



City of Santa Barbara California

STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT

REPORT DATE: August 13, 2015
AGENDA DATE: August 19, 2015
PROJECT ADDRESS: 1308 N. Salsipuedes Street (MST2015-00234)
TO: Susan Reardon, Senior Planner, Staff Hearing Officer
FROM: Planning Division, (805) 564-5470
 Danny Kato, Senior Planner *DK*
 Jo Anne La Conte, Assistant Planner *JAL*

I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The 3,200 square foot site is currently developed with an 818 square foot, one-story single family residence and a detached 260 square foot, one-car garage with a workshop area. The proposed project includes demolition of the existing garage and workshop area, construction of a new 233 square foot, one-car garage, a new 188 square foot, one-story addition, raising the plate height of the roof, window alterations, a new driveway, a new fence, gate and retaining wall, and associated grading. The proposal will address violations outlined in a Zoning Information Report (ZIR2013-00173). This property is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District and in the Lower Riviera Special Design District.

The discretionary applications required for this project are:

1. Open Yard Modification of the location of the open yard area and/or to reduce the size of the required open yard area (SBMC §28.18.060 and §28.92.110); and
2. Interior Setback Modification to allow window alterations and an increased roof height in the required six-foot interior setback to the east (SBMC §28.18.060 and §28.92.110).

Date Application Accepted: July 16, 2015

Date Action Required: October 14, 2015

II. RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Staff Hearing Officer approve the project, subject to conditions.

III. SITE INFORMATION AND PROJECT STATISTICS

A. SITE INFORMATION

Applicant: Thompson Naylor Architects	Property Owner: Sereboff Family Trust
Parcel Number: 029-092-010	Lot Area: 3,200 sq. ft.
General Plan: Medium Density Residential (12 du/acre)	Zoning: R-2
Existing Use: Single Family Residence	Topography: 9% slope

Adjacent Land Uses:

North – Residential	East - Residential
South – Residential	West – Residential

B. PROJECT STATISTICS

	Existing	Proposed
Living Area	873 gross sq. ft.	+ 196 sq. ft. = 1,069 gross sq. ft.
Garage	282 gross q. ft. (garage w/workshop)	267 gross sq. ft.

C. PROPOSED LOT AREA COVERAGE

Building: 1,418 sf 44%	Hardscape: 272 sf 9%	Landscape: 1,510 sf 47%
------------------------	----------------------	-------------------------

IV. DISCUSSION

The proposed project involves construction of a 196 square foot, conforming, one-story addition and a new 267 square foot conforming one-car garage location at the property, in addition to some alterations to the existing one-story residence.

East Interior Setback Modification

The existing dwelling on site is non-conforming to the east interior setback, as it located approximately one foot from the interior property line at its closest point, instead of the six feet required. The request is to allow a new larger window (approximately 4 ft. x 3 ½ ft.) to replace a smaller window in the interior setback. In addition, the proposal includes raising the plate height of the roof for the rearmost four feet of the dwelling from 6' 10" to 8' in order to convert the existing utility room to kitchen space. Staff is supportive of the requests as the increased plate/roof height and new window are not anticipated to adversely impact the adjacent neighbor as the proposed alterations are adjacent to the neighbor's driveway and are screened from view by an existing hedge and will result in a cohesive design to the existing dwelling.

Open Yard Modification

The applicant is requesting an Open Yard Modification for the location of the open yard area and/or to reduce the size of the required open yard area to allow for the proposed addition. The Zoning Ordinance requires 1,250 square feet of open yard area, which may be provided in multiple areas with minimum dimensions of 20 feet by 20 feet. The purpose of the open yard is to provide usable outdoor living space and/or visual open space. The 3,200 square foot lot is less than half the size of the minimum lot size in the R-2 Zone (7,000 sq. ft.), and is thus severely constrained. Both the current and the proposed site plans are currently non-conforming to open yard requirements with no portion of the open yard that meets the minimum dimensions. The size of the existing, main open yard area is approximately 530 square feet with a minimum dimension of 13.5 feet. The size of the proposed, main open yard is 412 square feet, with a minimum dimension of 17'10".

