



# City of Santa Barbara California

## STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT

**REPORT DATE:** August 8, 2007  
**AGENDA DATE:** August 15, 2007  
**PROJECT ADDRESS:** 434 West Gutierrez (MST2006-00541)  
**TO:** Staff Hearing Officer  
**FROM:** Planning Division, (805) 564-5470  
 Danny Kato, Zoning & Enforcement Supervisor  
 Roxanne Milazzo, Associate Planner *Rox*

### I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The 11,400 square foot project site is located on the corner of Gutierrez and Rancheria Streets. Current development on site consists of a single-family residence with attached two-car garages. The proposed project involves the addition of three attached residential units and three two-car garages. The discretionary application required for this project is a Modification to permit new construction within the front yard setbacks facing Gutierrez and Rancheria Streets (SBMC§28.21.060).

Date Application Accepted: May 29, 2007    Date Action Required: November 29, 2007

### II. SITE INFORMATION AND PROJECT STATISTICS

#### A. SITE INFORMATION

|                |                         |                 |             |
|----------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------|
| Applicant:     | Ellen Bildsten          | Property Owner: | Larry Weidl |
| Parcel Number: | 037-191-002             | Lot Area:       | 11,400 sf   |
| General Plan:  | 12 units per acre       | Zoning:         | R-4         |
| Existing Use:  | Single Family Residence | Topography:     | 30%         |

Adjacent Land Uses:

|                                  |                                 |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| North – Multi-family Residential | East – Multi-family Residential |
| South – Multi-family Residential | West – Multi-family Residential |

**B. PROJECT STATISTICS**

|                 | <b>Existing</b> | <b>Proposed</b> |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Living Area     | 1645 sf         | 5,722 sf        |
| Garage          | 475 sf          | 1,635 sf        |
| Accessory Space | None Existing   | 350 sf          |

**III. LOT AREA COVERAGE**

|            |               |
|------------|---------------|
| Lot Area:  | 11,400 sf,    |
| Building:  | 4,505 sf; 40% |
| Hardscape: | 3,060 sf; 27% |
| Landscape: | 3,835 sf; 33% |

**IV. DISCUSSION**

- This project was reviewed by the ABR on numerous occasions and received positive comments for the design. It was the position of the Board that the Modification being requested poses no negative aesthetic impacts.
- The project site is currently developed with a single family residence and two-car garage that will be maintained. The proposed project involves the addition of three residential units over six covered parking spaces. The new units and parking will be three-stories in height and will be attached to the rear of the existing unit. SBMC §28.21.060 requires a ten-foot front yard setback for one and two story buildings and fifteen-feet for three story designs. This property, with its corner location, requires front yard setbacks off of both street frontages. The proposed addition is requesting a ten-foot setback off of the secondary frontage facing Rancheria Street. Because of the grade change between the lot and the street, only the top two stories will be visible from the public right-of-way, and therefore, the building will appear to meet the required ten-foot setback for a one or two-story building. The existing residence, which complies with its required ten-foot front yard setback, will now require a fifteen-foot setback due to its three story portions. It is Staff's position that relief of both front yard setbacks can be justified due to the site constraints of two frontages, the grade difference of the lot from the street, and the width of the lot.

**V. RECOMMENDATION/FINDING**

Staff recommends that the Staff Hearing Officer approve the project, making the findings that the Modification is necessary to secure an appropriate improvement of providing rental housing for the Community and is consistent with the purposes and intent of the Zoning Ordinance on a lot with a recognized site constraint involving two front yards.

STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT  
434 WEST GUTIERREZ STREET (MST2006-00541)  
AUGUST 8, 2007  
PAGE 3

Exhibits:

- A. Site Plan
- B. Applicant's letter dated May 29, 2007
- C. ABR Minutes

Contact/Case Planner: Roxanne Milazzo, Associate Planner  
([rmilazzo@SantaBarbaraCA.gov](mailto:rmilazzo@SantaBarbaraCA.gov))  
630 Garden Street, Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
Phone: (805)564-5470

**Bildsten + Sherwin Design Studio Inc.**  
Architecture and Landscape Design  
1311 Anacapa Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
805. 962-7885

**May 29, 2007**

**Staff Hearing Officer**  
City of Santa Barbara  
P.O. Box 1990  
Santa Barbara, CA 93102

**Re: Modification Request for 434 W. Gutierrez Street  
APN# 037-191-002; Zone: R-4**

**Dear Staff Hearing Officer:**

The property referenced above has two front yard setback requirements due to its corner location. There is an existing 2-story house with garage near the corner of Rancheria Street and W. Gutierrez Street. The project proposal is to construct three additional living units three stories high that will attach to the existing structure. The new units will have garages at the ground level from the lower grade along the northeast side of the property and 2 upper stories of living space visible from the higher grade along the Rancheria Street frontage.

One of the modifications being requested is for the existing and new units along Rancheria Street to be located ten feet instead of fifteen feet from the property line, as the existing grade gives the appearance that the new structure is only two stories high.

