



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, March 24, 2008
BOARD MEMBERS:

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

MARK WIENKE, Chair
CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Vice-Chair
CLAY AURELL
JIM BLAKELEY
GARY MOSEL
RANDY MUDGE
DAWN SHERRY
PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)

CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p>Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

NOTICE

1. That on March 20, 2008 at 3:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Call to order.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:08 p.m. by Vice Chair Manson-Hing.

B. Roll call.

Members Present: Blakeley, Mosel, Mudge, Sherry, Zink, Manson-Hing, Wienke (arrived at 4:30)
Members Absent: Aurell
Staff present: Bedard, Shafer

C. Public Comment:

No public comment.

D. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of March 10, 2008.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of March 10, 2008, as amended.

Action: Zink/Mudge, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell and Wienke absent.)

Board member Zink requested written clarification as to whether the Board may address modifications.

E. Consent Calendar. ~~March 17 and~~ March 24, 2008.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of March 24, 2008. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Christopher Manson-Hing.

Action: Zink/Mudge, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell and Wienke absent.)

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Member Zink requested written directive on the Board's ability to comment on requests for parking modifications.

G. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

H. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Member Blakeley requested verification that height and planting at the Mesa Center matches the landscaping plan approved by the Board. Member Mudge agreed to review the plans and make a site visit.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**1. 1226 ALTA VISTA RD R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-150-038

Application Number: MST2006-00742

Owner: Jim B. Worthen

Owner: AV Partners

Architect: Brian Nelson

(Proposal for the conversion of six existing one-story residential dwelling units each at 630 square feet [four apartments and a duplex] to condominium units on an 11,250 square foot lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposal includes the demolition of two, three-car garages [six spaces] to create eight on-site uncovered parking spaces. A total of 430 cubic yards of cut is proposed for the construction of a trash enclosure and six private storage spaces units. The proposal includes the alterations to the existing porch and entry steps, to windows and doors for the creation of private outdoor living space, and a retaining wall on the west side of the duplex. Of the existing 11,250 square foot lot, 3,658 square feet is proposed landscaping. Planning Commission review is required for a Tentative Subdivision Map, Condo Conversions, and a Modification to remove six window openings within the interior yard setback along the southeastern property line.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION REVIEW OF REQUESTED MODIFICATIONS, A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND CONDO CONVERSION.)

(Time 3:25)

Present: Brian Nelson, Architect; Bob Fowler, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:48 p.m.

Jennifer Miller: addressed health & safety of neighboring oak tree; noise and lights of cars; prefers an 8 foot high fence.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:53 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Correct the plans cover page and square footage description.
- 2) Accurately show all existing trees on the plans and note which trees are to be removed.
- 3) Provide a solution for privacy of individual outdoor living areas.
- 4) Study the windows for a unified design that retains the historic nature of the existing windows.

- 5) Restudy the circular driveway element at the street for a more traditional style.
- 6) Return with a high-quality design for all unit entries that addresses individuality and traditional design to match traditional nature of existing architecture.
- 7) Study the parapet detail for authenticity.
- 8) There is concern with the distance of the proposed trash and storage location to the individual units.
- 9) Restudy proposed gas meter locations.
- 10) Study the parking area paving design.
- 11) Resolve the paving design and return with a solution to maintain the existing slab around the oak tree located at the rear of the parking area.
- 12) Replace the parking strip lawn with an appropriate ground cover that complies with City landscaping standards.
- 13) Study a solution that provides one sidewalk to individual units and allows more landscaping between the first four units.
- 14) Show the replacement of the curb cut to comply with new city standards.
- 15) The demolition of the garages has no aesthetic impact to the project.