The proposal would reconfigure the location of the Open Yard area, and would result in a minor decrease to the size of the Open Yard. Staff is in support of the Open Yard modification because of the site constraints associated with the undersized R-2 lot, and because the remaining open yard is useable. In addition, the open yard fulfills the intent of the requirements and allows for a minor expansion of the small residence while maintaining the existing neighborhood character.

Parking

The property is non-conforming to parking with one covered parking space, instead of the two covered parking spaces required. As less than 50% of additions are proposed to the dwelling, the parking may remain non-conforming with one covered parking space.

The existing one-car garage on site is non-conforming to setbacks as it is located on the property line and is connected to the adjacent neighbor's garage. The proposal includes demolishing the existing garage and constructing a conforming one-car garage that will meet the setback requirements. However, as the existing garage appears to be connected to the neighbor's garage, a condition has been included to address this potential issue.

An 8' wide garage door is proposed. Transportation staff has reviewed the new garage and have commented that although 8.5' wide garage doors are the City's minimum-sized garage door, that they can support a waiver for the 8' wide garage door, as it is the industry standard. Therefore, a condition has been included that a Parking Design Waiver shall be obtained from the Public Works Department for the garage doors.

Design Review

The project was reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) on June 17, 2015, and July 1, 2015 and was forwarded to the Staff Hearing Officer (SHO) with positive comments.

Environmental Review

The property is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District and is in the Lower Riviera Special Design District. A Phase II Historic Structures/Site Report (HSSR) prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates, concluded that the proposed impacts on the historic residence would be less than significant. The Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) accepted the report on June 17, 2015 with the understanding that the spatial relationship will be addressed in the report to demonstrate there is no negative impact to the adjacent property.

On July 1, 2015, revisions to the HSSR were submitted and accepted by the City Historian that confirmed there is no negative impact to the adjacent property. The revisions to the HSSR stated the significance of the existing garage is more closely related to its overall scale and massing and relationship with the adjoining house and the streetscape rather than the construction materials of the building. Therefore, the replacement of the existing garage with a new detached garage which would maintain the scale of the existing garage and its overall spatial relationship with the adjoining house and streetscape, meets Standard 9 (New additions and Spatial Relationships).

The project site is located within an area mapped as American City Archaeological and Early 20th Century Archaeological (1900-1920) sensitivity areas. A Phase 1 Archaeological Report, prepared by Heather Macfarlane, M.A. RPA, dated May 19, 2015 and an Addendum to the report on June 12, 2015, were accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on July 1, 2015. The report indicated that there exists a moderate potential for historic remains of a former structures in the vicinity of the existing bungalow and garage, and recommended monitoring by a qualified archaeologist. Therefore, staff has included the recommended conditions from the Phase 1 Archaeological Report and the Addendum to the report, to be reproduced on the plans prior to submittal for building permit.

V. FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS

The Staff Hearing Officer finds that the Modifications are consistent with the purposes and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and are necessary to secure an appropriate improvement on the lot. The proposed new window and increased plate/roof height in the interior setback are appropriate because they are not anticipated to adversely impact the adjacent neighbors as the proposed alterations are adjacent to the neighbor's driveway and are screened from view by an existing hedge and will result in a cohesive design to the existing dwelling. In addition, the resulting open yard area on the small lot with a single-family residence is appropriate because the resulting open yard area is useable by the residents.

Said approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. The violations outlined in ZIR2013-00173 shall be abated as part of this permit and shall be included in the Scope of Work.
2. A Parking Design Waiver for the garage doors shall be obtained from the Public Works Department.

3. The demolition of the garage shall not result in exposed framing of the attached neighboring garage/s exterior walls. The exterior walls of the adjacent neighbors garages where previously attached shall be improved to provide exterior materials to match existing. Review by the Historic Landmarks Commission will be required if necessary.
4. The applicant shall submit a contract with an archaeologist from the most current City Qualified Archaeologists List for monitoring during all ground-disturbing activities associated with the project, including but not limited to grading, excavation, trenching, vegetation or paving removal and ground clearance in the areas identified in the Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report and Addendum Report prepared for the site by Heather Macfarlene, M.A., RPA, Archaeologist, dated May 19, 2015 and May 19, 2015. The contract shall be subject to the review and approval of the Environmental Analyst.

