



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, September 19, 2016 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
BERNI BERNSTEIN
LISA JAMES
JOSEPH MOTICHA
DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
KATIE MAMULSKI, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Vice-Chair Miller.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Miller, Bernstein, Moticha, and Woolery.
Members absent: Sweeney and James (although was present for last item 6, 2327 Edgewater Way).
Staff present: Mamulski and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **Tuesday, September 6, 2016.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **Tuesday, September 6, 2016**, as amended.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/James absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **September 12, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Lisa James** and **Brian Miller** (with the exception of Item G, 1554 Alameda Padre Serra, reviewed by Joe Moticha).

Action: Moticha/Woolery, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained from Item F, 1605 Paterna Rd., Sweeney/James absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for of **September 19, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Brian Miller**.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/James absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Mamulski announced there were no changes to the agenda.

2. Ms. Mamulski introduced returning local architect, Christopher Mason-Hing, AIA for the ArchitecTours – Santa Barbara Chapter to make his second short presentation to announce the 8th Annual ArchitecTours to be held on Saturday, October 1, 2016:

a) The 8th Annual ArchitecTours will have the theme ‘Spirit of Santa Barbara – Past & Present’ featuring a combination of commercial and residential style and ages of projects showcasing historic structures that have withstood the test of time, balanced by contemporary buildings strongly rooted in the community.

3. Board member Bernstein informed staff she would be stepping down from Item #6, 2327 Edgewater Way, and that Board member Lisa James will be attending the meeting at that time in order for Board quorum to be maintained for that item.

E. Subcommittee Reports: There were no subcommittee reports made at this time.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 1530 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(3:20) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 045-181-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00356
 Owner: Jeffrey Swain
 Designer: Kate Svensson

(Proposal for an extension of the existing balcony from 8'-6" to 17'-0" and the replacement of existing double sliders on the second floor balcony with five panel bi-fold doors. Also proposed are new entry porch posts, extended entry porch slab, and a new window and french door at the front façade. This project is located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project requires Coastal Review and was last reviewed August 22, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Jeffrey Swain, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: **Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, and follows good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 1526 LA VISTA DEL OCEANO DR

E-3 Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-020
 Application Number: MST2015-00094
 Owner: Sailer Family Revocable Trust
 Architect: Don Swann

(Proposal to construct 171 square feet of first-floor additions and 617 square feet of second-floor additions to an existing 1,277 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with a detached 219 square foot, one-car garage. The project includes a new 400 square foot two-car garage, retaining walls, exterior steps, removal of an 80 square foot storage shed from the rear yard, and 88 cubic yards of grading to be exported off site. The proposed total of 2,263 square feet of development on a 5,005 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 93% of the required maximum floor-to lot area (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer Review for requested zoning modifications to allow additions and alterations in the front setback and westerly interior setback. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00300.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 029-16 and was last reviewed September 8, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Don Swann, Architect; Paula and Steven Sailer, Owners; and David Eng, Planning Technician II.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Mr. Eng requested the Applicant provide any details, changes or clarifications to be noted on the plans.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project design in consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and complies good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) Architect to lower the arch of the windows on the south elevation by a minimum of six inches in order to bring the windows into proportion with the rest of the structure.
- 3) Applicant to confer with staff regarding the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements prior to Final Approval at Consent Review.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 4 MINUTES AT 3:54 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 3:58 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 1630 MIRA VISTA AVE

E-1 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-013
 Application Number: MST2016-00106
 Owner: Barbara Thurman
 Architect: Tom Smith
 Applicant: Trish Allen

(Proposal to demolish the existing 544 square foot two-car garage and 47 square feet of a stairway area, and construct a new 565 square foot master suite in their place at an existing 3,180 square foot single-family residence. The proposal includes a new 447 square foot two-car garage and 122 square foot storage, stair, and elevator area to be located below the new master suite and to be made accessible with newly graded driveway. Also, included is a 108 square foot kitchen addition at the rear of the main floor. The proposed total of 3,831 square feet (of which 50% of the partial basement garage is receiving a 50% FAR credit) on a 13,094 square foot lot is 86% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes new site work, walls, steps, and an at-grade deck in the front yard. An Administrative Height Exception is requested to allow a wall that exceeds 3 1/2 feet in height to be located within 10 ft. of the front property line. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer Review for a zoning modification to allow the new garage and master suite above it to encroach into the interior setback.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 045-16 and was last reviewed May 2, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:58 p.m.

Present: Tom Smith, Architect; Trish Allen, Applicant; Erin Carroll, Landscape Architect; and Pete Spieler, Contractor.