Action: Sherry/Mosel, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Blakeley and Zink opposed. Aurell and Wienke absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

2. 416 E COTA ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-212-024

Application Number: MST2008-00097

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Architect: Christine Pierron

Applicant: Housing Authority of Santa Barbara

Architect: Mark Wienke

(Proposal for a lot merger of three existing lots to create one new 39,603 square foot lot in the C-M Zone. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing 20,450 square foot commercial building and the construction of 56 new affordable studio apartments (450 square feet each) and 1 two-bedroom (1,000 square foot) managers unit for a total of 57 residential units in a mixed one, two, and three-story development. A 1,350 square foot community center, a 900 square foot bike storage facility, and a 450 square foot utility room is also proposed. A total of fifty-two on-grade parking spaces are being provided by 37 covered and 15 uncovered spaces. The project is a City Housing Authority Project and requires Planning Commission review for a requested parking modification, a modification to encroach into required side and rear yard setbacks, and a bonus density modification.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION REVIEW OF MODIFICATIONS.)

(Time: 4:34)

Present: Mark Wienke, Architect; Christine Pierron, Architect; Skip Szymanski, Housing Authority, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 5:00 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:01 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The project is moving in the right direction, especially with the site planning and unit configuration.
- 2) The Board appreciates reviewing of the project in its early stage, and looks for more detailed elevations.
- 3) Provide cross sections through the site.
- 4) The neon application on the tower is not encouraged for compatibility with the location in the city.
- 5) Simplification of the tower element would be a positive direction.
- 6) The Cota Street elevation should relate more to the location's Italian history. Study the application for use of materials common to that era.
- 7) A less varied architectural style throughout the project is encouraged.
- 8) The Board looks forward to the detailing of the project to enlighten the architecture.
- 9) The Board looks forward to viewing all main elevations with project sections.
- 10) Study opportunities to provide light and/or greenery into the garage level and the plinth level deck above.

Action: Mudge/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell absent. Wienke stepped down.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 3427 SEA LEDGE LN A-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-082-009

Application Number: MST2006-00092

Owner: Leon F. and Joyce M. Lunt

Architect: Eberhard Roteman and Associates

Agent: Trish Allen

Applicant: Bob Price

(This is a revised project description. The proposal consists of the demolition of the existing 460 square foot attached two-car garage and 1,218 square feet of the existing residence in preparation for a remodel and two-story addition including 1,551 square feet for the first-floor, 1,016 square for the second-floor, a new 612 square foot basement and a new 540 square foot attached two-car garage for a net increase of 2,041 square feet all on a 32,189 square foot A-1/SD-3 zoned lot in the Hillside Design District and the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The project site is currently developed with a 2,954 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 460 square foot two-car garage. The proposal also includes resurfacing the existing 565 square foot deck and replacement of the guardrail, replacement of a retaining wall and the replacement of the existing septic system and drywells. When the project is complete, the development on the site will consist of a 5,455 square foot two-story residence which includes the 612 square foot basement and a 540 square foot attached two-car garage. A modification is requested to allow an "as-built" portion of an existing deck to encroach into the required 15 foot interior yard setback.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 034-07)

(Time: 5:41)

Present: Andy Roteman, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:12 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:13 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board prefers Scheme A as presented, with the following comments:
- 2) The Board would prefer having the one-story element at the garage extended to the left to help breakup the massing on that side.
- 3) On east elevation, move the second level protruding balcony to the left so as to not to conflict with the aforementioned extended wall.
- 4) Although some Board members are uncomfortable with the height of 27.3 feet, the Board would prefer having that condition than lowering the roof pitch allowing more roof to be visible from up hill, and therefore is comfortable with scheme A.
- 5) The Board understands the applicant will utilize darker materials to minimize glare.
- 6) In order to address the concerns of the northern neighbor, the applicant should attempt to minimize the effect of night glare from windows, especially from the second-floor entry glazing, by possibly using an opaque glazing or by altering the exposure of the interior lighting.
- 7) Provide exterior lighting fixtures and location details.

Action: Wienke/Mudge, 4/2/1. Motion carried. (Sherry and Manson-Hing opposed. Aurell absent.)

*****THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:27 P.M. TO 6:20 P.M.*****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. **505 WENTWORTH AVE** **R-3 Zone**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-143-010
Application Number: MST2007-00345
Owner: Wentworth Investors, LLC
Architect: Jose Esparza

(Proposal to construct three new two-story residential condominiums on an existing 6,500 square foot vacant lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposal includes 2 two-bedroom units totaling 2,128 square feet and 1 one-bedroom unit totaling 1,042 square feet. An attached 438 square foot two-car garage is proposed for each unit. The parcel has a 2% slope and 256.7 yards of grading is proposed.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND REVIEW BY STAFF HEARING OFFICER FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP.)