The archaeologist's monitoring contract shall include the following provisions

The archaeologist shall monitor all ground disturbing activities associated with the project, including, but not limited to grading, excavation, trenching, vegetation or paving removal and ground clearance in the areas identified as archeologically sensitive.

The following information shall be printed on the site plan:

If archaeological resources are encountered or suspected, work shall be halted or redirected immediately and the Planning Division shall be notified. The archaeologist shall assess the nature, extent, and significance of any discoveries and develop appropriate management recommendations for archaeological resource treatment, which may include, but are not limited to, redirection of grading and/or excavation activities, consultation and/or monitoring with a Barbareño Chumash representative from the most current City Qualified Barbareño Chumash Site Monitors List, should resources prove to be Native American in origin.

Appropriate management recommendations may include a standard Phase 2 archeological evaluation of the find, which in the case of foundation remains may include hand and/or mechanical excavations to trace foundations, documentation of their layout and construction and analysis of any associated artifacts. Should the Phase 2 evaluation determine the historic structure or site to be eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources (Pub. Res. Code 5024.1, Title 14 CCR, Section 4850 et seq. [Criterion D], and the structure or site cannot be feasibly avoided, Phase 3 data recovery may be required.

If the discovery consists of possible human remains, the Santa Barbara County Coroner shall be contacted immediately. If the Coroner determines that the remains are Native American, the Coroner shall contact the California Native American Heritage Commission. A Barbareño Chumash representative from the most current City Qualified Barbareño Chumash Site Monitors List shall be retained to monitor all further subsurface disturbance in the area of the find. Work in the area may only proceed after the Planning Division grants authorization.

If the discovery consists of possible prehistoric or Native American artifacts or materials, a Barbareño Chumash representative from the most current City Qualified Barbareño Chumash Site Monitors List shall be retained to monitor all further subsurface disturbance in the area of the find. Work in the area may only proceed after the Planning Division grants authorization.

Should monitoring during grading operations indicate that the project area is devoid of archaeological resources, no further monitoring work in the parcel shall be required.

Prior to issuance of the Certificate of Occupancy (Final Inspection), the owner of the Real Property shall complete the following: A final report on the results of all archaeological investigations including monitoring shall be submitted to the Environmental Analyst within 180 days of completion of the monitoring and prior to issuance of the Certificate of Occupancy (Final Inspection), whichever is earliest.

Any significant artifacts collected during monitoring or archeological excavations shall be curated at the most appropriate curation facility. Local facilities include Santa Barbara Natural History Museum Archeological Collections or the University of California, Department of Anthropology, Repository for Archaeological and Ethnographic Collections.

Exhibits:

- A. Site Plan (under separate cover)
- B. Applicant's letter, dated March 5, 2015
- C. HLC Minutes dated June 17, 2015 and July 1, 2015

Contact/Case Planner: Jo Anne La Conte, Assistant Planner
(JLaConte@SantaBarbaraCA.gov)
630 Garden Street, Santa Barbara, CA 93101
Phone: (805) 564-5470 x3320



5 March 2015
Revised July 16, 2015

JoAnne LaConte
City of Santa Barbara
630 Garden Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101

RECEIVED
JUL 16 2015
CITY OF SANTA BARBARA
PLANNING DIVISION

Subject: **1308 North Salsipuedes (APN 029-092-010)**

Request for Modification:

- a. Revision to existing structure re: interior/ sideyard setback
- b. Revision to window in setback (enlargement, same location)
- c. Open yard requirements

We propose to both remodel and add 196 s.f. to an existing one storey 873 s.f. SFR, demolish an existing non-conforming 1 car garage and replace it with a new conforming 1 car garage in a new location on a 50' x 64' lot in the Bungalow Haven District. We will remodel the existing driveway to be an appropriate ribbon driveway aligned with the new 1 car garage. We will retain the 6 foot high fence at the western property line, remove an existing 6'-0" high fence and gate on the east side of the driveway, and construct an approximately 3'-6" fence and gate from west to east to provide privacy for the new re-graded rear patio and provide a more usable open yard. There will be a new approximately 2'-7" high retaining wall as part of the rear garage walls which will also extend from the west garage wall to the property line fence.

Below is a brief property summary and project description as part of our pre-consultation to apply for 3 Modifications.

