



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, January 12, 2009 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:07 P.M.**
BOARD MEMBERS:

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT
- DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - PRESENT
- CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
- JIM BLAKELEY - PRESENT
- CAROL GROSS – PRESENT
- GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
- PAUL ZINK – PRESENT
- CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT
- KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Thursday, January 8, 2009 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:07 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Manson-Hing, Sherry, Mosel, Zink, Gross, Blakely, Aurell, Rivera, and Gilliland.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the special Architectural Board of Review meeting of January 6, 2009, as amended.
Action: Zink/Sherry, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

The Consent Calendar of January 5, 2009 was cancelled.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of January 12, 2009. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Clay Aurell with the exception of the landscaping for Items B and C which were reviewed by Carol Gross.
Action: Aurell/Sherry, 9/00. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.**1) Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:**

- a) At the January 26th meeting, Long Range planning staff will be giving a presentation on an Alternate Building Height Charter Amendment relative to reducing building heights in commercial zones that may go on the ballot in November of this year. The charter amendment would be an alternative to the Save El Pueblo Viejo Charter Amendment. The purpose is to give input to Council on design and land use issues and soliciting the Board's input on the key components.
- b) Item #3, 700 Block Alamar Street has been continued to the March 9th Full Board meeting at the applicant's request in order to give the applicant time to schedule and hold public neighborhood meetings and address neighborhood public concerns. It was announced by staff that this item will

NOT be re-noticed as a specific date was scheduled for this item, instead a timely agenda will be mailed to all listed interested parties and posted on the City website.

2) Member Rivera announced he will be stepping down from Item #2, 825 De La Vina Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Member Blakeley requested an update on a pending enforcement case regarding McDonald's at 1906 Cliff Drive.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

1. HALEY - DE LA VINA ST BRIDGE

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-203-001

Application Number: MST2003-00651

Owner: City of Santa Barbara, Public Works

Engineer: Bengal Engineering

Applicant: James Colton, Project Manager II

Architect: Penfield and Smith Engineers, Inc.

Landscape Architect: David Black

(Proposal for the demolition and reconstruction of the bridge spanning Mission Creek at the intersection of Haley and De La Vina Streets. The proposed bridge will be widened to accommodate the 20-year storm-water flow in the creek. The project also includes the demolition of the house located at 434 De La Vina Street.)

(Preliminary Approval expired 12/17/08. Preliminary and Final Approval is requested.)

(3:21)

Present: Scott Onishuk, Bengal Engineering; David Black, Landscape Architect; and James Colton, Project Manager II, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed. An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Preliminary and Final Approval with the following conditions:

- 1) Work with City staff to resolve the proposal to rebuild the existing over height non-conforming fence in the front setback at 132 E. Haley Street. Include consideration of landscaping opportunities in front of the fence or preferably clinging to walls for neighborhood beautification and to prevent graffiti tagging.
- 2) Provide a recycle and trash receptacles at each side of the bridge.
- 3) All signal boxes and man-made built cabinets on the deck are to be painted Malaga green.
- 4) Study relocating the 6-foot chain link fence on the downstream side away from the sidewalk, and provide some non-fenced in landscaping on the creek side of the walkway.
- 5) Work with City staff regarding the possibility of increasing the tree sizes where possible using preferably nursery stock (15 gal.). (The landscaping palette is better suited to an urban neighborhood rather than the more familiar native or riparian plantings.)

Action: Zink/Gross, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 825 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-024
Application Number: MST2007-00400
Owner: 825 De La /Popp LLC
Architect: B3 Architects

(Proposal for a new three-story mixed-use project to include seven residential condominiums and a total of 750 square feet of commercial space on an existing 14,750 square foot parking lot in the C-2 Zone. The proposal includes four one-bedroom and three two-bedroom residential condominiums, which vary in size from 809 to 1,776 square feet. A total of 19 parking spaces will be provided onsite (14 covered and 5 uncovered). Project requires Planning Commission review of a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(4:13)

Present: Doug Singletary, B3Architects.

Public comment opened at 4:30 p.m.

Jeff Ridenour, support: would like the project to move forward.