(Time: 7:03)

Present: Jose Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:11 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:11 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to Full Board, with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a 36 to 48 inch box tree in the front yard.
- 2) At the street elevation, provide a greater distance between the columns at the porch and the adjacent wall; five feet is suggested.
- 3) On the north elevation, refine the post-to-beam connections at the entrances of the two rear units.
- 4) At front unit on the north elevation, refine the fascia board member as it touches the main portion of the building at the second story.
- 5) On the floor plan, show the railing at the front porch of the front unit.
- 6) Provide a color board, exterior lighting information, and architectural details.

Action: Zink/Blakeley, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Wienke stepped down. Aurell absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

5. 120 S HOPE AVE F-18 C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014

Application Number: MST2008-00088

Owner: Patricia S. Nettleship Trustee

Applicant: Conceptual Motion Company

Architect: Kovac

Owner: Macerich Company

(Proposal for retail improvement at La Cumbre Plaza, existing Building F, Suite F-118. Exterior remodel [3750 square feet], to increased parapet height, new glass, stone and tile storefront elements and building graphic. Tenant improvement to include tenant storefront remodel and new interior improvements equaling 3320 net square feet [3500 gross leasable area].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(Time: 7:28)

Present: Angela Westfall, Conceptual Motion.

Public comment opened at 7:45 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:46 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full board with the following comments:

- 1) Applicant to study the La Cumbre Plaza Design Guidelines, and provide a different store front at the south elevation shear wall, where the Guidelines require a significant amount of storefront and display windows. One suggestion is to have external projections of displayed areas placed outside of the shear wall.
- 2) Provide a rendering that exemplifies the proposal.
- 3) Colors and materials generally acceptable, but there is concern with the glossiness of the ceramic tile.
- 4) The Board understands the back part of (the east section) the building is within the Vernacular Section of the Guidelines, however, the Board does not feel that it is absolutely necessary to rigidly has to comply with the vernacular direction to this portion of the project.
- 5) The Board finds the dura-trans (signage) unacceptable as it is not in compliance with the Sign Ordinance.

Action: Mudge/Blakeley, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell absent.)

Member Zink, requested the applicant to investigate two shiny flues visible above Ruth's Chris. He requested that the Board walk through La Cumbre and determine how Ruth's Chris relates to the interior mall scape.

(At the ABR meeting of 4/7/08 Member Manson-Hing stated that he thought Ruth's Chris was acceptable to the mall experience.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 714 W PEDREGOSA ST R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-122-015

Application Number: MST2008-00077

Owner: Kenneth Collier and Anne F. Anderson

Applicant: Marv Gustafson

Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 476 square foot one-story residence, to remove 6 square feet from the existing two-car garage, and to construct a new 563 square foot one-story residence attached to the existing two-car garage. A total of 60 cubic yards of grading is proposed. A total of 3,477 square feet of landscaping is provided. The project will result in two residential units with the proposed new 563 square foot one-story unit and the existing two-story 1,475 square foot residence on a 9,600 square foot parcel in the R-2 Zone. A total of four parking spaces will be provided by two covered and two uncovered spaces.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(Time: 8:02)

Present: Marv Gustafson, Peikert Group; Reverend Collier, Owner.

Public comment opened at 8:07 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 8:08 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Preliminary and Final Approvals can be made at Consent Calendar pending submittal of an Archeological Letter.
- 2) Skylights are to be tinted.

