



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, April 07, 2008

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

MARK WIENKE, Chair
 CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Vice-Chair
 CLAY AURELL
 JIM BLAKELEY
 GARY MOSEL
 RANDY MUDGE
 DAWN SHERRY
 PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Call to order.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m. by Vice-Chair Manson-Hing.

B. Roll call.

Members present: Aurell (out 4:25 to 4:54), Blakeley (arrived 3:43), Manson-Hing, Mosel (arrived 3:10), Mudge, Sherry (out 5:23 to 5:40, left at 8:19), Wienke (arrived at 3:10; out 4:09 to 6:54), Zink (arrived at 3:15)

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Bedard, Limon (left at 4:25), Shafer

C. Public Comment:

No public comment.

D. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of Tuesday, March 18, 2008, as amended.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Blakeley, Mosel, Wienke, and Zink absent.)

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of March 24, 2008, as amended.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel abstained. Blakeley, Wienke, and Zink absent.)

E. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar. The Consent Calendar of March 31, 2008 was reviewed by Manson-Hing.

Action: Mosel//Sherry, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Blakeley absent.)

Motion: Table the Consent Calendar of April 7, 2008, until later in the meeting.

Action: Sherry/Wienke, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Blakeley absent.)

(3:43 reopened Consent Minutes)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of April 7, 2008. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Sherry with the exception of the landscaping for Items F, reviewed by Randy Mudge.

Action: Sherry/Wienke, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Blakeley absent.)

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

a) Board member Sherry will step down from Item 7.

b) Chair Wienke will step down from Items 1, 2, and 3.

G. Subcommittee Reports.

Airport Sub-Committee: Members Wienke and Manson-Hing reported on Airport design progress. Mr. Limon reported that the project could return at a Special Meeting on April 15, 22, or 29, and added that any changes must be consistent with the Preliminary Approval which was granted. It was the preference of the Board that the regular meeting of April 21 begin one hour early, 2:00 p.m., for review of the Airport.

H. Possible Ordinance Violations.

The Board requested verification that the planting at the Mesa Center matches the landscaping plan approved by the Board. Member Mudge will review plans and making a site visit.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

(3:45) Water Conservation requirements for new construction and renovations at City facilities adopted by City Council on February 5, 2008.

Staff: Allison W. Jordon, Water Conservation Coordinator

Ms. Jordan provided a presentation and handout of the changes which were approved by Council. After the presentation Ms. Jordan was available to answer questions.

Individual or collective comments:

Suggested water softener standards be metered use rather than timed, and requirements for dishwasher and washer be low water use. Types of washers vary greatly on water consumption and energy use.

Comments only; no action taken.

(3:49) Proposed revisions to the City's Water Conservation Landscape Design Standards originally adopted by City Council in June, 1989.

Staff: Allison W. Jordan, Water Conservation Coordinator

Ms. Jordan provided a presentation of the process and proposed changes to the Guidelines.

The Board had the following individual or collective comment:

Suggested reducing the threshold for requiring a controlled irrigation system.

Comments only; no action taken.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**1. 2780 STATE ST 1****R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-600-001

Application Number: MST2008-00111

Owner: Robertson 2002 Family Trust

Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal for a new 280 square foot trash enclosure for existing commercial condominium units. The trash enclosure will replace the existing planter/paved area. No changes will occur to the existing 83 uncovered parking spaces [77 spaces required]. A modification is requested for an encroachment into the front-yard setback.)

(Referred from Consent.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES REVIEW BY STAFF HEARING OFFICER FOR A FRONT YARD MODIFICATION.)

(4:09)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the comment that the Project is not supportable as submitted. The applicant is encouraged to revise plans to find a more appropriate location for the trash enclosure.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 5/1/0. (Sherry opposed. Aurrell and Wienke absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 1720 SAN ANDRES ST

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-191-015

Application Number: MST2008-00066

Owner: Cameron Porter

Architect: Thomas Moore

(Proposal to construct a new 956 square foot two-bedroom residential unit above a new three-car garage. The proposal also includes the demolition of an existing 273 square foot, legal non-conforming, single-car garage and the existing 75 square foot shed. The existing 572 square foot one-story two-bedroom residential unit will remain. A total of four parking spaces [three covered and one uncovered] will be provided on site. The development is proposed on a 5,040 square foot lot in the R-3 Zone.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(4:21)