Don Elconin, support: past insensitive tree trimming and property line issues, which are currently being appreciatively worked out with Mr. Sharpe.

A support letter was submitted and read into the record by Donald G. Sharpe and acknowledged by the Board.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 4:38 p.m.

Straw vote: How many of the Board like Option A or Option B? Board stated no option preference.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

ARCHITECTURE:

- 1) The Board appreciates the new direction of the project and improved mass, bulk and scale. Applicant to look for other future opportunities of the proposed design.
- 2) Maximize the lighting opportunities of the light wells to the neighbor to the north.
- 3) Integrate the chosen design elements to work in better harmony and cohesion.
- 4) Maximize the relief created at building openings, such as doors, windows, etc.
- 5) Study the garage proposal for a stack garage and other opportunities allowed for an improved design.
- 6) Board looks forward to a proposal that would bring stylistic elements together cohesively.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Maximize landscaping options by reviewing (the driveway) turning radius for an improved entry and egress.
- 2) Study the trash enclosure for an alternate location.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan.
- 4) Study the linearity of the south property line for bulb-out opportunities.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera stepped down).

***** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS CONTINUED AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST TO THE MARCH 9TH MEETING. *****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 700 BLK E ALAMAR AVE 2588 SEG ID

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-588
 Application Number: MST2008-00554
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Public Works
 Architect: Synergy Development Services
 Applicant: Omnipoint Communications

(This is a new project proposal for the installation of three new 59 inch wireless panel antennas to be mounted on top of a utility pole located within the public right-of-way. The combined height of the utility pole and panel antennas is 43 feet. The project will remove the existing utility pole and replace with a new pole. The new utility pole will be located approximately four feet east to comply with ADA sidewalk accessibility. The antenna coaxial cables will be mounted flush on the utility pole and the antennas will be painted brown to match the utility pole. The project also includes two above ground power pedestals at 4 feet and 3.7 feet in height. The remaining equipment will be located in an underground (7 x 17 foot) equipment vault. The proposal also includes removal and replacement of 20 feet of existing curb and gutter per city standards. Per SBMC 28.94.030.DD.5 the project may be determined to be exempt from a Conditional Use Permit if the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) can make the findings of No Visual Impacts. The ABR's purview involves the location of the antenna on site, and color and size of the proposed antenna so as to minimize any adverse visual impacts.)

(Project requires Findings of No Visual Impacts.)

Continued to the March 9th Full Board meeting at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 101 S LA CUMBRE

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-027
 Application Number: MST2008-00084
 Owner: Avenue 26 Holdings, LLC
 Owner: The Horowitz Group
 Owner: Worchell Family Trust
 Architect: Callison Architects
 Business Name: Wachovia

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,656 square foot gas station and construct a new 3,332 square foot one-story building for Wachovia Bank on a 26,605 square foot lot in the C-2 Zone. The proposal includes a walk up depository, ATM, new site landscaping, 15 new parking spaces, 3 bicycle spaces, and a new trash enclosure. The project requires Development Plan Approval by Architectural Board of Review for the allocation of 1,676 square feet of new non-residential square footage.)

(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, and Development Plan Approval.)

(5:07)

Present: Mackey Deasy, Callison Architects.

Public comment opened at 5:21 p.m.

Deborah Kovanda, requested clarification on the proposed project.
An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:23 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

ARCHITECTURE:

- 1) Redesign the site layout with emphasis on the public/pedestrian presence.
- 2) Restudy the architectural detailing to be authentic
- 3) The building to address the corner to the public, both vehicular and pedestrian, to have a public presence to the front of the property and the way the building works with the parking lot.
- 4) Return with height information on the adjacent buildings, including the height of the existing gas station to be removed.

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Study opportunities to expand on the landscaping provided on the site, specifically to provide finger planters to the parking lot.
- 2) Restudy use of the *crepe myrtle* and *melaleuca* trees.
- 3) Restudy the use of the plantings, *myoporium* (ground cover) in the parkway
- 4) Add additional landscaping in the *festuca* beds.