The other modification being requested allows for the existing porch along the Gutierrez side of the house to remain, as it is located ten feet from the property line, and the new three-story attachment would increase the required setback to fifteen feet.

The major benefit of allowing the smaller setback along Rancheria Street is that the building is set farther from the neighbor along the northeast property line and driveway maneuvering space is preserved. The Gutierrez setback modification allows the existing porch to remain; the ABR board has stated that they view the porch as a neighborhood amenity.

**Sincerely,**



Ellen P. Bildsten, Architect AIA  
Bildsten + Sherwin Design Studio Inc.

## 434 West Gutierrez ABR Minutes

October 16, 2006

Comments submitted by Dennis Feeley, resident, expressing concern with traffic impacts were read into the record by Chair Bartlett.

Public comment closed at 6:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1) Study the Rancheria Street elevation to articulate the facades in a way that will break up the size, bulk, and scale. 2) Study less cantilevered areas to diminish the bulkiness of the third level. 3) Study implementing board-and-batt siding in lieu of stucco throughout the pediments. 4) Study the main entry to the two units off Rancheria Street. Some suggestions are: a. Study the application of brackets, or b. Redesign the roof, or c. Consider separate porch entries. 5) The Board is in favor of keeping the existing trellis and deck on the Gutierrez Street side. 6) The Board is less than unanimous in response to the modification request for the third level being 10 feet from the street. 7) Address potential privacy concerns to adjacent neighbors caused by the second level deck and window. 8) Study the 10 foot setback area on Rancheria Street to have a more subtle change of grade with retaining walls to be perpendicular to the building.

Action: Wienke/Mudge, 6/0/0. (LeCron, Blakeley absent.) Motion carried.

November 27, 2006

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1) The majority of Board members are concerned that the mass, bulk, and scale is increasing in an effort to improve the articulation of the structure. 2) The increased roof heights, especially in the central portion of the building, appear to make compliance with solar design guidelines and third level setbacks on Rancheria Street hard to achieve. 3) The Board is concerned with the plan layout of the existing house for Unit #1, it appears to be 2 or 3 units without the associated required parking. Unit 1 should be thoroughly depicted as to its design intent. 4) The applicant is encouraged to use the Gutierrez Street frontage for a true front door effect on the porch, which the Board would like to see remain even though it is located in the front setback. 5) The materiality appears to be moving in right direction. The use of additional board and batt siding is helping the articulation of portions of the architecture. The change in materiality from the plaster to the board and batt would be more successful if there was a plane change associated with the wall conditions. 6) The choice of materials for Unit #1 should be restudied to integrate that structure more into the final composition of the project. 7) There is concern with accuracy of the drawings especially relative to the vertical heights and the lack of sections through the building. 8) There is a question whether the three levels at the north end of the project are achievable given the lack of topographical information, dimensions,

and finished floor elevations. 9) Introduce planting pockets or a continuous planter along the eastern edge of the driveway abutting the adjacent neighbor.

Action: Mosel/Wienke, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

December 18, 2006

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Study the Rancheria Street side elevation for design articulation, such as siding on the second level and plaster notches.
- 2) Reduce the size and mass of the second and third stories of the rear elevation to better articulate the facades. The second and third-floors need to be scaled back in program and size to allow for better modulation and reduced mass and scale as seen from the driveway elevation.
- 3) Look for opportunities to make better use of the existing first floor notch between the first and second units so that it does not feel like an entryway.
- 4) Provide better proportioned windows in the first unit.
- 5) Add charm giving elements.
- 6) Provide significant trees in the courtyard parkway area.

Action: Wienke/Manson-Hing, 4/2/0. Motion carried. Bartlett/Blakeley opposed. (LeCron/Mosel absent.)

May 21, 2007

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The requested modifications pose no negative aesthetic impact.
- 2) Provide drawings showing railings and balustrades drawn as proposed (wood with wood balustrades).
- 3) Applicant is to study the left elevation of unit #3, at Gutierrez Street to not recess the living room exterior wall.
- 4) Applicant to study resolution details for conditions between the wood pilaster post, headers, and adjacent walls at various locations on the building entries, such as the Rancheria left side elevation.
- 5) Study the balcony on the driveway side above the large garage doors for continued differentiation of planes, and articulation of the elements.
- 6) The Board appreciates the revised project, including the stucco and board-and-batten siding, fenestration, the articulation of the massing and scale, and the revised front unit windows in proportion, detailing, and articulation.
- 7) The Board appreciates the articulation of the entries.
- 8) The Board would prefer a color scheme with differentiation of the building materials: stucco, wood, railings, etc. and a color palette that is not generally brown toned.
- 9) The Board would prefer one or two additional trees on the driveway side, especially closer to the street.
- 10) Provide permeable paving for the driveway. One suggestion is to include a ribbon driveway.
- 11) The Board appreciates the quality doors and windows as proposed.

Action: Manson-Hing/Aurell, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Sherry stepped down.)