Present: Thomas Moore, Architect; Cameron Porter, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:31 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:32 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The proposal is appreciated. Applicant is encouraged to return with a revised proposal that includes: a) the amount of landscape and green space for the project; b) retains the neighborhood compatibility of the front porch entry; c) has an enhanced walkway to the second unit.
- 2) If possible, remove the front yard parking to help maintain neighborhood compatibility.
- 3) Show all existing trees and vegetation including those proposed to be removed.
- 4) Retain at least two of the rear palm trees if possible.
- 5) Return with drawings that coordinate with site plans and elevations.
- 6) Provide additional detail, including guardrails.
- 7) Provide floor plans that are more efficient and do not contribute to the large massing.
- 8) Maintain a strong neighborhood compatibility street presence.

- 9) Include corrected open yard space requirements on the site plan and project description.
- 10) Provide photos of neighboring properties as seen from top of the existing house.
- Action: Mosel/Blakeley, 6/0/1. (Aurell abstained. Wienke absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

3. 315 BATH ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-232-001
 Application Number: MST2008-00126
 Owner: Lawrence J. E. Donovan and Bonnie K Li
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulitaitis

(Proposal to permit two as-built storage structures totaling 640 square feet of storage area in the C-2 Zone, which is developed with three commercial buildings totaling 7,292 square feet of commercial floor area. The total on-site development including the storage units is 7,932 square feet. There are 16 uncovered parking spaces provided which are to remain unaltered.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(4:55)

Present: Lawrence Donovan, Owner.

Staff comment: Ms. Bedard reported the addition of the storage containers (640 square feet) is considered new commercial square footage which requires parking. The site includes a total of 16 parking spots which is the minimum required number of parking spaces to be in compliance with the Zoning Ordinance.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The Board is comfortable with the storage containers remaining in their current location as they are in an area which is not highly prominent to public, and recommends options to downplay visibility.
- 2) Address and improve frontage of property.
- 3) Provide a more uniform street fencing to replace the current weathered grape stake.
- 4) Provide photos of the northeast corner of the property where currently exists a temporary shed structure.
- 5) Provide a proposal for northeast corner that allows for a better aesthetic view by the public when the property gates are open during working hours.

Action: Zink/Sherry, 7/0/0. (Wienke stepped down).

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:21 UNTIL 5:23 P.M. *****

(5:25) Item #3, 315 Bath Street, was reopened and a letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 3025 DE LA VINA ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-172-020
 Application Number: MST2007-00592
 Owner: SLO Trader's, LLC
 Architect: Michael Holliday

(This is a revised Project. Proposal to reinforce an existing retaining wall which ranges from 8' 6" to 23' 6" at the rear property line for 3025-3045 De La Vina Street. The current design has been revised from the design approved on 4/11/05 [MST2005-00111]. The proposed design will not affect the existing parking configuration.)

(Third Concept Review.)**(Preliminary Approval is requested.)**

(5:26)

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:32 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:33 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with return on Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The simplified version of the proposal is preferred, having no trellis, with vines covering the entire wall, and with flowering vines interspersed.
- 2) A darker earth tone colored wall is preferred.
- 3) The project may return on Consent Calendar for Final Approval.

Action: Sherry/Zink, 4/3/0. Motion carried. (Blakeley, Mosel, Mudge opposed. Wienke absent.)

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:01 P.M. UNTIL 6:34 P.M. *******CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****5. 121 S HOPE F123****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014
 Application Number: MST2008-00020
 Owner: Patricia S. Nettleship Trustee
 Business Name: Louis Vuitton
 Agent: Express Permits
 Applicant: Elizabeth Valerio

(Proposal for a tenant improvements and a facade remodel for a new Louis Vuitton retail store at La Cumbre Plaza. The proposal will consolidate two existing retail stores [F123 and F125] into one tenant space.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(Project requires compliance with La Cumbre Plaza Tenant Design Guidelines.)

(6:34)

Present: Elizabeth Valerio, Applicant.

Member Blakeley questioned why the item was reviewed on Consent Calendar (1/22/08) before being heard by the Full Board. Ms. Bedard stated that this was due to staff oversight, and all future projects at La Cumbra Plaza will be referred to Full Board.

Public comment opened at 6:51 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:52 p.m.

Failed

Motion: Preliminary Approval, with return to Full Board for in-progress review, with the following comments.

