parking stall as noted on the plans.

Action: Zink/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 505 WENTWORTH AVE****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-143-010
Application Number: MST2007-00345
Owner: Wentworth Investors, LLC
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to construct three new two story residential condominiums on an existing 6,500 square foot vacant lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposal includes 2 two-bedroom units totaling 2,128 square feet and 1 one-bedroom unit totaling 1,042 square feet. An attached 438 square foot two-car garage is proposed for each unit. The parcel has a 2% slope and 256.7 yards of grading is proposed.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 057-09.)

(4:54)

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with conditions and continued one week to Consent Calendar:

- 1) Study the necessary changes to make the front porch area more usable; and widen the porch area by 5-feet minimum from the guard rail.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) In the front yard portion of the planter intruding into the sidewalk, incorporate plantings large enough to deter pedestrians from walking through the planter area.
- 2) Reconsider the two trees in the front yard placed within 20 feet of each other to be of a different species due to size at maturity.
- 3) Correct the plan legend of tree in the back yard to correct the referenced "AG GRA" and identify the referenced tree.
- 4) The backflow area should be reconsidered for optimal screening.

Action: Rivera/Gross, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

4. 505 W LOS OLIVOS ST

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-210-012

Application Number: MST2007-00470

Owner: Douglas Jones

Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(The 13 unit condominium project includes a lot merger; demolition of a duplex and detached garage; demolition of a single-family residence and attached garage; construction of nine new three bedroom units and one new two-bedroom unit in three new buildings; addition to the existing apartment building; and remodel and conversion of the apartment building into two three-bedroom and one one-bedroom condominiums. The parking for the converted apartment building would be provided by one uncovered and five covered spaces in the existing carport and the parking for the ten newly constructed units would be provided with two-car garages attached to each unit. Three guest parking spaces would also be provided. The proposed development would total 24,635 square feet on the 32,550 square foot lot. Two of the three-bedroom units would be provided to middle income households using a target income of 130% of Area Median Income (AMI) consistent with the Inclusionary Housing Ordinance.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 022-09.)

(5:17)

Present: Detlev Peikert, and Bonnie Sangster, Peikert Group Architects.

Public comment opened at 5:36 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Ralph Philbrook, expressed concern regarding the privacy and public view of the adjacent property; requested one-story entry way length, width, and depth scaled dimensions on the plans.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 5:32 p.m.

- Motion:** **Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**
- 1) Study the entry porch foyer of Unit #10.
 - 2) On Unit #3, study the east elevation and how it addresses the neighboring property.
 - 3) Return with samples and suggestions for an appropriate revised color palette to introduce accent colors into the proposed project.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Incorporate either two medium sized trees or one large canopy tree to give a more finished appearance to the landscape in the ground cover planter area at the end of the entry driveway hardscape.
- 2) Incorporate full sized shrubs at least 30-inch minimum height in the planter area of the guest parking area to provide additional separation from the lawn area and the trellis and a more finished appearance to the landscape.
- 3) Incorporate some accent rounded shrubs or introduce corner shrubs into the interior walkway area to preserve the intentioned landscape.
- 4) Applicant to make a commitment to incorporate comparable sized oak trees at the entry frontage area, as a compromise, if the existing oak trees are not successfully transplanted within two years after landscape completion.
- 5) Provide stepping stones or a method to redirect pedestrian traffic to preserve landscaping in the planting areas along Los Olivos Street.
- 6) Balance the amount of ground cover plantings and shrubbery so that there is less ground cover and more shrubs for the interior walkway areas and along the Los Olivos Street planting areas.

Action: Aurell/Rivera, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing opposed, Sherry/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

Staff Comments: Staff requested the applicant to check with the assigned planner regarding applicable street tree requirements.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 6:02 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**FINAL REVIEW****A. 631 OLIVE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-005
 Application Number: MST2008-00577
 Owner: Carl and Constance Lindberg
 Applicant: Sefton Graham

(The project consists of a change of use of an existing 1,091 square foot one-story, single-family residence into a mixed-use building comprised of 629 commercial square feet, with the remaining 462 square feet to remain a residential unit. No exterior alterations are proposed to the existing building. The proposal involves various site improvements including new driveway paving materials, four uncovered parking spaces, including one accessible parking space, and additional site landscaping. The project was reviewed by the Staff Hearing Officer on 7/29/09 for a Medical Cannabis Dispensary Permit and requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 065-09.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 065-09.)

Postponed indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 435 E HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-212-026
 Application Number: MST2009-00232
 Owner: D J Holdings, LLC
 Architect: Thompson Naylor Architects

(Proposal to permit an "as-built" spray booth, "as-built" building color changes, to install a Title 24 compliant accessible ramp, remove two doors at the rear of the building, reinstall existing door to clear new ramp, and install new fencing around the trash enclosure.)

(Final approval is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 3768 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-034
 Application Number: MST2009-00363
 Owner: Gwen Griffin Santa Barbara, LLC
 Architect: Callison Architects

(Proposed replacement of two existing walk-up ATMs and addition of two over-night depositories. Additional improvements are proposed for the accessible path of travel for an existing ADA parking space. The ATM surrounds and awnings are being replaced prior a prior approval for MST2009-00191)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**D. 3855 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-010
Application Number: MST2009-00210
Owner: Grace Lutheran Church of Santa Barb
Owner: Macerich La Cumbre, LLC
Applicant: The Vons Companies, Inc.
Architect: Courtney & Le Architects
Agent: Little Div Architectural Consulting

(Proposal for an exterior facade remodel at the Vons in the La Cumbre Plaza. The proposal includes restriping parking stalls, the addition of accessible stalls and pathways per city requirements, new roof top equipment, exterior lighting, and landscaping.)

(Preliminary Approval granted 7/13/09. Final Approval of Architecture and Landscaping is requested.)

Final Approval of Architecture as submitted; and Final Approval of Landscaping as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 911 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-312-006
Application Number: MST2009-00312
Owner: Aguadulce Limited II, LP
Architect: Lenvik & Minor

(Proposal for alterations to the existing commercial buildings at 911 and 913 De La Vina Street to include revising the existing storefronts, a new stucco exterior veneer, and replacement of the rear door at 913 De La Vina Street. Site improvements proposed include re-paving and re-striping the four existing parking spaces, with the addition of one accessible space, the construction of a new trash enclosure, and new landscaping.)

(Preliminary and Final Approval of Landscaping are requested.)

Preliminary Approval and Final Approval of Landscaping as submitted.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Carol Gross**.