Property Information

The subject parcel is located in the R-2 zone district with a General Plan land use designation of Medium Density Residential and is within the Lower Riviera Special Design District/ Bungalow Haven.

The property is:

1. approximately 0.073 acres in size (3,200 square feet) and
2. developed with a one storey Single Family Residence (approximately 873 square feet with a site coverage of 1151.1 s.f. or 36 %) and a one storey one-car garage and associated site improvements,

Historic Resource value:

Architectural Historic Value:

The Residence has been identified as a "bungalow" and as being in the Demolition Review Study area. The City Survey has identified it as a contributor to the historic streetscape. We have communicated with the Urban Historian. We are currently in consultation with Post Hazeltine Associates with regard to our proposal. They will prepare a report based on our proposed design for City Review.

The existing one-storey garage is located both within the rear and side (N and W per project north) interior setbacks and is attached to the West (per project north) neighbouring garage. It may be attached to the garage of the neighbour at the North but we have not investigated this as of yet.

The relocation of the garage and desire to have both improved storm water drainage and a usable open yard require retaining walls at the garage of approximately 3'-6" feet in height at the rear of the garage to the existing fence (with varying height on the east and west walls).

The project received positive comments at the HLC hearing on June 17, 2015. The HSSR report was approved upon receipt of additional information regarding view to neighbouring chimney and the project received positive comments from the Commission both for the sensitivity of the design as well as support for the requested modifications.

Archaeological Resource Value:

The Archaeological report was heard and approved as amended on July 1, 2015 at HLC.

Height:

The existing residence and garage are both one storey buildings. The proposal will extend an addition to the existing one storey residence towards the (north) rear of the property. The roof of the addition will be lower at the ridge than the existing residence. The replacement garage will remain one storey. We conform to the required building height maximum of 45 feet or 3 stories.

We do not trigger Solar Ordinance conformance.

Distance between buildings:

The Garage is proposed to be relocated so there will be the required 5 feet of distance from the residence per 28.18.070 B while observing the 3 foot sideyard interior setback on the west property line side.

Setbacks:

Front:

- a. The required front setback is 15 feet for one storey portions of a residence. We do not propose an addition to the existing front towards the street.
- b. The required front setback for a garage facing the street is 20 feet. The proposed garage is approximately 24'-6" from the street.

Side:

At the East (project north) interior sideyard setback, the existing building is existing non-conforming and the encroachment varies from 3'-5" to 4'-10" feet (approx.) along the existing length of the building which is 34'-4".

The proposed addition and remodel will:

At the East (project north) interior sideyard setback-

- a. Modify the existing rearmost 4 feet of non-conforming encroaching wall/roof by raising the plate height (with subsequent roof change) from 6'-10" to 8'-0" high.
- b. Modify the existing 3 by 3 ft sliding window by enlarging the same opening for a 4'-0" x 3'-6" casement window
- c. The proposed new construction at the addition will conform to the 6 foot setback.

At the West (project north) interior sideyard setback-

- a. Remove the existing non-conformance of the garage location by rebuilding a new garage to conform to the 3 foot interior setback

At the North (project north) rear setback –

- a. Remove the existing non-conformance of the garage location by relocating it approximately 17'-10" from the rear property line.

There is no proposed change to the front yard setback.

Parking

2 covered parking spaces are required. The existing parking provides 1 covered parking space, and there is no change proposed. We are not proposing an addition of 50% or greater of the 1980 footprint.

ZIR

A 6 foot fence attached to the existing garage to be demolished is an open permit from previous owner. We have not decided whether to complete the process with an inspection but will before submitting for a building permit.

The non permitted portions of the existing rear of the building will be removed in the demolition.

Outdoor Living Space –Open Yard and Private Outdoor living space requirements

Every lot in this zone is required to provide outdoor living space and open yard requirements per 28.18.060.

The minimum required Open Yard is 1250 s.f., with minimum dimensions of 20 ft x 20 ft in perpendicular dimensions. We are not proposing more than one dwelling unit and we do not have an accessory dwelling unit, therefore the Private Outdoor Living Space requirement does not apply.