- 1) Provide a resolution on the north side between the existing building edge and the Lane Bryant store.
- 2) Resolve signage issues before returning to the Full Board, especially at top portion of the building. Study the rest of complex for true signage at corners.
- 3) Study an alternative for the column cantilever which may resolve the condition more satisfactorily.
- 4) Consider a less reflective stone color.

Action: Wienke/Sherry, 4/4/0. Motion failed. (Blakeley, Manson-Hing, Mosel, Zink opposed)

Revised

Motion: Continued four weeks to the Full Board with the following comments.

- 1) Provide a resolution on the north side between the existing building edge and the Lane Bryant store.
- 2) Resolve signage issues before returning to the Full Board, especially at top portion of building. Study the rest of the mall complex for true signage at corners.
- 3) Study an alternative for the column cantilever which may resolve the condition more satisfactorily.
- 4) Consider a less reflective stone color.

Action: Wienke/Sherry, 6/2/0. Motion carried. (Mudge and Zink opposed)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**6. 3880 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-240-046
 Application Number: MST2006-00185
 Owner: Sumida Family LTD Partnership
 Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects
 Business Name: La Sumida Nursery

(Proposal to construct a new two-story, 12,340 square foot, mixed-use building. This building on the portion of the lot facing Via Lucero would consist of 8,051 square feet of residential and 4,289 square feet of commercial square footage. The proposal includes eight residential units, four one-bedroom units, and four two-bedroom units, ranging from 729 to 1301 square feet. The project includes 118 uncovered parking spaces and 100 cubic yards of cut and fill grading under the building footprint. The proposal involves the demolishing of an existing non-residential building totaling 2,556 square feet. Development Plan Approval findings are required at ABR for 1,733 square feet of new commercial square footage.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES DEVELOPMENT APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

(7:40)

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect; Kim True, Architect.

Public comment opened at 8:05 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 8:06 p.m.

Mr. Mosel questioned whether the large canopy tree anchoring the parking lot would negatively impact the view corridor from State Street. Mr. Mudge responded that of all the trees would impact the view corridor. Mr. Zink stated that it would be preferable for the canopies to grow and close creating a green back drop with the mountains above. Mr. Wienke suggested moving the tree given that there are palm trees located behind it that will be taller; Mr. Mosel agreed with Mr. Wienke's suggestion.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project, with the Development Plan Approval Findings SBMC §28.37.300 and CEQA Categorical Exemption In-Fill Findings §15332, and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Extend the hardscape for unit 8 making the patio extend into the gravel area.
- 2) Provide a trellis above the trash enclosure.
- 3) Show enhanced paving for the pedestrian area between Via Lucero and State Street, as required by the Upper State Street Design Guidelines.

Action: Manson-Hing/Mosel, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Blakeley absent.)

FINAL REVIEW**7. 434 W GUTIERREZ ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-191-002

Application Number: MST2006-00541

Owner: Lorenz F. Weidl

Architect: Bildsten and Sherwin Design Studio

(Proposal for a three-unit, three-story apartment building to be attached to an existing 1,707 square foot single-family dwelling. The three units total 5,458 square feet and there would be four two-car garages totaling 1,750 square feet on the lower level. The project includes converting three existing 281 square foot garages to storage space, and a total of 50 cubic yards of grading. Modifications are requested to allow encroachments into the front-yard setbacks along West Gutierrez Street and Rancheria Street.)

(Preliminary Approval granted 11/5/2007. Final Approval is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 064-07.)

(8:19)

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; Lorenz Weidl, Owner.

Public comment opened at 8:28 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 8:29 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments

- 1) The plans should reflect the Preliminary Approval and any deviation is to be brought to Board's attention (plate heights, building heights, etc.).
- 2) Applicant is encouraged to return with color elevations due to concerns including the orange color of stucco in some locations.
- 3) East driveway elevation, second story at the north end: extend the board and batten upward into the shed roof area, in lieu of tongue and groove siding, and eliminate the 1x12 banding.
- 4) Reduce the size of the banding between the second and third level board and batten from 1x12 to 1x6. Note color shall to match the board and batten.
- 5) Provide detailed drawings for sill, door jamb, and head conditions for both stucco and board and batten wall. Window sill shall be thickened to 1.5" with a larger header board and articulate trim. Annotate window and door specifications, including color. The applicant indicated they want to specify a wood window with fiberglass exterior cladding - the Board finds this acceptable. Use authentic or true divided lights (muntins), in a grid pattern style (not a cottage pattern) throughout.
- 6) Provide a window sample and/or cut sheet.
- 7) Provide a more historical ranch style light fixture, with downward cast lighting in compliance with City Lighting standards. The light fixture presented appears too contemporary.
- 8) Changes to the landscape plan are approved with this submittal.