Action: Zink/Manson-Hing, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell, Blakeley, and Mudge absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 601 SAN PASCUAL ST R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-101-014

Application Number: MST2008-00091

Owner: Dario Pini

Architect: Bryan Murphy

(Proposal to construct a new 997 square foot second-story residence with three two-car garages below totaling 1,297 square feet. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing two-car garage and attached shed totaling 433 square feet. A 114 square foot first-story and 451 square foot second-story addition to an existing 1,151 square foot residence to result in a five-bedroom 1,716 square foot residence. The existing three-bedroom 1,200 square foot dwelling unit will remain unaltered. The 12,000 square foot lot is currently developed with two dwelling units and a two-car garage and with the current proposal the lot will consist of three dwelling units and three two-car garages.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(Time: 8:15)

Present: Brian Murphy, Architect; Dario Pini, Owner.

Public comment opened at 8:19 p.m.

Miguel Garcia, addressed story poles, sun light, west elevation windows, porches, lighting.

A letter in opposition from Leo Mandeville was read.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 8:26 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Initially Board is split on site planning in relationship to having two separate driveways and curb cuts, however, the Board has decided the proposal is acceptable with the following changes:
- 2) Unit C: The driveway and curb cut shall be reduced to the minimum, verify w/transportation.
- 3) Design a significant entry to Unit C - the Cota Street unit.
- 4) Redesign the front entry to Unit C, to include an interior stairway or other design elements, to articulate a more pedestrian and neighborhood friendly approach from Cota Street.
- 5) There is concern with deck above the Unit C garage and the potential for looming into neighboring windows. Suggestions include: a) restudy the deck proximity for compliance with the Good Neighbor Policy; b) provide roof form or prohibit the ability to stand at the edge to overlook the property; c) provide additional trees for screening.
- 6) Reduce the second floor cantilever over driveways to 18 inches to reduce overall mass.
- 7) Study Unit C for high windows or tree locations on the west property line to provide more privacy for the neighbor.

- 8) Unit B: there is concern regarding massing of the second-story addition. Study ways to reduce the mass and/or height.
- 9) Overall site plan: Provide a planting strip in center of the driveway off San Pasqual, to extend 60 feet from sidewalk.
- 10) Provide significant trees between the buildings.
- 11) On the site plan, show the significant trees that are to remain and those to be removed and/or relocated.
- 12) Drawings shall show all retaining walls on site.

Action: Sherry/Zink, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Aurell, Blakeley, and Mudge absent.)

I. ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 8:46 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

NEW ITEM

A. 134 HARBOR WAY

HC/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-250-011
Application Number: MST2008-00124
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Contractor: R and M Technologies
Applicant: Karl Trieberg

(Proposal to install three 4x10 roof mounted panels [for a total of 120 square feet] on the Marina One East Waterfront restrooms.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Public comment: A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval as noted on Sheet 1. 1) Pipe penetration through roof below panel. 2) Two cooper pipes ¾ inch (below solar panel).

NEW ITEM

B. 2840 DE LA VINA ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-220-023
Application Number: MST2008-00127
Owner: Storch Family Living Trust 4/25/02
Architect: DPA Architecture
Business Name: Ralph's Grocery

(Proposal to expand an existing equipment mezzanine by 521 square feet for an employee break room within the existing building. The proposal also includes the removal of three existing trees, six new trees, a change to the existing parking lot planters, and the addition of three new parking spaces.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received.)

Public comment: a letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Preliminary Approval as noted on Sheet L-3. 1) Relocate two existing large trees into resized landscape island. 2) Provide flowering pair (36" box) at resized landscaping project at Ralph's sidewalk along with three new trees and planters.

NEW ITEM

C. 2411 BATH ST

C-O Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-053-007

Application Number: MST2008-00132

Owner: David L. Williams and Janet Kaitschuk

Architect: Lenvik and Minor

Applicant: Brian Frederick

(Proposal to enclose a 155 square foot portion of an existing 2,157 square foot one-story commercial building for additional office space. The proposed enclosure area is within the existing building footprint and under the existing roof and is proposed to match the exterior finishes, colors, and detailing of the existing building.)

Public comment: A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Preliminary Approval with the following comments: 1) Return center portion of window to street to original. 2) Relocate the north window of the addition closer to the northeast corner. 3) Relocate signage to the right wall panel of the street elevation.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Christopher Manson-Hing. Consent Calendar ended at 2:20 p.m.