Public comment opened at 4:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, and follows good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Moticha/Bernstein, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 640 AURORA AVE****E-1 Zone**

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-122-014
Application Number: MST2015-00038
Owner: Nicolas A. D`Incelli and Rosalyn Cole
Designer: Jason Grant Design Studio

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for 1,230 square foot, of one- and two-story additions to an existing 1,590 square foot one-story residence with attached 441 square foot two-car garage and a rear uncovered patio. The project includes a new covered front entry porch, upper level balcony, permitting "as-built" 36 inch high retaining walls, removal of an "as-built" outdoor shower and removal of screening for the shower. The proposal total of 3,261 square feet on a 13,500 square foot lot is 78% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested front and interior setback modifications.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 061-15 and was last reviewed May 18, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Jason Grant, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:20 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) The Board finds the proposed 78% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) acceptable for this project.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 20 MINUTES AT 4:27 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 4:44 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 626 ALSTON RD****A-2 Zone**

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-171-020
Application Number: MST2015-00463
Owner: Fentisov Living Trust
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza
Landscape Architect: Jack Kiesel

(This is a revised project description for a new 3,987 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 487 square foot two-car garage. The project includes 548 gross square feet of covered patios, an 82 square foot covered entry porch, a 215 square foot open patio, a new driveway and driveway gate, walkways, a built-in hot tub, fountains, and new landscaping. It also proposes 609 square feet of cut-and-fill grading, of which 284 cubic yards will occur outside of the building footprint, and 214 cubic yards will be exported off site. The proposed total of 4,474 square feet on a 1.1 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The revised project omits a previously proposed one-car garage, second story, and roof deck.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project was last reviewed July 25, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:44 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect; Jack Kiesel, Landscape Architect; and L.R. Greenwald, Agent for the Owners.

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m.

- 1) Bobby Shand (also for Susan Shand), neighbors, opposition; spoke of concerns and requested the proposed building height be checked and verified during construction per approvals, and requested clarification of the landscaping "future planning" term; the proposed grading; and requested a plaster or wooden wall instead of the proposed chain link fence along the driveway.
- 2) Barbara Ireland, neighbor, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility, wild life impacts; the amount of dirt and infill, debris during construction, and amount of ground water used for construction and for landscape maintenance.
- 3) John Ireland, neighbor, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the timing of the earth-moving equipment allowed onto the property prior to approvals by the City.
- 4) Burt McCormack, neighbor, opposition; spoke of concerns and requested clarification of the proposed trees, and that landscape maintenance cuttings and debris be cleaned out as a potential fire hazard in proximity to his adjacent property.

Emails of expressed concerns from Bobby Shand and Susan Shand, and Barbara Ireland were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:07 p.m.

Staff clarified that the City was working on a process to verify standards and requirements/conditions of approval are observed during the construction phase of projects, and that any suspicious current activity should be reported as complaints to zoning and enforcement staff as such concerns are not within the purview of the Board.

Motion: **Project Design Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance in size, bulk, and scope, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, acceptable landscaping, poses no impacts to City views, and follows good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:30 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 5:40 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 2327 EDGEWATER WAY

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-350-007
 Application Number: MST2016-00191
 Owner: Hack Family Trust
 Architect: Tom Henson

(Proposal to demolish an existing detached 448 square foot two-car garage and 170 square foot one-car carport, and construction of a 1,490 square foot first-story addition and 871 square foot second-story addition, new attached 750 square foot three-car garage, and new driveway with motorcourt. Also proposed is to permit an "as-built" deck to this existing 1,602 square foot single-family dwelling. The proposed total of 4,663 square feet on a 22,189 square foot lot is 99% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments Only; Project requires Planning Commission Review and Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:40 p.m.

Present: Jacob Niksto, Applicant; Justin Manuel, Designer, Arcadia Studios; Tom Henson, Architect; and Carol Hack, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:54 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Emails of expressed concerns from Michel Boudreaux, Berni Bernstein, and Janet Koed were acknowledged.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) A majority of the Board finds the proposed project is too large; Applicant to reduce the maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) to 85%.
- 2) Restudy the style of the architecture and if the beach cottage look and materials are compatible overall design.
- 3) Restudy a two-car garage design instead of a three-car garage design in order to reduce the FAR.
- 4) The Board could support relocating the driveway away from the proximity of the adjacent neighbor's property with a northeasterly front area green buffer between the home and the driveway, and which relocates the garage to the west side of the property.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein stepped down, Sweeney absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:35 P.M. ****