Action: Mosel/Zink, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell abstained. Sherry stepped down.)

I. Adjournment.

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 9:06 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 718 E MASON ST****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-121-005
Application Number: MST2007-00056
Owner: Avalos Dora Ontiveros
Architect: Rex Ruskauff
Owner: Jaime Melgoza

(Proposal to construct a new 2,414 square foot, two-story commercial building with office and warehouse space on a 5,016 square foot parcel. Five parking spaces will be provided in a parking lot at the rear of the lot. Parking is in compliance for 1 space per 500 square feet of total square footage. The project requires Development Plan Approval Findings by the Architectural Board of Review for commercial construction between 1,000 to 3,000 square feet.)

(Review After Final for a change to the rear roll up door; deleted window on east elevation; and additional man door on south elevation.)

Public comment: a letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval as submitted of Review After Final.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 2780 STATE ST 1****R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-600-001
Application Number: MST2008-00110
Owner: Robertson 2002 Family Trust
Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal to add 920 square feet of asphalt shingle roofing, to match existing, over the existing exposed roof well between the existing commercial buildings C and D.)

(Preliminary Approval granted on 3/31/08. Final Approval is requested.)

Continued indefinitely at the applicant's request.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**C. 119 SKYLINE CIR****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-171-008
Application Number: MST2006-00522
Owner: Marc Tappeiner
Architect: Shubin and Donaldson

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,356 square foot two-story single-family residence and carport and construct a 2,944 square foot three-story single-family residence including a 699 square foot basement and attached 445 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes 420 cubic yards of grading inside the building footprint, and 120 cubic yards elsewhere on the 4,776 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The below-grade basement and garage allows a reduction in the FAR calculation for a total square footage of 2,595 which is 99% of the maximum FAR.)

(Preliminary Approval granted on 3/10/08. Final Approval is requested.)

Public comment: a letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval with the condition that reflectivity of the exterior aluminum panel material is consistent with the Ordinance.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**D. 403 E MONTECITO ST****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-343-010
Application Number: MST2007-00645
Owner: Richard Spann
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for multiple broadcasting antennas for an emergency radio station to be mounted on the north side of the existing three-story commercial building. The total height of the proposed antennas will be 12 feet and will extend approximately 5 feet off the building. It will occur at 22 feet above the base of the existing unit and will not project beyond the existing roof line. The project does not propose any architectural changes to the existing commercial building.)

(Preliminary Approval granted on 3/10/08. Final Approval is requested.)

Public comment: A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval with condition that the fiber glass stealth railing color to match existing black wrought iron tower color.

NEW ITEM**E. 1701 LOMA ST R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-153-011
Application Number: MST2008-00146
Owner: Paulette Bermant

(Proposal to construct two new second-story French Juliette balconies on the rear of an existing duplex within existing window sizes. Each balcony would be 2' x 6', resulting in a total of 24 square feet of new balcony space. Also, abate violation noted in ZIR2007-00407, garage is now accessible.)

(Concept Review.)

Public comment: Two letters in support of the project from James Rickard and Jennifer Wood, and Lori Karl were acknowledged. One letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Preliminary Approval with the comment that applicant is to provide a balcony detail framing dimensions to match the existing adjacent balcony on the south side (above garage).

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 103 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ OM-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-020
Application Number: MST2004-00791
Owner: American Tradition
Architect: Michael Caccese
Agent: Richard Fogg, Attorney

(Proposal to construct a parking lot to provide valet parking for the approved Fess Parker's Waterfront Hotel Resort located south of the property.)

(Review After Final for proposed changes to landscaping for visual requirements and incorporated V-ditch.)

Public comment: a letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval of the Review After Final as noted on sheet L.P.2: six 36" box sycamores and six 5 gallon oaks.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Dawn Sherry, with the exception of landscaping for Item F, reviewed by Randy Mudge. Consent Calendar ended at 2:30 p.m.