Action: Zink/Blakeley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 1405 HARBOR VIEW DR

R-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-292-005
Application Number: MST2007-00278
Owner: Carlos Villareal
Architect: Tom Jacobs

(Proposal to demolish an existing 985 square foot single-family residence and 337 square foot detached garage and construct two new two-story, single-family residences with attached two-car garages. Unit 1 is proposed to be 1,900 square feet, and the second unit is proposed to be 1,834 square feet, including the two-car garage. Total proposed development includes 3,734 square feet on a 7,320 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The project received Staff Hearing Officer Approval of a Coastal Development Permit and modifications on 12/17/08 (Resolution No 093-08).

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 093-08.)

(5:34)

Present: Tom Jacobs, Architect; and Carlos Villareal, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.
An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:ARCHITECTURE:

- 1) Carry forward Comment #3: "The applicant is to study window proportions, locations, styles and variety of uses on the east and other elevations..."
- 2) Carry forward Comment #5: "Some Board members commented that the south elevation of Unit 1 needs more design character as it faces Old Coast Highway."
- 3) Carry forward Comment #6: "Study the master bedroom balconies as they appear to be cantilevered a bit too far," *from the building face and need to be detailed appropriately.*
- 4) Carry forward Comment #8: "Some Board members prefer that the units have a less mirrored image. Some Board members are concerned that some windows are too large at the stairways and other locations."
- 5) Carry forward Comment #10: "Some Board members are concerned that the roof level stair element may be adding unnecessary height..."
- 6) Carry forward Comment #13: "Verify and show on the site plan locations of existing neighbors and the proximity of windows and outdoor spaces."

LANDSCAPING:

- 1) On the southeast portion of the property: a) relocate the proposed tree to be closer to the driveway, b) eliminate lawn in that area, and c) provide plants of varying heights to break up the visual of the garage door.
- 2) Substitute the *society garlic* plantings for a more substantial foundation plant.
- 3) Provide pavers in parkway to create a connection between the street and stairs.
- 4) Provide planting throughout the parkway, per the Parkway Code for a maximum height of 8-inches.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 6:31 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 2108 LAS CANOAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-030-031
Application Number: MST2005-00456
Owner: Donald A. and Lorna Lea McGilvray
Architect: Scott Branch
Architect: Burnell & Jewett

(Proposal for a new 2,192 square foot one-story single-family dwelling and a 611 square foot detached garage with a second-floor 478 square foot artist studio on a 4.64 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes 490 cubic yards of cut and 505 cubic yards of fill grading outside the main building footprint.)

(Review After Final of minor changes to accessory building stairs and relocate Fire Department required turnaround.)

Approval as noted on Sheets #A.1 and #A.15 for Review After Final with conditions:

1. Provide chimney cap details.
2. Add two new trees at the following locations: a) one at the hammerhead turnaround location; and b) one at the revised stairs at the garage.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**B. 1800 - 2300 CLIFF, LIGHTHOUSE, MEIGS, ETC**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-142-RW
Application Number: MST2007-00473
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Lisa Arroyo, Project Engineer

(Proposal to underground existing overhead utility lines along Cliff Drive between Salida Del Sol and Mesa Lane and portions of Lighthouse Road, Meigs Road, Camino Calma, and Flora Vista Drive. The project includes 20 new street lights on 27 foot, Type "A" poles, and installation of 3 new electric meter pedestals for connection of the new street lights.)

(Preliminary Approval granted on 6/16/08. Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 1115 QUINIENTOS ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-141-014
Application Number: MST2005-00609
Owner: Jaime and Robin Melgoza
Agent: Justin Van Mullem
Architect: Keith Nolan
Landscape Architect: Charles McClure

(Proposal to construct three detached two-story condominium units totaling 5,823 square feet with three attached two-car garages totaling 1,377 square feet on an 11,275 square foot vacant lot. Two additional uncovered parking spaces are proposed.)

(Final Approval of Architecture granted 12/15/08. Final Approval of Landscaping is requested.)

Final Approval as noted that the front fence is to be set back 28-inches from the sidewalk.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Clay Aurell**, with the exception of landscaping for Items B and C, reviewed by **Carol Gross**.