The existing Open Yard is 296 s.f though comprised of one dimension that is less than 20 feet. By moving the garage as we have, we will provide:

- a. A total of 413 s.f. which is less than required and
- b. Although we do not achieve a minimum dimension of 20 x 20 feet we do have 17'-10" x 23'-2" .

We believe this design improves the existing status in terms of fulfilling the goal of the Open Yard ordinance. Although substandard, the new Open Yard provides usable area on a constricted lot.

We request that the City balance the need for the required 20 feet per ordinance with the recommendation from the Architectural Historian that the designed location of the garage attempt to avoid aligning the front elevation of the garage with the front elevation of the residence.

1308 North Salsipuedes
Modification request
5 March, 2015
Revised July 16, 2015
Page 5

Aligning the rear of the garage with the corner of the SFR allows an aesthetic and consequent budget simplicity to the overall design and to the new retaining walls. We believe an additional 2'-2" would not gain much and create unnecessary jogs.

This concludes our property summary to support this pre-consultation prior to Application for Modification.

If you have any questions or require additional information, please contact our office at 805-966- 9807 ext. 2

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Susette H.H.C. Naylor', with a long, sweeping horizontal line extending to the right.

Susette H.H.C. Naylor, AIA
Thompson Naylor Architects

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 1308 N SALSIPUEDES ST

R-2 Zone

(2:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-092-010
 Application Number: MST2015-00234
 Owner: Sereboff Family Trust
 Applicant: Thompson Naylor Architects

(Proposal for a 188 square foot single-story addition to the rear of an existing 818 square foot one-story single-family residence. A 260 square foot one-car garage will be demolished and replaced with a new 233 square foot one-car garage. Exterior alterations to the residence include new roofing, doors, and windows including an enlarged window opening within the interior setback. Site alterations include the removal and replacement of the existing driveway with a reduced ribbon driveway, new fencing, and a retaining wall. The proposed total of 1,239 square feet of development on a 3,241 square foot lot is 57% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for open yard and interior setback modifications. This project addresses violations in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2013-00173). This property is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District and in the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

- a) **(Review of the Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concludes that proposed projects impacts on the historic residence would be less than significant.)**

Actual time: 2:57 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, agreed with the conclusions of the report, finding that it met with the Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation and will not have a negative impact on the historic resource.

Motion: To accept the report with the understanding that the spatial relationship will be addressed in the report to demonstrate there is no negative impact to the adjacent property.
Action: Murray/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

- b) **(Conceptual review; comments only. This project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for open yard and interior setback modifications.)**

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Suzette Naylor, Architect, Thompson Naylor Architects; Dr. Pamela Post, Architectural Historian, and Timothy Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest questioned the reasoning behind relocating the garage since the change would impact the spatial relationship between properties.

A letter of concern from Dan and Sheryl Wheeler was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:22 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The Commission supports the design with the modest addition, and the maintenance of the rear yard.
2. The modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the guidelines concerning the lot area modification since there is no increase in floor area and no impact to the adjacent property.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 1308 N SALSIPUEDES ST****R-2 Zone****(1:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-092-010
Application Number: MST2015-00234
Owner: Sereboff Family Trust
Applicant: Thompson Naylor Architects

(Proposal for a 188 square foot single-story addition to the rear of an existing 818 square foot one-story single-family residence. A 260 square foot one-car garage will be demolished and replaced with a new 233 square foot one-car garage. Exterior alterations to the residence include new roofing, doors, and windows including an enlarged window opening within the interior setback. Site alterations include the removal and replacement of the existing driveway with a reduced ribbon driveway, new fencing, and a retaining wall. The proposed total of 1,239 square feet of development on a 3,241 square foot lot is 57% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for open yard and interior setback modifications. This project addresses violations in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2013-00173). This property is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District and in the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

(Review of Phase I Archeological Resources Report and Memorandum prepared by Heather McFarland.)

Actual time: 1:48 p.m.

Staff comments: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. Specifically, he agreed that monitoring by a qualified archaeologist of earth-disturbing activities should be undertaken, given the possibility that historical cultural resources may be present. However, he also agreed that the chances of cultural resources being present are remote.

Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst, requested the memorandum so that the report satisfies the City's MEA requirements.

Motion: To accept the report as amended.

Action: Shallenberger/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Drury, La Voie, and Orías absent.) Motion carried.